



2022-23 Instructional Program Review and Planning

OVERVIEW OF PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING FOR INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS

Program Review and Planning is about evaluating and assessing programs and documenting plans for improving student success rates. Through review of and reflection on key program elements, Program Review and Planning identifies program strengths and strategies necessary to improve the academic discipline, program, and/or services to support student success.

The College also uses Program Review and Planning as the conduit to request resources (human, technology, facilities and funding) to further help improve and support programs.

BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

Academic Year

2022-23

Are you completing a comprehensive or annual PRP?

Annual

Division Name

Arts, Media and Business Administration

Department Name

Business Administration

Choose your department. If you don't see it, you may add it by typing it in the box.

Discipline Name

Real Estate (RE)

Choose your discipline. If you don't see it, you may add it by typing it in the box.

Department Chair Name

Mary Cassoni

Department Chair email

mcassoni@palomar.edu

Please list the names and positions of everyone who helped to complete this document.

Lakshmi Paranthaman, Assistant Professor
Reza Wrathall, Assistant Professor

Website address for your discipline

<https://www.palomar.edu/onlineeducation/category/real-estate-re/>

Discipline Mission statement

The Real Estate Program at Palomar Community College provides high quality instruction to students seeking real estate and appraisal education and preparation for successful professional careers.

[\(Click here for information on how to create a mission statement.\)](#)

Does your discipline have at least one degree or certificate associated with it?

☒ Yes ☐ No

Are any of your programs TOP coded as vocational (CTE/CE)?

☒ Yes ☐ No

List all degrees and certificates offered within this discipline.

Associate of Science (AS), Real Estate Broker License Preparation
Certificate of Achievement (CA), Real Estate Broker License Preparation
Certificate of Proficiency (CP), Real Estate Appraisal License Preparation
Certificate of Proficiency (CP), Real Estate Salesperson License Preparation

AA, AS, ADT, Certificates, etc.

BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION: FACULTY AND STAFFING RESOURCES

In this section, you will identify how many faculty and staff support your discipline's programs. This information is considered when you request permanent staff and faculty hires. It is also useful as you evaluate your program and the human resources and talent you have to support our students.

To help you answer questions in this section, you will need the links shown in red.

Enter the number of permanent or full-time faculty support your discipline (program)?

1

Enter a number.

Link: [Permanent Faculty and Staff Count](#)

For this past fall semester, what was your Full-time FTEF assigned to teach classes?

0.13

Link: [FTEF Data](#)

For this past fall semester, what was your Part-time FTEF assigned to teach classes? (Part-time FTEF = PT hourly and overload.)

1.27

Link: [FTEF Data](#)

List the classified and other permanent staff positions that support this discipline. If possible, include number of months and percentage workload.

Business Department Administrative Assistant

Link: [Permanent Faculty and Staff Count](#)

List additional hourly staff that support this discipline and/or department. Include weekly hours.

N/A

PROGRAM INFORMATION

In this section, you are asked to consider and evaluate your programs, including their program learning outcomes, the annual number of completions, goals for completions, and enrollment and efficiency trends.

PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES

Begin this section by reviewing the Program Review reports for programs and courses in [Nuventive Improve](#). All active course and program learning outcomes should be systematically assessed over a 3-year cycle. First, look at program learning outcomes.

- **Program** = Leads to a degree or certificate
- **Discipline** = A group of courses within a discipline

*Programs will be able to complete program completion and outcome questions.

How well do your program's learning outcomes communicate the scope and depth of the degree/certificate offered? Please explain.

All of the real estate program's learning outcomes focus on preparing the student for requisite career licensing exams and subsequent professional careers. As the real estate program and all of its degrees fall within career and technical education, the program's learning outcomes align with the scope and depth of our degrees and certificates.

How do they align with employer and transfer expectations?

Employers expect applicants to have the prerequisite state licensing to work in their profession(s). Licensing requires that applicants complete mandatory academic courses before taking the exam; as a result, the license itself is proof that the courses have been completed successfully, decreasing the value of a certificate. An Associate's or Bachelor's Degree may indicate a more well-rounded education because of the additional general education requirements outside of real estate, but this is not usually required.

Describe your program's plan for assessing program learning outcomes.

Faculty will evaluate student achievement of the program outcomes through subject tests that simulate the content of real estate licensing examinations and use this information to continuously improve our academic programs.

Summarize the major findings of your program outcomes assessments.

Our assessment data shows that students are meeting the 70% threshold for passing a sample of real estate courses offered in the last year.

PROGRAM COMPLETIONS

Student success is at the core of what we do in assisting students in achieving their goals.

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of Program Completion as a major

goal for our students. In addition, transfer and career readiness are key components of Palomar College's mission statement. This year, our funding formula has also changed reflecting this emphasis, providing additional funding as a function of the number of completions.

In this section, you will reflect upon the number of completions students earned for EACH degree/certificate you offer. As required for accreditation, you are also asked to set a standard which represents the lowest acceptable number of completions and a stretch goal for increasing the number of awards.

Link: [Program Completions](#)

Access the link above titled "Program Completions" and copy and paste five years of completion data for each of your discipline's degrees and certificates.

	----- 2017-18 -----	2018-19 -----	2019-20 -----	2020-21 -----	2021-22
A.S. Degree	0	2	1	1	4
Certificates:					
C.A.	1	2	1	2	4
C.P.	8	10	12	15	13
TOTAL Certificates	9	12	13	17	17
GRAND TOTAL	9	14	14	18	21

Have your program completions Increased, decreased, or stayed the same over the last 5 years?

☒ Increased ☐ Stayed the same ☐ Decreased

Choose one

What factors have influenced your completion trends?

Real Estate is a cyclical business and our enrollment in real estate education will also have cyclicity. Because it has been a Seller's market in which real estate values have been growing rapidly, it makes sense that program completions have also increased as students are eager to work in this area.

Our accrediting body, ACCJC, and the Federal Department of Education requires that colleges establish standards and goals for student success and completion.

A program-set standard for completion represents the lowest number of program completion you deem acceptable for your program. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the set standard, you would seek further information to examine why this occurred and strategies to increase completions.

A program stretch goal for completions is the number of completions you aspire to award for each program in your discipline.

To determine your stretch goal, consider the number of annual completions you typically award over time, then consider strategies or efforts you are making to increase completions in your program. Then identify the NUMBER you want to set as your goal.

Program Information Summary

In this section you are asked to evaluate your programs by considering their program learning outcome

assessments, the annual number of completions, goals for completions, enrollment and efficiency trends and any other internal or external factors that had an impact on your program.

What factors have contributed to the success of your program(s)? Describe how they have contributed.

The local real estate market has experienced continued growth and home prices have skyrocketed, most likely causing an increase in students hoping to qualify for their real estate salesperson licenses. The certificate of proficiency for Real Estate Salesperson Licensing Preparation contains the prerequisite courses required to take the licensing examination.

Please note: Our completion rate for real estate may not be accurate if we are relying on students to request their certificates rather than determining whether they completed the necessary courses to receive a certificate. For example, our CPE aligns with the courses required to take the CA Real Estate Salesperson Exam. Students completing these courses may just take the external licensing exam without notifying the registrar of their certificate completion since passing the licensing exam indicates the courses have been taken and is the desired requirement of the job market.

What factors have presented challenges for your program(s)? Describe the impact of these challenges.

1. Although not reflected in the current numbers, Covid-19 presented some challenges for professors who have traditionally taught in person and for students who do better in live classroom settings.
2. There is always the potential for contraction of the real estate market, which may precipitate a drop in program enrollment and cause strain on program offerings.
3. Real Estate Appraisal Licenses (above trainee) require apprentice training, but there is no formal method for licensees to be matched with licensed appraisers to train them. This can be a challenge for our appraisal students and may dissuade some from enrolling.

COURSE INFORMATION

In this section, you will review how students perform in the courses you offer as part of your program. The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success goals focus on eliminating equity gaps and increasing timely completions. Examining, reflecting upon, and developing strategies to improve course success rates is one way to help the college meet its Vision for Success Goals and support our students in reaching theirs.

Data are provided to help you examine differences in course success rates (C or better) across student demographic categories (e.g., gender) and course type (e.g., face-to-face, online).

After you complete your review of course success data, you are asked about the assessment of student

learning outcomes at the course level, progress you have made in these assessments, and changes you have implemented as a result.

COURSE SUCCESS AND RETENTION

ACCJC also requires that colleges establish institutional and program level standards and stretch goals for course success rates.

Program-set standards for course success rates represent the lowest success rate deemed acceptable by your discipline. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the rate, you would seek further information to examine why the drop occurred and strategies to address the rate. The College's institution-set standard for course success rates is 70%

Program-set stretch goals for course success rates represent the success rates you aspire your students to achieve.

The data includes overall success (% C or better) and retention rates (% No Ws) . The data tables include course rates by gender, age, ethnicity, special population, location, and modality (You can access the Student Equity Plan on the SSEC website <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ssec/>)

What is your program's standard for Discipline COURSE Success Rate?

70.0%

The College's institutional standard for course success rate is 70%. To access college success rates. Click on the link below.

Link: [Course Success Rate Information](#)

UPDATE 9/26/2022: The Course data links are under construction and will be operational shortly. This note will be removed when then link becomes functional again. Apologies for the inconvenience.

Why did you choose this standard?

This is the standard used by our external licensing agencies - the Department of Real Estate and the Bureau of Real Estate Appraisers, in addition to Palomar College.

What is your stretch goal for course success rates?

80.0%

How did you decide upon the goal?

Based on the normal distribution of grades, aiming for an average or median of a B or 80% is a stretch goal that is potentially attainable.

COURSE STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES (SLOs)

Summarize the major findings of your course level student learning outcomes assessments.

Our assessment data shows that students are meeting the 70% threshold for passing a sample of real estate courses offered in the last year.

Course level SLOs can be accessed through [Nuventive Improve](#)

Excluding courses that haven't been offered in the last three years, do you confirm that all of your courses have been assessed in the last three years.

☒ Yes ☐ No

This section is intentionally blank for annual PRPs. Please click "Next" to continue.

CAREER AND LABOR MARKET DATA

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of increasing the percent of exiting students who report being employed in their field of study. It is important for us to consider how all of our programs connect to future careers.

Go to this website <https://www.onetonline.org/> and enter your discipline in the bubble on the top right for ideas about potential occupations. Click on an example to see more detail.

The following websites are for CTE related data:

- [Centers of Excellence](#) (many other data resources besides supply and demand) Password: GetLMI
- [LaunchBoard](#)
- [LaunchBoard Resource Library](#)
- [Chancellor's Office Data Mart](#)
- [Career Coach-San Diego Workforce Partnership](#)
- [EDD Labor Market Info](#)
- [Career One Stop](#)

What kinds of careers are available for people who complete your programs (and/or transfer)? (Refer to O*net Link below) Are there any new or emerging careers? If so, how would the new or emerging careers impact your future planning?

Real Estate Sales Agent, Real Estate Broker, Mortgage Broker, Loan Officer, Real Estate Appraiser/Assessor, Financial Examiner, Real Estate Paralegal/Legal Assistant, Real Estate Investment Analyst, Property Manager, Asset Manager, Construction and Building Inspectors, Post-secondary Education Teacher, Title Examiners, Abstractors & Searchers, Small Business Brokers, Real Estate Investor

Link: <https://www.onetonline.org/>

What are the associated knowledge, skills, abilities (KSA's) needed for the occupations listed above? (click examples in the link above to get ideas)

Knowledge

Knowledge of (1) federal, state and local laws related to real estate and the real estate profession, (2) economic and accounting principles and practices, the financial markets, banking and the analysis and reporting of financial data, (3) materials, methods, and the tools involved in the construction or repair of houses, buildings, or other structures such as highways and roads, (4) principles and methods for showing, promoting, and selling products or services, (5) structure and content of the English language including the meaning and spelling of words, rules of composition, and grammar, (6) arithmetic, algebra, geometry at a minimum and calculus, statistics, and more advanced math for careers like appraisal and planning, (7) business and management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, production methods, and coordination of people and resources, and (8) administrative and clerical procedures and systems such as word processing, managing files and records, (9) applied computer, software, and technology proficiency.

Skills:

Active Listening, Problem-Solving, Collecting & Analyzing Data/Information, Customer Service, Coordination, Communication (Verbal and Written), Reading Comprehension, Negotiation, Persuasion, Teaching/Explaining the Meaning of Information to Others, Judgment & Critical Thinking, Mathematical Reasoning, Organizational, Planning and Time-Management skills, Clerical, Computer and Administration skills, Active Learning, Self-Motivation & Persistence

Abilities:

Oral Comprehension, Oral Expression, Written Comprehension, Problem Sensitivity, Speech Clarity, Speech Recognition, Inductive and Deductive Reasoning, Near Vision (especially for Inspection/Appraisal)

How does your program help students build these KSA's?

Course reading, lectures, exams, research papers, problems for application of learning. Some courses also offer discussion forums and independent research that is presented and shared collaboratively in both written and verbal presentation form, as well as other collaborative learning exercises in class, including professional panels/interviews. Finally, some courses incorporate a learning self-assessment.

The following four questions are for CTE programs only. If you are not a CTE program, please go back to the BASIC INFORMATION tab and select "no" for "Are any of your programs TOP coded as vocational (CTE/CE)?"

What is the regional three-year projected occupational growth for your program(s)?

Less than a 1% growth rate in the absolute number of BOTH Real Estate Sales Agents AND Real Estate Brokers employed in the Southern Region from 2021 to 2031, according to projections from the San Diego Workforce Partnership. COE for Labor Research shows real estate agents and broker job growth as flat through 2025. Property appraiser openings are expected to shrink by 3% through 2025, and property managers job openings are expected to increase 1% through 2025. (COE for Labor Research)

What is being done at the program level to assist students with job placement and workforce preparedness?

In the past, we have had industry speakers in real estate sales, finance, escrow, and appraisal speak to students in class and through events outside of class. Some professors offer extra credit for informational interviews with real estate professionals and attendance at real estate association events. I provide my students with a list of local real estate organizations that allow students membership or event attendance at low or no cost. A different professor offers extra credit for a Podcast with Brian Buffini (a highly accredited real estate coaching company) about Real Estate and the hard work that is required for a fulfilling career. Several of our part-time faculty work in the real estate field and can serve as contacts.

When was your program's last advisory meeting held? What significant information was learned from that meeting?

May 18, 2022.

Insofar as significant information and takeaways bearing on the Real Estate program, two important themes emerged from the advisory meeting:

1. The importance to current employers of "soft" knowledge and skills. This cuts across all disciplines within Business Administration, including Real Estate disciplines. This is also affirmed by the prevalence, while filtering through relevant Real Estate occupations on O-Net Online, of such "soft" knowledge areas like psychology, therapy and counseling (i.e., managing client relationships in real estate professions), and the importance of such "soft" skills as active listening, social perceptiveness, and negotiation, in addition to such global skills as critical thinking, reading comprehension, writing, speaking, and fluency with mathematics.
2. The imperative to align with Adult Ed. This aligns one of the Town Hall recommendations identified in the Sector Analysis of May 2022 from the Centers of Excellence for Labor Market Research (i.e., under "Business and Entrepreneurship"), which was to partner intentionally with Adult Ed consortia in the region.

Career Education programs are required by Title 5 to conduct a minimum of 1 advisory meeting each year.

What are the San Diego County/Imperial County Job Openings?

First, according to the to San Diego Workforce Partnership, companies in the Southern Border Region posted approximately 7,982 positions for Real Estate Agents since September 2019 (i.e., during the last 3 years of data), which equates to short-term, average demand of approximately 600 job openings per month. As detailed above, however, as a percentage growth rate in the absolute number of Real Estate Agents employed (i.e., accounting for vacancies, turnover, etc.), the long-term projection is just 30-50 new Real Estate Agents per year in the Southern Border Region until 2031, which equates to less than a 1% growth rate.

Second, according to the to San Diego Workforce Partnership, companies in the Southern Border Region posted approximately 247 positions for Real Estate Brokers since September 2019 (i.e., during the last 3 years of data), which equates to short-term, average demand of approximately 20 jobs per month. As detailed above, however, as a percentage growth rate in the absolute number of Real Estate Brokers employed (i.e., accounting for vacancies, turnover, etc.), the long-term projection is just 20-40 new Real Estate Brokers per year in the Southern Border Region until 2031, which equates to less than a 1% growth rate.

Include short- term # of projected job openings and long -term # of projected job openings

Work Based Learning

Applied and work-based learning (WBL) allows students to apply classroom content in professional settings while gaining real-world experience. WBL exists on a continuum that reflects the progress of experiences from awareness-building to training. Students often cycle back through the continuum many times throughout college and throughout their career. Faculty play a critical role in ensuring these experiences are embedded into curriculum and support learning.

Have you incorporated work based learning (work experience, internships, and/or service learning) into your program?

☐ Yes ☐ No

Do you want more information about or need assistance integrating work-based learning into your program?

☐ Yes ☐ No

How do you engage with the community to keep them apprised of opportunities in your program?

We periodically reach out to the San Diego Association of Realtors and the San Diego Appraisal Institute. Most of our part-time faculty are members of these organizations and the professional real estate community.

For example: regular meetings with community partners, connections with local High Schools, dual enrollment, Universities, business partnerships, Palomar events (i.e. Tarde de Familia, House of Humanities), and/or community groups (i.e. chamber, associations, non-profits).

PROGRAM GOALS

Progress on Prior PRP Goals

In the most recent PRP cycle, you identified a set of goals. Provide an update to your most recent PRP goals.

[Click here for previous PRPs with goal information.](#)

Prior PRP Goals

Goal 1

Brief Description

Update course SLO's in TracDat

Goal Status

☐ Completed ☒ Ongoing ☐ No longer a goal

Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.

All SLO's were updated last year, but during the course review process some were updated and TracDat needs to reflect these updates. As soon as the curriculum committee signs off on the outstanding Real Estate Courses, we will update the newly approved SLO's in TracDat.

Goal 2

Brief Description

Renew education provider status and appraisal course renewals with the Bureau of Real Estate Appraisers.

Goal Status

☒ Completed ☐ Ongoing ☐ No longer a goal

Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.

Goal 3

Brief Description

Assess continued viability of the appraisal degree.

Goal Status

☒ Completed ☐ Ongoing ☐ No longer a goal

Add any comments related to your work on prior goal (e.g., success, challenges, reasons for eliminating a goal). Describe Outcomes, if any.

We offered two appraisal courses that had failed to fill in the past, and both courses filled. Based on this recent enrollment, we have decided to continue the appraisal program and reassess if enrollment numbers fall again.

The Strategic Plan 2022 includes the College's Vision for Success (VfS) outcomes. Review the VfS goals and reflect on how your unit supports these outcomes. Identify one strategy your unit will implement to help the college meet these outcomes.

We are working to ensure the accessibility of our online course during the course evaluation process.

[Click here to access the Strategic Plan 2022.](#)

Describe any changes to your goals or three-year plan as a result of this annual update.

Among the Town Hall recommendations identified in the Sector Analysis of May 2022 from the Centers of Excellence for Labor Market Research (i.e., under "Business and Entrepreneurship") was to "review apprenticeship opportunities, including veteran apprenticeship programs, in all sectors." Accordingly, now that we have assessed the viability of the Real Estate appraisal program and decided to continue appraisal offerings, we will assess apprenticeship opportunities that are aligned with and fulfill BREA requirements.

RESOURCES

Congratulations! You are nearing completion. In this section, you will consider the resources you need to implement your three-year program review plan and/or address any findings from your assessment of your discipline.

The section is organized into the following five parts:

PART 1: Staffing Needs (Faculty and Additional Staff)

PART 2: Budget Review

PART 3: Technology Needs

PART 4: Facilities Needs

PART 5: One Time Request for Other Needs (NonTechnology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel)

Reflect upon the three year plan you created above, your current operations, and any upcoming factors (retirements, changes in legislation, and changes in policies or procedures) that will impact your unit. How will you allocate resources to implement your plan? Describe additional resources needed to improve the effectiveness of your unit/program. All resource requests must be aligned with the College's [Strategic Plan 2022](#).

Summarize any reallocation/re-organization of resources you are making based upon your three-year plan, your current operations, and any other factors (e.g., legislation). Describe the impact of the reallocation of resources to your unit.

NOTE: All requests listed in the PRP will be reviewed by deans and supervisors, then forwarded to

the appropriate review group for prioritization. A resource requests approved to move forward in the review process does NOT guarantee a position or funding.

PART 1: STAFFING NEEDS

Requests for faculty will follow the prioritization process currently in place in the Faculty Position Prioritization committee, which reports to the Education, Equity, and Student Success Council. Requests for new staff positions will be prioritized at the division level and reviewed at Exec.

Are you requesting additional full-time faculty?

☐ Yes ☒ No

Are you requesting AA, CAST for Classified Staff?

☐ Yes ☒ No

PART 2: BUDGET REVIEW

Review your Budget/Expenditure reports for fiscal year 2019, 2020, 2021. Consider your three-year PRP plan.

Click on the link below to access directions to the *Available Budget Report* to complete this section.

[How to Request the Available Budget Report](#)

Reflecting on your three-year PRP plan, are there any budget considerations you would like your dean/supervisor to be aware of for the upcoming year?

☐ Yes ☒ No

PARTS 3, 4 and 5 – TECHNOLOGY, FACILITIES AND OTHER NEEDS

1. One-Time Fund Requests. Through the PRP process the college implements an approach for prioritizing and allocating one-time needs/requests. Prioritization takes place through the appropriate groups, leadership, and the Budget Committee. The executive team and Resource Allocation Committee consider various sources for funding PRP requests. Resource requests also inform the larger planning process like Scheduled Maintenance Plans, Staffing Plans, and institutional strategic planning.

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#) (on the left menu of the webpage).

If you are a CTE program and think you may qualify for CTE funds for your PRP request(s), you are STRONGLY encouraged to answer the call for Perkins/Strong Workforce grant applications in February. Contact the Dean of CTEE for additional information.

Consider submitting one-time requests only if you have verified that you cannot fund the request using your general discretionary funds or other funds.

2. Technology and Facilities Review. Requests for technology and facilities are assessed by the Deans and then, if appropriate forwarded to the proper institutional group (e.g., technology review

committee, or facilities) for review and feedback.

PART 3: TECHNOLOGY NEEDS

Will you be requesting any technology (hardware/software) this upcoming year?

☐ Yes ☒ No

PART 4: FACILITIES REQUESTS

Do you have resource needs that require physical space or modification to physical space?

☐ Yes ☒ No

Please include only those facilities requests that could be accomplished within a one-year time frame and/or under a \$75,000 estimated amount. Other facilities needs, such as buildings or remodels, should come through the long-range facilities planning process.

PART 5: OTHER ONE-TIME NEEDS

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#). Please check with your department chair on the availability for this cycle.

Do you have one-time requests for other items (e.g., Non-technology equipment, supplies, operating expenses, travel) that your budget or other funding sources will NOT cover?

☐ Yes ☒ No

☒ **I confirm that all full-time faculty in this discipline have reviewed the PRP. The form is complete and ready to be submitted.**

Enter your email address to receive a copy of the PRP to keep for your records.

lparanthaman@palomar.edu