PALOMAR COLLEGE® Learning for Success — Program Review & Planning (PRP)

PART 1: BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

Program Review is a self-study of your discipline. It is about documenting the plans you have for improving student success in your program and sharing that information with the college community. Through the review of and reflection on key program elements, program review and planning identifies program strengths as well as strategies necessary to improve the academic discipline, program, or service to support student success. With that in mind, please answer the following questions:

Discipline Name:	Cooperative Education
Department Name:	Cooperative Education
Division Name:	Career, Technical, and Extended Education

Please list all participants in this Program Review:

Name	Position
Jason Jarvinen	Work Experience Coordinator
Margie Fritch	Dean, CTEES
Kat Balouch	ADA, Cooperative Education
Bruce McDonough	Work Experience Director, Emeritus

Number of Full Time faculty	1	**Number of Part Time Faculty**	8

Please list the Classified positions (and their FTE) that support this discipline:

Academic Department Assistant (1 FTE)

What additional hourly staff support this discipline and/or department:

None

Discipline mission statement (click here for information on how to create a mission statement):

The mission of the Cooperative Education Department is to help Palomar's students advance their career and technical training goals by providing work experience opportunities. Through structured work experience, students improve existing job skills, learn new job skills, expand their professional networks, and combine what they learn through coursework with what they learn on-the-job or through internships. Work experience also affords our students the opportunity to consider how their work reflects their values and interests and how they balance work with other priorities in their lives. This type of reflection is critical to Palomar's mission of helping students contribute as individuals and global citizens living responsibly, effectively, and creatively

in an interdependent and ever-changing world.

List any new degrees and certificates offered within this discipline since your last comprehensive review:

The Cooperative Education Department does not offer degrees or certificates.

Discipline Level Data: https://sharepoint2.palomar.edu/sites/IRPA/SitePages/PRP%20Summary%20Source.aspx

---

PART 2: PROGRAM REFLECTION

1. Program Analysis:

Reflect upon and provide an analysis of your summary data.

Enrollment Increasing enrollment in Cooperative Education courses is one of the top priorities for the department. Enrollment in Cooperative Education has fluctuated in recent years with enrollment in the spring semesters typically being higher than enrollment in fall semesters. Enrollment was 342 in Spring of 2017, 266 in Fall of 2016, 375 in Spring of 2016, and 298 in Fall of 2015. Overall, however, enrollment in Cooperative Education courses declined by 33% from the Fall of 2011 through the Spring of 2017 (from 511 students to 342 students) compared to a 15% decline in overall college enrollment during this period.

Enrollment has also declined by 39% during summer sessions--from 105 students in the summer of 2011 to 64 students in the summer of 2017.

The decline in Cooperative Education enrollment primarily reflects the lack of a full-time faculty member from 2011 through the Summer of 2017. During this period there was a reduction in capacity to conduct internal outreach to other Palomar departments and to students directly.

Cooperative Education is increasing outreach efforts. This fall, Cooperative Education conducted direct outreach to students in the Student Union at the San Marcos campus; collaborated with the Fashion Department on a Cooperative Education course focused on volunteer work experience at San Diego Fashion Week; and conducted outreach to CTEE Departments to market one- and two-unit eight-week fast-track CE courses.

These efforts helped to increase enrollment by 68 students from the beginning of the semester (August 21st) through census as of October 28th. The Cooperative Education Department will continue these outreach efforts to Palomar students, including at Palomar's other campuses.

Fill Rates Between Fall of 2011 and Spring of 2017 Cooperative Education courses had an average fill rate of 94%, which is relatively high compared to the average fill rate for Palomar overall (85%) and the CTEE Division (80%). Cooperative Education fill rates have generally shown an upward trend--the rate was 93% in the Fall of 2015 (298/320), 89% in the Spring of 2016 (375/420), 97% in the Fall of 2016 (266/273), and 95% in the Spring of 2017 (342/360). The fill rate is a bit unique for work experience because there isn't a fixed CAP on a course because FTES is collected on a per student basis.

Moving forward, Cooperative Education expects to meet 100% fill-rates. The Department compensates instructors on a per-student basis, and we will adjust class caps to the actual enrollment at census.

WSCH/FTEF Ratio The WSCH/FTEF Ratio for Cooperative Education was 482 in Spring of 2017 compared to 505 in Fall of 2016, 461 in Spring of 2016, and 450 in Fall of 2015. Between Fall of 2011 and Spring of 2017, Cooperative Education had an average WSCH/FTEF of 476. This was higher than Palomar College's average of 457 and slightly lower than the CTEE Division's average of 488. We expect the Cooperative Education Department's WSCH/FTEF ratio to stay reasonably constant because part-time instructors are compensated per student rather than per class.

2. Standards:

ACCJC requires that colleges establish institutional and program level standards in the area of course success rates. These standards represent the lowest success rate (% A, B, C, or Credit) deemed acceptable by the College. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the rate, you would seek further information to examine why the drop occurred and strategies to address the rate.

Discipline Level Course Success Rate:
   A. **The College's institutional standard for course success rate is 70%.**
   B. **Review your discipline's course success rates over the past five years.**
   C. **Identify the minimum acceptable course success rate for your discipline. When setting this rate, consider the level of curriculum (e.g., basic skills, AA, Transfer) and other factors that influence success**

Standard for Discipline Course Success Rate:	86%

Why?

The Cooperative Education Department's success rate averaged 86% from the Fall of 2011 through the Spring of 2017, compared to 85.7% for the CTEE Division and 72.1% for the College overall. The Cooperative Education Department's success rate has remained fairly steady during this period with a low of 81% in the Fall of 2013 and a high of 87.9% in Fall of 2016.

The Cooperative Education Department's retention rate averaged 92.7% between the Fall of 2011 and Spring of 2017, compared to 96.6% for the CTEE Division and 92.8% for the college overall. It makes sense that the Cooperative Education Department's retention is closer to the college's overall rate than the CTEE Division's rate because of the large number of students who take Cooperative Education for general work experience opportunities that are not necessarily directly related to their major. Students in CTE programs, on the other hand, are likely more focused on a specific occupational or career goal, which would contribute to a higher retention rate.

An average course success rate of 86% and average retention rate of 92.7% are strong, but we can improve on these. Students typically earn a D or an F because of a loss of contact with the program--they stop turning in monthly reports, do not attend the final interview, or do not complete the required number of work experience hours. Loss of contact with students can be a particular problem in Cooperative Education because the courses do not meet every week like a traditional lecture class. Students may not feel as strong of a connection to the instructor and other students because the learning objectives are individualized. Reaching students by phone or email is sometimes difficult.

The Cooperative Education Department is looking to use Canvas to help increase engagement and contact with students. Through Canvas, students will be able to see exactly which paperwork and reports they have submitted and which are still outstanding. Moreover, instructors will be able to facilitate online discussions in which students share progress, achievements, and advancements with one another. Instructors can create groups of students based on common industries (e.g. retail, food service, justice administration, water technology, social service, etc.) to make discussions of common challenges even more topical for students. In coming semesters we will examine whether these efforts lead to increased success and retention rates.

3. Program Update:

Describe your proudest moments or achievements related to student success and outcomes.

Our proudest moments in Cooperative Education are when students reach significant milestones through their work experience: moving from an unpaid internship to a paid position; earning a promotion in pay, title, or both; or significantly contributing to the workplace through the completion of a course learning objective. We have many strong examples this semester:

- One of our students works at Solutions for Change, a Vista nonprofit that serves families experiencing homelessness. She is one of the staff members on call at the organization's shelter at night. During the job site visit, her supervisor spoke very positively about her sound judgment and her dedication to the families she works with. The student noted that her proudest moments are when she speaks with a family or individual who is thinking about leaving the program and strengthens their resolve to stay. Her supervisor mentioned that they anticipate promoting her soon. The student is studying psychology and wants to be a therapist or counselor. She is gaining relevant experience at Solutions for Change.

- One of our students is a meter service worker at the Ramona Municipal Water District. He is studying Water Technology Education at Palomar. He completed significant projects for two of his learning objectives--one was creating a water meter job aid to help the Ramona Utilities Department verify water flow through a water meter. Another was creating a procedures manual for the District's new meter reading and billing software. His supervisor, Mr. Tim Warner, raved about his work and how helpful his projects have been to the department. Mr. Warner noted that he already had ideas for the student's learning objectives for next semester. He also said that he has identified the student as a future department manager because he expects to retire in the next several years.

- One of our students is in the Library Technology Program at Palomar. She is working as an intern in the library at the Soille San Diego Hebrew Day School. She is helping to reorganize the library at the school after a recent flood. Her supervisor emphasized that her ability to read and write Hebrew has been crucial for re-organizing the school's collection of texts in Hebrew. Without this student and her internship opportunity, the school would have been delayed on that organizing that part of the collection.

4. Program Improvement:

What areas or activities are you working on this year to improve your program? Please respond to new data as well as feedback from last year's program review.

The Cooperative Education Department is focusing on three areas to improve our program:

1. Increase enrollment--increasing enrollment in Cooperative Education is a top priority for the department. At its height, the program was serving over 900 students in each semester. The department has a Strong Workforce goal of growing enrollment to over 1,200 per semester over the next five years because of the importance of work experience for students to gain a foothold in the work force.

2. Increase internship and work experience opportunities for Palomar students in growing career sectors--the Cooperative Education Department will work closely with the Career Center, CTEE departments, and other departments in the college to cultivate new internship and work experience opportunities for Palomar Students. This will involve working with faculty members and their connections to industry to identify sustainable internship and work experience opportunities. The Career Center and Cooperative Education Department will coordinate to recruit students and offer academic credit to them.

3. Improve student retention in Cooperative Education courses--the department has averaged a retention rate of 92.7% in recent years. We would like to increase that rate to 95% by increasing engagement among students and the instructor-coordinator. Canvas offers some interesting possibilities for doing so.

5. Unanticipated Factors:

Have there been any unanticipated factors that have affected the progress of your previous plan?

The Cooperative Education Department has encountered several unanticipated factors in recent years. The first was a period of time without a full-time Work Experience Coordinator for the department. Additionally, the department ADA was split 50% between Cooperative Education and Family and Consumer Sciences for a little over a year. This further reduced capacity in the Cooperative Education Department. This reduction in capacity, combined with the natural turnover in faculty and staff in other departments, has contributed to a lack of awareness of the Cooperative Education Department and the benefits for students of work experience education. Enrollment has declined as a result. With an increase in departmental capacity, we expect enrollment to increase over the next several years.

6. SLOACs:

Describe your course and program SLO activities this past year. How have you used the results of your assessments to improve your courses and programs? Refer to the SLO/PRP report – https://outcomes.palomar.edu:8443/tracdat/

In Cooperative Education courses, Student Learning Objectives are individualized. At the beginning of the course, students set three learning objectives with feedback from their job or internship supervisors and their cooperative education instructor. The learning objectives involve learning a new job skill, improving an existing job skill, or completing a new project for the organization.

Supervisors rate the student's progress on each of the learning objectives. The instructor takes those ratings into consideration when determining the student's final grade in the course. Progress on the learning objectives accounts for 60% of student grades.

Because progress on learning objectives is a significant part of Cooperative Education course grades and because Cooperative Education courses have relatively high success rates (86% Fall 2011 - Spring 2017), we can infer that a majority of students are meeting the majority of their learning objectives. One of the advantages of building Cooperative Education courses in Canvas will be the ability to track progress on Student Learning Objectives more precisely. Because the data will be available electronically, we will be able to determine how many students met all 3 of their objectives, 2 of 3 objectives, etc. These data will help us to make further improvements to the course to boost student learning and success.

PART 3: PROGRAM GOALS

1. Progress on Previous Year's Goals: Please list discipline goals from the previous year's reviews and provide an update by placing an "X" the appropriate status box .

Goal	Completed	Ongoing	No longer a goal
Replace the Work Experience Coordinator	X		
Increase program enrollment		X	
Increase ADA from 50% time to 100% time in Cooperative Education	X		

2. New Discipline Goals: Please list all discipline goals for this three-year planning cycle (including those continued from previous planning cycle):

Goal #1	
Program or discipline goal	Increase enrollment in Cooperative Education courses

Strategies for implementation	1. Conduct outreach to Palomar students by:
	    a. Tabling at the San Marcos campus and at other campuses
	    b. Presenting at student group meetings
	    c. Presenting during classes
	    d. Deploying flyers and a-frame signs
	 2. Conduct outreach to Palomar faculty and departments to identify opportunities for collaboration
	 3. Conduct outreach to prospective Palomar College students who are enrolled in Cooperative Education courses in local high schools (currently 100 students at San Marcos High School and Mission Hills High School are enrolled in Cooperative Education)
	 4. Look to expand Cooperative Education course offerings at other nearby high schools
	 5. Support Palomar College efforts to increase enrollment, e.g. by working with Outreach Services on developing a College

	Ambassador Internship program. Students would earn internship credit at conduct outreach at their former high schools and other local high students.
Timeline for implementation	Strategies 1-3 are being implemented and will be ongoing. Strategy 4 will take more time. It will begin in Spring 2018 and remain ongoing. Cooperative Education is currently talking with Outreach Services about implementing strategy 5 by the beginning of Spring 2018.
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	● Enrollment in Cooperative Education classes ● Enrollment at Palomar College among students who took Cooperative Education classes in high school
Goal #2	
Program or discipline goal	Increase internship and work experience opportunities for Palomar students in growing career sectors
Strategies for implementation	1. Work with Career Center to reach out to internship opportunities identified by consultant (Eric Briggs). Determine whether opportunities are still active. 2. Coordinate with Career Center and faculty who are identifying sustainable internship opportunities through industry contacts 3. Build relationships with employer partners during student job site visits and through follow-ups 4. Network with the North County Chamber of Commerce and other local and regional business groups
Timeline for implementation	Planning regarding strategies 1 and 2 will begin at the end of Fall 2017 and begin to implemented in Spring 2017, ongoing thereafter. Strategy 3 is already occurring and be ongoing. Strategy 4 will begin in Spring 2018 and will be ongoing.
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	An increase in the number of internship and work experience opportunities for Palomar students.
Goal #3	
Program or discipline goal	Improve course success and retention rates in Cooperative Education courses.
Strategies for implementation	1. Build Cooperative Education courses in Canvas 2. Begin to add elements, such as class discussions, to increase engagement among students and instructor/coordinators
Timeline for implementation	1. The basic shell of Cooperative Education courses will be built by Spring of 2018. 2. We will begin to experiment with additional elements by Fall of 2018 and Spring of 2019.
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	● Increase in the course success rate to 88% over the next two years ● Increase in the course retention rate to 95% over the next two years

PART 4: FEEDBACK AND FOLLOW-UP

This section is for confirming completion and providing feedback.

Confirmation of Completion by Department Chair	
Department Chair	Jason Jarvinen
Date	November 6, 2017

***Please email your Dean to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by Dean	
Reviewer(s)	Margie Fritch
Date	November 14, 2017

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

Hiring of a new full time faculty will make a huge difference in the success of the program. The other true successes are the students that obtain employment through their cooperative work experience and the mentoring they receive from the faculty.

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

Declining enrollment is a concern, but hiring a full time faculty this fall 2017 will address this concern.

3. Recommendations for improvement:

Developing a sustainable internship program that would be offered through Cooperative Work Experience.

***Please email your VP to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by Vice President	
Reviewer(s)	Jack S. Kahn, Ph.D.
Date	1/14/2018

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

1. Great mission statement
2. Program analysis is fantastic – great review of historical trends, changes implement, and projected growth- well done and good news we are on an upward trend
3. Success rates are really something to be proud of- great to compare to college and the division as well to get some context
4. Student examples are definitely something to be proud of- great example sin diverse fields
5. Areas you are working on and goals are well stated and reflect the needs of the discipline (and college)
6. Really well done- great summary and description of work here- I think if a person outside the college read this they would not only understand what we are doing but would also be very impressed with the outcomes. Excellent summary.

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

3. Recommendations for improvement: