



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
February 7, 2022

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Marie-Therese Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Alyssa Vafaei, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT:

GUESTS: Barbara Baer, Jeff Epstein, Barbara Hammons, Bill Jahnel, Leanne Maunu, Billianne McLellan, Michael Mufson, Andre Pitts, Netta Schroer, Elizabeth Stephens

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Barbara Baer, part-time faculty and Co-President of PFF commended Faculty Senate for the equity work being done for part-time faculty. She also asked that nobody on Faculty Senate serve as a gatekeeper to faculty democracy. She said there is an agenda item today regarding the Faculty Constitution and the eligibility of part-time faculty to serve as Senate President and Senate Vice President. Baer said Faculty Senate represents all faculty and Senators use their best judgement to select leaders of Faculty Senate. The problem that exists is when Faculty Senate becomes the gatekeeper and won't allow someone to even be nominated for the position. Not allowing a faculty member to be considered means that they cannot try to persuade others. They cannot tell Senators all the great things they would bring to Faculty Senate. They cannot argue their positions because there's no position for them to stand up for. This does not mean that you have to vote for this person. You show them respect by listening to what they have to say and then decide whether or not to cast your vote for that person. Unfortunately, part-time faculty Senators are blocked and not allowed to be heard. Baer urged Senate to remove this impediment for part-time faculty Senators.

Senate President Rocco Versaci replied to Baer's comment by saying that altering the Faculty Constitution is not on the agenda today. Taking nominations for president-elect is on the agenda. Altering the Constitution is a much longer process and all faculty would need an opportunity to vote on any changes. Right now, the only Senators eligible for Senate President is full-time faculty.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson said prior to the start of the semester, ESL conducted several in-person registration events on campus. Proper Facilitron requests were submitted requesting tables, chairs, computers, and other necessary equipment to successfully register students. None of those requests were fulfilled. Staff had to scramble to find suitable equipment and computers to carry out the registrations. If the Administration wants outdoor

events to register students, they have to provide the tech and all other related equipment to do the job. Senator Lawson said this announcement was not made to cast blame on anyone.

Senator Susan Miller reminded Senators of Black History Month in February. Palomar's Black Faculty & Staff Association are sponsoring workshops throughout the month. Additional information can be found here: <https://www.palomar.edu/pbfsa/black-history-month-2022/>

Senate VP Jenny Fererro said that today was the last day to submit proposals for Women's History Month. <https://forms.gle/dx6xjsnzKqH2GWXe7>.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Towfiq/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated January 31, 2022 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: W. Nelson/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval of actions taken at the February 2, 2022 Curriculum meeting (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said Curriculum is trying to figure out how to manage the deactivated programs. Currently, there is no formal process in place to inform students who are enrolled in a program that is being deactivated. This will be a challenge for the committee and Nelson will bring additional information on this matter back to Senate.

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of the slate of committee confirmations (see Exhibit 3).

The motion carried.

AB705 Support Subcommittee - **Larry Moyano**, Faculty, at-large (22-24)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Leanne Maunu**, Faculty, English (22-23)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Richard Carr**, Faculty, English (22-24)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Tracy Fung**, Faculty, ESL (22-24)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **April Cunningham**, Faculty, L&L (22-23)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Cindy Anfinson**, Faculty, Math (22-24)
AB705 Support Subcommittee – **Erin Feld**, Reading (22-24)
Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – **Kellie Miller**, Faculty, at-large
TERB – **Candace Rose**, Faculty, at-large (20-22)

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny announced that Senator Ben Mudgett volunteered to temporarily fill the Senate President designated seat on Budget Committee for the duration of the Spring 2022 semester.

C. Equity in SLOs Task Force Proposal

Motion 4 MSC: Faulkner/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the Equity in SLOs Taskforce governance structure group request form as presented and then amended to add two positions for facilitators (faculty leading the efforts within the departments or two others recommended by SLOAC) (see Exhibit 4).

Michael Mufson reviewed the form and highlighted changes previously suggested by Senate.

The motion carried.

D. Nominations for & Election of Faculty Senate President-Elect

Senator and Elections Chair Beatrice Manneh asked for nominations for the President-Elect position. Senator Fari Towfiq nominated Senator Wendy Nelson. Senator Nelson declined the nomination. Senator Towfiq nominated Senator Ben Mudgett who declined the nomination. Senator Mudgett nominated Senator Lawrence Lawson who declined the nomination. Senator Wendy Nelson nominated Senate VP Jenny Fererro who declined the nomination. Senator Towfiq nominated Senator Erin Hiro who declined the nomination. Senator Teresa Laughlin nominated Senator Alexandra Doyle Bauer who declined the nomination.

Senator Will Dalrymple asked whether the provision in the Constitution regarding part-time faculty's eligibility to hold this position was ever suspended in past elections. VP Fererro said a formal Constitution change vote must occur first.

Senator Lawson nominated Senator Adam Meehan who declined the nomination. Senator Beatrice Manneh nominated Senator Towfiq who declined the nomination. Senator Towfiq nominated Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner who declined the nomination.

Senator Susan Miller said she thought this constitutional requirement was suspended a few years back thus allowing any sitting Senator to be eligible for this position. Miller also added that if there is current interest from a part-time Senator who is active and committed to Palomar, in the name of equity, maybe this rule should be suspended again. President Versaci said this constitutional requirement cannot be suspended today.

Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar, along with Senator Dalrymple nominated Senator Susan Miller who declined the nomination. Senator Aguilar added that he would like to address the constitutional requirement at a later date saying that many part-time faculty Senators have dedicated much time and effort to the Senate and to the College and should be eligible for this position.

Senator Doyle Bauer nominated Senator Aguilar who declined the nomination.

Senator Laughlin suggested tabling this item until next week so that Senators can reconsider accepting a nomination of this important role for Faculty Senate.

Senator Towfiq commented that the Faculty Senate President works side by side with high-level administrators and can often disagree with the decisions administrators make. Adjunct faculty, sitting in the Senate President role would be

vulnerable when opposing administrators' decisions or actions. Part-time faculty won't have employment protections that full-time faculty have and for that reason, part-time faculty should not become eligible to fill the Senate President position.

President Versaci will bring this matter back to action next week.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Fall 2022 Planning (see Exhibit 5 and 6)

Senate President Versaci said the District is currently planning for Fall 2022. Originally, the plan was to be back face-to-face for approximately 80% of classes. VP Kahn just recently sent a memo out stating that this 80% face-to-face ratio will be lower. The memo (exhibit) was sent out and Jeff Epstein and Netta Schroer reached out to Versaci and wanted to address this change at Faculty Senate. Versaci is meeting with VP Kahn on February 15th to further discuss this matter and said any concrete suggestions made during the discussion today will be shared with VP Kahn.

Jeff Epstein said his initial concern is the memo is technically a non-directive directive. It empowers individual departments and disciplines to make their own decisions which means not every department will not have the same rules for the return to campus. The memo conflates an issue. In some ways it feels like a memo about Palomar's COVID response but it really is about the abysmal enrollment numbers. The UCs are back, the Cal States are back and K-12 are back in the classroom. There really is no reason why Palomar can't have a robust presence on campus come Fall 2022 with vaccination rates, additional testing and following general trends that are occurring in the state and nationally. By considering just the Fall 2021 data as stated in the memo, an argument can easily be made that suggest departments should offer more online courses. This doesn't allow consideration of the negative impact it has on student learning. Teachers want to get back into the classroom but are being forced to use the Fall 2021 data to plan (more online courses) and that is not appropriate now. In addition, Epstein said if departments are not consistent with planning online versus face-to-face courses, this makes it more difficult for students to fill their schedules and will most likely, due to convenience, take only online courses. Departments who chose more face-to-face classes will likely experience more cancelled courses. There is no incentive for departments or disciplines to offer face-to-face courses unless there is an institutional support structure in place to guarantee that more disciplines and departments are face-to-face and that students are being encouraged to come back to campus. Administration needs a clear plan and a plan not based on false data.

The second point Epstein made was in regard to an email sent out last Friday from Richard Loucks. Until then, there was no mention of a CAP limit for face-to-face courses. When VP Kahn wrote his memo, it seems COVID concerns were not at the top of his priority list because the CAP was at 100%. Then they revisited it and now it's a 67% CAP with the right to bump it back up to 100% if health conditions allow for it. Epstein thinks this flexibility causes concerns that courses will be cancelled and will create issues for the efficiency rates as well.

Epstein then questioned the reference in Richard's email about giving as many considerations to the centers as possible. The memo said 77% of cancelled classes in Fall 2021 were face-to-face courses. This is misleading because a vast majority of face-to-face classes that were cancelled were at the centers. Epstein then asked Netta Schroer to run through the numbers that VP Kahn provided.

Netta Schroer reviewed the spreadsheet provided by VP Kahn that showed cancelled classes for Fall 2021. The spreadsheet shows the main campus and Escondido as the main culprits. Schroer said the numbers actually tell a different story and the "formula" for determining the correct class cancellation rate needs to be corrected. Schroer added an additional column to the spreadsheet (far right column - Exhibit 6) and shared the correct cancellation rates which shows the biggest culprits for canceled classes is Fallbrook, Rancho Bernardo and Escondido...not the main campus.

Senator Wendy Nelson said she is very concerned about the memo and how it effects the future for students and Palomar College and believes its not too late to better plan for Fall 2022. Faculty need to stand up and say we need some conversations around this. The idea that students don't want to come back because of the vaccination issue is unfounded. Where is this information coming from? Some students have never been on campus in the two years they have been enrolled here. They may be missing some crucial information about coming to campus because our marketing over the last year does not reflect any student life on campus. Palomar needs to figure out a way to get students back. If the shift to come back to campus doesn't occur now, Nelson is afraid that Palomar will become primarily an online campus. This is not good for the students at Palomar.

Bill Jahnel said the College is no longer operating with a fiscal cliff coming, but rather operating now with a plateau. Palomar now has room to create a base to grow. Just as the College has been able to be held harmless, Jahnel; thinks its time to adopt the language of "hold harmless." He thinks this is the time that Administration acknowledges "no budget constraints" and suggested that Palomar go at least 50% back to face-to-face for Fall 2022. Those classes should have a low enrollment threshold, same as this semester. And Jahnel suggested that class caps hold at the lower class caps for face-to-face for at least the first semester back. Jahnel acknowledged the need to gain "center status" for the centers and the difficulty to do online designated at a center, however, he said the College needs to be transparent about their push for more face-to-face classes at centers.

Leanne Maunu expressed her concern of the lack of an institutional plan. Maunu said she has 22 part-time faculty in her English department who regularly teach at Palomar but who do not have classes this semester. She had no help with advertising or marketing classes at the centers. Also, the fact that Palomar has dramatically reduced student support services including food services is also a concern. Palomar's website tells students that no food services will be available on any campus for the duration of this Spring semester. These services are vital to the students.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett expressed his opinion that Administration needs to understand that time is needed to rebuild programs. Senator Mudgett said the budget is being benchmarked to 17/18 so he isn't understanding the efficiency and lack of leadership in terms of getting students back on campus. Students are missing out on social capital building experiences as well as networking and building on new relationships that are very important to their future careers. The four-year students are getting this so why can't Palomar students get this interaction too. Palomar has to live by its vision, mission, and values.

Senator Zavodny said she recently enrolled as a student with the new vaccine card requirement and it was difficult to even find the link to upload the card. Once she found the link and uploaded the card, it took 24 hours for someone to manually verify it. Then, Zavodny was able to complete her registration. A new student in this situation would have run into these roadblocks in order to register for a face-to-face class and just change their mind about enrolling. This must be fixed.

President Versaci pointed out that Faculty Senate spent a lot of time brainstorming suggestions for improving enrollment which were delivered to the District. In recent conversations with President Rivera-Lacey, Versaci and Ferrero have shared their frustrations that no improvements are evident. Versaci has asked the President to visit a Faculty Senate meeting and was encouraged by Senators to invite her to the next meeting on February 14. VP Ferrero said she personally shares the Faculty Senate meeting recordings with both President Rivera-Lacey and with VPI Kahn so they can hear Senate's discussions firsthand as well.

Epstein said Kahn's memo says that FTES has not changed since last year which means the District is not operating with a reduction in courses that can be offered but the encouragement is still to offer less. But it also says that the District has no problem adding more courses if demand dictates it. Epstein finds this to be very disingenuous because the truth is, getting a course added is very difficult. Four or five years ago, an efficient course was 75% full. The goal post has been moved and it's basically 95% at this point. Faculty have been told unless you're at 100%, and you have a waitlist and nowhere else for students to fulfill the requirements, the class won't added. Even if you meet all these hurdles to add courses, the District takes the scheduling and modality design away from the departments and faculty and the

added class is going to be a fast tracked class and remote. Sometimes they do the shadow courses and they fill up, but of course they're trying to cancel everything a week or two weeks out before we even get to the semester. Faculty knows students are enrolling three and four days sometimes before a semester begins. Courses get canceled before they can even fill. The notion that the District has a lack of resources to do this is not quite right. Faculty need a full commitment from the College to actually bring students back.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro said DE Coordinators from around the county shared they are also experiencing these same issues. Students say they want to be back on campus but they're not showing it in enrollment. The ground classes for the all the Community Colleges are struggling versus enrollment. Hiro supports Epstein's idea to offer a robust offering at Palomar and students will come back on campus. Remember though, students can get an online class anywhere across the state through the CVC so there are always going to be online options for students.

Senator Lacey Craft said she agrees with many of the points that have been made about this being an enrollment issue and not a COVID issue. Limiting student services on campus is a huge issue. She supports marketing face-to-face classes by showing students what they're going to get by being face-to-face at Palomar. Palomar needs to show students what is offered on campus and how it will support their own success. Craft added that this current issue goes beyond enrollment and class modality since faculty are being told to rely on data that may be misleading or unclear. Craft said she thought Bioset was brought to the campus to offer testing, vaccinations and exemptions to students so students can come back face-to-face. If students were not vaccinated, we could still potentially offer resources to those students and believes that many students may not even know that this option is available.

Senator Sergio Hernandez said that CTE has been dealing with cuts for some time now and is discouraged for the future of the programs.

ASG President Marie-Therese Mouawad thanked Senators for their sincere and passionate concerns regarding student success. From her conversations with fellow students, she believes students do want in person classes.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner said several years ago there were discussions in Senate addressing the lack of faculty and students sitting on the Enrollment Management Task Force and asked if there are currently any efforts to make this happen now. Faulkner added that almost 15 years ago, the District was talking about an enrollment plan, not only in lean times but having an equally robust plan for when Palomar has the opportunity to grow. Is this plan somewhere in existence and has it been reviewed lately?

Senator and Accreditation Tri-Chair Adam Meehan said Palomar talks a lot about students and all the things necessary for students and always thinking about the students and philosophically he agrees 100%. This attitude of doing things for the student has hidden language that follows..."students are our customers and everything we do should be dictated by what we think students want." It just seems problematic, almost as if Palomar is abandoning the responsibility as educators and as an educational institution to set an example for students of what higher education is. This is not something derisive towards students Meehan said. Most of the students who show up on campus have just graduated from high school and they're learning from Palomar what college is supposed to be. Right now, they are seeing that for college, it's hard to register, your class may get canceled at the last minute and online learning is great. This self-fulfilling prophecy of "students just want online classes so that's all we're offering," isn't the message we should be sharing. What do we expect from students when this is the message we send?

Senator Zavodny, Chair of Committee on Committees said she has no record of any committee called Enrollment Management Task Force. There was a committee called Strategic Enrollment Management but it has been disbanded twice and doesn't exist as of October 2021. She is not aware of any enrollment management committee that exists within the shared governance structure right now although there should be one.

Versaci thanked everyone for their comments and said he will share this meeting recording with both President Rivera-Lacey and with VP Kahn so they can hear all comments made today. He will also invite the President to the Faculty

Senate meeting next Monday to further discuss all of these issues. Also, Trustee Rodriguez confirmed his attendance to the February 14 meeting some time ago.

- B. Proposal to Amend Some Senate-Controlled Reassigned Time - Tabled**
- C. Support for Probationary Faculty – Tabled**
- D. Reassigned Time Position Evaluations - Tabled**
- E. Accreditation Steering Committee – Tabled**

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad)

- The Associated Student Government meet on 1/31 to discuss attending the ASACC conference in Washington DC. The Board ultimately decided it would be a risk and voted to cancel the trip in favor of attending the SSCCC General Assembly in Sacramento from April 1-3, 2022, and are moving forward with the decision.
- The ASG also voted to change the Regular meeting time from a 11:30-1 to 11:00- 12:30 due to class scheduling conflicts.
- The ASG also has been approved for an in-person Spring Retreat in the SU building on Campus on the 11th and 12th of February.

President (Versaci)

At the Governing Board meeting on Tuesday, February 1, the Governing Board approved a specific map that outlines new voting districts for the five Governing Board positions. This approved map—the designated “Purple” map—was one of four choices put before the board. Three of them were created by an independent demographer, while the fourth—the designated “Public 101” map—was provided by an outside demographer hired by a coalition of two political groups that are seeking at least one seat on the Palomar Board. This Public 101 map was roundly criticized and exposed as creating a very favorable voting district for one of the hopeful candidates (while at the same time sabotaging one of the existing Board members). This process capped a multi-meeting process that included a special Governing Board meeting in mid-January, two special hearings on Saturday, January 29, and a special hearing as part of the 2/1 regular meeting.

It behooves all of us to stay informed about the upcoming November election, as three seats in newly-reconfigured districts will be in play, and this situation carries with it a huge potential to jeopardize Palomar’s DEI initiatives, as at least one of the declared candidates has been openly critical of those efforts as well as of specific faculty members.

College Council (Versaci) - No report. The College Council next meets on Friday, February 11.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci) – No report. The EESSC met on Friday, February 4 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro) – No report. The ECC met on Friday, February 4 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) – No report.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi) – No report.

Accreditation (Meehan) – No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

The Distance Education Committee met 2/2/22 and discussed the following:

- Palomar’s Proctoring Program is underway. We have hired a coordinator and are setting up the system. We hope to be up and running in a month or so.
- Zoom recordings made in the fall by faculty will be erased in mid-February. More information coming via email.
- The committee is considering two programs that help with communication in Canvas.
 - Pronto: <https://pronto.io/>
 - Pisces: <https://www.gopisces.com/>
 - Both programs will be put through our new form system and reviewed next time.
- The committee went through the goals and updated action plans and goals for the Spring semester.
- The committee worked with the ATRC to create a rough draft of course cancellation guidelines that we will bring back for DE approval on Feb. 16 before bringing it to Senate.
- The DE Committee approved a new form for faculty to use if they want to request a new online tool. This form is going to the ATRC for feedback and being tested this month before it goes out to the faculty.

Guided Pathways (Nelson) – No report.

Budget (Ferrerro) - No report. The Budget Committee did not meet this week.

TERB (Lawson) – No report.

Professional Development (Guerrero) – No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson) - No report.

This group’s first meeting of the spring semester will be Thursday, February 10.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) – No report.

Equivalency (Towfiq)

Equivalency Committee is busy reviewing equivalency applications.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)

- Full time faculty will receive electronic communication on individual FSA processes and steps during the month of February
- 45 discipline FSAs are coming due for their three-year renewal. Chairs should be on the lookout mid-semester for electronic communication on renewing their current FSA on file

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:52 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary