

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.



Program Review & Planning (PRP)

PART 1: BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

Program Review and Planning is the means by which faculty, staff, and/or administrators complete a self-evaluation of an academic discipline, program, or service. The self-evaluation includes an analysis of both quantitative and qualitative data on how the academic discipline, program, or service is supporting the mission and strategic planning of Palomar College in meeting the educational and career interests of students.

Service Area:	<i>Instruction</i>
Department Name:	<i>STAR Tutoring</i>
Division Name:	<i>Languages and Literature</i>

Please list all participants in this Program Review:

Name	Position
<i>Ruth Barnaba</i>	<i>Manager, Tutoring Services</i>
<i>Greg Thomas</i>	<i>Tutoring Coordinator</i>
<i>Leticia Murillo</i>	<i>Proctoring / Tutoring Assistant</i>

Number of Full Time Staff	3	Number of Part Time Staff	3
----------------------------------	----------	----------------------------------	----------

Please list the Classified positions (and their FTE) that support this discipline:

<i>Greg Thomas - 100% Tutoring Coordinator</i>	<i>Thomas Denny - 45% Tutor</i>
<i>Leticia Murillo - 100% Proctor</i>	<i>Patricia Robinson - 45% Tutor</i>
<i>Richard Sauerheber - 80% Tutor</i>	

What additional hourly staff support this discipline and/or department:

30 short-term and student tutors
1 short-term Tutorial Assistant

PART 2: PROGRAM REFLECTION

Describe your proudest moments or achievements related to student success and outcomes.

Our department is a constant work-in-progress. We do not provide a "one-size fits all" type of service. We are proud to offer varied pathways to learning to all of our students - one-on-one tutoring, appointments, group, directed study, review sessions and workshops. Thus, our accomplishments are varied. The success of our program can be attributed to innovative and dedicated staff and students.

1.) *Our 2017 Tutor Retreat - a platform for staff to learn from each other and work cooperatively*

- Brought our staff together as a unit with a common goal of developing and promoting independent learners, integrated new tutors
- Strengthened our commitment to student awareness of diversity. Understanding the nuances behind the diversity of our students is useful
- Evaluated current practices and policies to determine usefulness and relevance
- Established core values and goals
- It's everybody's job to make our Center a success

2.) *A student earning a hard, fought-for grade after many days/weeks of hard work and tutor guided study. We applaud work ethic, commitment and growth.*

3.) *Writing for and earning CRLA tutor training certification for an additional five years.*

What areas or activities are you working on this year to improve your program/service area? Please respond to new data as well as feedback from last year's program review.

Attempt to reduce any stigma that accessing tutoring may produce both internally and externally. In informal verbal surveys of students that do not get tutoring, I found that a 'Scarlet Letter' effect is still perceived by students and some faculty. Need to focus outreach and marketing campaigns on the benefits and achievements attainable with the use of tutoring. Accessing tutoring should signal to the individual student that they are doing something positive for their academic progress and signal to fellow students that maybe they too can garner some benefit from any of our services. Tutoring is not only for poor performers. Highlighting the advantage of utilizing tutoring may increase interest, faculty recommendations, and student utilization. Academic support is not sexy and almost requires a cultural acceptance that everyone has faults and can improve. Admitting fault is similar to becoming a pariah unless you're high achieving and even then it's not celebrated.

The move to the new LRC in the Summer of 2018 will help us create inviting spaces that will draw in students from all levels of achievement. Currently we serve only about 3% of the student body. Our efforts will increase this percentage to 5 - 8%. Academic support needs a broad integration into the campus climate to overcome the culture of non-acceptance (both in the classroom and out of it), a physical space that is welcoming with a low-threshold for engagement, and events and functions that celebrate individual achievement for all levels without prioritizing the very best or very worst.

We have been active participants on the Tutoring Committee for the past four years in an effort to be a part of the tutoring conversation and to facilitate collaboration with other tutoring areas on campus. Also, we have worked to assure that our tutors are vetted by the discipline they tutor for in advance of their beginning their assignments.

Have there been any unanticipated factors that have affected the progress of your previous plan?

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

Tutorial services throughout Palomar College need stable, institutionalized funding. It is difficult to do long range planning with multiple funding sources that fluctuate on a yearly basis.

STAR Tutoring will continue to do marketing and outreach. There are still many students and faculty who don't know about the myriad of tutoring services available on campus. We will continue to collaborate with departments, determining how our services can support student success through tutoring, workshops, and special programs.

What are your Service Area Outcomes (SAO)?

1. Students enrolled in N BASC 202 (Supervised Tutoring) who utilize STAR Tutoring services a minimum of 10 hours per semester will be more successful in their credit courses than students in similar credit courses who do not.
2. Students enrolled in N BASC 202 (Supervised Tutoring) who utilize STAR Tutoring services a minimum of 10 hours per semester will have improved study skills to enhance their ability to comprehend and retain key ideas from the course.

Summarize your planned Service Area Outcomes (SAO) results from last year and your implemented or planned follow-up:

Student outcomes were measured using three metrics:

- *completion rate - the percentage of students who remained enrolled in tutored courses for the entire term*
- *success rate - the number of passing grades achieved in the course being tutored in*
- *Student perception of success*

The STAR Tutoring Center provides academic support to all Palomar College students for the courses they are enrolled in. STAR Tutoring does not have tutors for every single class offered at Palomar but we do have tutors in most all high demand courses. STAR tutors are also available to assist with study techniques such as Organization and time management, note taking techniques, course anxiety, calculator tips, problem-solving skills, the ability to analyze information, communication skills, listening skills - all applicable to any course. Our goal is to create an open atmosphere of learning, with the purpose of encouraging dialogue among students in order to share techniques for academic success.

In the Spring 2016 semester, STAR Tutoring received funds from Student Equity Council for the specific purpose of tutoring targeted populations on an appointment basis. Marketing efforts were amplified with the goal to increase enrollments in the following student sub-groups: Latino, African-American, Students with Disabilities, Ages 25-49, Veterans and Foster Youth. The "intention to treat" effect may have had an impact in our statistics. No attempt was made to determine student's course preparedness before or after accessing tutorial services. How students are placed into the courses, the requirements that govern their completion and student unit load are different for each - all variables that ultimately affect our estimations.

Snapshot of The STAR Tutoring Center

*Tutors: 73% are peer tutors - students at Palomar or CSUSM
17% earned a Bachelor's degree or higher*

*Tutee population- 3% are enrolled in noncredit courses only, 38% are part-time (under 12 units), 59% are full-time (12+ units)
43% are male, 52% female, 5% not determined. Our student tutees reflect the diversity of the college.*

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

The STAR Tutoring Center had:

	Fall 2016		Spring 2017	
<i>Total # of Palomar students</i>	24874		25051	
<i>Total Students tutored</i>	660	2.6% of total	676	2.7% of total
<i>Total Tutoring Hours</i>	3541	An additional 1056 hours Student Equity hours were unreported	3116	An additional 1122 hours Student Equity hours were unreported
<i>Total Equity eligible students enrolled in tutoring (unduplicated)</i>	495	75% of the total number tutored	527	78% of the total number tutored
<i># of Courses tutored</i>	125		118	
<i># of New tutors trained</i>	7		4	

Appointments (Spring 2017)

103 students took advantage of STAR's tutoring appointments

605 individual appointments were scheduled, 545 appointments were attended à 90% attendance!

6 ACCT	12 CSIS	25 PHYSICS
6 ASL	9 ECON	35 PSYC (STATS)
1 BUS	62 ENG	4 READ
48 CHEM	48 ESL	
	289 MATH	

Grades earned by those using appointments

A 167	D 8	NP 2
B 156	F 21	W 12
C 145	P 22	NG 12

Completion Rate:

In Spring 2017, grade data was captured for 676 tutees. Data was manually downloaded from Peoplesoft Student Records. Of the 676, 83% were retained in their class. This percentage may only account for "treatment on the treated" effect. That is, are only motivated and informed students accessing tutoring services? Are these students also receiving services at other Centers? It is difficult to pinpoint what is the true cause of the higher completion rate other than stating that accessing tutoring in any form can increase the likelihood that a student will successfully complete their course. The overall college average hovers around 79%. After accounting for selection (students that sought out tutoring), tutored students are less likely to drop their course suggesting that tutoring may increase persistence. Students who received STAR Center tutoring services during the 2016–2017 academic year had an overall course retention rate 4% higher than the campus-wide average for students enrolled in courses that provided tutoring support but did not utilize STAR Center services.

Success Rate:

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

Of the 84% that remained in their course 73% received a passing grade of C or better, 9% received a D. The overall passing rate at Palomar College is approx. 71%.

Student perception of success:

Exit surveys completed by 182 students using the STAR Tutoring Center indicate:

Q1. STAR tutoring service received, on a scale from 0-3 (lowest to highest), as it relates to course success, understanding and confidence in the tutored course 0 = 1.1% (n=2); 1 = 12.6% (n=23); 2 = 24.2% (n=44); 3 = 62.1% (n=113)

Q2. Sessions attended:

1-3: 15.4% (n=28) 4-7: 15.9% (n=29) 8-12: 22.5% (n=41) 12-16: 15.4% (n=28) 17+: 30.8% (n=56)

Q3. Service received, overall, on a scale from 0-3 (very bad to very good).

0 = 1.1% (n=2); 1 = 4.4% (n=8); 2 = 15.9% (n=29); 3 = 78.6% (n=143)

Q4. Office hours sufficiently meeting needs/demand, on a scale of 0-2 (not at all to definitely):

0 = 1.1% (n=2); 1 = 55.8% (n=101); 2 = 43.1% (n=78);

Although control groups and regression analysis were not completed, the results of our surveys correlate the positive impact of tutoring on students' academic performance and retention in college. Students who were tutored had lower frequencies for withdrawing and higher frequencies for retention. Propensity Score Matching studies could be done to separate causation and correlation of tutoring intervention. What we do know is that course success has an impact on graduation rates. (IRP)

Summarize your planned Service Area Outcomes (SAO) assessment activities for the current academic year:

Data is collected on Satisfaction and Frequency of service usage. Each term STAR tracks students who have used at least 5 hours of tutoring services per term to determine their rate of persistence and achievement. Our goal is to have students pass their tutored course at the same rate or better as non-tutored students and will demonstrate independent application of learning strategies. Exit evaluations and student self-reports are collected throughout the term.

Sustain our learning center team by training new tutors, developing innovative special projects, and gauging the pulse of student needs, programs are way we will be able to respond to changing demographics and learning needs of our diverse student population.

PART 3: PROGRAM GOALS

1. Progress on Previous Year's Goals: Please list discipline goals from the previous year's reviews and provide an update by placing an "X" the appropriate status box .

Goal	Completed	Ongoing	No longer a goal
Expand the number of tutoring hours available in all subjects and disciplines. Funds from Student Success and Equity Council were used to support one-on-one appointment based tutoring activities as selected for its potential to address critical issues related to increasing college readiness and ultimately to close achievement gaps defined by race/ethnicity/age or socioeconomic status		X if funding continues	
STAR Tutoring will start recording and posting Student Remediation videos		In	

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

on our web site. Topics have been identified. Tutors have been selected. Working on getting software and hardware.		progress	
Continue to work with the Tutoring Advisory group to enhance the reputation and reach of Tutoring at Palomar College.		X	

2. New Goals: Please list all goals for this three-year planning cycle (including those continued from previous planning cycle):

Goal #1	
Goal	<i>Create a virtual lab that can be accessed from laptops and utilize video clips that offer tutoring in specific course content.</i>
Strategies for implementation	<i>Obtain hardware and software for recording and editing video and content Create storyboards outlining the targeted content and study skill techniques to be emphasized</i>
Timeline for implementation	<i>Spring 2018</i>
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	<i>Students may refer to these recorded sessions as needed or as assigned. This activity will facilitate students insights into learning and learning processes.</i>
Goal #2	
Goal	<i>Facilitate the implementation of an efficient data collection system.</i>
Strategies for implementation	<i>Work with Information services and attend conference workshops that highlight systems that are in use by other colleges Determine if systems can work with systems already in place at Palomar Create a cost analysis for presentation to Executive team.</i>
Timeline for implementation	<i>Spring 2018</i>
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	<i>System will be a tool to collect and organize information for accurate reporting of compiled data.</i>
Goal #3	
Goal	<i>In partnership with the Tutoring Advisory Committee, create and disseminate a Tutoring Survey to the entire campus. Continued collaboration with the Tutoring Advisory group will develop an institutionalization plan for all tutoring activities at Palomar College.</i>
Strategies for implementation	<i>Present to Tutoring Committee at next scheduled meeting</i>
Timeline for implementation	<i>Spring/Fall 2108</i>
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	<i>Meet the ever-growing list of student demand for services.</i>

PART 4: FEEDBACK AND FOLLOW-UP

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

This section is for confirming completing and providing feedback.

Confirmation of Completion by Department Chair

Department Chair	Ruth Barnaba
Date	11/11/17

***Please email your Dean to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by Dean

Reviewer(s)	Shayla Sivert
Date	12/18/17

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

STAR has made a strong effort to vet their tutors with the discipline chairs or tutoring coordinators at our college. They have applied for and received equity funds to create a wider variety of tutoring options for our students -- longer meeting times, appointments for meetings, and recurring tutors for our disproportionately impacted students. STAR also took the lead on applying for our CRLA Tutor Training Certification.

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

Palomar's decentralization of tutoring has made it hard for STAR to operate as it once did.

3. Recommendations for improvement:

Continue to work with disciplines to vet tutors; hours at STAR that are beyond those offered by other centers could be used to expand tutoring available to those discipline's students (i.e., evenings, weekends, etc.)

***Please email your VP to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by: Vice President

Reviewer(s)	Jack S. Kahn, Ph.D.
Date	1/13/18

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

1. Reducing stigma is an important goal thank you.
2. SAOs are good! Just need more specificity- name how much more successful etc.
3. However the actual results section is fantastic- you have a model SAO section which I may use to help their areas make improvements (with your permission of course!!)
4. Goals are great! Virtual lab- how interesting! How does this fit with net-tutor etc?

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

3. Recommendations for improvement:

ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING: Instructional Support and Other Units

Includes: Instructional Services Office, Division Dean's Offices, Occupational & Noncredit Administrative Office, Workforce and Community Development and Extended Education (Centers and Site Operations), KKSM, PCTV, Library, Telescope, Boehm Gallery, Academic Technology, Tutoring, Planetarium, Service Learning, Wellness Center, Women's Studies, STEM Center, Teaching & Learning Center, etc.

--