



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
April 17, 2023

APPROVED

PRESENT: Melissa Bagaglio, Kimberly De La Cruz (ASG), Kelly Falcone, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Shelbi Hathaway, Erin Hiro, Lawrence Lawson, Ben Mudgett, Michael Mufson, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Beth Pearson, Nicole Siminski, Alyssa Vafaei, Elena Villa Fernández de Castro, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Jason Jarvinen, Leigh Marshall (ZOOM-A), Leanne Maunu

GUESTS: Leah Brown, Erin Feld, Bill Jahnel, Angela Kong, Sabrina Menchaca, Gina Wilson, Rebecca Wilson

Notes: Senators participating in a meeting via ZOOM, and asserting an AP 2449 allowance, are considered present and attendance is recorded ZOOM-EC “emergency circumstances” or ZOOM-JC “just cause.” Senators observing the meeting via ZOOM without asserting an AP 2449 allowance are considered absent and attendance is recorded ZOOM-A.

All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The meeting was called to order by Faculty Senate President Wendy Nelson in LRC-116 at 2:30 PM. The meeting was also streamed live on ZOOM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Bill Jahnel made the following statement:

Thank you. I apologize for addressing the Senate at this time, but I rarely get summoned on a call out in the Senate minutes and so I felt the need, not so much for myself but for my colleague Matt Estes, just to make a clarification which was necessary. It is my understanding that Professor Bealo reported out that my colleague Professor Estes refused to do or failed to do the SLOs in our department last semester. I found that to be deeply disturbing and perhaps a mischaracterization of the situation that occurred. I do have some emails, and again to abbreviate for time, I will not attempt to go through them word for word but allow me to characterize the situation.

In our department, we generally have had an SLO Facilitator who has been Teresa Laughlin. In the Fall she was selected to be an acting dean. We received an email on November 1 from Professor Bealo asking to meet with the facilitator addressed to myself and to Professor Estes. Professor Estes does coordinate one of our discipline’s SLOs but is not the SLO Coordinator. After some conversation where he also talked to me in person, we directed that the current SLO Facilitator had been Professor Laughlin. Theresa did respond as dean and therefore could no longer fulfill that duty. Professor Estes offered to volunteer to do that work even though he wasn’t the facilitator and did not receive that stipend. Marty Schneider did grant him access to all three departments. On November 1, he sent out an email to the department coordinating the conversations and data that’s necessary to fill in those SLOs. And when he received a request from Bealo, further in the email chain saying that we’ve yet to meet with them, and they have not completed the stipend requirement unless we missed our spreadsheet. Estes’ last response on November 11, 2022, was the following: “Hello, Everyone

I'm just going to get it done. I've already gotten access to all the department SLO information. As been pointed out, the information is easily available through a Nuventive website and I've spoken to the discipline leads about which SLOs need to be evaluated this semester. They will get me the data sometime in January. I'm not getting a stipend that obviates the need for a meeting to meet the requirements for the stipend. Sincerely, Matthew"

This communication on November 11 was the final communication in that chain and I'm sure that Professor Estes just felt that the matter was settled. Not only did he do the SLO work, but he chose to do it without receiving a stipend. In the Spring, we expected Professor Laughlin would be returning to our department. We had scheduled her for classes, but that was not to be and her acting dean status was continued. She is retiring in the Spring and I'm sure that we will have a coordinator to receive the stipend next fall.

If there is any question about the work of our department, I suggest that there is an address at the Nuventive database to verify that the work for our department was done. I thank you for allowing me to mention and enter this clarification.

Senator Shelby Hathaway said she was recently in a meeting with DRC and math department. It is all of our jobs to make sure that we are meeting the needs of our students by making sure our material is accessible. It is not the job of DRC; that's not what they get funded to do. There might be in the works some funding to hire people to do curriculum development as it pertains to accessibility. Some departments struggle more than others trying to ensure their materials are accessible. Graphs are prominent in math and science and those are harder to make accessible for students. Faculty need to advocate having staff hired or trained to ensure that class materials are accessible in every way possible.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced that Michael Munson will be playing a Beethoven piece for Concert Hour at 1 PM on Thursday, April 20. *Latin Nights* takes place on Friday, April 21 at 6:30 PM in the Performing Arts Courtyard. More information regarding these events and tickets can be found at www.palomarperforms.com

Senator Melissa Bagaglio announced *Tarde de Familia* is coming on April 21 from 5:30 to 8 PM. The event is free and includes food and entertainment. No reservation is required and faculty are encouraged to attend and to invite their students.

Senator and PFF Co-President Lawrence Lawson said a PFF academic scholarship is available to members' dependents or others in their household. For more information, members can go to <https://www.palomarfacfed.org/benefits> The deadline to apply is May 12.

Senator Lawson also announced that Will Dalrymple was just elected Co-President of PFF. Dalrymple will be representing part-time faculty starting May 25, 2023.

Senator Scott Nelson announced *Café International* is tomorrow, April 18, from 1:30 to 3:30 in the Student Union. The event is free and open to the public. Treats from diverse cultures will be served. Everyone is encouraged to attend this fun event.

AGENDA CHANGES – There were no agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1: MSC Faulkner/Pearson

Faculty Senate approval of Faculty Senate meeting minutes dated April 10, 2023 as amended (Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum Committee

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Ben Mudgett said no action and no report is needed.

B. Committee on Committees

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said no action and no report is needed.

C. Reassigned Time Applicants

Motion 2: MSC Lawson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot (Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

SLO Co-Coordinator – **Shelbi Hathaway**, Fall 2023 to Spring 2025
Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair – **Adam Meehan**, Fall 2023 to Spring 2025

Motion 3: MSC Pearson/Lawson

Faculty Senate approval of confirming the following uncontested faculty leadership positions (Exhibit 2):

The motion carried.

Curriculum Co-Chair – **Vickie Mellos**, Fall 2023 to Spring 2025
CALM Coordinator – **Anastasia Zavodny**, Fall 2023 to Spring 2025

D. Equitable Placement & Completion Committee Governance Change Form

Motion 4: MSC Faulkner/Pearson

Faculty Senate approval of the revised Equitable Placement & Completion Committee change form (Exhibit 3).

The motion carried.

Erin Feld, Chair of the Equitable Placement & Completion Committee said the Director of Occupational Noncredit Programs was originally on the AB 705 (prior committee name) workgroup and this position was inadvertently left out when groups were combined. The Director of Occupational Noncredit Programs oversees all noncredit programming which used to include Basic Skills Programs. Students took noncredit classes to prepare themselves for credit pathways.

But now with AB 705 and AB 1705, we can't enroll students in noncredit classes who've completed the same classes in high school or some sort of equivalent class. There's been issues for the noncredit side with placing students and figuring out how to prepare students who would like the extra support but not ready for the math or English with support classes yet. The hope with this position coming on is that the director would be able to collaborate with the committee and think about how to problem solve in order to support students who traditionally would have taken noncredit. This position also oversees the Rising Scholar Program for formally incarcerated students. Again, those were students that traditionally worked with Counseling to support these nontraditional students. Having understood a perspective of what's happening with the math and the English, and the supports that we're going to be offering could be beneficial for this person. Also, the supervised tutoring classes that students have to enroll in to receive tutoring on campus are overseen by the Director of Occupational and Noncredit Programs. Some of the money that we are expecting because of AB 1705 and some other legislation is specifically about offering student support and tutoring would certainly be part of that.

INFORMATION

A. ASG Report

Senate President Wendy Nelson recognized Kimberly De La Cruz for her statement at the recent Governing Board meeting. De La Cruz said ASG voting takes place May 1 through May 5. She also stated that she will be pushing to fill the student seat on the Curriculum Committee. De La Cruz visited Sacramento on April 12 to lobby for Cal Grant reform and student housing and how it affects community colleges.

B. Leadership Reports

Service Learning (Exhibit 4)

Service Learning Coordinator Angela Kong said Service Learning falls under work-based learning. Although many of the students have part-time and full-time jobs to pay for rent and food, Service Learning is an opportunity for them to apply the concept theories and ideas they learn in the classroom to hands on experiences in the nonprofit sector and in their future careers. Under work-based learning, Service Learning falls under career preparation. However, depending on where the student is on their career journey, it can also apply to career awareness and exploration because they might not know what they want to study just yet. Service Learning provides an avenue for them to explore. It also covers career training. Especially in American Sign Language and Child Development, many students are able to get firsthand experience, particularly in that field. Why is Service Learning important... because it improves student success, retention and persistence. Kong shared the report/graph showing the success and retention rates for Fall 2015 through Summer 2019. She went on to say that it creates a deeper learning experience for students and strengthens their resumes to apply for future career positions. Based on the 2020 data from Institutional Research and Planning, when they looked at disproportionately impacted groups such as African American, Hispanic, first generation, foster youth, you can see a tremendous increase in success and retention rate. We are currently working on another equity report based on students who engage in work-based learning overall as an umbrella for the past three years.

Angela Kong said in the past years, Palomar has received a couple of grants, a Guided Pathways grant, a Regional Strong Workforce Program Equity grant, and a Civic Engagement grant. This has really allowed us to build a more robust Service Learning program on campus. We've been able to work with many more faculty who have integrated Service Learning in the classroom by providing faculty stipends and workshop sessions. We've also been able to gain some funding in terms of getting gas cards and bus trolley passes to support our students and acknowledged student participation with graduation stoles and graduation cords. And we've also built a Canvas course so faculty can actually learn how to integrate Service Learning in their classroom by helping them to re-examine their syllabus.

In the past two years, Kong said we've been able to work with faculty cohorts. They are currently in their second cohort, and this semester they're implementing Service Learning. In the first semester in the Fall, faculty attended

three workshop sessions to learn about Service Learning and reviewing and examining their syllabus to see how to integrate it. In the Spring semester, they implemented it into the class. Kong shared a list of the first and second faculty cohorts. Next year she hopes to work with a third cohort. Associate Dean Nicole Roe has applied for another Strong Workforce grant so this cohort can take place.

Gina Wilson, Service Learning Faculty Coordinator shared data from the Fall 2022/Spring 2023 semesters. Spring 2023 hours are not completed yet so they are expecting these number of hours to jump significantly. The grants really helped get more faculty involved which helps increase the number of students, and then the number of hours that students complete. This year there have been a couple new opportunities that faculty have taken on. In the fall, Child Development professor Barbara Hammons did a Saturday Service Learning event with her students. A few weeks ago, the ESL Department had a few professors come and do projects with the students and hope to have more in the future.

Wilson added that each year, the Service Learning Award reception is held in May. Students can be nominated by their professors or by their community department anytime during the school year. If the student accepts the nomination, they become eligible for the award. The Service Learning award is a small scholarship and a certificate and stole to wear. The award event is on May 16 from 6 to 7 PM and everyone is invited. It is a hybrid event in MD-157 and on Zoom. This event is a good opportunity to learn more about Service Learning and see what students have accomplished. For some of the students, it's their first time ever receiving an award or being eligible for a scholarship. Wilson said donations for the scholarship fund that have come from professors in the past need more donations.

Wilson said she too wanted to mention the Canvas course called Palomar's Service Learning Experience. Interested faculty are encouraged to email Wilson at gwilson2@palomar.edu or servicelearning@palomar.edu to get enrolled and get access to the class. It is ongoing, self-paced and consists of five modules.

Wilson encouraged faculty to go to www.palomar.edu/servicelearning/ The complete reports presented are located on the website.

Educators for Equity, Diversity and Cultural Consciousness Committee (EEDCC)

Senator and Co-Chair of the Educators for Equity, Diversity and Cultural Consciousness Committee (EEDCC) Michael Mufson began the presentation. The mission of the committee is aspirational, As activists to the Faculty Senate, this subcommittee will disrupt the status quo by dismantling and eradicating inequities. We challenge others to be uncomfortable, and to do transgressive work towards the shared goal of infusing equity and antiracism throughout our college. We will rebuild and critically question, challenge, engage, re-examine equitable practices and validate cultural agency of the entire Palomar College community with particular attention towards serving students.

The committee participates in a number of activities. We have one big project that we produce every year, which is a social justice event as part of Spring plenary. This year, the committee modified the name and clarified the intentions calling it the Social Justice Community Festival. This is an attempt to be more inclusive and to be holistic, to try to dissolve the siloed thinking that has been calcified in education for many centuries. In addition, we also primarily serve as an advisory function towards other groups on campus who are creating DEIAA related policies, procedures and practices.

Mufson said the goal for the festival was to create an inclusive, engaging, and joyous exploration to cultivate the possibility for transforming Palomar by prioritizing diversity, equity, inclusion, accessibility and anti-racism practices mindset and community. One of the barriers that we face in doing this kind of work is the feeling like it's a burden, like doing equity work is one more thing on top of everything else that we have to do at Palomar. We then show up for some kind of equity thing and we may feel judged if we don't know all the lingo...there are all kinds of discussions happening in the activism spaces around this kind of work. The committee's goal was to make an event where everyone could just simply explore this work in a joyous way.

The festival took place on the last Friday of plenary. Unfortunately, we didn't do an excellent job of tracking any kind of exact numbers of people that came, or the duration that they participated in various events. This is one of the things we want to improve upon but at the same time though, there is a balance between keeping it open and accessible to everyone. We could track some people through the PD Portal (75 people preregistered there) and produced a number of around 120 attendees in total who came. There was live music and a drumming circle attendees could join. There was a dance performance all focused on social justice issues and multicultural food was available. The most impactful event of the day was the human library because it centered the voices. The human library activity was a number of different students who were metaphorically framed as books, who shared their story about their lived experiences. The committee recruited students who had experiences related to diversity, equity, inclusion, accessibility and anti-racism. Mufson said this turned out to be a very profound experience for both students and attendees. Attendees were able to open their hearts and minds to get a deeper understanding of struggle that some students go through in order to make it through the system. The feedback received in the closing session was more opportunities to do this work, on a smaller scale, particularly the human library and creating 3 to 4 hour workshops based on some of the 60 minute workshops created for the event.

Senator Mufson thanked the PFF and CCE for providing gift cards to students and presenting excellent tables at the event. Also, gratitude to HR, EAP and Behavioral Health Services in providing outside counseling. Part of the ethos is to take care of people, to stop seeing statistics and start seeing human beings, all who contain stories, and recognizing that this work could potentially be triggering. Mufson also thanked Dean Salas' office and Professional Development in making this a successful event

Sabrina Menchaca, Co-Chair of the Committee continued the report adding that consultation with TERB took place regarding faculty evaluations and embedding DEIAA within the evaluation. EEDCC is part of the Facilitating Equity and SLO taskforce. We are reviewing wording, semantics, perceptions and trying to consider all words that we use because words can move mountains. Words are the essence of being aware of what we need to present for DEIAA. The committee had participation on Competency and Criteria Committee for evaluations and supporting employees experiencing DEIAA offenses. We had a few faculty come to us seeking support when they've experienced some DEIAA issues within the classroom

Menchaca said the committee wants to continue working on permanent institutional funding for the social justice activities. Figuring out how to compensate students for their valuable time and value in their voice without impacting their financial aid is important. Mufson added that there are institutional barriers currently at Palomar that need to be addressed.

Mufson said there are currently three more concerns; commitment to release time for the Committee Co-Chairs and part-time faculty members, timing of the of the festival to make it available for all staff a week before classes start, and a general concern that the DEIAA activities remain siloed and should be connected and coordinated. EEDCC often does not have any idea what other entities on campus are doing in DEIAA.

Co-chairs and various Senator feedback was as follows:

- The CDO provided support to find and then access funds to support the event.
- In order for Faculty Senate to evaluate the Senate pot of reassigned/release time for co-chairs, a better understanding of how the hours (20%, two co-chairs x 8 hours each per week) would be used. Mufson said that he was under the impression that the release time was already available as of last year.
- Evaluations are negotiated but PFF has not been made aware that EEDCC has been involved with embedding DEIAA in that process. The State has given guidance telling districts to hold off, because they're going to be providing some templates and guidance, so that the districts throughout the State have some common language to use related to that. Senator Falcone (TERB) said they approached EEDCC to get the dialogue started based on preliminary guidance already available from the Chancellor's Office only and no other action has been taken.

-
-

- There are faculty who feel very isolated and feel like they don't belong. They're being attacked for their discipline. They're being attacked for what they teach. Looking at ways to support and retain our faculty who experience this is really important right now especially as we continue to hire new faculty cohorts that are much more diverse. We don't have a retention mechanism in place to provide a sense of belonging and validation for what they teach, their experience and who they are. Senator Mufson said he would add this to the Committee's goals for next year so this can be addressed and he thinks it's essential that Palomar has a space for them.

C. ASCCC Spring 2023 Plenary Resolutions (Exhibit 5)

President Nelson said she is attending plenary on April 21. The final resolutions were included in the meeting exhibits. Some of the most notable resolutions that Senators provided feedback on were (see Exhibits):

- **6.04 S23 Support for AB 811 (Fong, as of March 28, 2023)**
- **7.01 S23 Destigmatize Academic Probation Language and Processes**
- **7.03 S23 Ensuring Anti-racist California Community College Online Faculty Training Materials**
- **7.04 S23 Defining Success for Part-Time Students**
- **10.01 S23 Disciplines List–Ethnic Studies**
- **2.01 S23 Assert the Value of the Work Done by the Online Network of Educators (@ONE)**
- **13.04 S23 Define Academic Freedom in Title 5**
- **13.04.01 S23 Amend 13.04 Define Academic Freedom in Title 5 Add a Third Whereas:**
- **1.01 S23 Add a Designated At-Large Part-Time Representative to the Executive Committee**
- **6.01 S23 Support AB 607 (Kalra, 2023), If Amended**
- **6.02 S23 Centering Inclusion and Access for Local Academic Senate and Academic Subcommittee Meetings Governed by the Brown Act**
- **13.01 S23 Low Textbook Cost Designation and Search in CVC Online Course Finder**
- **13.06 S23 Considering the Merits and Faults of Artificial Intelligence in the Community College Classroom**

D. Student Success Teams Pilot Update – Tabled.

E. Instructional Program Review and Planning Governance Structure (Exhibit 6)

Senate President Wendy Nelson presented the governance change form to add the Curriculum Co-Chair and an IRP Representative. This group will be tasked with reviewing the process and the timeline. In addition, this group will be prioritizing the primary goals for the process itself and discuss what we need to get out of this process. This item will come back for Action.

F. DEI Curriculum Framework – Tabled.

REPORTS

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan)

The Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship Council last met on April 7, 2023. Below are some highlights:

1. ACCJC annual report for 2023 was reviewed. Provides 3 years of data from 2019/2020 through 2021/2022. Once certified, this report will be on the Accreditation webpage and posted. Will be certified by mid April. Focuses on enrollment and completion data.
2. Annual Fiscal Report was reviewed. [Governing board](#) report will be updated. Eight sections in the report: General, revenue, expenditure, liability/debt, OPEB, cash position, annual audit, other.
3. Program Review and Resource Allocation Committee started prioritization of technology and one-time funds. Examining technology refresh process to make sure funding is available. CRM request will be part of an institutional conversation. Will be share back on April 25 with budget committee.
4. Small group work in the following areas:
 - a. Integrating data across the institution
 - b. User Group
 - i. Monitoring the development of the follow up report for Accreditation
 - ii. Evaluate the PRP process and make it more streamlined
 - iii. Ensuring staff are involved: Phase 2
 - c. Resource allocation

Next meeting is April 21, 2023.

ADJOURNMENT The meeting was adjourned at 4:00

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary