



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
April 4, 2022

APPROVED

PRESENT: Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Alyssa Vafaei, Rocco Versaci, David Williams (ASG), Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Teresa Laughlin

GUESTS: Michelle Barton, Leah Brown, Cynthia Cordova, Mark Evilsizer, Mireya Gutierrez-Aguero, Melissa Haickel Bagaglio, Barbara Hammons, Leanne Maunu, Billieanne McLellan, Lisette Ordorica Lasater, Tina-Marie Parker, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Mercedes Tiggs

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENT – No public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro announced that the San Diego Chapter of the American Association for Women of Color is accepting nominations from each college for the 2022 SDCAAWCC Women of the Year Awards. Each college can have a winner in each of the following categories: Student, Faculty, Classified, and Administrator. Please nominate as many people as you like as we want Palomar to be well represented for the amazing women doing work for our College community. Nominations are due by April 5 using the following link: <https://forms.gle/uhbNqdtEcRplX1Cp8>

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett said as a co-facilitator of the San Diego/Imperial Queer Alliance, he is leading the policy and advocacy group and forming a coalition to help the research team change the way LGBTQ data is collected. He asked that any interested volunteers to help with this project should contact him directly.

Senator Mudgett also announced that he attended the LGBTQ funding meeting last week. There is now an AB132 \$10 million trailer bill to help fund the support of LGBTQ students. (See the 2021-22 Categorical Programs Allocation Report Volume 2 [link](#) and see table of contents #4. LGBTQ+ program allocation memo).

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro reminded Senate of their approval from Fall 2020 to allow Palomar to become a CVC-OEI Home College and Teaching College. The last hurdle was just cleared recently so the switch for the Home College is ready and will become active shortly. More work is required in order to get Palomar live with the Teaching College.

Senator Hiro also announced that Palomar's online proctoring is close and she's looking for faculty who use Proctorio and who might want to go to online proctoring to test it next week and to provide feedback. Email her at ehiro@palomar.edu

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner reminded Senators of the 8 Plus 88 concert hour on Thursday, April 7 from 1 to 2 pm in the theatre. On April 8, there is an Applied Music Recital from 12:30 to 1:30. April 9, Palomar Chamber Singers along with the Palomar Symphony Orchestra will be performing at 7 PM in the theatre as well. More information can be found here: <https://www.palomar.edu/palomarperforms/>

Senator Alyssa Vafaei said she's been collaborating with colleagues across other departments to bring DRC into other events around campus. Katrina Rivera, a disabled Latina activist will be coming to Palomar on April 14. <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/drc/files/2022/03/EquitySpeakerSeriesCatarinaRivera.Accessible.pdf>

Senator Susan Miller reminded Senators about the Palomar Pride event taking place on May 11. It will be a carnival atmosphere with music, food and fun things to do. If any department is interested in setting up a table, click here: https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1cA7mVo8J8TZluekpMzYk3uUUGtXdP_xuKmkMkH-UewE/edit#gid=1888308970

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: W. Nelson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated March 21, 2022 (see Exhibit 1).

Abstention: Alexandra Doyle Bauer

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said no action was required. She said Curriculum will be discussing the math competence requirements for the AA degree on Wednesday, April 6. There is a required change which will have a big impact on the students. The meeting is from 3 to 5 PM and anyone is welcomed to come.

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 2 MSC: Zavodny/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of the following committee appointments (see Exhibit 2):

The motion carried.

Faculty Position Priority Committee - **Candace Rose**, Faculty, AMBA
Faculty Position Priority Committee – **Jason Jarvinen**, Faculty, CTE

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Manneh

Faculty Senate approval of the following committee confirmations:

The motion carried.

Faculty Position Priority Committee – **Cindy Anfinson**, Faculty, MSE
Faculty Position Priority Committee – **Jenny Ferrero**, Faculty, SBS

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said there is still a need to fill faculty positions immediately on the Valedictorian Selection Committee and the New Programs Committee. Senator Zavodny said she also needs faculty volunteers for hiring committees for both the VP of Instruction and the VP of Finance.

Motion 4 MSC: Zavodny/Manneh

Faculty Senate approval of the following committee confirmation:

The motion carried.

Valedictorian Selection Committee – **Lawrence Lawson, Faculty**

C. Hyflex Proposal/Resolution

Motion 5 MSC: Hiro/Sanchez

Faculty Senate approval of the resolution on HyFlex (see Exhibit 3).

The vote is delayed until April 11, 2022

Senator Lawson said HyFlex classes fall into the online category and veterans and international students can't take a HyFlex class unless they already have 9 face-to-face units. Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro said the Chancellor's Office is working on a special designation for HyFlex but it hasn't been finalized yet.

Senator Scott Nelson asked Senator Hiro if the state, other colleges or is Palomar thinking about offering asynchronous HyFlex classes or other HyFlex options. Hiro explained that for her and other faculty at Palomar teaching HyFlex classes, there is the live class (synchronous) online with ZOOM, along with an asynchronous component. This is the true definition of a HyFlex course but is optional here at Palomar. The key is flexibility and student choice. Senator Nelson asked Senator Hiro to edit the resolution to make this clear.

Senate Vice President Jenny Ferrero thanked Palomar faculty who piloted this method and modality. She expressed concerns with the first two resolves because there isn't flexibility in how those are worded and doesn't know if enough information is known yet for Senate to permanently endorse or even adopting HyFlex, or to encourage administrators to promote HyFlex as "the" solution for getting more students back on campus. She would be in favor of the resolution if the first two resolves were worded in a way that encouraged continued exploration of HyFlex and gave departments and faculty flexibility to choose HyFlex. She thinks the resolution is worded in a way that puts Senate in a position to be stating something that confidently can't be stated yet. If these suggested changes were not made, Senator Ferrero would not vote in favor of the resolution as it now reads.

Senate President Rocco Versaci agreed with VP Ferrero's comments and added that the commitment to fully embrace this possibly may be at the expense of other options including adding more money towards face-to-face classes or adding more money towards more HyFlex classes. This resolution may be taken as a push for financial backing of just HyFlex classes.

Senator Hiro said the language can definitely be softened in the resolution. This document is not designed to make faculty adopt HyFlex. This is designed to make the administration pay attention to it because they don't want to deal with it right now by putting up obstacles to allow it. If faculty wants more classes on campus, everyone needs to be in support of creative ways to make that happen and that is what this is about. Hiro added that faculty will need to be trained in teaching HyFlex and wants administration to pay for it. Senator Hiro said as the DE Coordinator she needs to be proactive and push for creative ways to teach classes "post-COVID." Some types of classes will look and feel different.

Senator Tanessa Sanchez supports HyFlex but said many students aren't even aware of HyFlex classes being offered at Palomar. While Palomar tries to meet students' needs, students must be well informed. It's about offering an option to both faculty and students who may not be ready to come back face-to-face or who prefer online teaching and learning.

Senator Alyssa Vafaei said she doesn't feel this is a matter of having to choose between face-to-face or HyFlex. HyFlex is face-to-face and a creative way to help students get back on campus. She said HyFlex is not new. She took HyFlex classes in 2005 at Sacramento State and appreciated the option of going to campus for the class or staying home to be in the class and it worked well for her. Senator Vafaei said there is this fear that faculty will be teaching to an empty classroom but this isn't true. Students are logged in or there in person. DRC fully supports HyFlex and having options for students and this is one of the ultimate examples of implementing universal design for learning. Palomar is all about equity of access to education and this is it. Students have flourished in this virtual environment because their homes are accessible to them when the Palomar campus is not.

Senator Leigh Marshall said she attended the Area D meetings and said this was a hot topic there. Basically, the issues were that institutions were pushing the HyFlex on faculty without providing proper training and the other was academic freedom...telling faculty how to teach their classes.

Senator Lawrence Lawson reminded Senate that ESL, specifically international students, HyFlex classes are not face-to-face classes according to the State and this needs to be fixed.

Senator Anastasia Zavodny asked for the current count of classrooms that can accommodate HyFlex classes and then asked how the College will decide which classes will have access to those rooms. Senator Hiro said there are approximately 30 classrooms wired for HyFlex. Many meeting rooms have also been updated using Herff funding. There are efforts being made to ensure that every department has access to a room ready for HyFlex.

Consensus was reached asking Hiro to take the document back to DE to make changes this week and bring the resolution back to Senate on April 11.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Becoming HSI Book Club Recommendations (see Exhibit 4)

Cynthia Cordova, assistant professor and Puente counselor/co-coordinator said she came to Senate to share information about the Hispanic Serving institutions (HSI) Book Club. There have been many calls to action over the last few years for DEI antiracist effort. In the midst of all of that, she noticed there wasn't anything actually taking place for Hispanic Heritage Month and didn't know why. Her colleagues explained to her that it's kind of up to individuals to make that happen. This forced Cordova to ask if the College was really serving the populations they say they are serving. Cordova did some research and asked her colleagues to help form this book club. Funding for the book club came from the Equity Council and PFF. Cordova explained the learning process, the creation and then recommendations outlined in the document to become a better HSI.

Senator Lawson asked Cordova what she needs from Faculty Senate to support the efforts. Cordova said that for right now, she is sharing this information with different groups on campus and soliciting volunteers to make things happen. Eventually, she would like to see if Faculty Senate would support and adopt the recommendations and then push for these efforts to become institutionalized by the College.

Hossna Sadat Ahadi said in 2018, she brought outcomes to Faculty Senate for Black Minds Matter Book Club. And although most Senators were in support, only one change was made two years later and that was not because of the book club but because of the wokeness of the institution. Palomar is still reluctant to create systemic changes at the institution. Sadat Ahadi encouraged Faculty Senate to hold the institution accountable for implementing recommendations made by the Black Minds Matter Book Club and now the HSI Book Club and DEI committees' recommendations.

Senator Lawson said a group of Senators should meet to come up with a resolution in support of the recommendations of both book club recommendations to present to the institution which can be the roadmap for moving forward. Volunteers are Senators Wendy Nelson, Lawrence Lawson, Anastasia Zavodny, Jason Jarvinen, Jenny Ferrero, Alyssa Vafaei and Tanessa Sanchez.

B. Update from EEDCC

Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Co-Chair of EEDCC made the following statement:

Palomar College employees have recently experienced anonymous threats of bodily harm and other violent acts privately and on social media due to their racial identity, DEI, social justice, and antiracism work. These threats have continued with no signs of abatement, and we are horrified and dismayed at both the threats themselves and the lack of transparency with handling such critical matters. Social justice, DEI, and antiracism has become the greatest threat to white supremacy and colonialism, and these attempts to silence progress and change is history repeating itself. Historically, we know lack of action is complicity, and this inaction places people and systems on the wrong side of history and results in individuals and communities to live in fear.

We again invoke the concept of In Lak 'Ech, or "you are my other me:" an attack on one member of our campus community is an attack on us all, and it impacts the entire institution. If an employee cannot feel safe on campus or in their own home as a result of work performed to fulfill the College's mission, our existing policies and procedures have failed and require revision.

Palomar College leadership must take immediate action to protect the physical and emotional well-being of employees under threat, build solidarity from the entire college community, and enact policies and procedures that respond nimbly to counter-act incidents as they occur. These threats are acts of domestic terrorism intended to reverse the great work of employees on behalf of the most vulnerable and marginalized students in our society, and ultimately to undermine the mission of our college and our educational system. College leadership must address this situation with courage and not give in to a regime of fear and silence. Let us learn from the narratives and experiences of those who have experienced inequities, discrimination, racism, and sexism for the sole purpose of dismantling them. These threats denigrate the entire community college system and the call to action we have been charged with. All members of our district are expected to support and stand in solidarity with DEI efforts at our campus.

As the Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness, we invite Faculty Senate to join us in solidarity to take a public stand against people who threaten others' lives, and to join us in our pursuit of creating a safe and supportive environment for all employees to do DEI work.

We call on College leadership to be the leaders that they have been tasked to be; to implement policies and procedures that will allow the district to address threats against faculty with a sense of urgency, and to publicly recognize the trauma and harm these threats have caused to the targeted faculty and their families. What follows is not a complete list, but a starting point for change we as a campus so urgently need:

- *Acknowledgement and transparency of threats to Palomar employees*
- *Swift and public condemnation of threatening and hateful attacks*
- *Response with urgency to support employees*
- *Immediately draft a plan to respond to these threats, which will then be brought to all constituent groups for feedback and input*
- *Proactive and intentional actions to provide protection and safety by creating and implementing practices to cultivate a physically and psychologically safe environment, rather than a reactive approach that places burden on targeted employees*
- *Develop a safe reporting mechanism in collaboration with EEDCC and HR to keep a record, provide support, and accountability*

- *Align intention with action for social justice, DEI, and antiracism work and Palomar employees who conduct/embody these efforts for the Palomar College community*

In the words of bell hooks, “sometimes people try to destroy you, precisely because they recognize your power—not because they don’t see it, but because they see it and they don’t want it to exist.”

Senator Lawson thanked Sadat Ahadi for bringing the statement to Faculty Senate and reminded Senators of what Trustee Miyamoto said a few weeks back at Faculty Senate about the permanency of BP/AP3000 Antiracist DEI initiatives on campus in the face of the possibility of a new governing board. She said it was not permanent. The people who are listening to carry this work forward, its important to continue those efforts.

C. Review of Annual ACCJC Report (see Exhibit 5)

Michelle Barton said every year Palomar submits a fiscal report and an annual report to ACCJC. In the annual report, Palomar identifies what our institution set standards are and the stretch goals. Every year, she comes to Senate to ask Senate to look at items to see if any changes are requested. Because Palomar has had a significant hit on enrollment and the approach used as a result of the pandemic for assigning specific withdraw grades, Barton recommended that Senate does not revise or modify this set standards or the goals. Barton went on to say that because we don't quite know the impact of the decrease in enrollment on some of the outcomes metrics down the road. Barton explained the report with Senate and explained a correction she made after the document was sent to Senators last week.

Senate President Versaci confirmed Michelle’s Barton recommendation to keep the report as is with no changes or adjustments.

D. Student Engagement Proposal from ASG (see Exhibit 6)

ASG representative David Williams provided an overview of his presentation. Williams said ASG feels like there is a lack of student engagement as a result of COVID. One of the ways ASG feels may increase engagement is by addressing class enrollment management. Right now, the schedule is considered static, limiting students to 19 units per semester. ASG recognizes that exceptions are made but often students are unaware of how to get through that petition process. ASG would like to see this changed to dynamic, meaning a student could go into their account online and add classes to their current semester when their current units (maybe after a 4 week course or intersession course is over) to add more units to that same semester. In other words, not waste any “weeks” during a semester when a student could actually be enrolled in and taking 19 units throughout the entire semester.

Senator Wendy Nelson asked Williams if he was aware of other colleges making this change. Williams said that while attending an ACCJC Conference, he heard other colleges were considering this change as well. He said that some comments were made that in some instances, students can bypass CCCApply to take courses at other community colleges. He also said that ASG recognizes that ED Code may need to be changed.

Several Senators voiced their support for this change and asked what Senate could do here at Palomar to help remove barriers. Williams asked if Senate could get feedback from faculty to see who supports a change and then start from there. Senator Fererro asked Williams if there was a way to determine how many students are attempting to take more than 19 units a semester and to collect that data to present in pursuit of institutional buy in. Fererro also said that students taking that many units may most likely need additional support to be successful in the classroom so infrastructure for that support is also needed and well planned for. Williams said that student success is ultimately the most important and added that the current face-to-face campus tutoring this semester has been exceptional for students.

E. “Better Know a Trustee”

Palomar College Trustee Mark Evilsizer thanked Faculty Senate for inviting him to the meeting today. Due to time constraints, Trustee Evilsizer deferred his time to allow for a full presentation by ASG.

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad) – No report.

President (Versaci)

I resent the call for Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair (closing date Friday, March 25) and send out a call for the Curriculum Co-Chair (closing date Friday, April 8). Both will be for one-year terms to finish out the current position holders' terms (Adam Meehan and Wendy Nelson, respectively). Unfortunately, there were no applicants for the Accreditation position, so I will put that call out once again.

Senate VP Jenny Ferrero and I met with President Rivera-Lacey on Monday, March 21 (with VPHR David Montoya) to discuss the Faculty Hiring Procedures and on Friday, March 25 as our regular, monthly meeting. The topics for the latter meeting were both the Faculty Hiring Procedures and a request for an update on the action plan regarding Campus Police following the campus forum on 5/27/21.

There will be an informational item on the Governing Board's April 5 agenda regarding the Faculty Hiring Procedures. I will provide them with an overview of the topic, the Senate's role in faculty hiring, a summation of/rationale for the changes we made, and our desire to explore options regarding where/how these procedures are housed and how they fit into shared governance. As to this latter item, Jenny and I will be meeting with President Rivera-Lacey, Vice President Montoya, and District Counsel sometime during the week of April 11 to discuss.

The Area D meeting was held virtually on Saturday, March 19. Jenny attended the early session and Senator/Councilmember Leigh Marshall attended the afternoon session (when resolutions were being discussed). She provided the following notes on two resolutions that generated debate:

- **Competencies:** The discussion was based on the idea that we should be using competency statements instead of tying competencies to particular disciplines. The example given was that there are other classes outside of English that could meet the "written expression" requirement; that is, a business writing course could meet the requirement for competency in written expression, thus allowing a student to more easily continue the pathway towards their own specific career goal.
- **Hyflex:** The main concerns were that institutions seemed to be pushing Hyflex on their faculty without training, which forced use of Hyflex could violate academic freedom (faculty not wanting to teach via Hyflex), and the negative impacts of Hyflex modalities on the quality of education. Also, for-profit companies have become involved due to technology.

College Council (Versaci) - College Council met on Friday, March 25.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)

The EESSC met on Friday, March 18. We approved the governance change for the AB705 Subcommittee, and we heard a proposal from DRC Director Shauna Moriarty for a new governance committee, the Access and Universal Design Committee. There was some discussion over the size of the proposed committee, which listed eighteen members.

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro) – No report.

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) – No report.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

We are meeting on 3/25/22 to discuss Zoom Security, DEI+ Antiracism statement that will be shared with faculty senate on 4/4/22, and how we need to promote/incentivize departments across campus to put on events that feature/speak to the intersectional identities of our students.

Accreditation (Meehan) - No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

The DE Committee is set to meet April 6 at 2:30 p.m. We will discuss a possible expiration on distance education certification, proposed DE policy changes coming from the state, and HyFlex next steps. We will also get a status update on Palomar Proctoring, which is set to launch in late April. Everyone is welcome to join the meeting via Zoom Meeting. Meeting ID: 919 9930 3997
Passcode: 974173

Guided Pathways (Nelson) – No report.

Budget (Ferrerro) – No report.

TERB (Lawson) – No report.

Professional Development (Guerrero) – No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson) - No report.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) – No report.

Equivalency (Towfiq)

The Equivalency Committee is busy with reviewing Equivalency Applications for our full time positions.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) - No report. FSA next meets on Tuesday, April 5.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary