



Program Review & Planning (PRP)

PART 1: BASIC PROGRAM INFORMATION

Program Review is a self-study of your discipline. It is about documenting the plans you have for improving student success in your program and sharing that information with the college community. Through the review of and reflection on key program elements, program review and planning identifies program strengths as well as strategies necessary to improve the academic discipline, program, or service to support student success. With that in mind, please answer the following questions:

Discipline Name:	Apprenticeship
Department Name:	Workforce Development & Extended Studies
Division Name:	CTEE

Please list all participants in this Program Review:

Name	Position
Nichol Roe	Associate Dean, Workforce Development & Ext. Studies
Valerie Belden	Professional Hourly Employee
Sandy (Michelle) Howard	Professional Hourly Employee
Patti Whitman	Professional Hourly Employee

Number of Full Time faculty	0	Number of Part Time Faculty	19
------------------------------------	---	------------------------------------	----

Please list the Classified positions (and their FTE) that support this discipline:

0

What additional hourly staff support this discipline and/or department:

3 hourly professional positions - for a total of 46 hours per week.

Discipline mission statement ([click here for information on how to create a mission statement](#)):

The mission of the apprenticeship program is to prepare students for construction trades through classwork and on-the-job learning experiences so that they can become journeymen in their trade earning a livable wage salary with benefits and pension.

List all degrees and certificates (e.g., AA, AT, Certificates) offered within this discipline:

A.S. Degree and Certificate of Achievements in:

- Acoustical Installer
- Carpentry
- Drywall/Lather
- Inside Wireman
- Plasterer
- Sheet Metal
- Sound Technician

PART 2: Program Assessment

The first step in completing your self-study is to examine and assess your discipline/program. To accomplish this step, complete the Following Sections:

Section 1: Program Data and Enrollment

Section 2: Course Success Rates

Section 3: Institution and Program Set Course Success Rate Standards

Section 4: Completions

Section 5: Labor Market Information (CTE programs only)

Section 6: Additional Qualitative Information

Section 7: Curriculum, Scheduling, and Student Learning Outcomes

SECTION 1: PROGRAM DATA & ENROLLMENT

Click on the following link to examine enrollment, efficiency, and instructional FTEF trends for your discipline. Log-in using your network username and password.

<https://sharepoint2.palomar.edu/sites/IRPA/SitePages/Productivity%20Metric%20Summary.aspx>

A. To access your discipline data, select your discipline from the drop down menu.

B. To access course level data (e.g., COMM 100 or BIOL 100) use the drop down menus to select “discipline” and “catalog number”.

Use the data to answer the following questions.

1. Discipline Enrollment

Discipline Enrollment (over last 5 years)	Increased	X	Steady/No Change		Decreased
--	------------------	---	-------------------------	--	------------------

Reflect on your enrollment trends over the past five years. Was the trend expected? What factors have influenced enrollment?

Enrollment in the apprenticeship Work Experience courses has increased steadily of the past three years. There are some inconsistencies in the data between 2011 - 2014, with a large increase and then small decrease in enrollments. However, I believe this is due to some poor administrative practices in the apprenticeship office over the past few years, in which many classes were not entered into peoplesoft. This was addressed last year with a major backlog project and administrative practices have been changed.

Additionally, the only data available for this review is from the Work Experience courses, which are a small portion of the actual apprenticeship enrollments. This is likely because WE courses are the only courses that generate FTES, and all other course enrollments generate RSI (Related Supplemental Instruction). However, because all apprentices are required to take WE courses as a part of their program, I believe this data can still be useful as a review for the discipline as a whole.

Considering the items mentioned above, I believe the data from 2014 - 2016 is a good reflection of the discipline. The increase in apprenticeship enrollment is not surprising. There has been a growing demand for apprentices in the construction trades

within San Diego County and there continues to be increasing state and federal interest in increasing the number of apprentices.

2. Course-Level Enrollment and Fill Rates

If there are particular courses that are not getting sufficient enrollment, are regularly cancelled due to low enrollment, or are not scheduled, discuss how your discipline is addressing this. For example, are there courses that should be deactivated?

Of the four WE courses to consider (Sheet Metal, Carpentry, Drywall and Electricians), the sheet metal program is by far the smallest program in regard to enrollments and our carpentry program is the largest. This is not surprising due to the broad nature of the carpentry program.

The data shown on this report is not an accurate reflection of fill rates for the apprenticeship programs. WE experience courses are scheduled differently from a traditional course, with very high “seat” capacities. It can be noted that the “seats” per course ranges from 300 seats to 1000 seats depending on the year and program. The lowest “fill rate” in 2016 - 2017 was for Sheet Metal with an 18.25% fill rate on a 400 seat class. This equates to 73 Sheet Metal Apprentices.

Apprenticeship classes are run as a cohort, and students cycle through their classes with the same students they began their classes with. Due to this, classes are not cancelled for low enrollment because we know the number of students who will be enrolled in each class scheduled. If there comes a situation in which a class is expected to have lower enrollment, it will often be rescheduled within the program cycle so that multiple cohorts of students enroll in that class.

3. WSCH/FTEF

Although the college efficiency goal is 525 WSCH/FTEF or 35 FTES/FTEF, there are many factors that affect efficiency (i.e. seat count / facilities / accreditation restrictions).

Discipline Efficiency Trend	Increased	X	Steady/No Change		Decreased	
Discipline Efficiency:	Above 525 (35 FTES/FTEF)	x	At 525 (35 FTES/FTEF)		Below 525 (35 FTES/FTEF)	x

Reflect on your enrollment trends over the past five years. Was the trend expected? What factors have influenced enrollment?

The WSCH/FTEF doesn't apply to apprenticeship programs due to the nature of both WE and apprenticeship programs. The apprenticeship program WE courses generate FTES, but do not have an FTEF output, which is skewing the WSCH/FTEF data. You can see in the data that WSCH/FTEF is 3,436 (well over 525) for 2016 - 2017. This number has increased over the past five years, due to the increase in enrollments which was expected as noted in the enrollment portion of the review.

4. Instructional FTEF:

Reflect on FTEF (Full-time, Part-time, and Overload) over the past 5 years. Discuss any noted challenges related to instructional staff resources.

Apprenticeship programs do not have an FTEF allocation. These programs receive a Related Supplemental Instruction (RSI) allocation based on positive attendance hours submitted to the chancellor's office. Instruction for apprenticeship courses are paid by the training centers. The RSI allocation fully covers Palomar's administrative costs to run the apprenticeship programs, and the rest is distributed to the training centers to compensate their costs.

SECTION 2: COURSE SUCCESS RATES

Click on the following link to review the course success rates (% A, B, C, or Credit) for your discipline. Examine the following course success rates.

- A. On-Campus Course Success Rates
- B. Online Course Success Rates
- C. Course Success Rates by gender, age, ethnicity, and special population (use the filter buttons at the top of the worksheet to disaggregate success rates by demographic variables)
- D. Course Success Rates by class location (Escondido, CPPEN, etc.)

<https://sharepoint2.palomar.edu/sites/IRPA/SitePages/Success%20and%20Retention.aspx>

1. Overall Success Rate:

Reflect on your discipline’s on-campus, online, and by location (ESC, CPPN, etc.) course success rates over the past five years. Compare your success rates to the overall college success rates. Are the rates where you would expect them to be? Have there been changes over time?

The overall success rates for Apprenticeship courses is quite high, between 94% and 99%. These success rates are again due to the nature of apprenticeship programs for three reasons.

1. The cohort model is beneficial to students because they have a consistent learning environment and always know what to expect and when to expect it, while also providing apprentices with a learning community throughout their program.
2. Apprentices work full time and are consistently implementing theory to practice in on-the-job training. Apprentices not only benefit from having an industry expert as their classroom instructor, but also have industry mentors while on the job.
3. Enrollments and registrations take place “in-time” for our carpentry program (the largest of our apprenticeship programs.) Classes are only a week long, and therefore students are less likely to “drop” a course if it is only 5 days. If a carpentry apprentice “drops” from the apprenticeship program before they are enrolled in the next class, it would not be reflected in the course success rates.

2. Course Success Rates by gender, age, ethnicity, and special population:

Reflect on your discipline’s success rates by the given demographic variables (gender, age, ethnicity, special population). Are there large differences between groups? If so, why do you think this is happening and what might you consider in the future to address the needs of these groups?

Note: Institutionally, the College has a goal to close the performance gap of disproportionately impacted students, including African-American, Hispanic/Latino, veterans, foster youth, and students with disabilities. You can access the Student Equity Plan on the SSEC website <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ssec/>

Gender	<p>There is a large gender gap for enrollment in the apprenticeship programs as a whole. This is a known discrepancy, which is why we have received a California Apprenticeship Initiative (CAI) grant from the CCCCO to develop a pre-apprenticeship program, with the goal of increasing the number of women and other underserved populations in apprenticeship programs. According to the data in this review, there were 0 females enrolled in the apprenticeship programs for 2015 - 2017. In fall 2014 - 2015, when there were 17 females enrolled, they had a 100% success rate. In spring 2013 - 2014 when there were 19 females enrolled, they had a 100% success rate.</p> <p>I believe this data is not completely accurate, for I know personally that there are a small number of females enrolled in the electrician and carpentry programs. However, the number of female enrollments is extremely low. Based on data that the department pulled to apply for the CAI grant last year, the following statistics were noted: 1.84% of carpentry apprentices were female, 3.72% of electrician apprentices were female and 3.17% of sheet metal apprentices were female. Each of the training centers has increased their marketing efforts to target more women into the apprenticeship programs. Between those efforts, and the future efforts of the upcoming pre-apprenticeship program, the department expects to see the number of females enrolled grow.</p>
Age	<p>Most enrollments in the apprenticeship programs are between the ages of 25 - 49 and have success rates over 95%. The second largest group (however significantly smaller at about 1/3 the number of apprentices) are between the ages of 20 - 24. The success rates of these students is still quite high, with rates over 94%.</p> <p>There is an extremely small population of apprentices 50 and over, however their success rates have</p>

COMPREHENSIVE PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING

	<p>consistently been 100% over the past 5 years. Another small population of apprentices are ages 19 and under, and success rates range between 90% - 100%.</p> <p>I believe the number of apprentices 19 and under will increase as we work with local high schools to offer the pre-apprenticeship program on site before or after school (possibly during the school day.)</p>
Ethnicity	<p>The largest population of apprentices are of hispanic ethnicity, which is double the enrollment of apprentices that identify as white. However, the apprenticeship programs lack a more broad diversity of ethnicities with extremely low enrollments of Black or African American apprentices. While it is possible that there may be other ethnicity groups in the “unknown” category, there is obviously a disparity. The CAI grant noted the low enrollment numbers among Black or African American apprentices and will include this group in the recruitment focus.</p>
Special Population (examples- veteran, foster youth, etc)	<p>According this data, there are no foster youth or veterans in the apprenticeship programs. However, again I believe this data may not be completely accurate due to the nature of the apprenticeship programs. Students apply via paper registration or on their first day of class and may not fully complete the demographic survey. However, we do know that numbers are extremely low for these two populations and they have also been identified in the CAI grant for a recruitment focus.</p>

3. Disaggregated Course Success Rates (Select at least two other variables):

Disciplines/programs find it useful to examine course success rates by other types of variables (e.g., time of day, level of course (basic skills, AA, Transfer). Examine course success rates disaggregated by at least two other variables and reflect on your findings.

Apprenticeship programs are specifically designed for students to work full-time in on-the-job training. Employers **must** allow students to attend class if it is scheduled during the day. Each training center schedules courses a bit differently, depending on their employer relationships. This is yet another reason success rates are quite high.

SECTION 3: INSTITUTION AND PROGRAM SET COURSE SUCCESS RATE STANDARDS

ACCJC requires that colleges establish institutional and program level standards in the area of course success rates. These standards represent the lowest success rate (% A, B, C, or Credit) deemed acceptable by the College. In other words, if you were to notice a drop below the rate, you would seek further information to examine why the drop occurred and strategies to address the rate.

Discipline Level Course Success Rate:

- A. The College’s institutional standard for course success rate is 70%.**
- B. Review your discipline’s course success rates over the past five years.**
- C. Identify the minimum acceptable course success rate for your discipline. When setting this rate, consider the level of curriculum (e.g., basic skills, AA, Transfer) and other factors that influence success rates within your area. If you set your discipline standard below the College’s standard, please explain why.**

Standard for Discipline Course Success Rate:	97.04
Why?	The average success rates from the last six recorded years (2011 - 2017) yield the average success rate of 97.04%.

SECTION 4: COMPLETIONS

Click on the following link to review the completions for your discipline.

<https://sharepoint2.palomar.edu/sites/IRPA/SitePages/Degrees%20and%20Certifications.aspx>

- A. To access your discipline data, go to the "Awards" tab at the bottom of the page and click on your discipline.
- B. To access your program level completions, click on the tab titled "Awards by Academic Plan" at the bottom of the page and then click on your discipline.

1. Overall Completions:

Reflect on your discipline’s overall completions over the past five years. Are the completions where you would expect or want them to be? What is influencing the number of completions?

The overall completion of certificates is a bit lower than expected, however not surprising. The apprenticeship programs are 4 - 5 year programs and due to that, yield a lower completion rate.

Additionally, many apprentices come into the program with outside experience, and can therefore be indentured at a higher level of apprentice. When this happens, the apprentice will receive their state certificate, however they may not receive a Palomar Certificate (because they have waived too many units.) Because the Palomar Certificate is not a requirement to work in industry, many apprentices would rather indenture at a high level to earn the state journeyman certificate more quickly, rather than completing the required units for the Palomar Certificate.

2. Specific Degree/Certificate Completions:

Do you have degrees or certificates with few or no completions? If so, what factors influence completions within specific programs? If you have degrees/certificates with few completions, are they still viable? What can be done to help students complete programs within your discipline?

Very few apprentices complete the AA/AS degree. This degree is not needed to work in industry, however it may become beneficial if wanting to move up into construction management. Due to this, I believe some apprentices may complete their AA/AS years later, if at all.

We are looking at the possibility of “packaging” GEs that are currently offered fully online and marketing this information to apprentices. Initial conversations with counselling have taken place, but have not yet been completed. If we can “package” these GEs for apprentices, we may increase the numbers of AA/AS completions slightly, however these apprentices are already working 40 hours a week in on-the-job training, while also taking classes part time. I do not foresee a large population of apprentices taking on additional coursework that would push them into a full-time courseload.

SECTION 5: LABOR MARKET INFORMATION (CTE PROGRAMS ONLY)

If you have CTE programs in your discipline, refer to the following link to obtain relevant labor market data. This data can be found on the Centers for Excellence website at <http://www.coeccc.net/Supply-and-Demand.aspx>

Example of Labor Market Information:

SOC	Description	Counties	2014 Occupations	2017 Occupations	Change	% Change	Openings	Annual Openings	10% Hourly Earnings	Med Hourly Earnings	Entry Level Education (Typical)
13-2011	Accountants and Auditors	Imperial	341	361	20	5.8%	57	19	\$17.70	\$25.09	Bachelor's degree
13-2011	Accountants and Auditors	San Diego	12,554	13,735	1,181	9.4%	2,388	796	\$20.88	\$32.92	Bachelor's degree

1. What is the regional three-year projected occupational growth for your program(s)?

The three year projected occupational growth in each of the three areas are as follows:
 Sheet Metal workers = 211 annual openings
 Carpentry/Drywall = 389 annual openings

Inside Wireman/Electrician = 350 annual openings

2. What is being done at the program-level to assist students with job placement and workforce preparedness?

The apprenticeship program is an “earn while you learn” format so when students complete the program. Students obtain hands-on-work experience in the industry while earning a livable wage, benefits and pension. Often times, students are able to work with multiple contractors so that they can network and learn a wider breadth of skills. In most cases, apprentices who complete their program and become journeymen, continue to work for their sponsor.

3. If your program has other program-level outcomes assessments (beyond SLOs and labor market data), including any external mandated regulatory items, discuss how that information has been used to make program changes and/or improvements.

N/A

4. When was your program’s last advisory meeting held? What significant information was learned from that meeting? (CTE programs are required by Title 5 to conduct a minimum of 1 advisory meeting each year)

The Associate Dean participates in the monthly meetings for each of our apprenticeship programs so there isn’t an “advisory” meeting per se because she meets monthly with the training center staff to share information about the program and the students. At these meetings, training center staff, labor union members, representatives from the State of CA Division of Apprenticeship Standards and industry contractors are all in attendance.

SECTION 6: ADDITIONAL QUALITATIVE INFORMATION

Not all information important to reviewing your program is quantitative or included in the section above.

Describe other data and/or information that you have considered as part of the assessment of your program. (Examples of other data and factors include, but are not limited to: external accreditation requirements, State and Federal legislation, four-year institution directions, technology, equipment, budget, professional development opportunities).

Something that is not shown with this data is the need to deactivate old apprenticeship programs that are no longer offered. They are not coming up in this data, but they are printed in the catalog. This is a project that will be addressed in the upcoming year to ensure the catalog is consistent with the programs actually being offered.

SECTION 7: CURRICULUM, SCHEDULING, AND STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES

1. SLO Assessment Results:

How have SLO assessment results impacted your planning over the last three years? Consider curriculum, teaching methodology, scheduling, department discussion (FT & PT faculty included) resources, etc. Refer to the SLO/PRP report – <https://outcomes.palomar.edu:8443/tracdat/>

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs

2. SLO Assessment Methods:

How effective are your current methods/procedures for assessing course and program student learning outcomes? What is working well and how do you know? What needs improvement and why? Refer to the SLO/PRP report – <https://outcomes.palomar.edu:8443/tracdat/>

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs

3. Program SLOs:

How do your program SLOs represent the scope and depth of learning appropriate to the degree/certificate programs offered? What needs improvement and why? Refer to the SLO/PRP report – <https://outcomes.palomar.edu:8443/tracdat/>

LOC decided AP courses would not need to have SLOs

4. Curriculum overview:

Does your program offer sufficient opportunities for students to learn current disciplinary and professional knowledge, skills, competencies, etc. for the type and level of degree/certificate offered? Discuss how your course/program reviews, since the last PRP, have changed and/or impacted your program. How is the potential need for program/course deactivation addressed by the department?

Palomar College, in partnership with 3 local union organizations, provides apprenticeship training programs registered with the California Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS). Apprentices earn Palomar College credit part-time while learning occupational skills in the classroom. These skills are then implemented in paid, full-time, on-the-job training while working for local contractors.

Unfortunately I have not seen previous comprehensive PRPs and cannot comment on changes. However, I can compare the average overall success rate with last year’s annual PRP, which states 96.8% was the average success rate. This year, that average has gone up to 97.04%. This information, combined with increasing enrollments, highlights the continued need for apprenticeship training at Palomar College along with the needed resources and support to make sure this program is exemplary for the students.

As mentioned previously, there are Apprenticeship programs published in the catalog that are no longer offered by palomar College. This problem will be addressed in the upcoming year to deactivate old programs.

5. Curriculum scheduling:

Describe how you schedule your courses to include a discussion on scaffolding (how all parts build on each other in a progressive, intentional way), and scheduling of courses so students can follow the best sequence. Address how enrollment issues impact scheduling and student completion/achievement.

Apprenticeship classes are run as a cohort model, and students cycle through their classes with the same students they began their classes with. Due to this, classes are not cancelled for low enrollment because we know the number of students who will be enrolled in each class scheduled. Classes are scheduled sequentially and build on each other. If there comes a situation in which an elective class is expected to have lower enrollment, it will often be rescheduled within the program cycle so that multiple cohorts of students enroll in that class.

6. Curriculum communication:

How does regular communication with other departments that require your courses in their programs occur – scheduling, review scheduling conflicts/overlaps for courses within same program, etc.?

N/A. All classes are scheduled and held at the training centers (not on Palomar campus.)

PART 3: Program Evaluation and Planning

Program Evaluation and Planning is completed in two steps.

Section 1: Overall Evaluation of Program

Using the results of your completed assessment (See Sections 1-6 above), identify the strengths and areas for improvement within your program. Also consider the areas of opportunities and any external challenges your program faces over the next three years. Summarize the results of your assessment in the Grid below.

Section 2: Establish Goals and Strategies for the Next Three Years

Once you have completed your overall evaluation, identify a set of goals and strategies for accomplishing your goals for this upcoming three year planning cycle. Use the template in Section 2 below to document your goals, strategies, and timelines for completion.

SECTION 1: OVERALL EVALUATION OF PROGRAM

1. Discuss your discipline’s strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats in regards to curriculum, assessment, enrollment, success rates, program completion, etc. For helpful suggestions on how to complete this section, go to <http://www2.palomar.edu/pages/irp/files/2017/02/Helpful-Tips-for-Completing-a-SWOT.pdf>

Strengths:	The apprenticeship programs have high completion rates due to the cohort nature of the program. This provides students with a learning community throughout their program and allows them to know what to expect and when to expect it. Additionally, students learn practical skills in on-the-job training, earn a livable wage, and receive benefits and pension.
Weaknesses:	Apprenticeship programs lack demographic diversity. There are very low number of females, black or African Americans, Veterans and youth enrolled in the programs.
Opportunities:	The new CAI grant that was received to develop a pre-apprenticeship program. The goal of this program is to help increase numbers of successful applicants into apprenticeship programs and expand access for underrepresented populations, specifically women, persons of color, veterans, foster youth and low-income individuals, in order for them to better compete in today's economic landscape, and earn a living wage.
Threats:	Many people (on campus and off) are not aware of the Apprenticeship programs offered at palomar. A major effort of the department over the next few years will be internal awareness and external marketing.

SECTION 2: Establish Goals and Strategies for the Next Three Years

1. Progress on Previous Year’s Goals: Please list discipline goals from the previous year’s reviews and provide an update by placing an “X” the appropriate status box .

Goal	Completed	Ongoing	No longer a goal
Increase underrepresented populations in our apprenticeship programs		x	
Growth in apprenticeship programs		x	

2. New Discipline Goals: Please list all discipline goals for this three-year planning cycle (including those continued from previous planning cycle):

COMPREHENSIVE PROGRAM REVIEW AND PLANNING

Goal #1	
Program or discipline goal	Launch pre-apprenticeship program
Strategies for implementation	Complete curriculum approvals, market program, schedule program, enroll students
Timeline for implementation	Launch program Fall 2018
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	Enroll 15 - 20 students in Fall 2018
Goal #2	
Program or discipline goal	
Strategies for implementation	
Timeline for implementation	
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	
Goal #3	
Program or discipline goal	
Strategies for implementation	
Timeline for implementation	
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	
Goal #4	
Program or discipline goal	
Strategies for implementation	
Timeline for implementation	
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	
Goal #5	
Program or discipline goal	
Strategies for implementation	
Timeline for implementation	
Outcome(s) expected (qualitative/quantitative)	

3. How do your goals align with your discipline's mission statement?

Current goals to increase the number of apprentices, especially those from underserved populations directly aligns with our mission to prepare students for the construction trades. Additionally, the new goal of developing a pre-apprenticeship program will better prepare students to compete in today's economic landscape, and earn a living wage by entering an apprenticeship program upon completion.

4. How do your goals align with the College's Strategic Plan Goals?

By focusing on recruiting and preparing students from underserved populations in our new pre-apprenticeship program (specifically women, persons of color, veterans, foster youth and low-income individuals,) we are directly meeting Palomar's mission to provide an engaging teaching and learning environment for students of diverse origins, experiences, needs, abilities, and goals.

PART 4: FEEDBACK AND FOLLOW-UP

This section is for providing feedback.

Confirmation of Completion by Department Chair

Department Chair	N/A
Date	

***Please email your Dean to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by Dean

Reviewer(s)	Margie Fritch
Date	November 28, 2017

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

Strategic and effective partnerships with local unions and training centers translates into student success rates in the program and in employment after graduation.

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

Staffing needs have increased due to the increase in the apprenticeship programs and student enrollment.

3. Recommendations for improvement:

Develop a staffing plan that will be categorically funded to support the apprenticeship programs.

***Please email your VP to inform them that the PRP has been completed and is ready for their review**

Reviewed by: Instructional Planning Council PRP Sub-Committee

Reviewer(s)	Katy Farrell
Date	12/8/17

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

Course completion rates. Cohort programs with comprehensive scheduling of courses.

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

Need for more diversity in the program.

3. Recommendations for improvement:

I've known about Palomar's AP programs for years, but I never really understood how they worked or how I could promote these programs to current and potential Palomar students. It would help if we had simple fact sheets that described the trades offered at Palomar, types of jobs a graduate might obtain, average salary and benefits, any previous experience needed, and how to apply/enroll.

4. Recommended Next Steps:

X	Proceed as Planned on Program Review Schedule
	Repeat Comprehensive Review

Reviewed by: Vice President

Reviewer(s)	Jack S. Kahn, Ph.D.
Date	1/14/18

1. Strengths and successes of the discipline as evidenced by the data and analysis:

1. Great discussion in enrollment section- gives a nice context of growth- but please include actual raw data (what are the actual numbers- see rubric)
2. Section 2 in enrollment is what I mean – well done and great examples using data and also helping the reader understand the nuance here with these programs
3. Excellent discussion of fte issue and differences with apprenticeship
4. Success rates are amazing- I'm so pleased we are expanding apprenticeship/ pre-apprenticeship
5. Great discussion of dedication to increasing diversity of the apprenticeship program- will look forward to seeing the proportions increase for the underrepresented with these efforts
6. Completion discussion is also well done and helpful
7. LMI presentation is also excellent
8. Curriculum discussion is also very well done
9. SWOT provided a succinct summary of the excellent narrative above
10. Well done description of the program and plans to improve

2. Areas of Concern, if any:

- a. Mission could be expanded and reflect more the uniqueness of our program etc.
Ex. <https://www.lcc.edu/techcareers/apprenticeship/>
- b. See comments throughout
- c. Just one goal? I think increasing diversity via the grant would be another though it is stated above etc. Maybe add more apprenticeship/pre etc?

3. Recommendations for improvement:

4. Recommended Next Steps:

X	Proceed as Planned on Program Review Schedule
---	--

	Repeat Comprehensive Review
--	------------------------------------

Upon completion of PART 4, the Program Review document should be returned to discipline faculty/staff for review, then submitted to the Office of Instruction and Institutional Research and Planning for public posting. Please refer to the Program Review timeline.