



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
April 11, 2022

APPROVED

PRESENT: Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Marie-Therese Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Alyssa Vafaei, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Leigh Marshall

GUESTS: Abbie Cory, Matt Grills, Adriana Guillen, Barbara Hammons, Billianne McLellan, Lisette Ordoria Lasater, Elyse Real, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Stacey Trujillo

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Abbie Cory, faculty, Director of the Pride Center and Chair of the Pride Center Committee to Combat Hate referenced legislation being passed in states such as Texas and Florida and others which makes Cory and her fellow Pride Center members concerned. Cory made the following statement:

On March 30 of this year, the journal *Inside Higher Education* reported that, to date, there have been a record 238 anti-LGBTQ bills introduced in state legislatures across the country since January 1. These include the so-called "Don't Say Gay" bill signed into law by Florida Governor Ron DeSantis on March 28 and Texas Governor Greg Abbot's February directive that all minors undergoing gender transition be reported to the state. Thirteen states have also banned trans girls and women from participating in women's sports, and a "ban the books" movement is sweeping the nation. These attacks on the LGBTQIA+ community are infuriating and heartbreaking. Those who have written this legislation do so only to curtail our freedom and spread hate wherever possible. Such laws do not protect families or morality, as their proponents claim, but rather lead to further oppression, persecution, and violence against LGBTQIA+ people.

The Palomar College Pride Center and PC3H (Pride Center Committee to Combat Hate) hold solidarity with those who oppose hateful, dangerous, and ignorant bills like the "Don't Say Gay" bill in Florida and the Anti-Trans directive in Texas. Homo- and trans-phobia have no place in our school systems, whether that be K-12 or higher education.

We invite the Palomar Community to continue to educate themselves about LGBTQIA+ issues, whether on your own or by attending a Pride Center event or PC3H meeting. We continue to support all members of the LGBTQIA+ community and will persist in our goal of creating and maintaining safe places on campus for that community and our allies. We want to remind everyone that we are strong. We have fought and won

countless legal battles, and strategies like these will not hold us down or push us back in the closet. LGBTQIA+ folks in Florida, Texas, and elsewhere, we support you. We will persist.

In unity,

- Your Palomar Pride Center and PC3H Family

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner reminded everyone about the concert hour on Thursday, April 14 featuring Jaeryoung Lee. Carol Seefeldt and Chris Kim will perform on April 21. On April 22, Latin Nights takes place and will feature a salsa band, dancing and refreshments. This happens in the Performing Arts Center Courtyard. More information about all events can be found here: <https://www.palomar.edu/palomarperforms/>

Senator and Chair of Committee on Committees Anastasia Zavodny reminded Senators about Political Economy Days happening April 19 through April 21. More information regarding each session can be found in the PD Portal.

Senator Alyssa Vafaei reminded everyone about the Palomar Equity Speaker Series event on April 14 featuring Catarina Rivera, a disabled Latina activist.

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/drc/files/2022/03/EquitySpeakerSeriesCatarinaRivera.Accessible.pdf>

Senator Susan Miller reminded Senators about the Palomar Pride event taking place on May 11. It will be a carnival atmosphere with music, food and fun things to do. For more information and to sign up to participate, click here:

https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1cA7mVo8J8TZluekpMzYk3uUUGtXdP_xuKmkMkH-UewE/edit#gid=1888308970

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated April 4, 2022 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of actions taken at the April 6, 2022 Curriculum meeting (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson explained F.3. ACTION: Math Competency in detail and responded to general questions asked by Senators regarding changes mandated by the State (AB705).

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmations for the following faculty positions (see Exhibit 3):

The motion carried.

Valedictorian Selection Committee – **Adriana Guillen**, Faculty, short-term position

Faculty Position Priority Hiring – **Christine (Tina) Barlolong**, Faculty, Student Services or At-large

Motion 4 MSC: Zavodny/Faulkner Faculty Senate approval of the results of the ballot for the selection of faculty positions on the VP of Instruction Hiring Committee (see Exhibit 4):

The motion carried.

Ben Mudgett, AMBA - **Jason Jarvinen**, CTE - **Stacey Trujillo**, L&L

Julie Van Houten, MSE - **Jenny Fererro**, SBS - **Alyssa Vafaei**, Student Services

Motion 5 MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq Faculty Senate approval of the following committee confirmation:

The motion carried.

VP of Finance & Administrative Services Hiring Committee – **Wendy Nelson**

Motion 6 MSC: Zavodny/Fererro Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmations of faculty positions on the VP of Finance & Administrative Services Hiring Committee (see Exhibit 4):

The motion carried.

VP of Finance & Administrative Services Hiring Committee - **Marlene Forney**, L&L

VP of Finance & Administrative Services Hiring Committee – **Barbara Baer**, SBS

C. **Appointment of Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair**

Motion 7 MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq Faculty Senate approval to confirm Rocco Versaci as the Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair for one year beginning Fall 2022.

The motion passed.

Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair – **Rocco Versaci**

D. **Appointment of Curriculum Committee Co-Chair**

Motion 8 MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq Faculty Senate approval to confirm Ben Mudgett as the Curriculum Committee Co-Chair for one year beginning Fall 2022 (see Exhibit 5).

The motion passed.

Curriculum Committee Co-Chair – **Ben Mudgett**

E. **HyFlex Proposal/Resolution**

Motion 9 MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq Faculty Senate approval of the HyFlex Resolution created by the DE Committee with the edits discussed during Senate today (see Exhibit 6).

Abstention: Beatrice Manneh

The motion passed.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro said she brought Faculty Senate's edits back to the DE Committee and those edits are now reflected in the current version of the document. The exhibit was sent to Senators on Friday but the document has a few extra edits (in red) which she shared during the meeting. One of the most significant changes was to add an asynchronous component to a HyFlex class. Senator Hiro said she did feel this option may hurt the "community sense" but didn't have a problem with adding it at the request of World Languages. Current HyFlex instructors felt that the spirit of HyFlex is the community of an in-class (classroom) with students in the physical classroom working live dialogue with the ZOOM students.

Senator Hiro said the DE Committee doesn't believe HyFlex will solve problems with getting back in the classroom as this issue is a totally separate and different challenge. The DE Committee supports HyFlex because it allows for accessibility. This option is not being forced on faculty but rather it offers another option for faculty to use where it seems appropriate.

Senator Lawrence Lawson said the addition of asynchronous makes it seem that faculty is teaching two courses at the same time which may make it a workload issue. This came up this semester and an MOU was created so faculty could be compensated for this extra work. Senator Lawrence also shared his student equity concern regarding international students and possibly veterans who may not yet have nine face-to-face units at Palomar and who are not eligible to take a HyFlex class (HyFlex is considered DE).

Senate VP Jenny Fererro acknowledged and agreed with Senator Lawrence's concerns and said she is not in support of adding "asynchronous" because this does become a workload issue and could result in complications in terms of having to negotiate compensation on an individual basis.

Senator Scott Nelson said that World Languages supported adding the asynchronous option because it was meant to replace the synchronous ZOOM meeting...not both simultaneously. World Languages doesn't feel that synchronous HyFlex works for their department because of the way the language classes are taught. The asynchronous option would give World Languages students more flexibility which is needed in the smaller programs at Palomar.

Senator Alyssa Vafaei explained that DRC is in support of HyFlex primarily because it offers equity in accessibility...equitable access for students with disabilities.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner said that in regard to the asynchronous portion of HyFlex, that could be an option of their own choosing by faculty and not necessarily reflected in the Resolution. Faculty can independently choose whether or not to offer asynchronously, just as long as the students have the choice to attend synchronously. Senator Hiro said this asynchronous component is often used along with HyFlex at other colleges but will delete this from the document.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Scholarly & Professional Achievement Award Committee

Senate President Rocco Versaci asked for volunteers to serve on the committee to make a recommendation for the Scholarly & Professional Achievement Award. Senators Molly Faulkner, Teresa Laughlin and Erin Hiro volunteered to serve.

B. Joint-Appointed Coordinators Evaluations (see Exhibit 7)

Senator Lawrence Lawson thanked fellow Senators Anastasia Zavodny and Wendy Nelson for working with him to come up with the draft. Senator Lawson explained the document. This evaluation would only apply to positions that are jointly appointed with the District. Lawson and Nelson added a version of this document could be used by Faculty Senate to evaluate positions solely appointed by Faculty Senate.

Senator Ben Mudgett added that evaluations in general are meant to measure and promote continuous improvement. Someone in any of these positions should also be provided with an improvement plan that provides professional development, institutional support, workshops, trainings and conferences to help that person be successful in the position.

VP Fererro, as the PFF negotiator said she is very hesitate to support this due to the fact that it is closely related to negotiations related to evaluations and discipline and may not fall under the Senate's purview. If this moves forward though, Senate needs to be careful about how this is structured so it does not read as an evaluation that could lead to improvement plans and discipline.

President Versaci said the creation of this document is furthering an agreement between the District, Faculty Senate and PFF. For now, this will only go to VP of Instruction only for feedback. Senator Wendy Nelson asked Senator Laughlin to present to PFF to get feedback. Versaci said he would hold up sending to VP of Instruction for now.

C. DRC Recording Agreements, etc. (see Exhibit 8)

Senator Alyssa Vafaei said she initially brought this issue up during an EEDCC meeting when a discussion took place about her colleagues who have been harassed, bullied or threatened. One of those ways was the sharing of course material or presentations. Someone asked whether the College could do something to help protect these types of materials. Senator Vafaei said DRC students have access to class recordings and there are agreements in place that students must abide by or there are consequences.

Senator Vafaei then shared DRC's student recording agreement with Senators. Vafaei added that the Standards of Student Conduct (AP 5500) also covers some of this and Vafaei recommends these documents and policies be updated to address current threats.

President Versaci said that this was prompted in part by a recent online article in which some faculty members of color doing DEI work were targeted and featured a screenshot from a faculty member's Canvas page.

There was some discussion regarding the definition of "for commercial use" and it needs to be updated to include any personal use. Senator Fererro said these acts are often times hard to uncover because its not clear who is making the threats.

Hossna Sadat Ahadi said that the person Senator Vafaei is referring to and who actually sent the information to Young American Foundation was easy to identify. Those investigating the incident said they looked at the student's Canvas account and saw similarities of language that was used in the article. This student dropped the class immediately after CRT was shared in the course. There was only one student in the class who was blatantly against the course from the beginning. This is free speech but this exploitation on faculty of color helped the organization to raise close to \$20,000 from Republican parties across the nation. This Foundation does this intentionally because that's how they make money then using it to generate funding for campaigns against Ethnic Studies, CRT and being anti antiracism. Sadat Ahadi hopes Palomar can look at these policies in online classes.

President Versaci asked that this item be brought back to Senate for further discussion to see how Senate can help turn this into an institutionalized policy.

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad)

- The Associated Student Government recently opened up applications to the Student Body to run for any position of the ASG Board for the upcoming Academic Year. We will be hosting our Election Forum in person and online, and Voting will begin at the end of April.
- We are prepping to welcome the new members and are engaging students through a series of Campus Events, one of which will be happening this Thursday from 11-1. We hope to see all of you at World Health Event!
- The ASG attended the SSCCC Conference on April 1-3. The members of the Board who attended were: ASG President: Marie-Therese Mouawad, Vice-President Roxanna Vega: Student Trustee: Rachel Alazar, VP of Club Affairs: Tyesha Tate, VP of Finance: Christopher Garcia Mendez, VP of Communications: Vivian Sanchez Rojas, Secretary David Williams, and Senator Oseas Garcia.
- I am happy to report ASG represented Palomar through the discussions and debates on the Resolution packet presented at the conference.
- We hope that future ASG's will continue to do the same.

President (Versaci)

At the Governing Board meeting on April 5, I read aloud the statement written by EEDCC and delivered to the Senate on April 4. This statement outlined the anonymous threats being made against faculty at the vanguard of Palomar's DEI efforts and made a call for specific actions for the District to take. Governing Board members seemed concerned by this and called for an immediate action plan to address the situation. I will continue to follow up on this matter with President Rivera-Lacey and others.

Dean Leslie Salas contacted me the week before spring break, and we met on March 21 to discuss the Umoja program. She expressed that the District is interested in having something in place for Fall 2022, and I shared with her the Joint Appointment agreement between the Senate and District, which includes Umoja. I initially said that I would ask for two Senate volunteers to join me and the relevant administrators in crafting the job announcement (as outlined in the agreement) but given our discussion last Monday regarding our collective DEI efforts, I instead asked Leslie and VP Lakhani to come to Senate to outline the plan more fully. I explained that one concern Senate has is the systemic lack of support that led to the previous Umoja Co-Coordinators resigning, and the Senate would be reluctant to participate in the selection of new coordinators if those issues have not been addressed. Both Leslie and Vikash will join us for our 4/18 meeting in a dedicated agenda item.

College Council (Versaci)

College Council met on Friday, March 25 and on Friday, April 8 (this latter meeting coming before Senate but after reports were due). One item for discussion from the 3/25 meeting was the formation of an "Access and Universal Design" committee. This was previously discussed in EESSC, and the subject of committee size and representation came up once again.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci) - The EESSC next meets on Friday, April 15.

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro) – No report.

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) – No report.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

- Co-chair Sadat Ahadi shared a statement on 4/4/22 on behalf of the EEDCC subcommittee regarding the recent threats to DEI faculty advocates at Palomar College. Faculty Senate will be sharing this collective statement at the 4/5/22 Board of Trustees meeting.
- This week the subcommittee plans to discuss student agreement/consent to not share course content on social media and online platforms outside of Palomar College.
- Alyssa Vafaei will be presenting at the 4/11/22 Faculty Senate meeting about policy that states the protection of course content and sharing DRC agreement document.

Accreditation (Meehan) - No report.

Distance Education (Hiro) – No report.

Guided Pathways (W. Nelson) – No report.

Budget (Ferrerro) – No report.

TERB (Lawson) - No report. TERB will meet next week.

Professional Development (Guerrero) – No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson) - No report. The AB705 Senate Subcommittee next meets on April 14.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) - No report. The Sabbatical Leave Committee will meet next week.

Equivalency (Towfiq) - No report.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) - No report.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary