



# 2022-23 Instructional Program Review and Planning

## OVERVIEW OF PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING FOR INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS

Program Review and Planning is about evaluating and assessing programs and documenting plans for improving student success rates. Through review of and reflection on key program elements, Program Review and Planning identifies program strengths and strategies necessary to improve the academic discipline, program, and/or services to support student success.

The College also uses Program Review and Planning as the conduit to request resources (human, technology, facilities and funding) to further help improve and support programs.

### BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

**Academic Year**

2022-23

**Are you completing a comprehensive or annual PRP?**

Annual

**Division Name**

Career, Technical and Extended Education

**Department Name**

Cooperative Education

*Choose your department. If you don't see it, you may add it by typing it in the box.*

**Discipline Name**

Apprenticeship Training (AP)

*Choose your discipline. If you don't see it, you may add it by typing it in the box.*

**Department Chair Name**

Jason Jarvinen

**Department Chair email**

jjarvinen@palomar.edu

**Please list the names and positions of everyone who helped to complete this document.**

Jason Jarvinen, Dept. Chair

**Website address for your discipline**

<https://www.palomar.edu/wcce/apprenticeship/>

**Discipline Mission statement**

The mission of the apprenticeship program is to prepare students for the workforce through classwork and on-the-job learning experiences so that they can become journey-level workers in their trade, earning a livable wage salary with benefits and pension.

[\(Click here for information on how to create a mission statement.\)](#)

**Does your discipline have at least one degree or certificate associated with it?**

☒ Yes ☐ No

**Are any of your programs TOP coded as vocational (CTE/CE)?**

☒ Yes ☐ No

**List all degrees and certificates offered within this discipline.**

-Acoustical Installer  
-Carpentry  
-Drywall/Lather  
-Inside Wireman  
-Intelligent Transportation Systems Installer -Plasterer  
-Sheet Metal  
-Sound Technician

AA, AS, ADT, Certificates, etc.

### **BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION: FACULTY AND STAFFING RESOURCES**

In this section, you will identify how many faculty and staff support your discipline's programs. This information is considered when you request permanent staff and faculty hires. It is also useful as you evaluate your program and the human resources and talent you have to support our students.

To help you answer questions in this section, you will need the links shown in red.

**Enter the number of permanent or full-time faculty support your discipline (program)?**

0

*Enter a number.*

Link: [Permanent Faculty and Staff Count](#)

**For this past fall semester, what was your Full-time FTEF assigned to teach classes?**

0

Link: [FTEF Data](#)

**For this past fall semester, what was your Part-time FTEF assigned to teach classes? (Part-time FTEF = PT hourly and overload.)**

0

Link: [FTEF Data](#)

**List the classified and other permanent staff positions that support this discipline. If possible, include number of months and percentage workload.**

1 Administrative Coordinator (CAST) position assigned to Workforce, Community and Continuing Education department.  
1 Career Technical Specialist assigned to Workforce, Community and Continuing Education department.  
1 Academic Department Assistant assigned to Workforce Development

Link: [Permanent Faculty and Staff Count](#)

**List additional hourly staff that support this discipline and/or department. Include weekly hours.**

## PROGRAM INFORMATION

In this section, you are asked to consider and evaluate your programs, including their program learning outcomes, the annual number of completions, goals for completions, and enrollment and efficiency trends.

## PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES

Begin this section by reviewing the Program Review reports for programs and courses in [Nuventive Improve](#). All active course and program learning outcomes should be systematically assessed over a 3-year cycle. First, look at program learning outcomes.

- **Program** = Leads to a degree or certificate
- **Discipline** = A group of courses within a discipline

\*Programs will be able to complete program completion and outcome questions.

**How well do your program's learning outcomes communicate the scope and depth of the degree/certificate offered? Please explain.**

Apprenticeship programs by design require that students work a minimum of 2,000 hours on the job within the industry.  
Palomar College programs require between 4000 - 5000 On the Job training hours. Additionally, all programs have an official Apprenticeship Training Committee, made up of employers, labor representatives, education and the Department of Industrial Relations that ensure programs meet industry needs. These committees are mandated to meet monthly.

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs.

**How do they align with employer and transfer expectations?**

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs.

**Describe your program's plan for assessing program learning outcomes.**

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs.

**Summarize the major findings of your program outcomes assessments.**

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs.

## PROGRAM COMPLETIONS

Student success is at the core of what we do in assisting students in achieving their goals.

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of Program Completion as a major

goal for our students. In addition, transfer and career readiness are key components of Palomar College's mission statement. This year, our funding formula has also changed reflecting this emphasis, providing additional funding as a function of the number of completions.

In this section, you will reflect upon the number of completions students earned for EACH degree/certificate you offer. As required for accreditation, you are also asked to set a standard which represents the lowest acceptable number of completions and a stretch goal for increasing the number of awards.

Link: [Program Completions](#)

**Access the link above titled "Program Completions" and copy and paste five years of completion data for each of your discipline's degrees and certificates.**

2017 - 2018: 105 certificates; 4 associate degrees  
2018 - 2019: 87 certificates; 1 associate degree  
2019 - 2020: 124 certificates 0 associate degrees  
2020 - 2021: 103 certificates; 3 associate degrees  
2021 - 2022: 169 certificates; 5 associate degrees

**Have your program completions Increased, decreased, or stayed the same over the last 5 years?**

☒ Increased ☐ Stayed the same ☐ Decreased

*Choose one*

**What factors have influenced your completion trends?**

Enrollment in apprenticeship programs is tied directly to labor market trends because every apprentice is required to work full- time as part of their program. The number of new apprentices accepted into the program each year is directly aligned with the number of jobs available in that particular trade. Completions reflect these trends as well. There is some fluctuation from one year to the next. The general trend in completions over the past five years has been upward.

Our accrediting body, ACCJC, and the Federal Department of Education requires that colleges establish standards and goals for student success and completion.

A program-set standard for completion represents the lowest number of program completion you deem acceptable for your program. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the set standard, you would seek further information to examine why this occurred and strategies to increase completions.

A program stretch goal for completions is the number of completions you aspire to award for each program in your discipline.

To determine your stretch goal, consider the number of annual completions you typically award over time, then consider strategies or efforts you are making to increase completions in your program. Then identify the NUMBER you want to set as your goal.

## Program Information Summary

In this section you are asked to evaluate your programs by considering their program learning outcome assessments, the annual number of completions, goals for completions, enrollment and efficiency trends and any other internal or external factors that had an impact on your program.

**What factors have contributed to the success of your program(s)? Describe how they have contributed.**

Apprenticeship programs are specifically designed for students to work full-time in on-the-job training. Employers must allow students to attend class if it is scheduled during the day. Each training center schedules courses a bit differently, depending on their employer relationships. The programs are in a cohort model, which creates a community among the students in the program. This is yet another reason success rates are quite high.

Labor market outcomes are strong for apprenticeship students. The tables below show LaunchBoard data for Carpentry, Electrician, and Sheet Metal students who completed apprenticeship programs. The first column shows the median annual wages for the year after program completion. The second column shows the median change in earnings for students for the year after program completion. The third column shows the percentage of completing students attaining a living wage one year after program completion.

The results are strong across all apprenticeship programs but particularly strong for electricians. For academic year 2019-2020, the most recent year for which data are available, 86% of completing apprentices earned a living wage for their geographic area. This represented a median increase in earnings of 200%.

**Carpentry**

2015-2016	\$62,072	100%	74%
2016-2017	\$42,596	84%	52%
2017-2018	\$54,260	86%	64%
2018-2019	\$55,084	80%	61%
2019 - 2020	\$62,560	65%	68%

**Electrician**

2015-2016	\$94,068	171%	84%
2016-2017	\$78,287	216%	83%
2017-2018	\$85,369	195%	86%
2018-2019	\$80,054	140%	79%
2019-2020	\$89,154	201%	86%

**Sheet Metal**

2015-2016	\$64,637	136%	72%
2016-2017	\$73,946	138%	93%
2017-2018	\$58,398	76%	70%
2018-2019	\$48,128	60%	61%
2019-2020	\$81,756	203%	88%

**What factors have presented challenges for your program(s)? Describe the impact of these challenges.**

The overall completion of certificates is a bit lower than expected, however not surprising. The apprenticeship programs are 4 - 5 year programs and due to that, yield a lower completion rate. Additionally, many apprentices come into the program with outside experience, and can therefore be indentured at a higher level of apprentice. When this happens, the apprentice will receive their state certificate, however they may not receive a Palomar Certificate (because they have waived too many units.) Because the Palomar Certificate is not a requirement to work in industry, many apprentices would rather indenture at a high level to earn the state journeyman certificate more quickly, rather than completing the required units for the Palomar Certificate.

## COURSE INFORMATION

In this section, you will review how students perform in the courses you offer as part of your program. The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success goals focus on eliminating equity gaps and increasing timely completions. Examining, reflecting upon, and developing strategies to improve course success rates is one way to help the college meet its Vision for Success Goals and support our students in reaching theirs.

Data are provided to help you examine differences in course success rates (C or better) across student demographic categories (e.g., gender) and course type (e.g., face-to-face, online).

After you complete your review of course success data, you are asked about the assessment of student learning outcomes at the course level, progress you have made in these assessments, and changes you have implemented as a result.

## COURSE SUCCESS AND RETENTION

ACCJC also requires that colleges establish institutional and program level standards and stretch goals for course success rates.

Program-set standards for course success rates represent the lowest success rate deemed acceptable by your discipline. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the rate, you would seek further information to examine why the drop occurred and strategies to address the rate. The College's institution-set standard for course success rates is 70%

Program-set stretch goals for course success rates represent the success rates you aspire your students to achieve.

The data includes overall success (% C or better) and retention rates (% No Ws) . The data tables include course rates by gender, age, ethnicity, special population, location, and modality (You can access the Student Equity Plan on the SSEC website <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ssec/> )

### What is your program's standard for Discipline COURSE Success Rate?

96.0%

*The College's institutional standard for course success rate is 70%. To access college success rates. Click on the link below.*

Link: [Course Success Rate Information](#)

UPDATE 9/26/2022: The Course data links are under construction and will be operational shortly. This note will be removed when then link becomes functional again. Apologies for the inconvenience.

**Why did you choose this standard?**

These data were pulled from LaunchBoard because the Palomar Course Success Rate dashboard only includes apprenticeship work experience courses, and those exclude a significant number of apprentices.

Carpentry: the average success rate from the last five recorded years (2015 - 2020) was 96%.

Electrician: the average success rate from the last five recorded years (2015 - 2020) was 96%.

Sheet Metal: the average success rate from the last five recorded years (2015 - 2020) was 95%

**What is your stretch goal for course success rates?**

98.0%

**How did you decide upon the goal?**

Given the average success rate of the past five years this goal is challenging yet appropriate.

## **COURSE STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES (SLOs)**

**Summarize the major findings of your course level student learning outcomes assessments.**

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs.

Course level SLOs can be accessed through [Nuventive Improve](#)

**Excluding courses that haven't been offered in the last three years, do you confirm that all of your courses have been assessed in the last three years.**

☐ Yes ☒ No

**If you answered no, please explain.**

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs

**This section is intentionally blank for annual PRPs. Please click "Next" to continue.**

## **CAREER AND LABOR MARKET DATA**

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of increasing the percent of exiting students who report being employed in their field of study. It is important for us to consider how **all** of our programs connect to future careers.

Go to this website <https://www.onetonline.org/> and enter your discipline in the bubble on the top right for ideas about potential occupations. Click on an example to see more detail.

**The following websites are for CTE related data:**

- [Centers of Excellence](#) (many other data resources besides supply and demand) Password: GetLMI
- [LaunchBoard](#)
- [LaunchBoard Resource Library](#)
- [Chancellor's Office Data Mart](#)

- [Career Coach-San Diego Workforce Partnership](#)
- [EDD Labor Market Info](#)
- [Career One Stop](#)

**What kinds of careers are available for people who complete your programs (and/or transfer)? (Refer to O\*net Link below) Are there any new or emerging careers? If so, how would the new or emerging careers impact your future planning?**

There are strong career options for students completing carpentry, electrician, and sheet metal apprenticeships. Demand for workers in the building trades remains strong in San Diego. There are emerging opportunities related to the increased demand for electric vehicles. The electrician apprenticeship, for example, recently requested some course changes to incorporate training for working on electric vehicle charging stations.

Link: <https://www.onetonline.org/>

**What are the associated knowledge, skills, abilities (KSA's) needed for the occupations listed above? (click examples in the link above to get ideas)**

KSAs vary by trade, but in general, programs require technical KSAs like building and construction, math and design, along with 21st century skills (aka soft skills) like active listening and complex problem solving.

**How does your program help students build these KSA's?**

As an apprenticeship program, students are required to complete a minimum of 2,000 on the job training hours to complete the program. Students also complete simulated work experiences in hands on labs at training centers, taught by instructors who are active in their trade. This combination of classroom training, lab training and on the job training provides both the technical skills and the 21st century skills needed to be successful in this industry.

The following four questions are for CTE programs only. If you are not a CTE program, please go back to the BASIC INFORMATION tab and select "no" for "Are any of your programs TOP coded as vocational (CTE/CE)?"

**What is the regional three-year projected occupational growth for your program(s)?**

Data from San Diego Workforce Partnership/Career Coach

Carpenter: 12,972 to 13,047 jobs/ steady

Electrician: 8,721 to 9,063 jobs/ 3.9% growth

Sheet Metal: 2,310 to 2,348 jobs/ steady

**What is being done at the program level to assist students with job placement and workforce preparedness?**

All students are required to work full-time while in the program. Students are required to complete a minimum of 2,000 on the job training hours per CA Division of Apprenticeship Standards. Our programs at Palomar require more than 5,000 hours. Apprentices are employees starting on the first day in their program.



**When was your program's last advisory meeting held? What significant information was learned from that meeting?**

Each apprenticeship program holds monthly advisory meetings. At these meetings industry representatives provide updates about employment and training needs. Representatives from the California Division of Apprenticeship Standards provide updates from the state's perspective.

*Career Education programs are required by Title 5 to conduct a minimum of 1 advisory meeting each year.*

**What are the San Diego County/Imperial County Job Openings?**

Carpenter - Current Openings: 1,246 (Career Coach); long-term projection: 12,720 through 2028 (Centers for Excellence)

Electrician - Current Openings: 1,040 (Career Coach); long-term projection: 11,470 through 2028 (Centers for Excellence)

Sheet Metal - Current Openings: 235 (Career Coach); long-term projection: 1,380 through 2028 (Centers for Excellence)

*Include short- term # of projected job openings and long -term # of projected job openings*

**Work Based Learning**

Applied and work-based learning (WBL) allows students to apply classroom content in professional settings while gaining real-world experience. WBL exists on a continuum that reflects the progress of experiences from awareness-building to training. Students often cycle back through the continuum many times throughout college and throughout their career. Faculty play a critical role in ensuring these experiences are embedded into curriculum and support learning.

**Have you incorporated work based learning (work experience, internships, and/or service learning) into your program?**

☒ Yes ☐ No

**What have you done to integrate work-based learning?**

Apprenticeships are work-based learning by definition.

**How does your work-based learning help your students learn how to do some of the tasks associated with the potential occupations?**

Apprenticeships intentionally combine classroom instruction with on-the-job training to prepare students for careers in the building trades.

**How do you engage with the community to keep them apprised of opportunities in your program?**

The monthly apprenticeship council meetings are a critical way to engage with the community. We also do outreach at events such as Pathways to Palomar and the annual Counselors Conference (when it is held).

*For example: regular meetings with community partners, connections with local High Schools, dual enrollment, Universities, business partnerships, Palomar events (i.e. Tarde de Familia, House of Humanities), and/or community groups (i.e. chamber, associations, non-profits).*

## **PROGRAM GOALS**

### **Progress on Prior PRP Goals**

In the most recent PRP cycle, you identified a set of goals. Provide an update to your most recent PRP goals.

[Click here for previous PRPs with goal information.](#)

## Prior PRP Goals

### Goal 1

#### Brief Description

Launch pre-apprenticeship program for the construction trades.

#### Goal Status

☐ Completed ☒ Ongoing ☐ No longer a goal

**Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.**

The Preapprenticeship program launched November 2018 with 10 pre-apprentices. Our goal for our California Apprenticeship Initiative grant was to train 60 students over the course of the grant. We trained 51, which given the challenges of the Covid-19 pandemic we consider to be a strong result. We do plan to continue the program as we re-emerge from the pandemic.

### Goal 2

#### Brief Description

Continue to grow the Military Leadership Apprenticeship Program.

#### Goal Status

☐ Completed ☐ Ongoing ☒ No longer a goal

**Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.**

The Military Leadership Program has grown significantly in the past few years. In fact, it is now a distinct apprenticeship program with its own program review. This is no longer a goal under the general apprenticeship PRP because Military Leadership is now completing its own PRP, with its own set of goals.

### Goal 3

#### Brief Description

Work with apprentice training program partners to complete reviews of all apprenticeship courses.

#### Goal Status

☐ Completed ☒ Ongoing ☐ No longer a goal

**Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.**

This review was completed during the summer of 2022. Course reviews and changes were submitted through the Curriculum Committee this fall. We will work through the process to completion.

**The Strategic Plan 2022 includes the College's Vision for Success (VfS) outcomes. Review the VfS goals and reflect on how your unit supports these outcomes. Identify one strategy your unit will implement to help the college meet these outcomes.**

Palomar College's Apprenticeship Programs support VfS Goal 4 (Workforce) and VfS Goal 5 (Equity). The majority of apprentices who complete their programs find employment in a related field (Goal 4). Apprenticeship programs serve a significant number of students in groups showing disproportionate impact (Goal 5).

[Click here to access the Strategic Plan 2022.](#)

**Describe any changes to your goals or three-year plan as a result of this annual update.**

As a result of this annual update, we will begin discussion with our apprenticeship training partners how we might embed diversity related content into course offerings.

## RESOURCES

Congratulations! You are nearing completion. In this section, you will consider the resources you need to implement your three-year program review plan and/or address any findings from your assessment of your discipline.

The section is organized into the following five parts:

PART 1: Staffing Needs (Faculty and Additional Staff)

PART 2: Budget Review

PART 3: Technology Needs

PART 4: Facilities Needs

PART 5: One Time Request for Other Needs (NonTechnology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel)

Reflect upon the three year plan you created above, your current operations, and any upcoming factors (retirements, changes in legislation, and changes in policies or procedures) that will impact your unit. How will you allocate resources to implement your plan? Describe additional resources needed to improve the effectiveness of your unit/program. All resource requests must be aligned with the College's [Strategic Plan 2022](#).

Summarize any reallocation/re-organization of resources you are making based upon your three-year plan, your current operations, and any other factors (e.g., legislation). Describe the impact of the reallocation of resources to your unit.

**NOTE: All requests listed in the PRP will be reviewed by deans and supervisors, then forwarded to the appropriate review group for prioritization. A resource requests approved to move forward in the review process does NOT guarantee a position or funding.**

## PART 1: STAFFING NEEDS

Requests for faculty will follow the prioritization process currently in place in the Faculty Position Prioritization committee, which reports to the Education, Equity, and Student Success Council. Requests for new staff positions will be prioritized at the division level and reviewed at Exec.

**Are you requesting additional full-time faculty?**

☐ Yes ☒ No

**Are you requesting AA, CAST for Classified Staff?**

☐ Yes ☒ No

## PART 2: BUDGET REVIEW

Review your Budget/Expenditure reports for fiscal year 2019, 2020, 2021. Consider your three-year PRP plan.

Click on the link below to access directions to the *Available Budget Report* to complete this section.

[How to Request the Available Budget Report](#)

**Reflecting on your three-year PRP plan, are there any budget considerations you would like your dean/supervisor to be aware of for the upcoming year?**

☐ Yes ☒ No

## PARTS 3, 4 and 5 – TECHNOLOGY, FACILITIES AND OTHER NEEDS

1. One-Time Fund Requests. Through the PRP process the college implements an approach for prioritizing and allocating one-time needs/requests. Prioritization takes place through the appropriate groups, leadership, and the Budget Committee. The executive team and Resource Allocation Committee consider various sources for funding PRP requests. Resource requests also inform the larger planning process like Scheduled Maintenance Plans, Staffing Plans, and institutional strategic planning.

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#) (on the left menu of the webpage).

If you are a CTE program and think you may qualify for CTE funds for your PRP request(s), you are STRONGLY encouraged to answer the call for Perkins/Strong Workforce grant applications in February. Contact the Dean of CTEE for additional information.

Consider submitting one-time requests only if you have verified that you cannot fund the request using your general discretionary funds or other funds.

2. Technology and Facilities Review. Requests for technology and facilities are assessed by the Deans and then, if appropriate forwarded to the proper institutional group (e.g., technology review committee, or facilities) for review and feedback.

## PART 3: TECHNOLOGY NEEDS

Will you be requesting any technology (hardware/software) this upcoming year?

☐ Yes ☒ No

## PART 4: FACILITIES REQUESTS

Do you have resource needs that require physical space or modification to physical space?

☐ Yes ☒ No

*Please include only those facilities requests that could be accomplished within a one-year time frame and/or under a \$75,000 estimated amount. Other facilities needs, such as buildings or remodels, should come through the long-range facilities planning process.*

## PART 5: OTHER ONE-TIME NEEDS

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#). Please check with your department chair on the availability for this cycle.

Do you have one-time requests for other items (e.g., Non-technology equipment, supplies, operating expenses, travel) that your budget or other funding sources will NOT cover?

☐ Yes ☒ No

☒ I confirm that all full-time faculty in this discipline have reviewed the PRP. The form is complete and ready to be submitted.

Enter your email address to receive a copy of the PRP to keep for your records.