



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
November 1, 2021

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Marie-Therese Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Tanessa Sanchez, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Beatrice Manneh, Tina-Marie Parker, Elizabeth Stephens

GUESTS: Kelly Falcone, Morgan Johansen, Billieanne McLellan, Hossna Sadat Ahadi

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS – No Public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny announced she along with Senator Will Dalrymple met with Dr. Rivera-Lacey last week about part-time faculty issues. She and Senator Dalrymple are looking forward to continuing work with her on these issues in the future.

Senator Dalrymple added to Senator Zavodny's announcement by saying that a highlight of this discussion with Dr. Rivera-Lacey was her willingness and interest in working with us on these part-time faculty equity issues. Also, she mentioned this issue in her weekly email that went out yesterday. Dalrymple hopes that part-time faculty has somebody who is willing to be a good ally in an issue that is very important.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Laughlin/Zavodny

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated October 25, 2021 (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson announced that no action is needed today.

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 2 MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmation (see Exhibit 2).

Elections Committee – **Alexandra Doyle Bauer**, Faculty 21-23

The motion carried.

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot (see Exhibit 2).

AP 5140 – **LeAnne Farmer**, KINE Faculty, DRC Review

The motion carried.

Senator Zavodny emailed the ballot to Senators.

C. Canvas Access for Librarians

Senator and DE Committee Chair Erin Hiro reminded Senators that the Library requested a new “Librarian” access feature in Canvas so Librarians can provide resources for students. This access may also include Tutoring. This new access would be controlled by faculty teaching the course who could decide who and when this access is used.

Last week, Senators asked whether the Librarian role would have access to all grades in Canvas or just grades associated with Librarian-created modules. ATRC’s David Gray said the access can’t tailor grade access for individual modules. The Librarian function would have full access to all grades in a Canvas class.

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson said that it seems like a lot of this stuff on Canvas is modular. It’s surprising to him that often times, when asking for this customization, we are often told it’s not possible. Senator Lawson is nervous to give access to grades to anyone else. The Librarians need this access and it makes sense, but it makes him uncomfortable voting for access. Lawson hopes that ATRC will further investigate ways where customization could be possible.

Motion 4 MSC: Lawson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to allow a “Librarian” role be added to Canvas (see Exhibit 3).

Abstention: Marie-Therese Mouawad

The motion carried.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Senate Monthly “to Do” Calendar (see Exhibit 4)

Senate President Rocco Versaci presented the exhibit. The DE Coordinator position is still in flux because the position should be a two-year term and Erin Hiro was selected to serve a three-year term. Senator Hiro said she is hoping to serve the remainder of her three-year term to complete projects she is currently working on. To make that change now, Hiro said that it might be problematic for other faculty who considered running for the DE position as a three year

term and now it's a two year term. Senator Hiro added that there is a learning curve for this position and sometimes wonders if a two year term is enough. President Versaci said that moving the calls to December with a selection in early spring would give the new coordinator time to shadow the outgoing coordinator for a better part of a full spring semester. Unfortunately, though, there is no release time available for this shadowing period.

President Versaci said the DE position will change back to a two year term at the end of Senator Hiro's term. The document will be available on the Faculty Senate webpage.

B. Senate Constitution "Clean Up" (see Exhibit 5)

President Versaci reported that he along with VP Fererro and Senator Zavodny went through the Constitution and made various superficial changes to terms or committee names that are no longer valid and made some corrections that were identified. Versaci reviewed the edits and asked for feedback from Senators.

VP Fererro reported the changes will go to faculty for a full vote. The Elections Committee will be responsible for getting an electronic vote out to all faculty.

C. PRP Review Committee Proposal (see Exhibit 6)

Senator Zavodny shared the exhibit for the new Instructional Planning and Review Committee. She explained that the information is not new but was taken from those roles and products of IPC relating to PRP. A significant change is that it will be a joint committee between Faculty Senate and Equity, Education & Student Success Council (EESSC). Also, a few changes are reflected in faculty and dean divisional membership. Some potential members who are not listed yet on the document from VP Kahn who suggested adding two classified CCE with one coming from a transfer area and the other coming from the Instruction Office, an ASG representative and a CAST or AA person who has expertise related to PRP.

Senator Wendy Nelson commented that adding a researcher to this committee will be very helpful but cautioned that the membership is quite large. The committee is technically a working committee that creates a document. Since this work is under the purview of Faculty Senate, the members of this joint committee should be Faculty Senate. Nelson suggested maybe a total of eight to 10 members should serve on this committee and said Senate President should also be a member. She advised that the VPI should serve as well as the SLO Coordinator, a PFF representative, a researcher and possibly just three more faculty.

Senator Lawrence Lawson added this move for change is to remind us that this review work does fall under 10+1+1. Lawson also asked if this was considered a Joint Operational Committee and further explained that there are rules established by the Governance Task Force (GTF) in play now that dictates membership should consist of equal members from both Faculty Senate (appointed faculty) and one other council committee. Senator Lawson suggests that the other membership not coming from Faculty Senate should come from EESSC only for this PRP work.

VP Fererro also cautioned about the size of the group and explained that she feels not every member listed is needed to get the job done. One of the goals for the governance restructuring work was to get away from creating situations where we essentially feel like unless everybody's represented, nothing can be okay. Fererro went on to say that we need to trust each other to reach out to the people that can provide the feedback that we need but get the job done with a smaller group. She said we do want this to be faculty driven but we don't want to create a system where nothing gets accomplished.

Additional supporting statements were made by other Senators. Senator Zavodny made live updates to the exhibit using recommendations made during this discussion. President Versaci said he will take the exhibit as amended today to EESSC on Friday to get feedback. He'll report back to Senate next Monday.

D. Proposal for Senate Release Time (see Exhibit 7)

President Versaci said Council began looking at the current allocations for Faculty Senate release time. He shared the exhibit and explained the current designations and recommended changes that would be effective fall of 2022.

Senator and Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator Candace Rose explained that she recently updated the position's scope of work and it was determined that it is actually equivalent to 70% release time because a staff support person was never hired by the District to assist her. Versaci asked Senator Rose to push this issue to PFF and she responded that she has and PFF will be responding soon.

Versaci will bring this item back to Senate next meeting for further discussion or to bring to Action for approval.

E. Clarify the NOHE Process

President Versaci said he sent out a call to faculty regarding issues they may have experienced with the NOHE process. There were some replies.

VP Fererro and Senator Teresa Laughlin, PFF Co-President reported that the District's negotiation team wants to fix the NOHE process and that there have been no formal negotiations between PFF and the District on this matter. This is an administrative problem and although PFF negotiates compensation, there is not a mechanism in place for PFF to pay people. The District's system is very antiquated and we can only continue to offer up recommendations of how to fix it or make it better.

Several Senators and some faculty shared personal stories dealing with the NOHE process and questioned the approval (signature/sign off) requirements. They also shared frustration over the District's lack of concern to fix the issue when some faculty rely on this compensation to pay their rent or feed their families. There were concerns about inconsistencies in pay rates from department to department and the way this compensation is recorded on the pay stubs which makes it almost impossible to know what is getting paid.

Senator Wendy Nelson suggested that a few Senators meet with faculty who replied to the call and get their suggestions of how to make the process more efficient. Also looking at how other colleges are making it work may be a good start to creating a list of recommendations to give to the District.

President Versaci suggested that PFF Co-Presidents Barbara Baer and Senator Teresa Laughlin, along with Senate VP Fererro and himself should meet with Amber to further discuss these issues and report back to Senate. He will also let President Rivera-Lacey know that this important discussion will take place.

F. ASCCC Fall Plenary Resolutions (see Exhibit 8)

President Versaci reported that he and VP Fererro will be attending the ASCCC Area D Fall Plenary this week. He asked Senators to review the packet and let either Versaci or Fererro know if any of the resolutions are of concern.

REPORTS:

ASG (Mouawad) - No report.

President (Versaci)

I have been in dialogue with VPHR Montoya about some of the hiring changes the Senate has ratified—specifically, the shift of payment for additional advertising from departments to the District and the additional wording on the job announcements. The VP’s position on the latter is that it has not yet been ratified as part of AP 7120 (though, as far as I can tell, the discussion about revisions to that AP seem to have stalled somewhere). As for the former, President Rivera-Lacey and VP Montoya confirmed that they are looking for funding sources, but that the change will be made. I contacted all of the chairs of departments that are hiring and told them about this, as well as the new two-level interview process. I also asked those chairs to have the selection committees brainstorm additional places to advertise in our ongoing efforts to create a more diverse pool of initial applicants. I will meet with VP Montoya on Monday, November 1, and I will follow up on all of this; in addition, Senate VP Jenny Ferrero and I will meet with President Rivera-Lacey, VP Montoya, and VPI Kahn on Tuesday, November 2 to discuss more specifics about the Faculty Hiring Procedures.

The Governing Board will hold its regular meeting on Tuesday, November 2. There are several items of interest on the agenda, and I encourage faculty to attend. These items are:

- A report on HEERF spending, including what’s been approved and how much money is left.
- A discussion of the possibility of going out for another bond, likely starting with a poll of the voting district.
- A discussion of the viability of affordable student housing at Palomar.
- A presentation on the current enrollment situation and processes. This is meant to be the first of a two-part enrollment presentation, where this one is meant to provide an overview of enrollment issues, and the second—scheduled for December’s regular meeting of the Governing Board—will discuss solutions. President Rivera-Lacey has indicated that has drawn from the document provided to her by the Senate for these presentations.

College Council (Versaci)

The College Council met on Friday, October 22. One of the items on the agenda was to approve a slew of BP/AP revisions. Three of these added language regarding faculty input on administrative evaluations. There was robust discussion about the procedures for this, and Senator Lawrence Lawson explained that, according to Ed Code, the Governing Board is responsible for developing them. After further discussion, President Rivera-Lacey agreed that the Governing Board would have this on their agenda for February.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci) – No report.

The EESSC met on Friday, October 29 (before Senate but after reports were due).

Institutional Effectiveness (IE) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferrerro) – No report.

The ECC next meets on Friday, November 5.

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin)

It is hard to believe that November is right around the corner! Where does the time go! We have had a busy fortnight as always. I attended the San Diego and Imperial County Labor Council (SDICLC) Gala in San Diego. The theme was Star Wars “A New Hope.” We were very fortunate to have three of our Governing Board members join us: Trustees Miyamoto, Raju, and Rodriguez. It was a lovely evening.

The PFF is working with the CCE, Feeding San Diego, and SDICLC on a Thanksgiving Food Distribution. It will be Saturday, November 20th in parking Lot 12 from 8am -10am or when we run out of food, whichever comes first. Check your email for information on how to volunteer.

I advocate for Faculty in standing meetings:

- Special Governing Board Meeting 10/20/21:
 - Presentation of the ISER the Accreditation team.
 - Campus shared governance meetings:
- Faculty Senate
- College Council
- Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship Council (alternate)
- TERB
- Budget
- Benefits

Negotiations are always ongoing and extensive. Jenny Ferrero is a wonderful Lead Negotiator. Thank her if you have a chance. She is always prepared and poised in her presentations, as well as being tough as nails! In spite of Jenny's expertise, negotiations are slow going. I have regular meetings with members to aid in emergent issues, and regarding various concerns about hiring practices, working conditions, vaccine requirements, evaluations, and contract interpretation.

As always, we stay in close communication with our siblings, brothers, and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.

We continue to have monthly meetings with all of our Governing Board members in order to explain the PFF's priorities and keep the lines of communication open.

If you have concerns about these or any other issues, please email me at tlainelaughlin@gmail.com.

Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness – EEDCC (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

- Our college's inaugural **Social Justice Convening** will take place on **Friday, January 28th 2022 from 9:00-3:00 p.m. virtually.**
- This convening is open for all employees and students at Palomar College. **Faculty and staff** can also [submit their workshop proposal \(due 12/3/21\)](#) which should be aligned with the Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness (EEDCC) core values.
- Our **foci** for the Social Justice Convening this year is **Our Heart, Our Community: In Lak Ech**
- Please [register ASAP](#) or **before Wednesday, January 26, 2022 to be sent a Zoom link.**
- If you have any questions from November onwards, please contact Eduardo J. Aguilar (eaguilar@palomar.edu) and Dr. Lisette Ordorica Lasater (llasater@palomar.edu).
- Please share this information with your divisions, departments, and students!
- Dr. Kahn attended our last meeting and the EEDCC members who will be working with him to create DEI SLOs include Alan Lechusza Aquallo, Tina-Marie Parker, and Michael Mufson.

Accreditation (Meehan) - No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

The Distance Education Committee is working on putting together a proctoring plan, creating HyFlex training for next Spring and drafting information on Zoom recordings for faculty. Our next meeting is set for Nov. 3 at 2:30 p.m. on Zoom: ID 919 9930 3997 Passcode 974173. All are welcome to attend the meeting. For more information, please visit our [website](#).

Guided Pathways (Nelson)

1) Guided Pathways Expenditure Report:

- 5 Academic Years: 2017-18, 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21, and the 2021-22 academic year in progress. There will be space to provide intended expenditures.

Survey questions

- What percentage of students are engaged in Guided Pathways activities and practices?
- What has the college done to align course offerings with student education plans?
- Please provide one major success story for your college.
- Please provide one major obstacle for your college.
- What could the Chancellor's Office do to assist in further implementation of Guided Pathways on your campus (Technical Assistance, Policy or Regulatory Change, PD, Technology Investment, Other)?
- What was the most effective usage of Guided Pathways funds on your campus (Faculty Release Time, PD, Administrative Planning, Student Engagement, Technology Enhancements)?
- New allocation through 2025-2026 coming soon!

2) Guided Pathways Request Process/Form:

- Updated the request for funding form adding additional questions
- Still finalizing the budget for the rest of 2021-2022 to determine available funds
- Researching NOHEs versus Stipends for paying faculty for GP work
- Created an outcomes document for recipients to complete when work is completed.
- Request form will be available in November.

3) Leading from the Middle

LFM is a change-focused leadership development program dedicated to developing and equipping middle leaders from California Community Colleges (CCC) with skills and strategies to "lead from the middle." Participants will have the opportunity to apply their knowledge to a "real world" problem at their college.

Palomar College Project - Student Success Teams

Create Student Success Teams to support our students and remove systemic barriers that prevent them from succeeding. The success teams will offer wrap-around support for ALL of our students, especially those that have been historically underserved.

The Student Success Teams will include a diverse group of faculty, staff and administrators and will provide high touch services to our students. Disaggregated data will be used to examine student outcomes and success, based on pathways.

Palomar's Team: Leslie Salas, Dean, Student Success, Equity and Counseling Services Glyn Bongolan, Counseling Department Chair & GP Pillar 3 Lead Wendy Nelson, Curriculum Co-Chair & GP Pillar 1 Lead Nancy Browne, Manager, Student Success Kineta Rios, Business Systems Analyst

Budget (Ferrerro) – No report.

The Budget meeting scheduled for Tuesday; October 26 was cancelled.

TERB (Lawson) – No report.

Professional Development (Guerrero) - No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson) - No report.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) – No report.

Equivalency (Towfiq)

The Equivalency Committee is reviewing Equivalency Applications.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) - No report.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) – No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary