



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
March 6, 2023

APPROVED

PRESENT: Melissa Bagaglio, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Shelbi Hathaway, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Leanne Maunu, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Nicole Siminski, Alyssa Vafaei, Elena Villa Fernández de Castro, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Lacey Craft, Kimberly De La Cruz (ASG), Lawrence Lawson, Leigh Marshall, Michael Mufson, Beth Pearson, Edwina Williams

GUESTS: Rosie Antonecchia, Leah Brown, Patriceann Mead, Tina Recalde, Rebecca Wilson

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The meeting was called to order by Faculty Senate President Wendy Nelson in LRC-116 at 2:30 PM. The meeting was also streamed live on ZOOM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS – No public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro announced that Palomar’s Women’s Basketball team won their playoff game Saturday and qualified for the Elite Eight round of the CCCAA State Championship Tournament. Palomar is the only team who qualified from the southern conference and Coach Leigh Marshall was selected Coach of The Year for the southern conference.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced that *Rent* takes over the Howard Brubeck Theatre beginning March 10 with the last performances on Sunday, March 19. Get your tickets now at www.Palomarperforms.com

Senator Alyssa Vafaei said the disability community experienced a huge loss over the weekend, Judy Heumann passed away. Heumann was considered the mother of disability civil rights in the US and internationally as well.

Senator Ben Mudgett said he attended a webinar sponsored by the Chancellor’s Office on bachelor’s degrees. It was mentioned that 68 districts are in recovery now either meeting or exceeding pre-COVID enrollments. The districts who are still struggling will get assistance from the Chancellor’s Office to help improve enrollments. Of the 15 community colleges who offer bachelor’s degrees, some important student data was shared:

- 63% of those enrolled are black indigenous people of color
- 66% are female
- 87% said they only considered getting a bachelor’s degree because of the value (\$10,000 cost for four years)
- 92% said community colleges should continue offering bachelor’s degrees
- Student’s salaries increased by \$25,000 upon getting the degree
- 80% found jobs within three months of graduating

- 95% were employed in their field of study

Senate President Wendy Nelson said that offering baccalaureate degree programs provides equity for students who live and learn in the community college neighborhoods but who can't leave the area to pursue the bachelor's degree for various reasons. Nelson suggested this topic be agendaized for further discussion in Senate.

Senator Shelbi Hathaway attended an AB 1705 conference where she heard about some good programs. One of them was math related and it was called *Mind Over Math*, where a counseling class is attached to cooperative math courses and had the counselors are somehow involved in the classroom. This also increased access to student mental health services. Another college said their *First Year Experience Program* was for any student who has less than 20 units. The class helps build the student's soft skills that are needed but students don't always have. Both programs focused on the "whole" student, and not just students in a specific department.

President Nelson said Joe Early reached out to get a faculty volunteer to serve as an outside member of a hiring committee for a basketball coach. She asked Senators to volunteer or to ask colleagues to serve. She added that serving on hiring committees as an outside faculty member can give newer faculty the experience of how the committees work. HR is also looking for compliance officers. President Nelson will get an email out to fulltime faculty hoping to recruit for both positions.

President Nelson announced that the Faculty Constitution/Bylaw Bifurcation survey went out to all faculty. If Senators haven't responded, please do so. Senator Alexandra Doyle Bauer will send it out one more time.

President Nelson said that several faculty leadership positions with reassigned time are still vacant and without any applicants.

AGENDA CHANGES – The order of Information Items has changed due to VPI Recalde's schedule.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1: MSC Faulkner/Hathaway Faculty Senate approval of Faculty Senate meeting minutes dated February 27, 2023 (Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2: MSC Mudgett/Faulkner Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum Committee actions taken March 1, 2023 (Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Ben Mudgett said the course review campaign is moving smoothly and getting lots of feedback from faculty that are in the process or undergoing risk reviews themselves or their designees. He said there is currently one issue that can't be resolved. If a course is cross-listed and it's not a course that you house, it is the responsibility of the housing department to do the course review. Some faculty want to be included in that review process and a potential process change may be developed so this can happen in the future. Until this can happen though, course reviews will be done by the department who houses the course.

B. Committee on Committees

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said no action was needed this week. Senator Zavodny said that when Senate sat the hiring committee for Dean of SBS, Faculty Senate, per AP 7120 announced the faculty co-chair. Past practices have been to allow faculty serving on the committee to appoint the faculty co-chair among themselves. At this moment though, a co-chair designee has not been chosen.

INFORMATION

A. ASG Report – De La Cruz

ASG Representative De La Cruz was not present but emailed a report to all Senators. That report will be included in the Reports section of the minutes.

B. Faculty Service Area (FSA) Update (Exhibit 3) – Jarvinen

Senator and FSA Jason Jarvinen shared the exhibit and a brief overview. A fulltime faculty member is hired into at least one faculty service area and may qualify for multiple positions at that time. There is also an opportunity to apply for additional areas later on if faculty meet minimum qualifications defined by the State. The District can locally set additional competencies.

One of the FSA Committee goals this year was to communicate more to fulltime faculty about this process and the ability to apply for additional FSAs. During initial discussions, there was confusion on the committee about exactly where FSA has come into play and under what circumstances. HR was invited to a meeting and Kathy Jain; a member of the FSA Committee did some research of how other California community colleges manage FSAs.

At Palomar, FSAs come into play in a few situations. They are one element that goes into determining order of layoffs and reduction in forces. They are also part of the lateral transfer process. They are also part of the administrative transfer process. According to ASCCC, FSAs should only have one purpose: they determine the order by which faculty may be laid off when a district is facing a reduction in force – layoffs of fulltime faculty. The FSA Committee consensus is in alignment with ASCCC and believes that using it as a part of a transfer process is inappropriate because it actually raises the bar for internal transfers as opposed to what a new applicant would have. The committee would like both Faculty Senate and PFF to look into this matter and hopefully consider changing those practices.

Additionally, Senator Jarvinen said that some campuses have one uniform FSA across the entire college. Teaching a number of courses in that FSA qualifies. Skyline College's FSA is equal to the minimum qualifications. There was no consensus on the FSA Committee to recommend one of these two changes. In order to consider these options, a larger discussion must occur among faculty because those are dramatic changes.

Senate VP Jenny Fererro said she appreciated the information and a good conversation needs to take place. A lateral transfer could absolutely result in reduction in force. The way it reads in the current Contract protects faculty within a particular department from being bumped down seniority wise in a situation where a program gets eliminated and there is faculty in that program who have been a Palomar for 25 years. They come in and use a lateral transfer without an FSA that they haven't taught in 25 years, they are more senior than everyone else who's been in that department. This absolutely would impact load and from a contractual standpoint, this would be problematic. This is why the FSAs are included in lateral transfers at Palomar.

Jarvinen replied to a comment about prioritizing students need for faculty with higher qualifications (an FSA) in order to teach that course which would be maintaining the high quality within each department. He said that in almost all situations, the FSA is going to have higher qualifications than minimum qualifications. For example, Jarvinen said that the minimum quals for Work Experience is a masters. But then, if you are going to teach Work Experience in a specific discipline, whatever the minimum quals are for that discipline are also needed. At least five years of work experience in that area is the minimum quals. A new applicant wouldn't need to meet this, just minimum quals plus whatever

preferred qualifications were posted in the job listing. A lateral transfer process can seem more akin to a hiring process than it is a reduction in force situation.

Senator Ben Mudgett said that when he was chairing FSA, he wondered the same thing. He was reminded that at Palomar, we have the extra plus one, which is faculty has primary purview and the Governing Board relies primarily upon the faculty for the recommendation. A lateral transfer is a hiring decision. And because FSAs are used to that capacity, and we're one of the very few districts or colleges across the state that have that extra plus one. Because we have purview over hiring, it makes since why we have it. What doesn't make since is that somebody could apply for their FSA, they meet it. The FSA says a minimum of three years teaching part-time with positive evaluations. Once you get that FSA, you don't have to show anything else about maintaining that FSA. We don't require people to maintain that FSA even if you haven't taught in that FSA in 25 years. Senator Mudgett said he thinks there's some gaps to fill.

Senator Leann Maunu, in referring to the Contract's language giving departments the opportunity to discuss and vote on lateral transfers, she asked if there was any discussion about eliminating this opportunity because it would undermine department autonomy and department expertise. Senator Jarvinen said this was not being considered.

Senator Kelly Falcone asked for clarification questioning what happens in a lateral transfer situation if the candidate meets the FSA and all the extra experience, does a department still need to vote to approve? If so, why does the candidate need to meet all the extra qualifications if they may not get the transfer if the department vote is no? VP Fererro said this takes the place of the hiring process. Falcone added that we currently have different requirements for what our hiring practices are versus our lateral transfer process.

President Nelson said that when we hire new faculty, we should encourage them to apply for FSA because they may have the experience at that time. VP Fererro said a few years back, this recommendation was made to HR for the onboarding process but she doesn't know if it was added. Nelson also said that on the outside, sometimes it feels like we are putting things in place to make sure our colleagues can't teach in our area and it doesn't feel very collegial. She said that maybe the Contract should be changed so that when somebody comes through in a lateral transfer, they don't get to keep their seniority in the same way. Maybe a compromise can be made because it seems like if seniority is the problem, then we need to talk about this so that we remove barriers to prevent job loss.

Senator Jarvinen said the discussion confirms the confusion about FSAs and asked what can be done to clear this up or at least reach a common understanding.

Rosie Antonecchia said the issue is we are trying to protect our fulltime faculty in a reduction in force situation, but departments need to also be considered to maintain the integrity of their discipline. These are two different moving pieces; thus it creates confusion. She asked who has the authority to differentiate between the two and to determine the priority, and who has the authority to do what first?

Several Senators and President Nelson recommended that a discussion between FSA, PFF and HR take place.

C. VPI Recalde Introduction – W. Nelson

Vice President of Instruction Tina Recalde greeted Senators and thanked President Nelson for the invite.

Senator Leanne Maunu said that for Fall 23, there was a FTEF reduction even with good fill rates in the English Department as well as other departments. She asked if we should anticipate further FTEF cuts for Spring 24 planning. Secondly, when classes have been cancelled with low enrollment, those classes are permanently cut from our schedules. Senator Maunu said we don't have the opportunity to get those classes back again with our FTEF allocation. And asked VP Recalde for her thoughts regarding this practice.

VP Recalde said she is not anticipating any cuts and her plan is to roll over Spring FTES from last year. She will be asking for more FTEF because she feels she needs it to increase enrolment. She said that permanently canceling classes due to

low enrollment goes against everything that we do in terms of instruction and wanting students to be able to complete their programs and making sure that we have a pipeline going forward. She said that if a class was cancelled for this reason, she believes it should still be offered again. It may be in question if the sequencing is right. The direction that she would like to see Palomar move in is rather than having strict numbers that are used to decide cancellations, we move more to conversations between department chairs and Deans and then with the VPI about determining if there are a lot of classes with high enrollment, what classes can be run low enrollment to create a balance within a discipline and then a division within the College...creating more flexibility. VP Recalde added that when a class is brought back, the FTEF will it be based on what was previously allocated not based on what actually successfully ran.

VP Recalde went on to say that the ship has already sailed for Fall 2023. Moving forward though, there is an opportunity to think again of flexibility and how to shift FTEF over the entire academic year versus strict allocation for the term only should any class cancellations occur. VP Recalde will also be asking for extra or a "reserve" of FTEF to set aside and use for new programs or growth in certain areas.

Senator Falcone said the only way Palomar will grow is to offer more opportunities. Palomar has cut so much that so many students have left. We need more courses. She said we know that the Chancellor's Office is offering assistance for colleges to recover from low enrollments and hopes that Palomar is tapping into those resources for more growth. VP Recalde agreed and said the only way to recover is to grow.

President Nelson said more consideration is needed to maintain courses students need to complete degrees and certificates. Recalde agreed and said those are the conversations that should happen within the divisions. If there is no more FTEF available within that division, then we bring it to the next level. This Spring, Recalde said she is already having those conversations encouraging Deans to work with department chairs to build the Fast Track 2 classes so we could try to get some of that enrollment back. She said she is already having conversations about how to redistribute what's being used and not used among the different Ed Centers as well.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro asked VP Recalde about the future for Distance Education. Recalde responded saying Distance Education is staying. Determining though what disciplines makes since and where there is student demand. Being aware of CVC-OEI and making sure that Palomar is offering sufficient courses so that our students are not going somewhere else is also important. The CVC-OEI also gives Palomar an opportunity to teach students that aren't in our immediate area and finding that balance is important. Recalde said there is a need for more conversations around Distance Education and what it will look like moving forward. These conversations will take place as part of an enrollment management plan.

Senator Mudgett added that often times, faculty will work hard developing innovative programs and new curriculum with an expectation that it may take some time for those programs or courses to gain traction. Meanwhile, once they are launched, with an expectation of initial lower enrollments, the classes are cut due to low enrollment and can never come back. This stifles innovation and taking risks. These new programs and courses may be a tool Palomar can use to recover and grow enrollment. Recalde replied saying now more than ever, Palomar needs to be innovative and thinking outside the box of how to grow.

Senator Falcone said that Palomar should be honoring course commitments made especially in an intentionally designed program. Recalde agreed and said this is why she doesn't like hard numbers for cancellations. A faculty member should be able to go to the department chair, the chair should be able to go to the Dean and explain the intentions and ask for more time to fill enrollment before the class is cancelled due. She also said it's important for faculty to be included in these hard conversations with Chairs and Deans so we can be more strategic in planning management of classes.

Senator Faulkner said that faculty did not have a voice in any prior enrollment management process and she appreciated Recalde's point of view that faculty should be included. Recalde will prepare a plan over the summer to launch a new enrollment management plan taskforce and ensured that faculty will have a role.

D. Committee Reports (Exhibit 4) - W. Nelson

President Nelson shared the exhibit and said she will be asking faculty leaders of programs or committees, for annual yearend reporting to Senate. Council agrees. These reports will be presented orally during a Faculty Senate meeting. The reports should include goals, accomplishments, issues and concerns. This practice may also provide a better understanding of the work involved making a leadership role attractive to faculty. Senators unanimously agreed with the plan.

E. Senate Resolution on Lifelong Learning and Self-Development (Exhibit 5) – Falcone

Falcone addressed Faculty Senate about the impact of AB928 and the creation of a singular GE transfer pathway called Cal-GETC that does not include Lifelong Learning and Self-Development (LLSD). Currently, students follow the GE Advising Guide for CSU and IGETC to transfer to a UC. The CSU GE Advising guide includes LLSD. The majority (75-78%) of CCC students transfer to a CSU, thus have benefited from taking a course in LLSD. The new Cal-GETC pathway is based on IGETC and they chose not to include LLSD. There were many challenges in creating the singular pathway. The academic senates for both CSU and UC approved Cal-GETC. The ASCCC approved Cal-GETC with five resolutions in support of LLSD, showing there is concern about the decision not to include LLSD in the Cal-GETC pathway. Numerous other organizations and colleges have since written a resolution in support of LLSD and asking for further consideration of the possible impact to the CCC system due to this change. The CCC CEO/Trustees have written a resolution, along with districts and academic senates from Los Angeles Community College District, Contra Costa Community College District, Coast Community College District, and College of the Canyons. Statewide organizations, such as the CCC Physical Education, Kinesiology, and Dance have been advocating and leading letter writing campaigns. Falcone asked if Faculty Senate would be interested in joining in writing a resolution in support of LLSD. If so, Falcone will share a draft with Senate for review and approval at the next meeting.

VP Fererro supported the resolution but said a letter writing campaign to legislators may be better in terms of getting any movement at this point in the process but appreciates the optimism.

Senator Mudgett said community college students primarily transfer to the CSU who will now be held to the new Cal-GETC standards. There are significant impacts that our steering committee has to address over the next couple of years. ASCCC passed a resolution to encourage LLSD as a graduation requirement. On the CSU GE pattern, American History & Institutions is a graduation requirement. They don't have to take it to transfer, but it's better for them to take it here because it's less expensive and they get that much further along in their pathway. For the UC, the graduation requirement on IGETC is Language other than English, so it's a competency. So they're encouraging something similar, a graduation requirement, so that we can at least have the opportunity to provide our services in LLSD. Because the students are going to be held to the new standard and who are mostly CSU bound, there is an opportunity to address the importance of LLSD as a graduation requirement in a lower division level for us to teach that to support the students along the way. Students will be held to a new standard that they never really wanted and it doesn't meet their needs. The curriculum is less relevant than what our students want. There are significant issues in that LLSD addresses to help students along the way. The standards are to support students in their psychological, sociological, and physiological development. More than ever, our students are going to need those three components that LLSD supports trying to get through this new pattern. We might transfer eighty students to the UC but we transfer 800 to CSU so maybe there's a way for us to weave that in.

Senator Falcone said she sent a draft resolution to all of the department chairs who have impacted courses. Falcone will send the draft to Senators and President Nelson will add this to Action for the Senate meeting on March 13.

F. Committee on Committees will Provide Update on Committees – Tabled.

G. Student Success Teams Pilot Update - Tabled.

REPORTS

ASG (De La Cruz)

- I promoted the idea voiced a few weeks back about getting more support for online and hybrid students. As of the 24th of March, ASG has built an Ad Hoc committee on the lookout for student feedback & insight via questionnaire of sorts (details to come), which will now also include online and hybrid students as a key audience. Thank you to the faculty members that discussed that issue a few weeks back. ASG benefited from that reminder to keep an eye out for non-in person students.
- I have attended our 03/03 ICC meeting, Inter Club Council, and contacted the Chair to begin the process of touching up a possible Google interest form for faculty members willing to advise a club. Details to follow, but huge thank you to everyone who has at least **considered** advising one. I will discuss this further with your chair, W. Nelson, and the ICC Chair, P. Rodriguez.
- For any questions referring to my position or role in ASG/ Faculty Senate, what my personal thoughts are on a specific thing mentioned in this meeting, or otherwise, please reach me via email- kdelacruz@palomar.edu ; While I can't always speak entirely on behalf of all our students or for ASG itself, I *can* always bring a certain topic of interest to ASG and report back to you our collaborative thoughts. Please continue considering student input and opinions for all Palomar College-related matters (except faculty-district negotiations, I forgot what those are called, but everything else that includes students is worth mentioning to us).
- HUGE THANK YOU to Erin Hiro for stopping by at our last meeting (03/03) and getting the word out regarding The Telescope and the student voice for the Academic Integrity Task Force. We look forward to having a possible rotation of faculty members joining us every week (Fridays 11:15 a.m. - 12:45 p.m., our agenda is posted on the bulletin board near the bathrooms in the Student Union every Tues.)
- As always, if you currently help with a club or student program on campus and would like to boost your Instagram reach- or just have your images posted on our ASG Instagram- be sure to just DM them directly to @palomarcollege.asg (or follow us, too!)
- Please report back to the Faculty Senate Chair on whether you all would be okay with having ASG members come to your classes and present for a few minutes on what we do, what resources we offer, and possibly mention the ASG elections coming up. Whether this be a raise or hands or a discussion about what the presentations / time slots might look like, I'd appreciate your feedback. I look forward to hearing your thoughts from your Chair or discussing this at the next meeting when I'm present.
- Thank you again for having our (student) voice be heard at your meetings. Huge shoutout to the Women's Basketball program too, by the way. Legends.

President (Nelson)

I attended the following meetings this week: VPSS hiring committee planning meeting, Accreditation Steering Committee, New Program Process, EESSC agenda review, Budget Subcommittee, DEIAA Framework Workgroup and the reception for VPs.

Here are some highlights:

Accreditation Steering Committee – We briefly discussed the follow-up report and reviewed our progress. We reviewed the questions in the Annual Report and the Annual Fiscal report both due April 14, 2023.

New Program Process – This workgroup of curriculum is currently discussing how we can improve and streamline the new program approval process. The recommendations will be shared at the curriculum committee.

Budget Subgroup – The meeting began with a discussion of ACCJC requirements. The top CFI criteria that most frequently contribute to low scores: 1) Primary Reserve Ratio 2) Operating Revenue Ratio 3) Surplus or Deficit 4) College Enrollment 5) Funded Ratio: OPEB 6) Audit issues 7) Leadership Changes. We discussed these areas at Palomar College.

We also remarked that the 85% rule was not on this list. We reviewed a list of colleges with the sum of salaries and benefits as a %. Palomar College was 28 highest out of 71 at 84.6%. Over half of the schools were over 80%.

DEIAA Framework Workgroup – this workgroup started meeting last spring with members from Senate, Curriculum and PD. We have been reviewing the ASCCC framework and how we can implement some of the practices at Palomar College. We spent our meeting identifying areas of responsibility and action for each area in the document. We need to discuss our recommendations and then we will bring them back to Faculty Senate.

CCC Baccalaureate Degree Workshop – I spent two days at Golden West College learning about the CCC bachelor's degree Programs. The presentations included: Overview of Application Process, ACCJC Approval Process, Research needed for Baccalaureate Programs, Funding and Financial Aid, Impact on Curriculum Inventory System and Curriculum and the Academic Senate and Faculty and Articulations Perspectives.

Accreditation (Versaci)

Michelle Barton and I met on Monday, February 20 to review my notes on the updates from the workgroups. Revisions to those updates are pending additional information from the workgroups. We are still on track to have a revised follow up report by the end of March.

College Council (Nelson/Fererro)

College Council met on 2/24. In addition to reports from all constituencies, the Council discussed and approved the governance structure of the DEIAA Competencies and Criteria task force. It was reiterated that any products of this task force that influence evaluations will need to be negotiated by the bargaining units. The Council also reviewed BP 3570 and discussed the challenges involved in enforcing smoking and vaping bans on campus.

Equivalency (Klinger)

The Equivalency Committee is currently reviewing applications.

PFF (Lawson)

PFF is currently planning Meet Your Trustee events for April—a social, non-business event to meet Trustees on a personal level. More info soon.

If you're a PFF member, please pass this scholarship application to anyone in your family who is looking for college scholarships: <https://tinyurl.com/PFFScholarship> Application deadline is May 12th 2023.

The Palomar Faculty Federation (PFF) is accepting nominations between now and March 9, 2023 for the following PFF Executive Board positions, Two-year terms- May 2023 through May 2025: One part-time faculty Co-President; Two full-time faculty Executive Board Members; Two part-time faculty Executive Board Members; Two at-large Executive Board Members (full- or part-time faculty); to nominate a colleague, please use this form: <https://tinyurl.com/PFFNominate>

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)

The Teamwork ILO rubric is going through Curriculum for approval or changes 3/1/23.

The SLO Co-coordinators will be meeting with SLO Facilitators the weeks of 3/6 and 3/13.

The Teamwork ILO notifications to assess are scheduled to be emailed on 3/20/2023 for all faculty who have a course this semester that has at least one SLO that maps to Teamwork.

Since we met last semester with META to see their SLO assessment options, we will be meeting with Nuventive staff on 3/14/2023 at 10am for a demo of their current platform.

LOSC is refining the Visual Communications ILO rubric this semester for a scheduled assessment in Fall 2023.

ADJOURNMENT The meeting was adjourned at 4:02 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary