



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
November 29, 2021

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Roxanna Vega (ASG), Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Eduardo Aguilar

**GUESTS:** Kelly Falcone, Barbara Hammons, Billieanne McLellan, Kitty Stahl, Alyssa Vafaei

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT** – No public comments.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Senate President Rocco Versaci announced Council will be meeting this Wednesday, December 2 at 1:30 instead of 1 PM.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner reminded everyone that Performing Arts has performances every weekend through the end of the semester. For ticket information, go to [www.palomarperforms.com](http://www.palomarperforms.com)

Senator Lawrence Lawson reminded Senators about the December 3 deadline for submitting a Social Justice Convening Workshop proposal. The proposal form can be found here:  
[https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLScLFA6m7vfQ7PNp\\_Rrscm0-YcsQX4quPwweqLVTHYOIQ49mA/viewform](https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLScLFA6m7vfQ7PNp_Rrscm0-YcsQX4quPwweqLVTHYOIQ49mA/viewform)

Senator Lawson also announced there is an article about Palomar College on the Young Americas Foundation website. The article speaks of, among other things, Palomar's dedication to antiracism, and spotlights comments made by specific Palomar faculty. Lawson encouraged all faculty to support those faculty who are speaking up for antiracist and antiracism measures on the Palomar campus.

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro said organizers are looking for faculty to participate in Women's History Month (March 2022). If interested, click here: <https://forms.gle/hG7VsgmXQoJ1pSn48>

ASG Representative Roxanna Vega said that ASG is working on a student survey to go out before the end of the semester asking students for general feedback on their experiences at Palomar College. Vega will provide the results to Senate next semester.

Senator Alexandra Doyle Bauer said the Library will have different hours during finals week. Notices, via email are going out with this information.

**AGENDA CHANGES** – No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Laughlin/Fererro

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated November 15, 2021 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstentions: Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Adam Meehan

The motion carried.

**ACTION**

**A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of curriculum actions taken November 17, 2021 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

**B. Committee Appointments**

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said no action is necessary. She went on to remind Senators of a faculty vacancy on the Instructional PRP Committee. She also announced that a faculty call will be going out to fill a position on the hiring committee for a Director of Early College Outreach and Access. She also shared that she met with the Shared Governance Workgroup to discuss where all the new shared governance structure information and forms will be centrally housed. She will report back to Senate once that determination is made.

Senate President Rocco Versaci said he got an email from HR on Thursday, November 18 or Friday, November 19, just before the break saying there was a faculty spot on this hiring committee Senator Zavodny just mentioned. HR needed a name by December 3. Versaci wrote back and explained this has been an ongoing issue with HR where Senate does not get enough advanced warning about faculty positions for hiring committees and said the earliest date will be December 7. Versaci said he will continue working with HR for improved lines of communication.

**C. Part-Time Equity Group/Mentorship Program**

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Dalrymple

Faculty Senate approval of the Part-time Faculty Mentorship Handbook (see Exhibit 3).

Several Senators thanked the work group for their efforts and expressed support of this program.

The motion carried.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. Update on Faculty Hiring Procedures/AP 7120 (see Exhibit 4 and 5)**

Senate President Versaci recapped events leading up to the discussion today. After he and VP Fererro met with President Rivera-Lacey and VPs Montoya and Kahn on 11/2, they were waiting for three simple but important pieces of information from Montoya before Versaci could bring the procedures back to the Senate: 1) Some wording that allows for additional reasons to halt a search midway 2) Confirmation that our additional wording regarding degrees-in-progress does not violate Ed Code 3) Confirmation that there exists no substantive reason for limiting the Joint Selection Committee to seven members total. Everyone in the meeting had all agreed that these would be the final pieces to get in place. Unfortunately, obtaining the above bulleted items has not been simple; Versaci's repeated requests of Montoya for this information have been met with—alternately—assurances that it would be forthcoming, or silence. Montoya asked to meet with Versaci on Tuesday, November 23. At that time, Montoya expressed his belief that the Faculty Hiring Procedures needed to be “subsumed” within AP 7120 and go through the shared governance process. Versaci asked if that meant that elements of faculty hiring that had been decided upon by Senate could be amended by the committees and/or councils in that shared governance process, and Montoya replied that yes, such amendments were a possibility. Versaci asked him to put all of his views in an email and send it to the group that had been meeting on this (Versaci, Fererro, Kahn, and President Rivera-Lacey), and he said it he would do it that afternoon. The email he sent on Tuesday, November 23 was brief and referenced the memo written by then-HRVP Lisa Norman to the Senate in December of 2018 (see Exhibit 3 in this week's agenda). Versaci responded to everyone on the email chain on Wednesday, November 24 (see Exhibit 4 in this week's agenda). On that same day, President Rivera-Lacey phoned Versaci and she expressed her confidence that a “win-win” path forward could be found.

Senate VP Fererro followed up by saying the response from VP Montoya on November 23 completely contradicts all of the conversations that took place with the executive cabinet. Fererro said she and Versaci will follow up with President Rivera-Lacey in a timely manner.

Versaci shared that President Rivera-Lacey did tell him that they are moving into the second level interviews for the Africana Studies position and they're going to be doing the two-level process we recommended.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin said this has been an issue for quite some time. AP 7120 clearly states that this falls under Faculty Senate purview. Laughlin added that Faculty Senate needs to continue to push back very hard on this matter...it's the law.

Versaci added that during his discussion with the President, he told her academic and professional matters should have the same kind of status as negotiated items. When we're in a meeting and something comes up or someone's complaining about sabbatical, that's immediately shut down. Versaci is continuing to push for the same priority for academic and professional matters. Versaci added, just as a reminder for everybody who's serving on committees and councils, if elements of the 10+1+1 come up, the discussion should be immediately shut down, and advised to come to Senate to discuss the matter here.

Versaci said he will continue to follow up on this matter.

### **B. Senate hybrid meetings for Spring '22**

Senate President Versaci and Senators discussed the advantages and disadvantages of conducting hybrid Senate meetings beginning in Spring 2022. A straw vote was conducted and consensus was to continue meeting remotely in Spring 2022.

### C. Complications to Faculty Emeritus Conferrals

Senate President Versaci said a fellow Senator asked him about conferring emeritus status to faculty who may be forced to retire early due to being accused by the District of an unethical act. The question was, would Senate strictly adhere to its own criteria or would Senate consider the reason the faculty member was forced to retire?

Several Senators commented on the risks of considering a forced retirement in the emeritus confirmation process. It was noted that this hypothetical issue would be kept confidential by the District so Faculty Senate would never know the reason to begin with.

### D. Part-Time Equity Group/Shared Governance Proposal (see Exhibit 6)

Senator Anastasia Zavodny summarized the exhibit with special attention given to the shared governance section. The current focus of the Part-time Equity Workgroup is how can we equitize the shared governance system...make it more welcoming and inclusive for part-time faculty colleagues who have a wealth of knowledge to contribute to Palomar.

Senator Will Dalrymple, also a member of the work group added that the Resolution is a signpost marking progress that has been made so far. It's also a forward looking statement that brings one of our key opportunities into focus. This is one of the best opportunities to recognize our community and expand that community. If we're looking at the big picture for a moment, every step forward, whether its civil rights or human rights, we first recognize that there's an "in group," and then affirmatively we say, "Hey we're going to enlarge that group, we're going to expand the circle."

Dalrymple added that full time faculty get compensated at the rate of five hours per week for their service. Part-time faculty get zero unless they serve. If they serve, part-time only get compensated on a small minority of all the different possible committees or councils. And then, even in that small minority of cases, it's at this very diminished rate. It's a rate of \$15 an hour, minimum wage.

Senator Wendy Nelson noted that full-time faculty are being compensated for five hours per week for institutional service but some do not volunteer to do the work. It's unfortunate that some full-time faculty absorb the extra work that needs to be done. It's very unfortunate that part-time faculty get paid just \$15 an hour or nothing at all for their institutional service.

Senator Zavodny added that there are more ways to perform institutional service other than committee service work. And with the increasing positions for shared governance work, that number exceeds the count for full-time faculty. We should really look at integrating our part-time faculty into those roles and work.

VP Ferrero said a few years ago, PFF negotiated for part-time compensation on certain committees. PFF tried to get compensation for any part-time faculty serving on any committee or council and the District pushed back. PFF then narrowed the compensation to committee work where there were attendance requirements and there was actual work being done. She said PFF has tried numerous times to get the hourly rate increased and has only been successful in raising it from originally \$11 an hour to \$15 an hour. Ferrero said PFF keeps trying for a non-instructional rate and will continue to do so.

Several Senators voiced their support of passing the Resolution as presented.

**Motion 4** MSC: Dalrymple/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to move the meeting back into Action.

The motion carried.

**Motion 5** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the Part-time Faculty Equity/Shared Governance Resolution (see Exhibit 6).

The motion carried.

**REPORTS:**

**ASG (Mouawad)** – No report.

**President (Versaci)**

The main issue that I have been working on is getting the final approval of the Faculty Hiring Procedures and the faculty portions of AP 7120 (to refamiliarize yourself with the history of this, please see my President reports of 11/8/21 and 11/15/21). After Jenny and I met with President Rivera-Lacey and VPs Montoya and Kahn on 11/2, we were waiting for three simple but important pieces of information from VP Montoya before I could bring the procedures back to the Senate:

- Some wording that allows for additional reasons to halt a search midway
- Confirmation that our additional wording regarding degrees-in-progress does not violate Ed Code
- Confirmation that there exists no substantive reason for limiting the Joint Selection Committee to seven members total

We had all agreed that these would be the final pieces to get in place. Unfortunately, obtaining the above bulleted items has not been simple; my repeated requests of VP Montoya for this information have been met with—alternately—assurances that it would be forthcoming, or silence. VP Montoya asked to meet with me on Tuesday, November 23. At that time, he told me that it was his belief that the Faculty Hiring Procedures needed to be “subsumed” within AP 7120 and go through the shared governance process. I asked if that meant that elements of faculty hiring that had been decided upon by Senate could be amended by the committees and/or councils in that shared governance process, he said that yes, such amendments were a possibility. I asked him to put all of this in an email and send it to me, Jenny, VP Kahn, and President Rivera-Lacey, and he said it he would do it that afternoon. The email he sent on Tuesday, November 23 was brief and referenced an attached the memo written by then-HRVP Lisa Norman to the Senate in December of 2018 (see Exhibit 3 in this week’s agenda). I responded to everyone on the email chain on Wednesday, November 24 (see Exhibit 4 in this week’s agenda). On that same day, President Rivera-Lacey phoned me and we had a discussion about the issue and she expressed her confidence that we would find a “win-win” path forward. Senate will discuss this matter as Information Item A in this week’s agenda.

**College Council (Versaci)**

The College Council met on Friday, November 12. Most of the Council’s time was spent on the agenda’s information items (update on Strategic Plan 2022 Year 3 Action Plan, Review of the Governance Structure Handbook, Costs report on having ASL interpreters at council meetings, and discussion of having a single place to house committee membership lists). We started to go through final approval of various BP/APs, and as there were several requests to pull and discuss individual BP/APs, we only got through a portion of these. Several people requested that the BP/AP discussion go to the top of the agenda for the next College Council meeting.

**Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)**

The EESSC met on Friday, November 19. Highlights include:

- Approval of the DRC Advisory Committee
- Discussion of various BP/APs
- Child Development Department name change
- Selection of EESSC volunteers for the newly-constituted PRP Review Committee. They were:
  - Leanne Maunu (Faculty, English)
  - Patrick O’Brien (Faculty, Counseling)

- Natalia Volodina (Faculty, Biology)
- Nicole Roe (Associate Dean, Workforce & Extended Education)

**Institutional Effectiveness (IE) Council (Bongolan)** – No report.

**Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro)**

EEC met Friday, November 19. Discussion occurred related to proposed revisions to the governance flowchart. Concerns included missing reporting relationships and representation, while appreciation was expressed for the work done to simplify and make a more visually appealing graphic. The Council also moved several policies and revisions to the Benefits Committee governance structure form forward to College Council.

**Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo)**

The ISC met on Friday, November 19. Highlights include:

- Erin Hiro volunteered to serve as Co-chair of the council replacing Debra Doerfler who is retiring.
- There was discussion of adding an additional voting member (a Representative from Business Services) to the council. College Council did not support adding Dennis Astl as a voting member due to concerns of how it would affect representation. The consensus was to not propose any changes to add additional voting members to the council at this time.
- BP3810- Claims against the District. There was discussion on changing the procedure for claims against the district to allow claims under a specific amount to be approved without going to the Governing Board. Examples were provided of small claims that took an excessive amount of time to be approved. The proposal suggested involved changing the process for claims under \$50,000. Claims below this amount could be approved but would still need to be reported to the Governing Board. Derrick Johnson, Manager of Environmental Health and Safety joined the meeting for the discussion. He will research other District policies and bring proposed changes for procedures to a future meeting.
- Mike Day, Director of Information Services, provided an update on the Technology Master Plan Subcommittee. The group has started informally meeting as a workgroup to begin reviewing PRPs. He asked faculty serving on the council to reach out to determine interest in Faculty Division Representatives to serve on the subcommittee. Mike Day again expressed concerns with the committee becoming difficult to work with too many members and favors smaller work groups to address specific technology concerns. The subcommittee will meet monthly, with work groups meeting in the off weeks. He supported the need for faculty involvement for PRP reviews.

**PFF (Laughlin)**

It is hard to believe we are about to celebrate Thanksgiving. I am grateful for the people I work with. The faculty have gone above and beyond to ensure student learning during this difficult and distracting time. The PFF, CCE and Palomar Foundation, along with the San Diego and Imperial Counties Labor Council (SDICLC) will be distributing Turkeys and other goodies in Parking Lot 12 from 8-10 a.m. on Saturday November 20<sup>th</sup>. We are also collecting toys for the SDICLC toy distribution in December. For every unwrapped, factory packaged toy that is collected, the PFF will contribute \$5 to the cause.

Don't forget our Meet and Greet with our Trustees on December 1<sup>st</sup> at My Yard Live at 4:30. All are invited! The PFF will provide non-alcoholic beverages and snacks.

I have been actively involved in the shared governance and union meetings including:

- Governing Board Meeting 11/2/21:
  - There were several presentations.
  - The Governing Board approved the vaccine incentive payment and retention bonus.
  - The Governing Board approved flying the Progress Pride flag on campus for Pride month.
- Campus shared governance meetings:

- Faculty Senate
- College Council
- TERB
- Budget
- Benefits
- Negotiations are always ongoing. We have Chair listening sessions for current and past Department chairs scheduled for Thursday, 11/18 at 6-7pm and Friday, 12/3 at 3-4 pm. These listening sessions will help with negotiating articles 12 and 20.
- Interaction with members: I have had with several individual meetings with members regarding various concerns.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.
- Meetings with Board members: We meet monthly with each Trustee to keep the lines of communication open.
- Meetings with Dr. Star Rivera-Lacy to discuss Spring 2022 expectations for in person interaction among other topics.

If you have concerns about these or any other issues, please email me at [tlainelaughlin@gmail.com](mailto:tlainelaughlin@gmail.com).

**Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)** – No report.

#### **Accreditation (Meehan)**

There will be an all-campus forum to discuss accreditation, with a focus on governance, on December 2 from 1-2PM. Zoom link here:

<https://palomar-edu.zoom.us/j/93299588836>

The Institutional Self-Evaluation Report (ISER) goes to the Governing Board for second reading and approval on December 7.

#### **Distance Education (Hiro)**

- Kelly Falcone attended the Chancellor's office webinar and said it was focused on DE. Said there is a push for all campuses to be teaching colleges in CVC exchange. Current percentage of online offerings varies widely across the system. Students are divided about half and half between wanting on-ground vs online courses .
- Erin Hiro reported that the annual Online teaching Conference will be in June 29 - July 1, 2022 in Long Beach in person. You can register at <https://onlineteachingconference.org/>
- Erin Hiro reminded the committee to let their colleagues know that Zoom Recordings need to be downloaded by early February 2022 or they will be erased.
- The PFF is negotiating with the district to get new HyFlex faculty paid to be trained before the beginning of spring. The plan is to have new HyFlex teachers take a self-paced Canvas course over the break and then meet with current HyFlex teachers in person Jan. 25 or Jan. 26 to practice teaching HyFlex in the classroom with the technology.
- Kelly Falcone is updated an existing Canvas course on Accessibility. The DE Committee hopes to have it live and available for PD hours in the Spring.
- Erin Hiro sent an online proctoring proposal for funding to Rocco Versaci and Jack Kahn, who will decide whether to incorporate it into a larger proctoring program that includes ground options.
- Erin Hiro inherited a Canvas course that readies students for online learning. It is out of date and will take some work to get it ready for new students. But the question is, does anyone need online readiness after Covid?
- Erin Hiro told the committee that her department is noticing an increase in No Show students, particularly in the shorter classes such as FT2. They are likely Financial Aid fraud cases. These students are dropped but that hurts the

overall efficiency of those classes. Erin fears this could lead to unwarranted class cuts. If others are noticing an increase of students who never participate in the classes and are dropped, please let your deans know.

- The next DE Meeting is Dec. 1 at 2:30 p.m. Email ehiro@palomar.edu for more information.

### **Guided Pathways (Nelson)**

- The Guided Pathways Funding Request Form will be available on the GP Website beginning Dec. 1. Requested funds will need to be used by the end of the spring semester. If you have a project that needs funding and aligns to Guided Pathways – please complete the form.
- The Guided Pathways team is working on the Expenditure Report which is due to the Chancellor's office on Dec. 24. It will be presented at the GP Taskforce meeting on Dec. 16.

**Budget (Ferrerro)** - No report.

### **TERB (Lawson)**

The Tenure and Evaluations Review Board is continuing to review evaluation processes and clarify steps. For the part-time evaluation process, there is a form for Deans to complete, if they opt to review the evaluation material, where they can comment on a part-time faculty member in a key area: fulfilling contractual obligations. This form has been useful in providing input and support for faculty evaluations. If a Dean requests to review a part-time evaluation packet, per guidelines in the contract, evaluators should share the appropriate information with the Dean so that they can complete the Dean Form.

TERB has also been confirming and reconfirming the out-of-cycle Peer evaluation process. In Fall of 2019, TERB created a process for peer out-of-cycle evaluations to create a more robust process of evaluation when such an evaluation is called by a department chair. In essence, the process follows many aspects of the probationary evaluation process: student evaluations in courses up to load, three observations (if possible), a self-reflection by the evaluatee, an outside member (chosen by TERB), among other features of the probationary evaluation process. The goal of a more robust per evaluation process when an out-of-cycle evaluation is requested (due to "documented concerns") is to provide extra guidance and support for both the evaluatee and the peer review team. Out-of-cycle evaluations are always sensitive, so extra eyes on the process is beneficial.

**Professional Development (Guerrero)** – No report.

### **AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)**

The AB705 Support Subcommittee met on 11/14/2021. This was an unofficial meeting, to try to make up for the meeting lost to the Veterans Day Holiday.

- Action
  - No action taken (unofficial meeting).
- Readings/Research: We went over the following research:
  - From CAP: Invalid Placement Practices Widespread in CCCs October 2021
  - From the CCCC: Report and Recommendations for Improving Black and African American Student Outcomes
- Reports
  - CCCC Language: replacing the "AB705" terminology with "Equitable Placement and Completion."
  - Chancellor's Office is now using this name vs AB 705.
  - Each college is submitting a Transition Plan by spring 2022 to explain how they will be in compliance by fall 2022.
  - AB705 SSC: change to our governance structure.
    - Our Subcommittee and the AB 705 workgroup currently exist.
    - The workgroup did initial work as AB 705 was beginning.
    - VPI asked us to merge the two groups and keep the Subcommittee and add some workgroup members.
    - Senate approved the new governance structure.



- Meetings are still open for people to come even if your spot on the subcommittee was eliminated.
    - Current members will need to reapply to be on the Subcommittee.
  - AB705 Workgroup
    - Palomar College will use IRP's definition of throughput, which looks at the cohort of first-time students starting in the fall. § Last meeting we looked at the CCCCCO's: Transfer-level Gateway Completion Dashboard. IRP confirmed that "completion" is the same as "throughput."
  - Guided Pathways
    - Nothing related to AB 705 to report.
- Group Work
  - We prepared our 12/3/2021 report to EESSC (Education, Equity, and Student Success Council).
- Announcements
  - READ 105 supporting students impacted by AB 705 taking stats classes – flyer shared by Erin Feld.
  - Nick Quintana shared a link to apply to be a writing tutor and asked people to share with those who might be interested/qualified: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/tutoringservices/become-a-tutor/>
  - Next meeting: 12/9/2021 2:30 – 4 pm

### **Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)**

We are continuing to review sabbatical applications for revision or approval. We continue to be inspired by the good work our colleagues are proposing to do.

### **Equivalency (Towfiq)**

The Equivalency Committee is reviewing applications.

### **Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)** – No report.

### **Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)**

The FSA Committee is discussing communication strategies for full-time faculty awareness of FSAs, why they're important, and how they are used. The committee is preparing draft communication to send to full-time faculty early in the spring 2022 semester.

### **Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)**

Credit for Prior Learning (CPL) is up and running - and our students are succeeding in saving time and money towards their educational goals!

By the end of this fall 2021 semester, 52 students will have successfully completed the CPL petition process, earning credits in a total of 158 courses.

Here's the breakdown:

- CPL courses awarded credit from April 2021 through summer of 2021
  - 83 courses
  - 26 students
- CPL courses pending - credit to be awarded at the end of this fall 2021 semester
  - 75 courses
  - 26 students

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*  
 Molly Faulkner, Secretary