Status: **Reviewed**

**Entry #:** 296

**Date Submitted:** 9/14/2020 1:30 PM

# OVERVIEW OF PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING FOR INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS

Program Review  is about documenting the plans you have for improving student success in your program and sharing that information with the community. Through the review of and reflection on key program elements, program review and planning identifies program strengths as well as strategies necessary to improve the academic discipline, program, or service to support student success. With our new Guided Pathways plan, this review becomes even more crucial for the success of our students and college.

We are using the Strengths, Opportunities, Aspirations, Results (SOAR) strategic planning technique  to help us focus on our current strengths and opportunities, create a vision of future aspirations, and consider the results of this approach.

## BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

**Academic Year**
2020-2021

**Are you completing a comprehensive or annual PRP?**
Annual

**Department Name**
Business Administration

**Discipline Name**
Real Estate (RE)

**Department Chair Name**
Jackie Martin

**Division Name**
Arts, Media and Business Administration

**Website address for your discipline**
https://www.palomar.edu/business

**Discipline Mission statement**
The Real Estate program at Palomar College program involves the study of California real estate principles, practices, procedures, and law. It offers courses that fulfill the educational requirements to sit for the California Real Estate Salesperson and Broker examinations as well as some educational requirements for the BREA appraisal examination Courses also respond to the educational needs of students interested in related real estate careers or obtaining a general knowledge about real estate.

**(click here for information on how to create a mission statement)**

**Does your discipline have at least one degree or certificate associated with it?**
Yes

**Are any of your programs TOP coded as vocational (CTE/CE)?**
Yes

**List all degrees and certificates offered within this discipline.**
Real Estate Appraisal License Preparation (CP)
Real Estate Broker License Preparation (AS, CA)
Real Estate Sales Person License Preparation (CP)

**Please list the names and positions of everyone who helped to complete this document.**
Lakshmi Paranthaman
Jackie Martin

Use the link to provided to help answer the staffing questions below. This form requires a login and password to access. Please use your Palomar email and password to log in.

Link: Permanent Employees Staff Count

**Full-time Faculty (total number of FT faculty in your discipline)**
1

**Full-time Faculty (FTEF)**
.2

**Part-time faculty (FTEF)**
1.6

**Classified and other permanent staff positions that support this discipline**
ADA, ISAIII (with publications, but no tutoring)

**Additional hourly staff that support this discipline and/or department**
N/A

# PROGRAM INFORMATION

In this section you are asked to consider your programs, their learning outcomes, the annual number of completions, goals for completions and enrollment and efficiency trends.

## PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES

Begin this section by reviewing the Program Review reports for programs and courses in Nuventive Improve (TracDat). All active course and program learning outcomes should be systematically assessed over a 3-year cycle. First, look at program learning outcomes.

- **Program** = Leads to a degree or certificate
- **Discipline** = A group of courses within a discipline

*Programs will be able to complete program completion and outcome questions.

**How well do your program's learning outcomes communicate the scope and depth of the degree/certificate offered?**
Each of the four Real Estate Programs offered align with the outcomes of the program which is to enter the real estate industry as real estate professionals. The outcomes also communicate the depth of this CTE program in that each degree or certificate helps to prepare the student to pass an industry specific real estate license exam. Employers of course, require these licensees in this field.

**How do they align with employer and transfer expectations?**
Courses provide the required education for the California Salesperson and Broker Licensing exams. A real estate license meets the employer expectations for hire.

**Describe your program's plan for assessing program learning outcomes.**
All FT and adjunct faculty are asked to assess course SLO's and provide supporting data and their interpretation of that data for course evaluation at periodic intervals (yearly or bi-annually).

**Summarize the major findings of your program outcomes assessments.**
We have created the program learning objectives and tied them to courses. Unfortunately, the drop in success rates does not meet the PLO for minimum success rate. If this trend continues, we may have to take action to make sure we are providing the support our students need to be successful.

## PROGRAM COMPLETIONS

Student success is at the core of what we do in assisting students in achieving their goals.

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of Program Completion as a major goal for our students. In addition, transfer and career readiness are key components of Palomar College's mission statement. This year, our funding formula has also changed reflecting this emphasis, providing additional funding as a function of the number of completions.

In this section we will identify a program standard and a stretch goal (what you would like to move toward) for program completions.

The standards represent the lowest number of program completions deemed acceptable by the College.  In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the set standard, you would seek further information to examine why this occurred and strategies to increase completions.

In this section we will identify a program standard and a stretch goal (what you would like to move toward) for programs.

**List the number of completions for each degree/certificate for the previous year.**
2019-2020

AA/AS 1
Certificate CAL 1
Certificate CPE 12

Total = 14

**Have your program completions Increased, decreased, or stayed the same over the last 5 years?**
Stayed the same

**What factors have influenced your completion trends?**
Completions stayed the same from 14 completions in 2018-2019.

## Program Information Summary

Consider your program outcome assessments, completions, and enrollment/efficiency trends, as well as other internal and external factors.

**How have these factors contributed to the success of your program(s)?**
The more successful completions, the more students are likely to qualify for the licensing exams.

**How have these factors presented challenges for your program(s)?**
Our completion rate for real estate may not be accurate if we are relying on students to request their certificates rather than determining whether they completed the necessary courses to receive a certificate. For example, our CPE aligns with the courses required to take the CA Real Estate Salesperson Exam. Students completing these courses may just take the external licensing exam without notifying the registrar of their certificate completion since passing the licensing exam indicates the courses have been taken and is the desired requirement of the job market.

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of reducing equity gaps through faster improvements of underrepresented groups.

ACCJC also requires that colleges establish institutional and program level standards in the area of success rates. These standards represent the lowest success rate deemed acceptable by the College. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the rate, you would seek further information to examine why the drop occurred and strategies to address the rate.

**Click on this link to review the course success rates (A, B, C, or Credit) for your discipline.**

In this section we will identify a course success rate standards and a stretch goal (what you would like to move toward) for programs.

Course Success Rates by gender, age, ethnicity, special population, location, and modality (You can access the Student Equity Plan on the SSEC website https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ssec/ )

# COURSE INFORMATION

## COURSE SUCCESS AND RETENTION

**What is your program's standard for Discipline COURSE Success Rate?**
70.0%

**Why did you choose this standard?**
70% - In alignment with college's course success rate, as well as the DRE licensing exam minimum for passing the California Salesperson Exam.

**What is your stretch goal for course success rates?**
75.0%

**How did you decide upon the goal?**
Same rationale as for our program goal of 70%.

## COURSE LEARNING OUTCOMES

**How have you improved course-level assessment methods since the last PRP?**
No, we have not recently taken additional steps to improve our assessment methods.

**Summarize the major findings of your course outcomes assessments.**
This year we saw a drop in success rates to 66.2% but a 3 point increase in retention to 93.6%. This may mean that some students that should have dropped the course remained. It also is aligned with the overall drop in school success rates.

The course level SLO's indicate an attainment of programmatic learning outcomes for foundational knowledge, computation, and analysis and problem solving/critical reasoning, but have not yet been mapped to assess outcomes based on ethics in the newly created PLO's as ethics are integrated into each course.

**This section is intentionally blank for annual PRPs. Please click "Next" to continue.**

**This section is intentionally blank for annual PRPs. Please click "Next" to continue.**

# CAREER AND LABOR MARKET DATA

**The following websites are for CTE related data:**

- Centers of Excellence (many other data resources besides supply and demand) Password: GetLMI
- LaunchBoard
- LaunchBoard Resource Library
- Chancellor's Office Data Mart
- Career Coach-San Diego Workforce Partnership
- EDD Labor Market Info
- Career One Stop

**Do you want more information about or need assistance integrating work-based learning into your program?**
No

**What is the regional three-year projected occupational growth for your program(s)?**
Employment of real estate brokers and sales agents is projected to grow 6 percent from 2016 to 2026, about as fast as the average for all occupations.

There will be a continued demand for real estate brokers and sales agents, since people turn to them when looking for a larger home, relocating for a new job, and for other reasons. Employment is projected to grow along with the real estate market.

The millennial generation will be entering the prime working-age and household-forming age cohort over the next decade. This generation has delayed home ownership because of financial and personal considerations. Therefore, their entry into the housing market should increase demand for real estate agents and brokers.

An improving job market and rising consumer spending also will drive demand for brokers and agents to handle commercial, retail, and industrial real estate transactions.

However, tighter credit regulations and increasing real estate prices may cause some people to continue renting as opposed to entering the housing market.

The real estate market is highly sensitive to fluctuations in the economy, and employment of real estate brokers and agents will vary accordingly. In periods of economic growth or stability, employment should grow to accommodate people looking to buy homes and businesses looking to expand office or retail space. Alternatively, during periods of declining economic activity or rising interest rates, the amount of work for brokers and agents will slow and employment may decline.

**What is being done at the program level to assist students with job placement and workforce preparedness?**
Career Programming
Last year, Professor Paranthaman coordinated a real estate career panel to talk about their respective careers and roles during the escrow process. The panel consisted of a Real Estate Broker of Record, a Mortgage Broker, an Escrow Officer, and a Transaction Coordinator. She also hosts webinars with real estate professionals in her online courses, for example, with the Chief Growth Officer for Keller Williams and a Vice-President of the Appraisal Institute. She makes these live webinars available to any current real estate student. Some faculty also offer extra credit for informational interviews with legal professionals and for attending professional events with local law organizations.

Career Resources
Professor Paranthaman created informational interviewing and resume guides with scripts and step-by-step instructions for Palomar real estate students, in addition to an extensive list of local professional real estate organizations that offer free or low-cost student memberships. Some faculty provide extra credit for participation in professional real estate events to encourage networking.

Expanding Work Experience Opportunities/Internships
Professor Paranthaman is scheduled to meet with a local real estate brokerage to discuss potential internship opportunities for students interested in exploring real estate sales careers. She would also like to work with the BREA to discuss the creation of case based and clinical education for students to earn appraisal hours toward their licensing requirements and local city zoning/permitting offices to establish internship opportunities. She would also be interested in exploring whether there might be property management opportunities on campus if Palomar College moves forward with its plans to create on-campus housing.

**When was your program's last advisory meeting held? What significant information was learned from that meeting?**
May 13th, 2020. Business and Industry Advisory Roundtable, conducted online.

The Advisory Program in the business department brings in professionals from the community to advise the department administration and discipline experts on potential internship opportunities as well as to provide input on needed skills for professional success or new programs.

**What are the San Diego County/Imperial County Job Openings?**
2012-2022, Long Term

Job Title Industry Job Openings Job Postings
Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers Community and Civic Organizations 94 629
Property, Real Estate, and Community Association Managers Financial Services and Real Estate 839 629
Appraisers and Assessors of Real Estate Financial Services and Real Estate 73 35
Real Estate Brokers Financial Services and Real Estate 178 80
Real Estate Sales Agents Financial Services and Real Estate 450 476
Title Examiners, Abstractors, and Searchers Financial Services and Real Estate 171 4
Title Examiners, Abstractors, and Searchers Professional and Technical Services 46 4
Job Openings Total: 1,852

The Chancellor's Office Vision for Success stresses the importance of increasing the percent of exiting students who report being employed in their field of study. It is important for us to consider how **_all_** of our programs connect to future careers.

Go to this website https://www.onetonline.org/ and enter your discipline in the bubble on the top right for ideas about potential occupations. Click on an example to see more detail.

**What kinds of careers are available for people who complete your programs (and/or transfer)? (Refer to link above) Are there any new or emerging careers and if so how would the new or emerging careers impact your future planning?**
Real Estate Sales Agent, Real Estate Broker, Mortgage Broker, Loan Officer, Real Estate Appraiser/Assessor, Financial Examiner, Real Estate Paralegal/Legal Assistant, Real Estate Investment Analyst, Property Manager, Asset Manager, Construction and Building Inspectors, Post-secondary Education Teacher, Title Examiners, Abstractors & Searchers, Small Business Brokers, Real Estate Investor

**What are the associated knowledge, skills, abilities (KSA's) needed for the occupations listed above? (click examples in the link above to get ideas)**
Knowledge
Knowledge of (1) federal, state and local laws related to real estate and the real estate profession, (2) economic and accounting principles and practices, the financial markets, banking and the analysis and reporting of financial data, (3) materials, methods, and the tools involved in the construction or repair of houses, buildings, or other structures such as highways and roads, (4) principles and methods for showing, promoting, and selling products or services, (5) structure and content of the English language including the meaning and spelling of words, rules of composition, and grammar, (6) arithmetic, algebra, geometry at a minimum and calculus, statistics, and more advanced math for careers like appraisal and planning, (7) business and management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, production methods, and coordination of people and resources, and (8) administrative and clerical procedures and systems such as word processing, managing files and records, (9) applied computer, software, and technology proficiency.
Skills:
Active Listening, Problem-Solving, Collecting & Analyzing Data/Information, Customer Service, Coordination, Communication (Verbal and Written), Reading Comprehension, Negotiation, Persuasion, Teaching/Explaining the Meaning of Information to Others, Judgment & Critical Thinking, Mathematical Reasoning, Organizational, Planning and Time-Management skills, Clerical, Computer and Administration skills, Active Learning, Self-Motivation & Persistence
Abilities:
Oral Comprehension, Oral Expression, Written Comprehension, Problem Sensitivity, Speech Clarity, Speech Recognition, Inductive and Deductive Reasoning, Near Vision (especially for Inspection/Appraisal)

**How does your program help students build these KSA's?**
Course reading, lectures, exams, research papers, problems for application of learning, some courses offer collaborative learning exercises in class, professional panels/interviews

**Work Based Learning**

Applied and work-based learning (WBL) allows students to apply classroom content in professional settings while gaining real-word experience. WBL exists on a continuum that reflects the progress of experiences from awareness-building to training. Students often cycle back through the continuum many times throughout college and throughout their career. Faculty play a critical role in ensuring these experiences are embedded into curriculum and support learning.

**Have you incorporated work based learning (work experience, internships, and/or service learning) into your program?**
No

**How do you engage with the community to keep them apprised of opportunities in your program?**
In addition to our annual community advisory meeting, we regularly meet with individuals currently working in real estate for input as well as local real estate organizations. Many of our adjunct faculty are currently working as real estate professionals in the community outside of their teaching. We also recently wrote advertising copy to highlight our real estate program in our course catalog and work with Palomar News for coverage related to the program.

# Program Goals

In the previous sections, you identified opportunities for improvement.  Using these opportunities, develop 3-year SMART goals for your department.  Goals should be Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Relevant, Time-Specific. Ensure your goals align with the mission of your department and/or the College's strategic plan.

Please list all discipline goals for this three-year planning cycle. Click here for previous PRPs and goal information.

## Goals

### Goal 1

**Brief Description**
Update Real Estate Courses of Record to Align with new C-ID model courses

| **Is this a new or existing goal?** | **Goal Status** |
| --- | --- |
| New | Ongoing |
| Existing | |

**How will you complete this goal?**
Draft updates to courses of record based on areas of difference with new C-ID model courses

**Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)**
Updated drafts for school approval

**How does this goal align with your department mission statement, the college strategic plan, and /or Guided Pathways?**
This should help our goal of teaching effectiveness and student learning by ensuring an updated, relevant curriculum and easier transfer to other schools within California through articulation agreements (which furthers transfer to 4 year universities, if applicable for real estate courses).

**Expected Goal Completion Date**
1/31/2021

### Goal 2

**Brief Description**
Update course SLO's and map them to PLO's in TracDat

| **Is this a new or existing goal?** | **Goal Status** |
| --- | --- |
| Existing | Ongoing |

**How will you complete this goal?**
Update SLO's with adjunct faculty input (and also alignment with C-ID model courses and external licensing organization criteria) and research measurable assessment methods.

**Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)**
Write and update new course SLO's and tie to PLO's in TracDat.

**How does this goal align with your department mission statement, the college strategic plan, and /or Guided Pathways?**
This should help our goal of teaching effectiveness and student learning by ensuring comprehensive assessment of learning objectives.

**Expected Goal Completion Date**
8/31/2021

# RESOURCES

Congratulations!  You are nearing completion.  In this section, you will consider the resources you need to implement your three-year program review plan and/or address any findings from your assessment of your discipline.

The section is organized into the following four parts:

PART 1: Staffing Needs (Faculty and Additional Staff)

PART 2: Budget Review

PART 3: Technology and Facilities Needs

PART 4: One Time Request for Other Needs (NonTechnology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel)

## PART 1: STAFFING NEEDS

Requests for faculty will follow the prioritization process currently in place in IPC, and the IPC SubCommittee. Requests for new staff positions will be prioritized at the division level and reviewed at Exec.

**Are you requesting additional full-time faculty?**
No

*NOTE: If you are requesting full-time faculty, you must go back to the Labor Market section of the form to complete that section. It is required when requesting additional faculty positions.*

**Are you requesting new Classified, CAST or AA positions?**
No

## PART 2: BUDGET REVIEW

Review your Budget/Expenditure reports for 2018, 2019, 2020.  Consider your three-year PRP plan.

Click on the link below to access directions to the *Available Budget Report* to complete this section.

How to Request the Available Budget Report

**Reflecting on your three-year PRP plan, are there any budget considerations you would like your dean/supervisor to be aware of for the upcoming year?**
No

## *NOTE: PARTS 3 and 4 – TECHNOLOGY, FACILITIES AND OTHER NEEDS*

This year the College is implementing two new processes related to resource needs coming from the PRP process.

1. One-Time Fund Requests. The college is implementing a process for prioritizing and allocating funds for one-time needs/requests tied to Program Review and Planning.  Prioritization will take place through participatory governance in planning councils and the Budget Committee.  Then, a recommendation will be made to Exec for funding of request utilizing various funding sources.

   For more information about funding sources available, see IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES.

   Consider submitting one-time requests only if you have verified that you cannot fund the request using your general discretionary funds or other funds.

2. Technology and Facilities Review.  From now on, ALL requests for technology will go through an institutional review process.  If you request technology here, you will see a description of the process below.

## PART 3:  TECHNOLOGY AND FACILITIES NEEDS

**Will you be requesting any technology (hardware/software) this upcoming year?**
No

**Do you have resource needs that require physical space or modification to physical space?**
No

## PART 4: OTHER ONE-TIME NEEDS

For more information about funding sources available, see IELM BLOCK GRANT, LOTTERY, PERKINS AND STRONG WORKFORCE GUIDELINES. Please check with your department chair on the availability for this cycle.

**Do you have one-time requests for other items (e.g., Non-Technology Equipment, Supplies, Operating Expenses, Travel) that your budget or other funding sources will NOT cover?**
No

**I confirm that the Program Review is complete and ready to be submitted.**
Yes

**Enter your email address to receive a copy of the PRP to keep for your records.**
Lparanthaman@palomar.edu

## Review

## Chair Review

**Chair Comments**
Excellent work on the PRP Lakshmi. I especially like the first Goal of updating the courses to the new C-ID models for Real Estate.

Also, impressed with what you and other faculty are doing in the area of bringing in panels of professionals, recording for webinars, creation of information interview and resume guides with step by step instructions for RE students, etc. Also, bringing in internship opportunities, plans for working with BREA for students to earn appraisal hours, and exploring property management opportunities at Palomar related to potential campus housing.

Such important improvements in this program for our students. Awesome.

| | |
|---|---|
| **Chair Name** | **Chair Sign Date** |
| Jackie Martin | 10/19/2020 |

## Dean Review

**Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:**
Great work. Despite a slight dip last year, the program has demonstrated solid growth over the last 4 years.

**Areas of Concern, if any:**
Success rates for younger students and minority students are definitively below the college's institutional standard.
There may be ways to examine these classes and determine why retention remains good while the success rates are a little lower than we would hope.

**Recommendations for improvement:**
None

| | |
|---|---|
| **Dean Name** | **Dean Sign Date** |
| Justin Smiley | 11/6/2020 |

## IPC Review

**Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:**

**Areas of Concern, if any:**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

| | |
|---|---|
| **IPC Reviewer(s)** | **IPC Review Date** |

## Vice President Review

**Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:**
clear understanding of connection to PLOs and courses and how best to address student needs by impacting instruction

**Areas of Concern, if any:**
1. ensuring that all eligible students receive certificate
2. no WBL
3. general outcomes for goals

**Recommendations for improvement:**
1. devising a strategy for notifying students when they are on track to complete a certificate that semester -- work with dean and Student Services for supporting info; also be sure to understand financial aid and veteran implications
2. meet with dean and Nichol Roe to discuss WBL and Career Continuum so that you have a solid understanding of the institutional support provided; may help focus your own efforts differently and more effectively
3. rewrite goals to make them more specific and easily measured for attainment or progress towards meeting the goal

| | |
|---|---|
| **Vice President Name** | **Vice President Sign Date** |
| Shayla Sivert | 1/3/2021 |