



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
December 6, 2021

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Roxanna Vega (ASG), Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:**

**GUESTS:** Bill Carrasco, Kelly Falcone, Christian Garcia, Barbara Hammons, Cheryl Kears, Patriceann Mead, Billianne McLellan, Kitty Stahl, Alyssa Vafaei

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Senate President Versaci said a Special Senate meeting will most likely take place on Friday, December 17 to approve curriculum actions taken on December 15. More information will be forthcoming.

Senate President Versaci said he wanted to thank Governing Board Trustee David Garcia to the meeting today but noticed Trustee Garcia was not in the meeting yet.

Senator Will Dalrymple congratulated Senator Anastasia Zavodny and Travis Ritt for their recognition for the Distinguished Faculty Award.

Alyssa Vafaei said the final faculty spotlight event takes places this Friday with Dr. Albistegui-Dubois talking about why “fear is not the goal” and how this philosophy carries over into his teaching and best practices in his STEM classes.

Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar reminded Senators about the Social Justice Convening taking place in January.

Senate VP Jenny Fererro reminded Senators that Women’s History Month is coming in March. All activities will be virtual. Organizers are still accepting presentation or event ideas. Proposals can be submitted here:

<https://forms.gle/6fWBtP7c3T1qToTy6>

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner said the Winter Dance will take place this Friday and Saturday at the Howard Brubeck Theatre. Tickets can be purchased here: [www.palomarperforms.com](http://www.palomarperforms.com)

**AGENDA CHANGES** – No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Towfiq/Sanchez

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated November 29, 2021 (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

**ACTION**

**A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: W. Nelson/Marshall

Faculty Senate approval of curriculum actions taken December 1, 2021 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator Faulkner said she was sad to see that Technical Theatre is going away.

**Motion 3** MSC: W. Nelson/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval of curriculum action that replaces the Multicultural requirement for the Associates Degree with the new CSU Ethnic Studies requirement (see Exhibit 3).

Abstention: Beatrice Manneh

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson reminded Senators that starting Fall 2021, all new Palomar College students who plan to transfer to a CSU campus will be required to complete an Ethnic Studies course from CSUGE Area F for full certification. This includes students completing an Associate Degree for Transfer.

Nelson said this action was recommended by the GE (Curriculum Subcommittee) and was just approved unanimously by the Curriculum Committee. Senator Nelson shared the exhibit and the document can be found here:

[https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ethnicstudies/files/2021/06/Ethnic-Studies-flyer\\_A.pdf](https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/ethnicstudies/files/2021/06/Ethnic-Studies-flyer_A.pdf)

Nelson said that current multicultural designated courses will not be going away or automatically deactivated because those courses also meet other requirements.

Senator Faulkner expressed her concern by saying that Palomar is standing on an “enrollment cliff” for all courses that are currently designated multicultural requirement. She hopes this change will be widely publicized. She also hopes to see a mechanism put in place immediately for classes to apply or go through a process to see if the course meets the requirements for Ethnic Studies, much like is done for the humanities option.

VP Fererro said it's important to recognize the important role that Ethnic Studies plays in a good, well rounded education. Not all departments are going to be impacted equally so it's important to show support of the programs that are having the multicultural designation removed by finding ways that those courses can still remain relevant and robust. Fererro also said she received clarification from a counselor that students who are not taking a gap in their education will be able to remain on the previous Associate Degree GE pathway.

Senator Ben Mudget confirmed Ferrero's comment saying the catalog rights would remain in effect if the student matriculated prior to fall 21 and they maintained continuous enrollment.

Patriceann Mead said she doesn't understand why Palomar cannot have both. Ethnic Studies will meet the needs for some of the students but the multicultural classes, at least in Performing Arts target another group of students. All classes that have to do with the African and Latin Diaspora specifically talk to the students of color. There has to be a way for some departments to maintain multicultural classes because it is important for those students who are part of Performing Arts.

Senator Wendy Nelson responded to Mead's comments by saying that the GE Subcommittee is talking about a GE requirement discussion to include some thematic GE. One of the themes could be multicultural.

Senator Eduardo Aguilar said he is in the Ethnic Studies department and was included in the conversation to make this change from the Multicultural Studies Department to the Ethnic Studies Department. One reason for the change was to stay current with the state in terms of paradigms. Another reason for the change was to make sure these courses are taught by people that are trained in the subject and who will include topics that may not be talked about in other classes. Aguilar said that in every course, decolonize materials should be discussed and he hopes that Palomar can get to a place where it has Ethnic Studies in each subject area in the College.

Senator Lawrence Lawson said there may be an opportunity for some of those courses that were multicultural that will lose that designation, to be in some sort of learning community with some Ethnic Studies courses if they connect in some way.

Senator Susan Miller shared her support by saying that as a sociologist, all of her department's courses take a critical race perspective and look to understand systemic racism. Palomar needs to follow the mandates of the State who understands the spirit and the intent of that legislation which is to give all students an opportunity to take a really deep dive into understanding our culture and our history. It is Ethnic Studies faculty, who have the training, who have the skills and the knowledge to bring that to students. Faculty should support the newly formed Ethnic Studies Department and work with them and make sure that they get good, solid institutionalization.

## **B. Committee Appointments**

### **Motion 4** MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the following committee appointment (see Exhibit 4).

Hiring Committee, Director Early College, Outreach & Access – **Glyn Bongolan**, Counseling

The motion carried.

President Versaci reported that one part-time faculty responded to the call to fill a part-time faculty Senator seat so a ballot for that does not need to go out to faculty. Faculty Senate can confirm the appointment.

### **Motion 5** MSC: Faulkner/Fererro

Faculty Senate approval of the following part-time faculty to fill a Senate vacancy that commences January 31, 2022.

**Alyssa Vafaei** – Part-time Faculty Senator

The motion carried.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. Better Know a Trustee (Delayed)**

Senate President noted that Trustee Garcia was not currently on the call so Information Item A would commence once Trustee Garcia logged into the meeting.

### **B. Update on the Palomar Bookstore & ZTC/LTC Initiatives**

Senator and CALM Co-Chair Anastasia Zavodny gave a brief history of CALM and introduced Co-Chair Bill Carrasco. In 2018, legislation came through for the labeling of zero textbook cost (ZTC) and low textbook costs (LTC) courses in the online class schedule. The class schedule shows logos ZTC and LTC. Faculty submits textbook requests to the bookstore who then manually process the forms. If it's done timely, that information is added to the online class schedule so students know when registering for a class, that there is low cost or zero cost for textbooks.

Zero cost means there is no cost for the student for accessing the textbook though there may be an option to purchase one. Low textbook cost, by definition, is a textbook that the students purchase from the bookstore at \$40 or less, and that is total textbook cost for the course.

Zavodny said the process for this program continues to have many issues. Feedback from faculty show problems with the bookstore not labeling textbooks in a timely manner or other reasons like overpricing the textbooks that should be low cost.

Co-Chairs Zavodny and Carrasco will continue to work to improve the process to better serve the students and to comply with the law. Faculty who has suggestions or recommendations to improve the process were asked to contact Co-Chair.

President Versaci will ask VP Kahn for a meeting with bookstore management.

### **C. Part-Time Equity Work Group Update**

Senator a part-time faculty work group member Will Dalrymple began the discussion by explaining that one of the key ways to understand equity is by looking at it in terms of a set of values and to how to determine that value. Last week, Senators became aware of and discussed the minimal \$15 per hour or no compensation at all part-time faculty are provided when they serve on shared governance. He also paraphrased the core value statement of the newly formed EEDCC committee. Part of the work for Senate is recognizing inconsistencies and trying to find ways to work through them. Dalrymple said Faculty Senate is doing a good job of rising to meet challenges of being champions for equity in ways that he hasn't seen before on the campus.

Senator Zavodny followed up by asking where the next tangibles or actions to help Palomar move towards full equity. Zavodny asked Senators to consider all shared governance positions as faculty positions. All faculty are working towards the same goal of ensuring success of the institution and success of the various initiatives.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin said she is impressed with everything the part-time equity work group is doing and said there is a call for PFF to be working on the idea of equity as well. PFF is working in concert with the Senate workgroup consisting of Senators Zavodny, Dalrymple, Jarvinen, Laughlin, Miller and Sanchez, and faculty Kelly Falcone, Barbara Hammons, Elizabeth Stephens, Barbara Baer and Kateri Mouawad (ASG). PFF has a current 50/50 campaign going that is moving and pressing for equal pay for equal work and equal respect for all of our faculty members.

Senator Tanessa Sanchez quoted Palomar's own mission statement and suggested that Palomar models this practice with their own faculty. She said that because of the inconsistency in the way shared governance committees are made up and presented, Palomar should provide a clear, consistent and equitable language that invites all seats to be filled "by faculty."

Barbara Hammons said she heard over the years that part-time faculty are not as invested as full-time and the reason they don't want part-time involved is they could leave. Hammons said full-time can leave as well. What she would like the thought process to be is - the more involved you become, the more committed you are. The general consensus should be part-time faculty are as committed to Palomar, to the students and the well-being of everything as a whole and not - we don't want them because they'll leave.

VP Fererro thanked the work group and said she agrees with everything that was said today. Her mindset has been changing over the last years regarding part-time faculty participation and said just because somebody is a full-time colleague doesn't necessarily guarantee that they're going to stick with a commitment. She has witnessed the amount of work and commitment and passion that part-time faculty have. She said she is definitely in favor of everything that can be done in negotiations. Fererro said she recognizes that inherently the responsibilities are different for full-time faculty than for part-time. This doesn't prevent faculty from being partners. She went on to say that there is room for all faculty to really contribute and have their voices heard. She said she thinks it's really valuable for part-time colleagues to feel respected and honored and obviously compensated at the level that they should be.

#### **A. Better Know a Trustee (continuance)**

Senate President Versaci welcomed Trustee David Garcia. Trustee Garcia introduced himself saying he is a San Diego native and currently a high school teacher.

Senate VP Fererro asked Trustee Garcia what his primary goals are as a trustee for Palomar.

Trustee Garcia said his biggest goal is to make sure all students have access to reliable resources that will help them advance in their career, and to provide those resources in a fair and equitable manner. Providing accessibility to good career opportunities is also important...a pipeline from school to work.

Senator Eduardo Aguilar asked Trustee Garcia what the biggest obstacles are to advancing equity, inclusion and diversity in the District, and how can they get all constituents groups on campus to work together to do the work that is needed.

Trustee Garcia answered saying that this also goes back to making sure people have accessibility to resources. In his work, he tries to figure out what variables are evident and that keep different types of populations or demographics either disenfranchised or disengaged and to try and remedy that or reconcile any type of disparities in a way that would allow them to advance. This uplifts everyone in a very positive way.

To answer Aguilar's second questions, Trustee Garcia said a personal investment is necessary so there is more incentive to participate.

Senator Teresa Laughlin welcomed Trustee Garcia and asked if he had any questions regarding Senate.

Trustee Garcia said he didn't have anything to ask of Senate today but once he has had a chance to observe, he'll be in a better position to articulate questions to ask Senate.

Senator Will Dalrymple said that a majority of faculty at Palomar are part-time faculty and the compensation scale is much different as well. He asked Trustee Garcia if he has thought about how to bring more resources to part-time faculty.

Trustee Garcia said the board is actually having discussions regarding this matter now. Garcia believes there are ways to calculate or formulate appropriate compensation. He also said there is much support from the governing board for this issue.

Senator Sergio Hernandez asked Trustee Garcia what his thoughts were on Career Technical Education (CTE).

Trustee Garcia responded saying he recently read an article where Senator Hernandez's Diesel Mechanics Technology Program was spotlighted and commended him on his work. He said he is a huge advocate of

technical careers and this is the type of education that can provide a good paying technical job for students. He will continue to push for this funding for this type of program at Palomar.

Senator Ben Mudgett asked Trustee Garcia how and when he and fellow governing board members will critically evaluate the budget to align with the antiracism work that is needed in support of BP3000.

Trustee Garcia said it is very critical to take a deep dive analysis in terms of the data. Identifying certain demographics or populations and isolate those variables and then provide resources. Good policy is driven by data. The data then tells us where the resources need to go.

Senator Lawrence Lawson said that at the last board meeting, he thought Trustee Garcia mentioned a study that shows that people who had been infected with COVID are less likely to be reinfected than fully vaccinated folks would be to get a breakthrough infection. He asked Trustee Garcia if that was based on an Israeli study, which was comparing SARS/COVID to natural immunity to vaccine induced immunity. Lawson said that particular study has not been certified by a peer review study and that where the preprint study was posted--[www.medrxiv.org](https://www.medrxiv.org)--[notes](#) explicitly that "Preprints are preliminary reports of work that have not been certified by peer review. They should not be relied on to guide clinical practice or health-related behavior and should not be reported in news media as established information."

Lawson asked Garcia if he knew the nature of that study and that it was not yet peer reviewed and the guidance specifically said that shouldn't guide health behaviors.

Trustee Garcia responded saying there have been multiple studies showing the same and not many that have argued the opposite. Garcia mentioned several studies that he uses to reference the comments he made and reads COVID studies extensively.

VP Ferrero asked Trustee Garcia to explain his abstention vote on the PRIDE Resolution vote that took place at the last governing board meeting.

Trustee Garcia explained that as an institution, he believes that the focus needs to be on education. He does have concerns that the institution has become over politicized or that Palomar is becoming too political when we focus our resources, our attention and efforts on political activity, as opposed to quality education. He said it deviates from the actual goal of the institution. He said things like that are often times performative and as somebody who is has historically always voted for LGBT rights, and as somebody who has always voted in terms of the ways that are going to be favorable, he doesn't feel that the College is in a position or should be acting as political activist. He said this is his personal opinion and doesn't have any type of animosity towards the LGBT community.

VP Ferrero encouraged Trustee Garcia to reach out to the PRIDE Center and to faculty who can point him in the direction of all of the data showing that faculty and staff are here to serve students and students who feel respected, seen, welcomed and safe on their campuses are going to have a much better educational experience.

President Versaci thanked Trustee Garcia and said he hoped Garcia would return and experience the entire meeting to get a better sense of the kind of things Faculty Senate does.

#### **D. Update on Changes to the Senate Release Time Pot – Tabled.**

## **REPORTS**

### **ASG (Mouawad)**

On Monday November 29, The Associated Student Government approved the first reading of the Compensation piece in our by-laws. Each member of the board has added significant discussion on the compensation piece, and who will be compensated is still up for debate.

The ASG has approved travel for the ASACC Conference in March of 2022 and will be reviewing who is eligible for travel before bringing it to the Governing Board for approval.

President Mouawad and Senator Luke Eder met with Dr. Falcone to talk about the anonymous student survey that ASG initiated in the past two semesters for student feedback, and how we, ASG, can do it again this semester. President Mouawad is in the process of sending out the information to the Institutional Research and Planning Department.

Monday November 29th , ASG President Mouawad met with Dr. Kahn, Professor Liz Mendoza, and Professor Fabienne Chauderlot to discuss opportunities for ASL students to interpret for the committees and councils.

The idea would be to use Service learning as a method of getting students to participate as well as complete school-work assignments. Professor Mendoza pointed out that the students aren't adequate interpreters for public, recorded meetings, as there is a level of risk to the deaf community who need signage and interpretation.

Instead, the group suggested pairing up certified interpreters and students for their last semester in the ASL program which requires 90 hours of ASL learning.

President Mouawad offered to have them at ASG meetings and committees, as they are low risk and wouldn't require certified interpreters. Dr. Kahn mentioned he would bring up to President Rivera-Lacy for further discussion.

On a side note, Professor Mendoza mentioned that ASL students in the two two-year programs were facing difficulties with their financial aid being halted. President Mouawad wants to get further details for assisting in any way possible.

Tyesha Tate, ASG's VP of Club Affairs, had the last ICC meeting of the semester on December 1st, and will start it up again in the spring of next year. ASG will have our last meeting of the semester on the 6th to finalize the last of our preparation for the spring semester.

As always, ASG continues to move forward, develop and grow. We look forward to serving the Students of Palomar College and collaborating with Faculty and Staff again next year.

### **President (Versaci)**

I have been following up on several issues discussed and/or decided at previous Senate meetings with varying results. Specifically:

- The issue of establishing better lines of communication between Senate and Human Resources in terms of administrative search committees that need faculty representation. We have grown increasingly frustrated with the demands from HR to provide the names of faculty volunteers for these search committees within timelines that are not conducive to our processes, constituent size, or Brown Act demands. I reached out to Celina De La Torre and Monique Dumbrique on Friday, November 19, about having a conversation about how we might solve this problem. Monique responded on Wednesday, December 1, informing me that she had some ideas, had reached out to her director, and would get back to me soon.
- The issue of improving the process by which students under 16 years old obtain enrollment authorization signatures. As discussed in Senate on October 25, it is crucial (and in keeping with the ASCCC's position) that instructors retain the authority to allow students under 16 into their classes, due largely to issues of course content. Senate was also in agreement that the current process by which students obtain the necessary signatures, as

administered by Enrollment Services, is very cumbersome, and our recommendation was that the process be streamlined, possibly via Adobe Sign. I conveyed this request following that meeting, repeated it during the EESSC meeting on November 19, and sent a follow up on Monday, November 29, to Kendyl Magnuson, Director of Enrollment Services. To date I have had no response.

- The issue of the changes we made to the faculty hiring procedures, as is our purview under the 10+1+1. As detailed in our Senate meeting of November 29 (and in my President's report) for that same meeting, we responded to Vice President of Human Resources David Montoya's position regarding the approval process as erroneous in that it contradicts the faculty authority granted by Ed Code, Title 5, and our own Governing Board. Our response further expressed dismay that his position relied on a controversial memo created under College leadership that was divisive and ultimately dismissed by our Governing Board. To date I have had no formal response.
- The issue of improving the use of Notice of Hourly Employment (NOHE) forms. Senate VP Jenny Fererro, Senator Teresa Laughlin (in her role as PFF Co-President), and I met with Vice President of Fiscal Services Ambur Borth and others to discuss how the NOHE payment process might be improved. It was a short meeting—too short to solve the issue—and functioned mainly as an airing of the difficulties/barriers that existed in prompt payment. The main takeaway was that many of the problems lie with PeopleSoft (big surprise). We were assured that Fiscal Services would look into it and that the conversation would continue.

Jenny and I met with President Rivera-Lacey on Thursday, November 18 to discuss a host of issues, including some of the above. One issue we raised—which was brought to our attention by our own Pam Grasso—was that short-term/temporary employees have been excluded from the Covid vaccine incentive payment. We pointed out that they were part of the Palomar family, that they were under the same requirements as everyone else to get the vaccine, and that they lacked a bargaining unit to advocate on their behalf. President Rivera-Lacey was aware of the issue and assured us that she was working on a proposal for the Governing Board to consider.

**College Council (Versaci)** - The College Council next meets on Friday, December 10.

**Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)**

The EESSC met on Friday, December 3 (before Senate but after reports were due).

**Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan)**

The Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship Council met on Friday, November 19. Here are some of the main points from the meeting:

- Reviewing the process of getting feedback for non-instructional PRPs. Kahn and Kenney-Whitley will work on a proposal.
- Council goals are being established. Looking for feedback from constituents on goals for IEPFSC. Two of the goals included connecting all appropriate committees to the Council and monitoring and communicating the fiscal health of the college.
- Standing Reports (only 1 report):
  - Budget committee: There is an ad hoc committee led by Dr. Star to determine the appropriate threshold (such as 85%) for salaries and benefits. Benefits committee reports to Employees, Community, and Communication Council. Discussion took place about whether or not the benefits committee should report to IEPFS.

**Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro)**

The ECC Council met on Friday, December 3 (before Senate, but after reports were due).

**Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo)** – No report.

**PFF (Laughlin)** – No report.



### **Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)**

- Our college's inaugural **Social Justice Convening** will take place on **Friday, January 28th 2022 from 9:00-3:00 p.m. virtually.**
- This convening is open for all employees and students at Palomar College. **Faculty and staff** can also **submit their workshop proposal (due 12/3/21)** which should be aligned with the Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness (EEDCC) core values.
- Our **foci** for the Social Justice Convening this year is **Our Heart, Our Community: In Lak Ech**
- Please **register ASAP** or **before Wednesday, January 26, 2022 to be sent a Zoom link.**
- If you have any questions, please contact me (eaguilar@palomar.edu) or/and Dr. Lisette Ordorica Lasater (llasater@palomar.edu).
- Please share this information with your divisions, departments, and students!
- Dr. Kahn and members of the EEDCC will be working with him to create DEI SLOs These members are, Alan Lechusza Aquallo, Tina-Marie Parker, and Michael Mufson.

### **Accreditation (Meehan)**

The Governing Board will vote on whether to approve the Institutional Self-Evaluation Report (ISER) at its December 7 meeting.

### **Distance Education (Hiro)**

The Distance Education Committee met Dec. 1 and worked on the following issues:

1. The Distance Education Coordinator reported that the district is making progress on becoming a CVC Home College and plans to have a pilot program in the Spring 2022, following through on the Senate vote in Fall 2020.
2. Erin Hiro is encouraging all faculty to consider attending the in-person Online Teaching Conference next summer. For more information, look for an email coming soon on how to help faculty pay for registration fees. More information can be found here. <https://onlineteachingconference.org/>
3. Erin Hiro is putting together a Spring plenary training list. If there are areas where faculty would like more training, please email her at ehiro@palomar.edu.
4. Erin reported that Unicheck, one of our plagiarism checkers, is being discontinued. Erin will send a reminder about this to all faculty.
5. Zoom recording deletions: Erin will send out an announcement reminding faculty that deletions will be made during the 2nd week of Feb.
6. The PFF negotiated a MOU with the district to get faculty paid for HyFlex. Thanks to Jenny Ferrero and company for their hard work. The HyFlex training will be sent out to participating faculty.
7. The DE Committee spent almost an hour pouring over an updated Accessibility Course/Training. Kelly Falcone worked with the DRC to overhaul the training. It will be available to the faculty next week.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** – No report.

**Budget (Ferrerro)** - The Budget Committee next meets on Tuesday, December 14.

**TERB (Lawson)** – No report.

**Professional Development (Guerrero)** – No report.

**AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)** – No report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** – No report.

### **Equivalency (Towfiq)**

The Equivalency Committee is reviewing Equivalency Applications.

**Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)** – No report.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** - FSA next meets on Tuesday, December 7.

**Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)** - No report.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:56 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary