



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
March 7, 2022

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Marie-Therese Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Alyssa Vafaei, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Leigh Marshall

GUESTS: Michelle Barton, Barbara Hammons, Billianne McLellan, Norma Miyamoto, Elyse Real

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENT – No Public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said she was invited to a meeting that morning to discuss enrollment and assumed she was invited to attend based on her connection with Guided Pathways. The group began reviewing the list of enrollment issues provided by Senate some time ago and it seems the College is listening and these issues are now being discussed. She believes the meeting was arranged by VP Lakhani and other attendees included Michael Day, Kendyl Magnuson, Leslie Salas, Kineta Rios, Nancy Browne, Jennifer Finn, Deanna Shoop and Debra Avila. Senator Nelson said she was the only faculty member in the meeting and that a schedule for regular future meetings is expected.

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson said in response to concerns from evaluatees and committees, TERB is moving forward with the idea of placing an evaluations coach on any committee that is under an improvement plan, just to make sure that TERB answers questions for the evaluatees and committees and to ensure they feel confident that the process is being followed.

Senator Lawson also congratulated the following full-time faculty who were awarded tenure or permanent status at the recent Governing Board meeting:

Efrem "Charles" Alexander	Counseling
Lisa Casas	ECE Lab School
Cynthia Cordova	Counseling
Ladylyn Dominguez	Counseling
Jessica Hernandez	Nursing
Elise Lindgren	Biology
Joe Lucido	Design & Manufacturing

Leigh Marshall	Kinesiology
Timothy Martin	Library
Rebecca Mattson	Nursing
Christina Dawber	Counseling/EOPS
David Meske	Computer Science and Information Technology
Karmi Minor-Flores	Counseling
Larry Moyano	Counseling
Andrew Page	EME
Hossna Sadat Ahadi	Counseling
Lindsay Sperling	Chemistry
Marie Templo-Capule	Library
Gina Wilson	Child Development
Ashley Wolters	Trade & Industry

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner said *Little Shop of Horrors* is opening Friday, March 11 and ends Sunday, March 20. Performances are live on stage in the Howard Brubeck Theatre and tickets can be purchased here: <https://palomar.universitickets.com/> For select performances, virtual ZOOM tickets are available. For more information about the virtual opportunities, email the box office at hmurray@palomar.edu

Senator Alyssa Vafaei encouraged Senators to sign up for the Haben Girma event on March 14. There are still seats available to attend in person and the event can be viewed using ZOOM webinar. Click here for more information: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/drc/haben-girma/>

Senator Vafaei announced that a new film in the Equity Film Series will be screened on March 23. The film is called *Crip Camp: A Disability Revolution*. Faculty and students are encouraged to attend.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro encouraged all faculty to attend a valuable in-person conference in late June. The Online Teaching Conference is full of interesting information on the latest technology and techniques for online learning. More information can be found here. <https://onlineteachingconference.org/> Also, PFF has grants available for faculty's conference registration and Hiro found funding from her department to pay for the hotel. The form to apply for the registration fee grant is found here: <https://www.palomarfaced.org/benefits>

Senator Hiro said an issue was brought up by part-time faculty and wants to get this item on the agenda for next Faculty Senate meeting. Part-time faculty shared that a course content created by them is sometimes transferred to a full-time professor without their consent when the part-time professor loses the class. The Union got involved and recently met with Senator Hiro and ATRC to come up with some solutions.

Senator Susan Miller reminded faculty about the Women's History Month events taking place in March. Registration for the events can be done through PD.

Senator Miller said the PRIDE Committee at Palomar is organizing a celebration in May when the PRIDE flag will be officially unveiled and ready to be flown over the campus during June. Departments are needed to participate with a table or presentation about their programs. More information can be found here: <https://acrobat.adobe.com/link/review?uri=urn:aaid:scds:US:5df36625-8145-3695-9354-f35aca3f0abb>

Senator Lacey Craft congratulated the women's basketball team for winning their playoff games last week. The team will be moving on to the Elite Eight and the State Tournament this week.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Towfiq/Fererro

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated February 28, 2022 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstention: Jason Jarvinen

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum actions taken on March 2, 2022 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said an email went out last Friday to faculty telling them that if they submitted proposed curriculum before the October 1st, 2021 deadline, to check their email including "Other" email to see if there are any messages from META asking for clarifications on those proposals. All reviews will continue to move forward but any new course or new program, or course changes won't be deleted, they will be moved into draft and relaunched for Fall of 2023.

B. Committee Appointments – No action required this week.

Senator and Chair of Committee on Committees Anastasia Zavodny said faculty may have seen some announcements about scholarship volunteers. She is coordinating with the senders of the email to link this activity to the Scholarship Committee. There seems to be some confusion regarding the roles of both.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair

Senate President Rocco Versaci said Senator Adam Meehan needs to be replaced as the Co-Chair for the Accreditation Steering Committee to serve out his last year of the three-year appointment that ends Spring of 2023. Versaci said Senate needs to decide whether to put out a call to serve just the remaining year of Meehan's term or a call for a full three-year term to begin in Fall 2022. Clarification is needed in regard to the release time associated with this position. Senate VP Jenny Fererro said currently in Appendix F, all of the release time for the Accreditation Coordinator Self-Study co-chair comes out of the Senate's pot. There is an additional 40% available to the Accreditation Steering Committee to be split among them but that is then otherwise available to the Senate and this needs to be clarified.

Michelle Barton explained because of the warning Palomar was placed on in 2009, the accreditation workload increased and extra release time was set aside to compensate for the additional work but said she isn't sure where it came from.

VP Fererro said the current contract reads indicates it's two year assignment every six years which leads her to believe that four years goes by without any release time coming from Senate's pot.

Michelle Barton explained the new seven-year accreditation cycle and the different phases of workload within the cycle. Barton and Senators agreed in order to properly assess the position moving forward, all parties need to know the new accreditation system and the work expected. Fererro explained this needs to be done before Appendix F is negotiated later this Spring and Fererro will rely on assistance from both Barton and Meehan to work through it.

President Versaci said the advantage of putting out a call for a one-year term would give everyone time to see how this position is reconsidered and sorted out. Currently, the position receives 40% release time which will carry over for the remaining year of the term. Versaci will work with Both Meehan and Barton to get a call out for a one-year term.

B. SOAA Approval (see Exhibit 3)

Senator Wendy Nelson began with explaining that the Scale of Adoption Self-Assessment (SOAA) is completed every year and shared with Senate. The primary purpose of the document is for colleges to reflect on their own Guided Pathways journey by providing an opportunity to show progress and as a tool for strategic planning. The Chancellor's Office uses the document for benchmarking and understanding the progress all institutions are making and to look at common trends across California and the country in the Guided Pathways work. Senator Nelson said Palomar is going to receive additional funding in July but isn't aware yet of how the funding will work and no details are available.

Senator Nelson reviewed the exhibit and summarized the progress Palomar has made in each of the four Pillars and spoke of next steps toward implementation. Nelson asked Senators to share any projects with her that they have worked on or will be working on that could be added to the document.

Senator Zavodny asked Nelson about the College's purchase of various software and asked where those decision are made. Nelson said they are often made within the workgroup tasked with the issues but does think more conversations and transparency need to take place. Nelson added that Guided Pathways does have a process now to ensure that any purchases made for Guided Pathways does come through the pillar leads and it would be helpful if the Chancellor's Office did a better job of vetting software. Senator Ben Mudgett reminded Senators that Senate requested that any software involving academic and professional matters should at the very minimum, come through Faculty Senate as information so Senate knows what's happening. Nelson said she asked about an RFP for High Point but was told an RFP was not necessary.

C. Proposal to Amend Some Senate-Controlled Reassigned Time (see Exhibit 4)

President Versaci said there were two recent negotiated MOUs that had to do with the Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator and the SLO Co-Coordinators. Council is making a recommendation to shift some of the Senate's release time as explained on the exhibit but a few new factors have come into play that will affect any changes. VP Fererro said the District is bringing PFF another MOU relating to CALM release time later this week. Versaci explained that Mark Bealo's SLO Co-Coordinator term was not expiring this year and he actually had one more year on his term and Aundrea's term is actually the one expiring in May. A call with a short window will go out for that seat this week.

Consensus was met to delay this discussion until next week once the MOU relating to CALM was set.

D. Reassigned Time Position Evaluations (see Exhibit 5)

Versaci started the discussion saying when Senate made the joint appointment procedure with the District, part of it was that Senate, PFF and the District would come up with some kind of evaluation and process. Versaci shared the exhibit showing what Mt. San Antonio College uses to evaluate reassigned time. Versaci asked Senators for feedback on this particular model.

Senator Lawson rejected the evaluation sheet saying there was no evaluation mechanism present unless the exhibit is missing page two. The document just lists things to do. Versaci said this document may just be a place to start building the process for Palomar and really was here just to show that other colleges are also doing this. Versaci said there also needs to be clarification of who does the evaluation and who has membership. Versaci said that TERB is three-pronged now involving PFF, the Senate and the District. VP Fererro said that if any process that is adopted has any power to remove people from a position or to change somebody's release time, it would have to be negotiated. If committees are involved, Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar suggests that members of the particular committee should also be involved in the evaluation if a committee is present.

Versaci asked for volunteers to form a small workgroup to look at this in more detail and bring ideas back to Senate in a few weeks. Senators Wendy Nelson, Lawrence Lawson and Anastasia Zavodny volunteered.

E. "Better Know a Trustee"

President Versaci welcomed Governing Board President Norma Miyamoto to the meeting. Trustee Miyamoto thanked Senators for the invitation and spent a few minutes talking about her varied work experiences that prepared her for the role as a Trustee and helps her better understand challenges faced by all employees at Palomar. Trustee Miyamoto said she has learned a lot in her four years of service as a Trustee and will continue to learn as she serves. She cares deeply about Palomar and its mission of access to an education for a better life for those who knock at the door. She said she will run for another term next election.

Senator Laughlin welcomed Trustee Miyamoto and invited her to attend the PFF Meet & Greet on Wednesday evening. Trustee Miyamoto said she was thrilled to see the invitation come through, and to see Trustees, Dr. Rivera-Lacy and Vice Presidents all invited. She remembered a time when Trustees were discouraged to attend this kind of event and she is grateful that the Palomar community is coming together.

Senator Erin Hiro asked Trustee Miyamoto what she thought are the biggest challenges facing the Governing Board right now. Miyamoto said the fiduciary responsibility of the College is always challenging because it is so complex. The upcoming election is also a challenge for the Board. Elections sometimes cause turbulent times and to remain focused on the work to be done is most important. Miyamoto thinks it takes three or four years for a Trustee to really learn their role. She said another challenge is each Trustee coming to the meetings prepared. This means reading and studying all materials before the meetings so each Trustee can be fully involved in the discussions, monitoring the policies and voting on the policies. Each Trustee needs to be diligent in their own individual work so that the Board can contribute as a body of five and function cohesively.

Senate VP Fererro thanked Trustee Miyamoto for coming to the meeting and asked, from Miyamoto's perspective, who she thinks she represents, the entire Palomar district or the district within the Palomar district where she resides, and how does that representation impact her decision making? Miyamoto replied she represents both. Her constituents in District Five who voted her into the position know she is very concerned about the Fallbrook Center. And, Miyamoto said that ultimately she, along with four other Trustees were responsible for the entire Palomar College District and function as one board with the entire District's needs in mind.

Senator Will Dalrymple asked Trustee Miyamoto what she sees as the biggest opportunity the Governing Board has in terms of support for part-time faculty. Miyamoto said the biggest opportunity is "listening" to part-time faculty. Part-time faculty have a strong voice and the Board needs to listen to what their needs are. Many of those needs are met through negotiations so part-time faculty need to make sure their voices are heard by the union as well.

Senator Lawrence Lawson shared that he appreciates the current Board's support of DEI work at Palomar and asked Miyamoto's opinion about the continuing efforts of the Board to support once the election is over and the potential of new Board members. Miyamoto said she is always optimistic and said everyone needs to get very motivated to ensure

that the DEI work can continue. She said that every two years, there is a huge probability that new Trustees will be at the table learning to work together and building trust. Miyamoto believes that the Board is a cohesive Board dedicated to DEI. The elections are important but it is everyone, the people at Palomar who have the responsibility to keep the DEI initiative moving forward, said Trustee Miyamoto.

Senator Ben Mudgett asked Trustee Miyamoto to look into her crystal ball and share what Palomar looks like post pandemic. Miyamoto said she truly believes that post pandemic, Palomar will be in a better place. Rebuilding enrollment is a given but she thinks improvements being made to processes will make a difference. Faculty will have had the opportunity to understand their own best modality for teaching by then. The energy level and the trust brought here by President Rivera-Lacey is also making a positive difference as well. Miyamoto recognized the entire Accreditation team for their work and said President Rivera-Lacey truly helped bring Palomar from third base to home plate and her work is appreciated. COVID brought on hardships Miyamoto said but sometimes hardships also cause us to work more together as a unit and we come out the other end in a better place.

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad) – No report.

President (Versaci)

Palomar College welcomed the Accreditation Visiting Team this week. Their visit was virtual, but members of the team attended out 2/28 Senate meeting and conducted a series of other interviews. Members of Senate Council attended two interviews on Tuesday, 3/1—the first focused primarily on the governance structure and program review, and the second focused primarily on communication and curriculum. The Accreditation Team held its exit interview on Thursday, March 3, and the news was very good: several informal commendations, one formal commendation for Professional Development, and no recommendations in any areas to meet standards. There were some recommendations to continue work being done, most of which related to the Governing Board and one on fiscal reporting. The team stressed, however, that these were suggestions to “make a good college even better.”

At the Governing Board meeting of Tuesday, 3/1, there were several informational and action items, including:

- An update on Covid funding
- A presentation on Dual Enrollment strategies
- A presentation on the CCC Baccalaureate Degrees Program
- Tenure granted to nineteen probationary faculty members
- Approval of the 2022-2023 Sabbatical Leaves

Finally, I have been hearing from chairs of faculty hiring committees about contradictory messages that they are getting regarding the procedures. One point in particular is how many faculty members from the 1st level committee may move on to the 2nd level. In our revised faculty hiring procedures, there is no upper limit (the wording reads “at least two members”), but AP 7120 limits the total number of 2nd level members as seven. As I have stated/written before, this situation is further complicated by the fact that the District has selectively employed procedures in our version that contradict AP 7120 (i.e., the combined 2nd level interviews), which creates a problem insofar as faculty hiring falls under our 10+1+1 and this selectivity on the part of the District undermines our authority. I have been in conversation with both VP Montoya and President Rivera-Lacey about this, and we are planning to meet Monday, March 7 following the Senate meeting, and I have been assured that we will leave that meeting with clarity on faculty hiring issues, including the issue about whether this round of faculty interviews can be in-person if the committee so chooses. The major proposal that we hope to move forward on is to remove all references to faculty hiring in AP 7120 and instead refer readers to the Faculty Hiring Procedures on the Senate website (which will require some further revisions, which will be brought to Senate ASAP after we confirm this plan). Senate VP Ferrero and I have been actively engaged in reaching closure on this issue, but it has been delayed largely because of the attention being paid to accreditation.

College Council (Versaci)

The College Council met on Friday, February 25. Some highlights:

- We reviewed and approved the New Programs Committee
- Cynthia Cordova (Counseling) presented the recommendations that came out of the *Becoming Hispanic Serving Institutions* Book Club
- Jenny Fererro presented a breakdown of all of the policies and procedures still in need of revisions for gender-neutral language
- Discussion of reactivating the Enrollment Management Task Force

In regard to this last item, there was active discussion about the urgent need to revamp the enrollment system before addressing some of the issues outlined in the initial presentation of this item, which focused on the name of the group. Senator Lawrence Lawson pointed out that without fixing the system was a foundational first step, and discussion of all other enrollment-related matters should have a much lower priority. His points were seconded by other faculty members on the Council.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)

The EESSC met on Friday, March 4 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan) – No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro)

ECC Council met on March 4 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) – No report.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

EEDCC will meet on 3/4/2022. We are currently discussing the following.

- AP 3000 Luis Guerrero regarding Professional Development requirements and other recommendations.
- Drafting a statement to the Faculty Senate taking a stand against racism at our campus given the recent events virtually on zoom and social media.
- We are also discussing possible composition changes for the subcommittee.

Accreditation (Meehan) – No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

The DE Committee met on March 2 and discussed the following issues:

1. The DRC noted an increase in the number of problems with DRC students not getting the required extra time on exams in online courses. The Instruction office is already working on video instruction to help faculty set the quizzes for specific students to include more time.
2. The Peer Online Course Review team is poised to submit the second set of courses for state review to become a local-certified campus. They are also going to begin having other faculty review their courses for state certification. For more information contact Amy Caterina or Linda Morrow.
3. There are 13 faculty members teaching HyFlex courses this semester. The DE Committee is working on a Senate recommendation to consider keeping HyFlex as a permanent format and to begin promoting HyFlex classes to the wider Palomar community.

4. The DE Committee members were interested in the Senate work on possible pedagogy for new faculty members and the suggestion to use Universal Design training that already exists as it aligns with our Universal Design and Accessibility goals.
5. Currently there are 1,041 certified instructors but 110 of those have training that is more than 10 years old. The DE Committee is considering bring back a recommendation to the Senate to require updated training for faculty who were certified more than 10 years ago. They will continue to meet on this issue.
6. The committee is still fine-tuning a process of how to evaluate whether to pay for new programs that help online faculty members.
7. DE Committee members are meeting with PFF and ARTC members to come up with Canvas Access Guidelines that will ensure faculty's content is not lost if a course is cancelled or transferred to another faculty member.
8. The ATRC asked the DE Committee to consider changes to Zoom settings to make meetings safer against Zoom Bombing. The Committee will bring the issue back at its next meeting March 16.

Guided Pathways (Nelson) – No report.

Budget (Ferrerro) - No report.

TERB (Lawson)

For the beginning of the Spring 2022, TERB is mostly focused on approving improvement plans for probationary and peer evaluations. Otherwise, TERB is concerned about student evaluation mechanisms that solicit student feedback and share it with faculty before grades are posted. TERB has also spent time reconfirming out-of-cycle peer evaluation processes including who selects the chair in the case the evaluatee is the department chair (TERB approves the selection made by the evaluatee, in that case), when the 10-day response window begins (after the evaluatee signs the report—so a response cannot be accepted unless the report is signed), and if an Evaluation Appeals Committee applies to peer evaluations as well (contractually, it does not).

Professional Development (Guerrero) – No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)

No report this week from the AB705 SSC. Our first meeting is 3/10.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)

At the last Sabbatical Leave Committee Meeting, we approved a revision to a sabbatical application. Then, the committee discussed requiring final reports to be completely electronic starting Fall 2021 and discussed recommendations for the assembly of those electronic reports. The committee was in favor but had questions about projects whose products could not be digitized. The committee then discussed how best to handle revisions requests—a summary of highlights or a completely rewritten application. The next meeting is 14 April, 2022.

Equivalency (Towfig) – No report.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)

SLO Facilitator meetings are taking place this week.

Our goal is to refine the GE/ILO mapping for Written Communication and Civic Knowledge and Engagement before spring break and then at the beginning of April, notify instructors who have courses with SLOs that map to either the Written and/or Civic ILOs with guidelines on how to assess them.

<https://www.palomar.edu/teachingexcellence/college-outcomes-rubrics-and-resources/>

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1u4NkNn4wy27Bsq5spJyZi177G_FT7pVuyJmHRWnB78I/edit

<https://www.palomar.edu/teachingexcellence/wp-content/uploads/sites/140/2019/01/GE-Assessment-Rubric-for-Civic-Knowledge.pdf>

This will go out to the written communication ILO sections at the beginning of April:

Written Assessment: <https://www.palomar.edu/teachingexcellence/college-outcomes-assessment-instructions-written-communication/>

A similar set of instructions will accompany the civic ILO assessment.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)

There are 45 disciplines undergoing review to renew their discipline FSA. The renewal cycle will begin after spring break. BP and AP 7211, Full Time Faculty Service Areas and Competencies, are undergoing updates. The committee will work within shared governance to make any needed changes.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) – No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary