



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
November 8, 2021

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Tanessa Sanchez, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Roxanna Vega (ASG), Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Tina-Marie Parker

GUESTS: Michelle Barton, Mark Bealo, Kelly Falcone, Paul Gabriola, Billianne McLellan, Carole Meagher, Alyssa Vafaei

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro reported the Governing Board passed a resolution that was based on the Senate's resolution to declare the month of June as Pride Month and to fly the Progress Pride flag at all campus sites.

Alyssa Vafaei invited faculty to attend the last faculty spotlight events in DRC. This week, Kelly Falcone will be sharing her Universal Design for Learning and how she uses it in her classes. Richard Albistegui-Dubois is on deck for December. The ZOOM events are on Fridays at 11 am. Faculty can register to attend through the PD website.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner encouraged Senators to attend any of the performing arts events occurring weekends over the next month. She also announced *that Little Shop of Horrors* will be the spring 2022 musical and auditions are happening on November 15. <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/palomarperforms/event/little-shop-of-horrors-auditions/>

Senator Susan Miller said another Queer Café event will be held this Wednesday as well as most Wednesdays. It begins at 3PM and we will be looking at queer representation in media and TV.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate President Rocco Versaci announced that all of the Trustees responded to his invitation to come visit a Senate meeting. The schedule is as follows: 12/6 - Christian Garcia; 2/14 - Roberto Rodriguez; 2/28 - Kartik Raju; 3/7 - Norma Miyamoto; 3/14 - Mark Evilsizer.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Towfiq/Zavodny

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated November 1, 2021 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum actions taken on November 3, 2021 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Motion 3 MSC: W. Nelson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of GE Approvals as listed (see Exhibit 3).

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson explained Curriculum has a GE Subcommittee who meet regularly and looks closely at all courses to ensure they meet requirements.

Abstention: Lawrence Lawson

The motion carried.

B. Committee Appointments

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny reported no committee appointment actions are necessary this meeting.

C. Proposal for Senate Release Time Changes

Senate President Rocco Versaci shared and summarized Exhibit 4 and further explained this redistribution of Faculty Senate release time was discussed in Senate last meeting and has not changed.

Motion 4 MSC: W. Laughlin/ Ferrero

Faculty Senate approval to redistribute Faculty Senate release time as reflected in the exhibit (see Exhibit 4).

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson questioned why the Curriculum Tech Review position is not reflected on this exhibit because she is confident the funding does come from Senate's 2.6 FTE release time. Senator Nelson also advocated for allocating some of the release time to the CALM Chair and said that if any of the 2.6 release time is not available for this, she hopes that some action can be taken to ensure the 2.6 can be increased in the near future. Nelson said that equity is very important and CALM, EEDCC and CPL are all about equity.

VP Ferrero said when Appendix F of the contract is reopened this spring, PFF will be working to try to get more release time for positions but added it has been exceedingly difficult to do over the last couple of years. PFF has an extensive list of requests for Appendix F. Ferrero went on to reassure Senators that since 2017 she has been leading negotiations and at every opportunity, she asked for an increase to the Senate pot as well as release time for those positions that

have their own line item in Appendix F. PFF consistently gets an answer of no. Fererro feels that with a different administration and a different governing board, this could change. Fererro reminded Senators that although there is a need to increase the Senate pot, 2.6 is what is on the books now so Senate must make decisions of how best to use the 2.6 and that is what's being decided today.

Senator and Credit For Prior Learning (CPL) Coordinator Candace Rose asked Senator Fererro why the Senate is providing release time for EEDCC instead of for CPL when CPL came first and the work is 10+1+1 work. Rose asked why not give CPL a .4 and ask PFF to negotiate additional funding for EEDCC. Fererro answered saying that all the positions are being negotiated. EEDCC is a subcommittee of Faculty Senate where CPL is not. The CPL position would most likely be a separate line item (outside of the Senate pot) in Appendix F. And, the District has already indicated that it would be interested in making the CPL position institutionalized.

Kelly Falcone asked why Faculty Senate isn't stepping back on this change and instead putting forward exactly what is needed for all of these positions. Senate should be asking PFF to negotiate for all of them. The shuffling of release time makes it very hard to continue growth in our projects. Falcone encouraged the Senate to keep in mind what is needed to sustain all these programs moving forward and know that divvying out that little pot of money means a lack of inconsistency in whatever we're offering. Falcone asked what Senate could do to join PFF's efforts and suggested writing resolutions outlining Senate needs.

Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar said that as a leader, he hopes to leave a precedent for the EEDCC community demonstrating that the work is extremely important and allocating funding resources towards this work is showing just how important it is. He asked Senators to show support for this Senate subcommittee by approving an allocation of funds for release time for the leadership of EEDCC.

Senate President Versaci reminded Senators the motion currently on the floor is about redistributing the current release time pot of 2.6. Any discussions regarding lobbying the District for additional release time for other important positions is an important discussion that should take place at another time.

SLOAC Co-Coordinator Mark Beale read the following statement from SLOAC Co-Coordinator Aundrea Tavakkoly:

"It has come to my attention that Senate is proposing to reduce the release time of the SLO co-coordinators to .2 each (we are currently .4 each) to be able to offer .2 each to EEDCC coordinators. The EEDCC coordinators probably are earning that release time, however reducing the release time of the SLO coordinators would be a mistake, and would be problematic in terms of the accreditation report, where our SLO process is being called out. Due to some of the issues we have encountered, and our efforts to address them, continuity with the SLO coordinators is, I believe, essential.

Mark and I are currently (and easily) putting in the work for .4 release time in order to do the work stated in the contract. Currently added to our plate is the Technology task force we are a part of, where we are reviewing the efficacy of Nuventive and Meta and looking for better replacements, as well as the Equity SLO task force that we were planning to bring to Senate this Monday November 8th. With both of these things added, our workload is easily up to .6. If the release time is decreased I foresee a discontinuity in SLO – co-coordinators, and that will reset the clock on all the work that we've been doing, as new SLO co-coordinators will need time to get up to speed. That will easily take at least a semester – in my experience. It's also important to keep in mind that when I applied to be a coordinator, the call had gone out at least twice, if not 3 times, and I was the only applicant on the 3rd round – so unless you already have someone (or 2 people) in mind who want/s to do this work for .2 release time, there may not be any SLO coordinators come fall 2022.

FYI, if the release time is reduced, it might be in the best interest of the college to get a new coordinator come Spring 2022, so that the new person gets the benefit of .4 release time (and Mark) as they come up to speed. I have enough FTEs for spring to be able to step down without affecting my load. I enjoy the work, but right now - with the new task forces - the workload is too much for .4 release time. Also my mom has been in and out of the hospital the last few months, and I was considering dropping a class to reduce my Spring workload – dropping this position may end up being the better option all the way around.”

Mark Bealo continued on saying that when he was considering the amount of work that he and Andrea do and have done, when this reduction in release time came to his attention, he was offended and does not support the change. Bealo said he would resign immediately if this release time for SLO is reduced. In his opinion, it will be a few more years before all the program assessments are brought to a better level. Bealo summarized the responsibilities that both he and Aundrea are tasked with now. He said that he asked VP Kahn for a full-time classified position to deal with the database issues alone so the SLO Co-Coordinators could focus on bringing up SLOs to be more robust or more effectual. In reality, the co-coordinators are not doing this right now.

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson acknowledged Mark Bealo’s remarks especially since he also experiences similar problems as the TERB Coordinator but said Senate is trying to figure out the math for equity sake, “to put our money where our mouth is” by allocating release time to EEDCC.

VP Fererro said it's important to recognize that Palomar has systemic problems that makes it harder for everybody, not just SLO or TERB Coordinators or Curriculum. In many areas, a lack of classified support where we have vacancies that have never been filled or have been consolidated where something that used to be 100% position for a classified support staff is now .4. All of those issues combined makes tasks that faculty perform that have released time takes more time and more work. When PFF asks for additional release time for existing positions or new positions, we keep running into a sense, on the part of administration that there are lots of faculty with release time who are not doing their jobs. This impacts the negotiations. Fererro doesn’t necessarily agree with that or think it’s accurate but that's definitely a perception. PFF will continue to work cleaning up Appendix F and continue trying to get appropriate release time for positions that need it.

Versaci suggested to table the motion until SLO Co-Coordinators can provide Senate with detailed information about the workload and demands they currently experience in these positions. He also asked Senator Aguilar for a detailed breakdown of what work is being performed for EEDCC as well. Senate can review the information and revisit this item at a later date.

Motion 5 MSC: Towfiq/Hernandez

Faculty Senate approval to table Motion 4 and revisit at a later date once more information is received regarding the SLO, EEDCC and the Curriculum Tech Review positions.

The motion carried.

D. PRP Review Committee Proposal

Motion 6 MSC: Towfiq/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of the Governance Structure Group Request change form for Instructional Program Review and Planning group (see Exhibit 5).

Versaci explained this is the simplified version that Senate came up with last Monday. The exhibit was approved by EESSC last Friday. The only change made by VP Kahn was deleting the word “funding” from the Products category.

The motion carried.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Accreditation Update & Accreditation Co-Chair Position (see Exhibit 6 and 7)

Michelle Barton stated she wanted to begin engaging Faculty Senate in preparation for the site visit. Barton shared highlights of the ISER and pointed out some topics where the Accreditation team feels there may be some follow up with Faculty Senate and other faculty leadership.

The institutional self-evaluation report is ending December 7. Assuming ACCJC accepts it, we will be required to send it to ACCJC within 60 days of the site visit, which would be December 30 so our target is to get it out is on December 17. We then have a virtual site visit February 28 through March 3. The visiting team will ask for virtual interviews with individuals and they will attend various virtual meetings including Faculty Senate. Barton continued her summation of both exhibits explaining the role that both Faculty Senate and faculty play in the accreditation process including what processes and documents must be made available to their team. The ISER will be coming to Senate to ask questions and to make sure Senators and faculty have the information to actively engage and respond to the accreditation team during the visit.

Additional discussion occurred regarding the confidentiality of faculty who may teach one of the 50 or so classes selected in the review process by the accreditation team. Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin was adamant that faculty identity remains confidential and that the accreditation review should not be used for any other purpose including faculty evaluations. Barton responded by saying that the accreditation team is required to maintain that confidentiality.

Senator and Accreditation Tri-Chair Adam Meehan announced that he will be going on sabbatical after the visit. A follow up report most likely will be due within a year after the visit. A new tri-chair will have to be appointed and approved by Faculty Senate.

B. Part-Time Equity Group/Mentorship Program – Tabled.

C. Communication Strategies from Senate to Faculty/Campus – Tabled.

D. ASCCC Fall Plenary Update

Senate VP Fererro asked Senators to review her notes and to forward any questions they may have.

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1kveWFHfp3LZ0j-hCFxcWDnZ38hzeaeAimFJxXK-Qnq0/edit?usp=sharing>

REPORTS:

ASG (Mouawad)

The ASG continues to meet every Monday. ASG has been working hard on writing up a compensation policy for our by-laws in order to compensate the Executive members of the board, by building and following an accountability measurement grid.

We are also working to improve our goals, and increase awareness by participating in Shared Governance Committees.

The ASG and our Vice-President of Events, Isabella Proano, held a Pumpkin Painting Contest on Thursday, October 21st, in honor of Halloween, and will be awarding 3 contestants with the best pumpkin a small prize for the occasion. We intend to host more on campus and virtual events to promote ASG, Palomar, and student success.

Also, we are intending to host a Thanksgiving Event for Faculty, Staff, and Students. The tentative date is November 18th, a Thursday. Details and flyers to come, so stay tuned!

We hope to see you all at our next event!

President (Versaci)

Senate VP Jenny Fererro and I met with President Rivera-Lacey and Vice-Presidents Kahn and Montoya to discuss the changes to the Faculty Hiring Procedures/faculty portions of AP 7120. This was a follow up to a previous meeting, where Star expressed some concern over the change we proposed regarding who makes the final decision to hire. The upshot of our conversation—which we will bring back to Senate for discussion, likely on 11/15—is that consensus will be actively sought but that the President will make the final call to present to the board. Given that we have collapsed the 2nd and 3rd levels so that the President is now a member of the Joint Selection Committee (and not operating/interviewing separate), this seemed like a workable concession. All agreed that after Star went through a couple of hiring cycles, we could revisit this; she was uncomfortable agreeing to such a big shift this early in her tenure. We also brought up the issue of the District paying for additional advertising (that will happen), removing the stated limit of seven people total in the Joint Selection Committee (that will likely happen), and payment for 1st level interview travel (this will, in my opinion, also happen).

Also, I extended an invitation to the trustees to join us for our Senate meeting. The open dates (hosting one trustee at a time) are 12/6, 2/14, 2/28, 3/7, and 3/21. As of this writing (Wednesday afternoon), I have already received four responses.

At the Governing Board meeting last night, the Board received an update about the HEERF funds and spending. It looks like there is approximately \$15M in unencumbered funds left to be spent by August 2022 (though extensions are available). The District is also going to apply to the State for approximately \$1M to conduct a feasibility study for student housing; the application does not commit the District for anything other than this study. Also, the District passed the resolution to declare June Pride Month and fly the Progress Pride Flag at all of the centers. This was the resolution written by Abbie Cory, Jenny Fererro, and Ben Mudgett, and which the Senate passed on September 13. The resolution passed with four “ayes” and one abstention (Garcia).

College Council (Versaci)

The College Council last met on Friday, October 22, and meets next on Friday, November 12.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)

The EESSC met on Friday, November 5 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Institutional Effectiveness (IE) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferro)

The ECC met on Friday, November 5 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) – No report.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

EEDCC will meet on 11/12 & 12/10 from 12:30-2 PM on Zoom.

- Our college's inaugural **Social Justice Convening** which will take place on **Friday, January 28th, 2022, from 9:00-3:00 p.m. virtually.**
- This convening is open for all employees and students at Palomar College. **Faculty and staff** can also [submit their workshop proposal \(due 12/3/21\)](#) which should be aligned with the Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness (EEDCC) core values.
- Our **foci** for the Social Justice Convening this year is **Our Heart, Our Community: In Lak Ech**

- Please [register](#) ASAP or before Wednesday, January 26, 2022, to be sent a Zoom link.
- If you have any questions from November onwards, please contact Eduardo J. Aguilar (eaguilar@palomar.edu) and Dr. Lisette Ordorica Lasater (llasater@palomar.edu).
- Please share this information with your divisions, departments, and students!
- Dr. Kahn attended our last meeting and the EEDCC members who will be working with him to create DEI SLOs include Alan Lechusza Aquallo, Tina-Marie Parker, and Michael Mufson.

Accreditation (Meehan)

In preparation for the virtual visit from our accrediting agency, ACCJC, members of the Accreditation Writing Leadership Team (AWLT) will be discussing expectations and responsibilities with the Faculty Senate. The first appearance will be at the November 8 meeting, with additional appearances to follow in December and February.

There will also be an all-campus forum to discuss accreditation, with a focus on governance, on December 2.

The Institutional Self-Evaluation Report (ISER) goes to the Governing Board for second reading and approval on December 7, and the approved report will be sent to ACCJC on December 17.

Distance Education (Hiro)

Here are the highlights from the Distance Education Committee meeting Nov. 3.

- There is a memo from the Chancellor's office about CVC Home and Teaching Colleges that talks about technical changes that will make it easier for colleges to handle student data. That should make it easier for colleges to become Home and Teaching colleges. This will allow Palomar to revisit its goal of being a Home and Teaching College.
- Kelly Falcone announced that she discovered that faculty can learn a lot more about students' actions on Canvas by looking at New Analytics on the right-hand side of a Canvas course. Faculty can also message students by searches such as "message students who have a 60 percent or lower in the class." These tools can be effective for student retention and success.
- HyFlex Training update: They currently have 11 Hyflex teachers for Spring 2022 but more are expected. They hope to have training complete and available to new HyFlex teachers by the end of November.
- POCR: We are making progress on the application with the state to become a local POCR-certified school and have a meeting set for the evaluation.
- From Classic to New Quizzes
 - Faculty are still emailing her with concerns about the expected transition from Classic Quizzes to New Quizzes in Canvas. The migration is burdensome. The DE Coordinator will bring this issue up at local and state meetings and report back on other college's experience with New Quizzes. She has also asked the ATRC to rush training on New Quizzes for faculty to have by the winter break.
- Proctoring Update: The DE Coordinator reported that she is continuing to meet with proctors and others who can give feedback into creating an online proctoring program. She also plans to meet with Rocco Versaci and Jack Kahn about a possible campus-wide proctoring center that handles both on-campus and online proctoring to meet the changing demands of proctoring. The goal is to have this proposal to the administration by December for implementation next spring.
- Accessibility Training update: A former Distance Education Coordinator created a Canvas Accessibility class that needs updating. A few of the DE members are working to update this course. It will be designed to be self-paced and managed by the Distance Education Coordinator.

Guided Pathways (Nelson) - No report.

Budget (Ferrerro)

The Budget Committee next meets on Tuesday, November 9.

TERB (Lawson) – No report.

Professional Development (Guerrero) – No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)

No report. Next meeting is on Thursday, December 9 (we will miss the November meeting as it falls on Veterans Day).

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) – No report.

Equivalency (Towfiq)

The Equivalency Committee is reviewing Equivalency Applications.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)

The Faculty Service Area Committee discussed the professional eminence competency. The committee consulted with the Academic Senate of California Community Colleges (ASCCC), and received the following guidance:

"The use of eminence to grant equivalence to the minimum qualifications is still permitted and there could always be candidates that have such significant expertise that they could teach particular courses in a discipline. The Academic Senate has always encouraged colleges to be cautious when using eminence because candidates are not authorized to only teach certain courses in a discipline, but all of the courses that a district offers in that discipline. For many years and in multiple papers, the Academic Senate has encouraged districts to consider other information beyond eminence to grant equivalence. Ultimately, this is a local decision and districts have the right to use eminence as the sole criteria, but we continue to encourage looking at other aspects of their qualifications before granting equivalence."

The FSA committee supports the purview of the discipline in using eminence as an additional competency. The determination as to whether eminence is met is the purview of the equivalency committee.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,


Molly Faulkner, Secretary