

Status: **Reviewed**

Entry #: 43

Date Submitted: 11/2/2020 9:16 AM

2020-2021 ANNUAL REVIEW

OVERVIEW OF PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING FOR NON-INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS

Program Review is a self-study of your unit. For non-instructional program review, the definition of what is a unit varies based upon your division. A unit may be a department (e.g., Information Services, Institutional Research and Planning, Financial Aid), a program (e.g., EOPS, TRIO), or a division (Human Resource Services). The Vice Presidents for each division have identified/defined the units that will complete the review cycle.

Regardless of whether your unit is a program, department, or division, program review is about documenting the plans you have for improving Institutional Effectiveness in your area and sharing that information with the college community. Through the review of and reflection on key elements, program review and planning identifies program strengths as well as strategies necessary to improve the operation of your area. With that in mind, please answer the following questions.

The Annual Update is designed to help you track progress on your three-year plan. It allows for updates to your plan based on:

- 1) Updates to Service Area Outcomes assessment cycle or unit data;
- 2) new events, legislation, or processes that affect your unit's ability to meet your mission; and
- 3) a review of progress on your three-year plan's goals.

BASIC UNIT INFORMATION

Program/Unit Name
Tutoring Services

Department Name
Tutoring

Division Name
English, Humanities and Reading

Name of Person responsible for the Program/Unit
Ruth Barnaba

Website address(es) for your program(s)/unit(s)

Webpage URL 1

Unit webpage

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/tutoringservices/>

Webpage URL 2

Unit webpage

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/tutoring>

Please list all participants and their respective titles in this Program Review

Participant	Title
Ruth Barnaba	Manager,
	Tutoring Services

STAFFING AND SERVICE UPDATES**Staffing**

Use the link provided to help answer the staffing questions below.

Link: [Permanent Employees Staff Count](#)

This form requires a login and password to access. Please use your Palomar email and password to log in.

Full-Time Staff**Total Number of Full-time Staff**

7.00

Number of Classified Staff

9.00

Number of CAST Staff**Number of Administrators**

1.00

Number of Full-time Faculty**Describe additional temporary hourly or contract staff who support this unit and/or department. (Include FWS/District Student Worker/Veteran Student Worker)**

One Federal Work Study assistant

50 Short-term or Student tutors

Part-Time Staff**Total Number of Permanent Part-time Staff**

3.00

FTE of Part-time Staff (2x19 hr/wk=.95)

1.70

FTEF of Part-time Faculty**Have you experienced any changes in staff this past year? If so, please describe how the changes have impacted your operations.**

Retirement of one full-time Tutoring Coordinator; Duties have been reassigned to Manager as much as possible with some duties left undone. Expansion of program outreach and scope is hindered.

Program/Unit Description

Have the services your unit performs change in any way over the past year?

Transitioned to 100% online.

Reminder: Data does not autosave. Save this content before moving to the next section or closing form.

PROGRAM/UNIT ASSESSMENT

SERVICE AREA OUTCOMES UPDATE

GOT SERVICE AREA OUTCOMES?

Outcomes are statements written in support of student learning to show direct support (instruction) or indirect support (services) provided on campus. Assessment is the way we measure how well we are achieving our outcomes.

For non-instructional areas, outcomes are called Service Area Outcomes (SAO).

So, what is an SAO?

A Service Area Outcome (SAO) is a statement about what a client will experience, receive, or know as a result of a given service. Clients can be students, faculty, staff, or community members.

As part of our three-year planning and review cycles, all non-instructional units are asked to:

- identify at least two SAOs,
- develop a plan and assess their SAOs,
- reflect on the results,
- and take action, as necessary.

Palomar has adopted Nuventive Improve (previously named TracDat) as our official repository for SLO and SAO Assessment information.

Review and/or define your SAOs and assessment plans and ensure they are entered in Nuventive Improve by:

- 1) Login to Nuventive Improve (previously TracDat) <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/sloresources/2015/08/10/tracdat/>. Your Palomar username and password is your login.
- 2) Check your SAOs for **currency** and **sunset** any SAOs if you no longer plan to assess them.
- 3) Revise or edit your current SAOs by revising their wording and/or updating the assessment and assessment results.

NEED HELP?

Nuventive Improve:

- 1) If you need help with anything Nuventive Improve related such as login, unit identification, entering SAO info, contact Marti Snyder at msnyder2@palomar.edu.
- 2) Check out this video on how to enter SAOs in Nuventive Improve: <https://youtu.be/b1sRa68wm4c>

Defining and Assessing SAOs:

Not sure if your SAOs make the grade? Need some help writing an SAO? Not sure about how to assess your SAOs?

- 1) [Hartnell's SAO Guide](#) is a nice resource! Thank you Hartnell!

- 2) Contact Michelle Barton at mbarton@palomar.edu. We have a resource support team to help.

A template for entering SAOs can be found on the [IR&Ps Non-instructional Program Review and Planning website](#)

SERVICE AREA OUTCOMES TEMPLATE					
Date Identified or Last Reviewed	Description of SAO (What is your SAO?)	Assessment Method (How will/do you measure or assess it?)	Criterion (How will/do you know if you met the outcome?)	Date of Assessment	Date of Next Assessment
1)					
2)					
3)					
4)					

Are all of your unit's SAOs and assessment plans **UPDATED** and **ENTERED** in Nuventive Improve?

Yes

SAOs Summaries / Reflection

If you have completed any SAO assessments over the past year, summarize what you learned from the assessment and what improvements you have implemented or plan to implement as a result of your SAO assessments. If you have not completed SAO assessments, document why (e.g., SAO was assessed last year).

SAOs

SAO 1

SAO Title

Students enrolled in N BASC 202 (Supervised Tutoring) who utilize STAR Tutoring services a minimum of 10 hours per semester will be more successful in their credit courses than students in similar credit courses who do not.

Assessment Status

Assessed

SAO Summary and Reflection

Studies on the effects of tutoring on student success demonstrate a significant trend: the more academic support students receive, the more likely they are to pass their courses and stay enrolled.(1). Despite our advertising efforts to increase students' awareness and understanding that tutoring is somewhat or very important to student success, only 6-10% of enrolled Palomar students use tutoring services.

Data Collection

During the 2019 Fall semester, tutoring visits were pulled from the database. Student visits were grouped by discipline and/or course. Success rates* and retention rates** were calculated by querying discipline or course grades from that same term of enrollment. These students' performance measures were compared with students campus-wide who were enrolled in tutor-supported courses but did not utilize tutoring services.

*Success is a grade of a C or better or pass.

**Retention is when a student earns any grade except a Withdrawal.

Findings for Fall 2019

Retention rates for students who received tutoring services were slightly higher than the campus-wide average for students enrolled in courses that provided tutoring support but did not utilize services, with an average increase of 3%

When looking at these same performance measures during the 2019 Fall semester, among individual disciplines and courses rather than all disciplines/courses combined, the data show greater increases in both success and retention measures for those students who utilized tutoring services - on average of 7% higher than students campus-wide. These data imply that student participation in Tutoring increases students' academic performance.

In the open-ended survey response sections, it was troubling to find evidence from the comments that students still expressed that they did not seek tutoring because they were ashamed, shy, embarrassed, or too proud to ask for assistance. The best time to mold the students perception of tutoring and demonstrate the benefits of tutoring is during the students' first semester experience.

Footnote:

1 Casazza, M. & Silverman, S. (2013). The Path to College Completion – Meaningful Access and Support. Council of Learning Assistance and Developmental Education Associations, p. 15.

SAO 2

SAO Title

Students enrolled in N BASC 202 (Supervised Tutoring) who utilize STAR Tutoring services a minimum of 10 hours per semester will have improved study skills to enhance their ability to comprehend and retain key ideas from the course.

Assessment Status

Not assessed

Next planned assessment

FALL 2021

OTHER ASSESSMENT DATA

Review the Quantitative and Qualitative Data from your comprehensive review. If there are updates please describe them below.

ACHIEVEMENTS AND OTHER RELEVANT INFORMATION

Describe your program's achievements this past year. Where possible, describe how these achievements are related to our students and their success!

Transitioned to an online format. Staff had to quickly learn how to transform our services to virtual tutor / mentor / SI leader experiential education. Staff learned how to plan and facilitate experiential learning in our academic support program. Staff developed creative techniques for opening virtual training sessions, team meetings, group sessions; cultivation of self-reflection; and activities for building bonds between staff members and students to maximize opportunities for tutor-to-peer learning.

Provide an update on recent changes in legislation, policies, procedures, processes, and/or technology (software and hardware) that have impacted or will impact your program/unit? What effect will these changes have on your program/unit?

Hope to have better tracking of program and services offered through improved Palomar Attendance Tracking 2.0 software. As of now, the software is unusable in our current delivery mode. Tracking of data is time consuming and unreliable.

The guidelines under which a tutoring program can collect apportionment after AB 705 implementation have evolved. The opportunity to collect state funding based on tutoring activity has allowed more sessions to qualify and the delivery of tutoring at Palomar should be reevaluate to capitalize on this funding opportunity.

In addition to (or in response to) the changes listed above, what board policies, procedures, and processes need to be updated, created, or deleted?

None

Reminder: Data does not autosave. Save this content before moving to the next section or closing form.

PROGRESS ON GOALS

Review the goals listed on your comprehensive review and summarize progress you have made on the strategies for implementation. If your unit has experienced challenges implementing the goals, describe those challenges.

Click on "+Add Goal" below for each additional goal.

Goals

Goal 1

Goal

Create College Algebra support group and Develop strategies that balance the college's aim to increase the academic profile of entering students

Choice

In progress

Describe Progress

Tutors stay abreast of course syllabus objectives by communicating with the math department. Selected tutors have received training on the process of group dynamics and study skill attainment. STAR creates an environment where students feel comfortable to ask questions. Math 56 study groups have been formed and are meeting Monday – Wednesday 2:00 – 4:00. Tutoring access to all registered students has increased by 8%

Describe Challenges

Current online format. Most of all math tutoring and support is provided by the Math department

Describe Outcomes (if any)

Goal 2

Goal

Create leadership and experiential opportunities for tutors and document how these learning experiences are interconnected with their program of study.

Choice

In progress

Describe Progress

Tutors are developing workshop materials on various topics providing students with the support, skills, and confidence they need to achieve academic excellence and become independent learners. To hope to develop and produce short videos of tutor's study skills aptitudes.

Describe Challenges**Describe Outcomes (if any)**

Goal 3

Goal

Enrich the student experience through creating intentional cocurricular and curricular programs, which will prepare students to successfully engage in a vibrant, complex, and culturally diverse world.

Choice

Not Started

Describe Progress**Describe Challenges****Describe Outcomes (if any)**

The Strategic Plan 2022 includes the College's Vision for Success (VfS) outcomes. Review the VfS goals and reflect on how your unit supports these outcomes. Identify one strategy your unit will implement to help the college meet these outcomes.

The ultimate aim of the College's Vision for Success is to help students complete their educational goals. As part of our department SAO's, we will take a good look at our baseline data to determine which student groups are most in need of support and assistance to reach their educational goals. Question that will be addressed: What can we as a department do to help this group move forward?

A beginning strategy is to establish a college-wide vision and culture of "tutoring for all" instead of "tutoring for remediation." Reinforce the "tutoring for all" message across the college by conducting a communications and marketing campaign that promotes the overall benefits of tutoring.

Describe any changes to your goals or three-year plan as a result of this annual update.

Co-location of tutoring services as a college-wide restructuring effort remains undetermined. I can only imagine that any decisions made in this respect will have an impact on service delivery mode and methods

Reminder: Data does not autosave. Save this content before moving to the next section or closing form.

RESOURCES

Congratulations! You are nearing completion. In this section, you will consider the resources you need to implement your three-year program review plan and/or address any findings from your assessment of your discipline.

The section is organized into the following four parts:

PART 1: Staffing Needs (Faculty and Additional Staff)

PART 2: Budget Review

PART 3: Technology and Facilities Needs

PART 4: One Time Request for Other Needs (NonTechnology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel)

Reflect upon the three year plan you created above, your current operations, and any upcoming factors (retirements, changes in legislation, and changes in policies or procedures) that will impact your unit. How will you allocate resources to implement your plan? Describe additional resources needed to improve the effectiveness of your unit/program. All resource requests must be aligned with the College's **Strategic Plan 2022.**

Summarize any reallocation/re-organization of resources you are making based upon your three-year plan, your current operations, and any other factors (e.g., legislation). Describe the impact of the reallocation of resources to your unit.

PART 1: STAFFING NEEDS

Are you requesting new Classified, CAST, or AA positions?

No

If you are requesting STAFF, please fully complete this section. If not, you can skip to the next resource section. Click "+Add Staff, CAST, AA request" below for each additional request.

When considering the funds required for a position, consult the HR website for position salary schedule and the **Benefits Worksheet for additional costs related to benefits for the position.**

PART 2: BUDGET REVIEW

What budget considerations would you like your dean/supervisor to be aware of or to consider? Please be as specific as possible. For example, if you need an increase in the 40000 account and a decrease in the 23000 account, describe what increase your department needs, how much, and a description of why the department needs the adjustment.

As Palomar transitions back to on-campus services, funding for tutors at Escondido TLC and Camp Pendleton will need to be budgeted if Equity funding is not restored.

Review your Budget/Expenditure reports for 2018, 2019, 2020. Consider your three-year PRP plan.

Click on the link below to access directions to the *Available Budget Report* to complete this section.

How to Request the Available Budget Report

Reflecting on your three-year PRP plan, are there any budget considerations you would like your dean/supervisor to be aware of for the upcoming year?

Yes

Reminder: Data does not autosave. Save this content before moving to the next section or closing form.

NOTE: PARTS 3 and 4 – TECHNOLOGY, FACILITIES AND OTHER NEEDS

This year the College is implementing two new processes related to resource needs coming from the PRP process.

1. One-Time Fund Requests. The college is implementing a process for prioritizing and allocating funds for one-time needs/requests tied to Program Review and Planning. Prioritization will take place through participatory governance in planning councils and the Budget Committee. Then, a recommendation will be made to Exec for funding of request utilizing various funding sources.

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#) (on the left menu of the web page).

Consider submitting one-time requests only if you have verified that you cannot fund the request using your general discretionary funds or other funds.

2. Technology and Facilities Review. From now on, ALL requests for technology will go through an institutional process. If you request technology here, you will see a description of the process below.

PART 3: TECHNOLOGY

Will you be requesting any technology (hardware/software) this upcoming year?

Yes

Technology Request

Technology Request 1

What are you requesting?

MacBook Pro

Provide a detailed description of the technology item requested. What is it, and why do you need it? Please be as descriptive as possible. Include in your description how the requested item aligns with your discipline's PRP goals, analysis of PRP data, SLO/SAOs.

This Mac computer will allow Tutoring Manager to monitor student support services in the same format as desktop computer. The Apple operating system provides unique and helpful features that are easy to manipulate and share between devices.

Estimated Amount of Request.

\$2,603.00

Will you fund the request through your budget or other sources?

One Time Request

What PRP plan goal/objective does this request align with?

1,2,3

What Strategic Plan 2022 Goal/Objective does this request align with?

1:5

2:3

3:3

If you have multiple requests for technology and had to prioritize, what number would give this? (1 = Highest)

Do you think that your request for technology will require changes to a facility?

No

Note about technology requests:

All technology requests will now go through a review process before prioritization.

- *Your director will send you a Technology Request Checklist (aka Technology Proposal Analysis Checklist).*
 - *You must complete this checklist and return it to your director no later than 10/30/2020.*
 - *Once the director approves the form and the request, the director will send the document to the Technology Review Committee to determine IS resources needed, any integration issues, and/or potential overlap with existing technology.*
 - *The results of the review will be sent to the director with feedback.*
 - *The director will determine whether or not the request moves forward for prioritization and/or implementation.*
 - *Requests for one-time funding will move forward for prioritization.*
 - *Requests that use funding from your department budget may move forward for purchase.*

PART 3: FACILITIES NEEDS

Do you have resource needs that require physical space or modification to physical space?

No

PART 4: ONE TIME NEEDS

For more information about funding sources available, see [IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES](#) (on the left menu of the web page under "Instructional Funding Sources").

Do you have one-time requests for other items (e.g., Non-Technology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel) that your budget or other funding sources will NOT cover?

Yes

Requests

Request 1

What are you requesting?

Up-to-date textbooks

Estimated Amount of Request.

\$2,000.00

Will you accept partial funding?

Yes

Budget Category

Supplies

What PRP plan goal/objective does this request align with?

1,2,3

What Strategic Plan 2022 Goal/Objective does this request align with?

Provide a detailed description of the item requested. What is it, and why do you need it? Please be as descriptive as possible. Include in your description how the requested item aligns with your discipline's PRP goals, analysis of PRP data, SLO/SAOs.

Access to up-to-date resources allows us to provide consistent and effective tutoring services.

Please upload a copy of the quote, if available.

Reminder: Data does not autosave. Save this content before moving to the next section or closing form.

FEEDBACK AND FOLLOW-UP

Once your Program/Unit PRP is completed, your division or planning council should review and discuss based on your Vice President's planning process. This area is intended for summary feedback and recommendations from the divisional review.

Confirmation of Review by Division / Planning Council

Person/Group/Council who reviewed PRP:

Dr. Fabienne S. Chauderlot

Date Reviewed

11/10/2020

FEEDBACK

Strengths and successes of the program/unit as evidenced by the data, analysis, and assessments:

The STAR programs and centers are very well organized and managed around the principle of student centered quality services and that is well illustrated in this detailed review. The team has been able to adjust to the all online environment with remarkable flexibility and creativity which is a reflection of the sound no-nonsense and experience leadership of the manager as well as the great work ethics of the center managers and their colleagues.

Areas of Concern, if any:

Staff have taken on the role of regular tutors and a pool will have to be rebuilt upon return on campus but the team is efficient.

Recommendations for improvement:

None at this time

Enter your email address to receive a copy of the PRP to keep for your records.

fchauderlot@palomar.edu

I confirm that the Program Review is complete and ready to be submitted.

Yes

Vice President Review

Strengths and successes of of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

transition to online tutoring with COVID; the expressed desire (as part of Goal 2) to provide growth opportunities for tutors; tutoring for all vs. tutoring for remediation

Areas of concern, if any:

transitioning back to in-person tutoring with a return to business as usual -- an opportune moment to rethink how tutoring is to be done at the college

Recommendations for improvement:

1. consider lessons learned with OL tutoring and possible increase in access to students; what can and should be continued OL? How?
2. use supply budget to purchase textbooks (as available) rather than one-time funds

VP Name:

Shayla Sivert

Signature Date:

12/30/2020