



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
February 28, 2022

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Alyssa Vafaei, Rocco Versaci, David Williams (ASG), Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Jason Jarvinen

**GUESTS:** Cindy Anfinson, Michelle Barton, Fabienne Chauderlot, Roberto Gonzalez, Barbara Hammons, Billieanne McLellan, Patricia Menchaca, Veronica Ogata, Kartik Raju, Elyse Real, Candace Rose, William Turini, Maria Villagomez, Ann Wright

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro announced that nominations for the Palomar College Empowered Women Award are being accepted up until March 3. Nominations are open to anyone who has exemplified Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Antiracism leadership at Palomar, and supported other women in education and in the community. Nominations can be submitted here: <https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSeTO2kZWtxEb4X6TaNCRXuvVPNjFb0jkP-nyN-d4nBYm8x-Nw/viewform>

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced Performing Arts season is in full swing this semester with many exciting events. For the full line up, go to [www.palomarperforms.com](http://www.palomarperforms.com)

Senator Alyssa Vafaei encouraged Senators to sign up for the Haben Girma event on March 14. There are still seats available to attend in person and the event can be viewed using ZOOM webinar. Click here for more information: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/drc/haben-girma/>

Senator Alex Doyle Bauer said all library locations are now open Monday through Thursday after hours and on weekends. She also mentioned that study spaces are now available to students.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS** – No announcements

**AGENDA CHANGES** – No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Towfiq/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated February 14, 2022 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

**ACTION**

**A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of actions taken at the February 16, 2022 Curriculum meeting (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said she will be sending out information soon about upcoming Curriculum trainings and drop ins.

**B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the slate of committee confirmations (see Exhibit 3).

Nay: Lawrence Lawson

The motion carried.

AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Wendy Metzger**, Faculty, Math (22-23)  
Curriculum Committee – **Elena Villa Fernandez de Castro**, Faculty, L&L (19-22)  
AP5140 – **Gina Sanders**, Faculty, Math  
AP5140 – **David Linenberger**, Faculty, Kinesiology

**C. Selection of Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator**

**Motion 4** MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of the selection of Candace Rose for Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator for a two-year term (see Exhibit 4).

The motion carried.

Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator – **Candace Rose**

**D. Selection of Student Learning Outcomes Co-Coordinator**

**Motion 5** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the selection of Mark Bealo for one of the Student Learning Outcomes Co-Coordinator positions (see Exhibit 5).

Nay: Lawrence Lawson

The motion carried.

Student Learning Outcomes Co-Coordinator – **Mark Bealo**

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. AB705 Senate Subcommittee Governance Change (see Exhibit 6)**

Cindy Anfinson explained that one of the requested changes is adding a classified staff member from either Tutoring or Assessment and added past experiences showed this representation on the committee was valuable. The second change was a simple change of title for the manager of the Teaching Learning Center, Deborah Avila. Her new title is Manager of Palomar Promise and College Access Programs.

**Motion 6** MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to move back into Action.

The motion carried.

**Motion 7** MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the proposed changes to the AB705 Senate Subcommittee Governance Change (see Exhibit 6).

The motion carried.

### **B. AB705 Improvement Plan Review (see Exhibit 7)**

Cindy Anfinson reviewed the exhibit and explained the work that is currently being done. Senator Lawrence Lawson asked Anfinson to further explain the level of support for integrating ESL placement into the online Palomar application and said that ESL has been asking for this change for quite some time. Anfinson replied that both Nimoli Madan and Tracy Fung have been working on this and the committee understands how extremely important this is for ESL students. Dean Patricia Menchaca said this has been an ongoing issue for some time but said conversations are taking place and Palomar is committed to work through it now. Dean Machaca added that it will be a matter of meeting with Kendyl Magnuson to help get the process going and the work needed can be done with people in place now meaning no new hires are required to make this happen.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson asked what will be done with all the courses that have prerequisites. Dean Menchaca said they are having conversations with the Articulation Officer (Ben Mudgett) now. Palomar has been asked to wait for more direction from the Chancellor's Office because there are some inconsistencies between AB705 and Title V with respect to prerequisites. While waiting for that additional guidance, conversations with Mudgett are occurring in regard to courses that could be acceptable in the absence of those and helping direct different disciplines' faculty to other courses.

Senator Susan Miller addressed the support course issue for Behavioral Science Statistics. The course is already four units and the department has asked to reinstitute tutoring since that was a good avenue of support for students which resulted in more student success. Senator Miller's inclination is strengthening tutoring rather than adding more units and support courses.

**Motion 8** MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to move back into Action.

The motion carried.

**Motion 9** MSC: Faulkner/Fererro

Faculty Senate approval of the AB705 Improvement Plan (see Exhibit 7).

The motion carried.

### **C. Part-time Faculty Equity Update** (see Exhibit 8)

Senator Anastasia Zavodny said part-time faculty equity and inclusion work kicked off in earnest in Fall of 2020 with a survey of the faculty. From those findings, Faculty Senate's designated workgroup began working to close gaps. One of the first accomplishments was standardizing a naming convention for part-time faculty to mirror full-time faculty. The titles are adjunct assistant professor, adjunct associate professor and adjunct professor. A department by-laws template was created for departments to use and its use is strictly optional. A mentoring program for part-time faculty was created and will be launched shortly by Professional Development. Palomar now has a formal process in the works to recognize part-time faculty for years of service to Palomar and providing service pins is in the works as well. Senate has adopted a resolution for equity within shared governance opportunities for part-time faculty.

Senator Zavodny said much part-time equity and inclusion work is occurring now statewide including ASCCC's work. Work is also being done by PFF to close the gaps in terms of pay for part-time faculty. A Part-time Parity Project is occurring this semester as well.

Senator Will Dalrymple said the faculty survey done in Fall 2020 showed adjunct faculty were looking for greater appreciation and acknowledgement. The workgroup has been discussing emeritus status for part-time faculty and would recommend Palomar offer it. Senator Dalrymple shared an exhibit showing two other community colleges emeritus programs that include part-time faculty (see Exhibit 8).

Senator Susan Miller spoke in support of an emeritus program for Palomar's part-time faculty saying it shows respect and appreciation for dedication and commitment to Palomar College.

President Versaci said this matter will be further explored and discussed this semester at Faculty Senate.

### **D. Support for Probationary Faculty**

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson said a conversation started in TERB around the evaluation process and a need for a first semester pedagogy or andragogy seminar course for new probationary faculty. This came up because some probationary faculty felt unprepared for the teaching part of their career. Some also say they didn't feel supported by their tenure and evaluation committee for the teaching portion. Some ideas that came out of TERB to offer more support included a 20% load in the first semester for either an intentional intervention for pedagogy or andragogy or an actual course, some PD linked workshops, and institutional wide reaching support for first semester probationary faculty members for that specific piece of the evaluation process.

Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar supported Lawson's comments and added he would like to see an evaluation of the tenure process from an equity perspective. He is personally going through the tenure process and sees equity issues. He has been told by colleagues, also probationary, that they feel some equity issues exist as well.

Senator Sergio Hernandez agreed with Senator Lawson's comments and added that the technical knowledge is there but there is definitely a learning curve with all the software especially for all new faculty.

Senator and Distance Education Coordinator Erin Hiro said she receives positive feedback from faculty who complete the POET training and some even say they wish there was some similar training available for ground classes. Senator Hiro would like to see both online and in-person training involved. She supports both a 20% training load idea for new faculty along with some type of mentoring program.

Senator Zavodny said she thinks a "center" on campus similar to TLC where fostering teaching excellence can occur would be good. This place could become an innovative workspace where faculty can come to learn, mentor or be mentored or just exchange ideas.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said the Guided Pathways team has been working on an online course called PETAL (Palomar Excellence in Teaching & Learning) to support Pillar IV which is to ensure learning. The course focuses on universal design and the team hopes to have it done by June.

Senator Lawson thanked everyone for their support and asked everyone to email additional comments and feedback to him. He said everyone has seen with the pandemic, the students' education and preparedness for going fully remote has been inequitable and feels Palomar has tried its best as an institution to help students be more successful in online courses. The same has not happened for faculty though said Lawson, specifically probationary faculty who may be facing some of those similar and equitable issues in teaching online. In some cases, support for faculty members needed to reach the same level but in some instances that support with teaching online was not there which impacted some faculty along with their evaluations. Lawson said EEDCC is specifically tasked as part of Faculty Senate to look at TERB processes from an equity perspective. Lawson said this is his last semester as TERB coordinator so this analysis needs to occur this semester so TERB can have good guidance for the incoming TERB Coordinator. TERB will be bringing people together through EEDCC to begin having conversation now before the fall semester begins and another year of evaluations begin.

#### **E. Accreditation Steering Committee Co-Chair – Tabled.**

#### **F. Better Know a Trustee**

Trustee Kartik Raju thanked Senators for the invitation to Faculty Senate. He began by saying he has always had a passion for education and is a lifelong learner. He is an electrical engineer and has worked in software for about 18 years with a focus on technical program management and product management. He also has a passion for music production. His current focus for Palomar is increasing enrollment, continued financial stability and supporting the equity DEI accessibility work with universal design being done at the school. He has also worked on expanding his understanding of operations and how that can allow him to provide the best support possible from the policy side. The goal is to ensure that Palomar is able to provide the community with the best educational opportunities possible. He said he felt warmth and support from the entire Palomar community and is very excited about being part of the Comet family.

Senator Alyssa Vafaei thanked Trustee Raju for coming to various DRC hosted events. She said that DRC students often share they feel invisible on campus and it meant a lot for them to see him there. It's very impactful and uplifting for all students, faculty, staff and administrators to see him there as well. Trustee Raju said it's a good fit for him especially since he personally used a DRC program while attending college himself and DRC does amazing work.

Senator Eduardo Aguilar thanked Trustee Raju for being at Palomar College and being part of many events on campus. Trustee Raju said it's a good fit for him since his own personal values are aligned with the College's. He said it's good to have an environment at Palomar that is so welcoming and also focused on providing support, equity and diversity to the entire community.

Senator Lawson asked Trustee Raju what he sees as a major concern for Palomar moving forward and what ideas does he have to address those concerns. Raju said he is focused on a few things at the moment and is gaining more understanding of how Palomar can do better in those areas. One issue is improving enrollment and he thinks that providing better access or student experiences in the actual enrollment process is needed. Reducing manual efforts on both faculty and others to get students through that process and make it more streamlined and easier is important. His second concern right now is to better provide not only an excellent educational experience but also a diverse experience. More diverse classes in performing arts for example, will result in a more rounded education for students. A part of education is discovery and understanding who you really are or where you want to go. Providing these diverse opportunities supports the discovery. Raju said that learning face-to-face has a different impact on students' lives and that is really the best way to learn for most people.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin commented that pre-COVID, there was a lot of contraction with classes in general and with COVID, this has been exacerbated. Performing Arts as well as other departments have experienced this contraction and yet the departments are held harmless with a new floor coming down the pike. In terms of policy, is the Governing Board going to be more encouraging of the administration to allow lower class enrollments to go or even adding to the class course catalog or schedule? Trustee Raju said that if Palomar has the means, then that is something to work out with the administration. From a policy point of view and speaking for himself only, he would encourage more enrollment and more classes and to have this expansion ready.

Senator Aguilar said that Palomar has adopted AP3000 to ensure all employees receive equity training but asked Trustee Raju what else he thinks can be done to get the College educated on what equity really means and efforts synchronized. Trustee Raju said that having more events like the Social Justice Convening event helped him personally open his eyes to aspects of inequity that he wasn't even aware of and also gave him a better overall understanding. The event provided a very focused approach that really spoke to people about individual experiences that others had, and then talked about those experiences.

David Williams, ASG Student Representative asked Raju how students and faculty can support equity together. Trustee Raju said creating a safe environment for students to be open with faculty about their own experiences on campus is important.

Senator Ben Mudgett thanked Trustee Raju for supporting Palomar College's PRIDE proclamation. Senator Mudgett invited Raju to attend a meeting of the San Diego Imperial Queer Alliance group who meets once a month.

President Versaci thanked Trustee Raju for coming to the meeting, attending school events and fostering connections here at Palomar.

## **REPORTS**

**ASG (Mouawad)** – No report.

### **President (Versaci)**

First, welcome back to everyone who is teaching a face-to-face class this semester; it's been nice to have to look for a parking space and seeing faculty, staff, administrators, and—above all—students milling around campus.

Building on our conversation in Senate on 2/14 regarding Fall '22 planning, several of us met with VP Kahn to discuss various incentives to get students back on campus. Suggestions ranged from specific incentives like bookstore credit to more general (and impactful) disincentives like a difficult enrollment process and unexciting marketing/messaging.

Jenny and I also had our monthly meeting with President Rivera-Lacey, where these same topics were covered. In addition, we discussed the changes to the faculty hiring procedures and are waiting to hear back on the plan to remove all references to faculty hiring from AP 7120, save for a statement that refers the reader to the Faculty Hiring Procedures (modeled after the statement in AP 4022 – Curricular Matters). We are hoping to resolve this in March and bring the latest revision of the Faculty Hiring Procedures to the Senate for ratification.

**College Council (Versaci)** - The College Council met on Friday, February 25 (before Senate but after reports were due).

### **Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)**

The EESSC next meets on Friday, March 4.

**Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan)** – No report.

**Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro)** - ECC Council will meet next on March 4.

**Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo)** – No report.

**PFF (Laughlin)**

We are really open for EDUCATION! Some of us are back on campus and, although quieter than we are used to, it is really nice to be back. Starting the first three weeks online was a bit of a struggle, but here we are. The accreditation visit is next week. It will be via Zoom, which is unfortunate because our campus looks more beautiful than ever.

I have been actively involved in the shared governance and union meetings including:

- CFT Committee meetings via Zoom on various topics including vaccine and mask mandates, part-time health, and other equity issues.
- Special Governing Board Meeting 2/15/22:
  - The main discussion was accreditation and the preparation for it.
- Campus shared governance meetings:
  - Faculty Senate
  - College Council
  - TERB
  - Budget
  - Benefits
- Interaction with members: I have had with several individual meetings with members regarding various concerns.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.
- Meetings with Board members: We meet monthly with each Trustee to keep the lines of communication open.
- Meetings with Dr. Star Rivera-Lacy to discuss fall 2022 planning.
- We have several special projects we are working on including the pay project and part-time equity project which require many meetings.

We continue to work for the interests of our members. An injury to one is an injury to all!

**Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)** – No report.

**Accreditation (Meehan)** – No report.

**Distance Education (Hiro)**

The DE Committee met Feb. 16 to consider the following programs and whether to recommend the ATRC purchase them for use by faculty.

- Pronto: Committee members recommended not purchasing Pronto at this time as there are other free options that provide the same services.
- Pisces: Committee members recommended not purchasing Pisces at this time as there are other free options that provide the same services.
- Chegg: Committee members recommended not suggesting Palomar sign up for an official account as instructors can do this on their own to see if their quizzes are being used in the application.
- The committee opted to continue modifying a tools approval form in conjunction with the ATRC to streamline the approval process.
- The DE Committee looked at the newly created Canvas Access Guidelines and members of the committee expressed frustration with the guidelines not being enough to stop the trend of part-time instructors losing Canvas course work with little notice. They asked the DE Coordinator to reach out to the Senate and PFF to work together on this issue. They have not approved the guidelines to send to the senate.

Rough draft of the guidelines:  
Canvas Course Cancellation Guidelines

Background: Part-time faculty approached the Senate on Jan. 31 with two complaints. First, they were not given enough notice about the cancellation of a course to move any content out of the course. They often lose the content or must work with ATRC to try and get it back. Second, when their course was not canceled but reassigned to another professor who needed it for load, the content the adjunct professor had put into the class remained in the Canvas shell and was sometimes used by another professor without their permission.

The Distance Education Committee recommends the following to address these problems.

**Problem 1: Class Cancellations**

- When a class is canceled in People Soft, usually by the department ADA, it automatically drops the Canvas shell. The ATRC said it is difficult, and sometimes impossible, to recover the content.

Possible solution:

- It can be solved at the department level if the department chair gives the professor warning that the class is going to be canceled. Usually, department chairs know at least one but often two weeks in advance that the course is in danger and should warn the faculty of possibility.
- Can we determine a detailed warning time before classes are cancelled and after professors are notified?
- If the professor gets a few days to prepare, they can request a Canvas Sandbox through the ATRC and move the contents from the Canvas course to the new Sandbox. (ATRC will put together a how-to list for those functions.)

**Problem 2: Class Reassigned**

Possible solution:

- It can be solved at the department level if the department chair gives the professor warning that the class is going to be transferred to another faculty member. The department ADA can give the other professor a few days to prepare for losing the class.
- If the professor loses the class and does not want to give the content to the new professor, they can request a Canvas Sandbox through the ATRC and move the contents from the Canvas course to the new Sandbox. Then, the professor can reset the Canvas Course to erase all existing content. (ATRC will put together a how-to list for those functions.)

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** – No report.

**Budget (Ferrerro)**

Budget Committee met on February 22. We were introduced to the new Senior Fiscal Director, Nancy Lane, who joins Palomar from SDCCD, and spent the majority of the meeting reviewing the Governor's budget proposal for 22/23, with a great deal of focus on comparisons to other CCC Districts.

**TERB (Lawson)** – No report.

**Professional Development (Guerrero)**

Given that everyone got the email from Dr. Star about the Zoom bombing, which I was also an attendee in the session while it happened, during a black history month event, we wanted to let the senate know that TechConnect is in the development phase for training regarding meeting disruptions; we are also available to collaborate with Palomar's PD department on developing some training specific to Palomar soon. Hopefully, this is helpful, once we have more information we can pass it along.

**AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)**

The AB705 Subcommittee met on Thursday, February 10. Here is everything that was covered at that meeting:

**Action**



We approved the December 2021 Minutes.

#### **Information**

- We reviewed the new governance structure.
- Discussed voting in a new committee chair at the March 2022 meeting.
- The chair submitted another governance structure change request to add a Classified Representative, appointed by the CCE, from the area of Tutoring or Assessment.
- We reviewed how this subcommittee fits into the new governance structure and went over some information from the Governance Structure Handbook.

**Readings/Research:** We went over the following research:

- From The Charles M. Dana Center: Community College Students Assessed as Needing Mathematics Remediation: Seven-Year Impacts of Corequisite Remediation with Statistics
- PPIC (Public Policy Institute of California) Report December 2021: Community College Math in California's New Era of Student Access
- USC and UC Davis: Progress and Potential: Considering the Question of Racial Equity in CA AB705
- RP Group: Transition in Math from High School to Community College Before and After AB705

#### **Reports**

- We went over an update on the Equitable Placement and Completion Plan. IRP (Institutional Research and Planning) completed the Data Addendum in December 2021. Based on those results, our college is going to follow Option 2. which means we will, by Fall 2022, ensure transfer-level placement in math and English for all U.S. High School graduates and permit no pre-transfer enrollments for students in certificate, degree, or transfer programs.
- Daniel Straub, DRC, gave a presentation on Supporting Students with Disabilities in Math following AB705.
- No reports from Guided Pathways.

#### **Group Work**

- Group 1: reviewed what needs to be done to adopt the State's Default Placement Algorithm for math at Palomar College. We discussed updating the placements students receive in PeopleSoft, updating the Math Placement Tool (and can this be embedded in PeopleSoft), updating advising sheets, etc.
- Group 2: focused on how to transition AB705 students, many of whom only know "Zoom College," back to F2F instruction. Topics discussed included campus tours, how faculty can get students to engage in F2F group work via small "pods," the issue of food services being closed in the Centers, pro-rating health services fees, clear messaging on parking, be flexible with office hours (including offering online and other options), and institutional support for tutoring to include both F2F and online options.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** – No report.

#### **Equivalency (Towfig)**

The Equivalency Committee is very busy reviewing Equivalency Applications.

**Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)** – No report.

#### **Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)**

The committee is discussing the need to review and make recommendations as appropriate to BP/AP 7211 in consultation with appropriate stakeholders. Discussions also include closing the loop with the Curriculum Committee when a new discipline under the state minimum qualification handbook is adopted as a new discipline/program at Palomar College.

**Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)** - No report.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary