



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
September 20, 2021

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Sergio Hernandez, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Tina-Marie Parker, Candace Rose, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Roxanna Vega (ASG), Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT:

GUESTS: Cindy Anfinson, Sara Beck, Lisa Cecere, Cynthia Cordova, Kelly Falcone, Marlene Forney, C. Harrell, Leah Hoover, Bill Jahnel, Kendyl Magnuson, Kristen Marjanovic, Leann Maunu, Patriceann Mead, Patrick O'Brien, Elizabeth Pain, Scott Richison, Tanessa Sanchez, Netta Schroer, Alyssa Vafaei, Jon Walker, Susan Wyche

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro reminded faculty of the deadline to submit proof of a COVID vaccination to HR. The deadline is October 11. Use "COVID-19 Proof of Vaccination" in the subject line of the email. Include your name, employee ID # and photos of both sides of your vaccination card. Email to: benefits@palomar.edu

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced that Neil Simon's *Fool, A Comic Fable* starts on October 7, live and in person on campus. Tickets can be purchased here www.palomarperforms.com Every Thursday, everyone is invited to tune into concert hour. More information for these free concerts can also be found here www.palomarperforms.com

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate President Rocco Versaci announced an email was sent to Senators requesting volunteers to participate in a work group created to design a system to evaluate the new governance structure. If interested, let President Versaci know by noon on Sep 21.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Laughlin/Zavodny

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated September 13, 2021 (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum actions taken on September 15, 2021 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of the following committee appointments (see Exhibit 3):

The motion carried.

Evaluations Appeals Committee – **Joe Limer**, Faculty, tenured, at-large (21-23)

Academic Review Committee – **Elvia Nunez**, Faculty, Instruction, Library (21-23)

Infrastructure and Sustainability Council – **Sara Beck**, Part-Time Faculty Representative, advisory vote

Senator and Chair of Committees on Committees Anastasia Zavodny said a Senator volunteer is needed for the EAC Committee. Another call will go out today with a submission deadline of September 30. Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson added that if a Senator does not volunteer by the deadline, the seat becomes an at-large seat and will be filled by another faculty member.

C. Governance Change Form DEqCC

Motion 4 MSC: Laughlin/Zavodny

Faculty Senate approval of the changes made to the Senate subcommittee currently called DEqCC (see Exhibit 4):

The motion carried.

Senator and Co-Chair of DEqCC Eduardo Aguilar explained the necessary changes made to the name and scope of the subcommittee.

D. Senate Requests/Recommendations to District re Faculty Hiring

President Versaci explained this list is a product of recommendations made during the recent faculty hiring procedure discussions by Faculty Senate. This list includes additional recommendations not under Faculty Senate purview and may improve diversity in faculty hiring. These recommendations will be forwarded to Dr. Rivera-Lacey and her executive team. VP Ferrero added that once this document gets reviewed by the President and her team, Faculty Senate needs to be available to respond with ideas and suggestions of how best to incorporate these recommendations into the process.

Motion 5 MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the document titled “Suggestions to District to Improve Diverse Faculty Hiring” as amended (see Exhibit 5):

The motion carried.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Volunteers for Academic Grade Review Panel (see Exhibit 6)

President Versaci shared the exhibit with Faculty Senate and said he will be asking Senator Zavodny to send a call out to faculty requesting two volunteers to sit on the panel.

B. Umoja Program Update

President Versaci reminded Senators that at the last Senate meeting, VP Lakhani shared that the District's plan was to immediately go out for two new co-coordinators for the Umoja program. During a meeting with Dr. Rivera-Lacey on Sep 14, Versaci and Fererro shared Faculty Senate's concerns about the rush to fill those positions and Dr. Rivera-Lacey agreed to postpone the call. The District plans to research the history of both Umoja and Puente and sort out the requirements of moving forward. The President wanted to be assured that students currently enrolled in the program are getting their needs met. She met with the ex-co-coordinators and Richard Carr who felt strongly that students will continue to receive a full experience while in the program. Additionally, Versaci is working and will continue to work with Amber Colbert to possibly start a black student alliance club. Versaci will continue to provide Senate with updates.

Regarding the issue of the Umoja co-coordinators not getting paid for their work in a timely manner, Senator and Curriculum co-chair Wendy Nelson said she would like to see Faculty Senate get involved to improve the NOHE process to ensure that all faculty get paid as promised and on time for extra work performed. Nelson said this is a systemic problem at Palomar and offered to be part of a work group to offer up recommendations to the District.

C. Federal Grants Opportunities (see Exhibit 7)

Dr. Susan Wyche, Dean of CTE began her presentation by stating she created the Powerpoint for President Rivera-Lacey and VP Jack Kahn primarily to show them what was happening at the federal level relating to workforce funding that will be coming our way in just a few short months. The Biden Administration, through its American Rescue Plan, has targeted the community college system for this funding.

Dr. Wyche summarized some of the slides listing programs and areas that will be targeted by the federal government for funding grants. Wyche reminded faculty that California Community College Chancellor Eloy Oakley is currently on sabbatical and is now working closely with the US Education Secretary on higher education matters including this upcoming grant program and how best to implement the funding process. Money will be available for improving infrastructure as well as free college tuition programs. Wyche hopes to see an uptick in enrollments and Palomar should have money to spend on those programs. She also stated that Palomar will have to increase and improve their wraparound student services so students can be successful in those programs. Palomar needs to evaluate how do we prepare our college to deal with much more financial activity and hiring activity that comes with being asked to scale up programs.

Regarding timing, Wyche went on to say that Congress wants to get this legislation done before the election year which is next year so they will have it under budget reconciliation by November. Negotiations are happening right now as to the total amount of the final bill. It will take Congress 6 to 9 months to figure out how to get the funds to the agencies and how the agencies will disperse it. Some funds may come in the form of grants or even pots of money moved to the states. The states then figure out how to disperse it. Calls may be going out next spring and then the funds hitting within the next year or two.

To plan for robust and improved institutional processes to support this change, Palomar needs to look at these bills and to ask ourselves, where do we have existing programs that can be modified or scaled up to meet the need. We need to think about staffing and how our current hiring and fiscal processes support this influx.

Dr. Wyche closed her presentation by telling Faculty to get ready to think outside the box.

D. Academic Due Process – Tabled.

E. Governance Change Forms from College Council (see Exhibit 8)

President Versaci shared governance change forms that were brought to College Council for first reading. The members were asked to share the documents with their constituent groups for comment. Most of the changes are basic in nature. Regarding the Professional Development Committee, Senators suggested adding something about reporting back to Senate on the faculty portion. Adding the idea of joint committees in the reporting relationship section was also mentioned.

F. Enrollment Barriers for our Students (see Exhibit 9)

President Versaci said there is great concern on campus regarding plunging enrollments. Although COVID is a major cause, there are other issues that need to be addressed. He emphasized this is a solutions-oriented discussion and will begin with listening sessions...allowing faculty to share their experiences, observations, and ideas about enrollment issue barriers.

There was lengthy discussion on the matter. To read the full set of notes taken during this discussion, view here: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1F88XzhyH7iYCKOVnRY2EWzCm_EVdp4o_yxdc9fQQiys/edit?usp=sharing Some of the comments were not delivered during the Senate meeting but came in via email to the Senate President and Senate Vice President both before and after the actual meeting.

After the session, Versaci said he will send out one more call to faculty to give another chance to share information. Versaci and VP Fererro are compiling the information and will report back to Senate for next steps.

REPORTS:

ASG (Mouawad) - No report.

President (Versaci)

Jenny and I met with Dr. Star Rivera-Lacey on Tuesday, September 14, to discuss various issues, including the Faculty Listening Session coming up on Thursday, the changes to the faculty hiring procedures, some enrollment concerns, and the issues surrounding the Umoja program. Star agreed that a call should not go out for new co-coordinators until we get more information about the program's history and address ways to ensure both its success and the success of the coordinators (obviously related). Of utmost concern at this point is for the current students, and she has been assured by the outgoing coordinators and others involved in the program that those students will have a meaningful experience.

College Council (Versaci)

The College Council met on Friday, September 10. We reviewed the roles and responsibilities of the council, disbanded SPC and Policies & Procedures (since the CC is replacing SPC and will assume the work of P & P). There was some discussion about creating a work group or task force to review P & P matters before they come to the larger group. We also reviewed other changes to the governance structure necessitated by our shift to new councils. Those changes are on as information in the Senate's 9/20 meeting.

Equity, Education, & Student Success (EESS) Council (Versaci)

The EESSC met on Friday, September 17 (after these reports were due).

Institutional Effectiveness (IE) Council (Bongolan) - No report.

Employees, Community, & Communications (ECC) Council (Ferreiro)

Employees, Community, and Communication Council met on 9/3. The Council reviewed the scope of work, discussed committees that should report to ECC Council, and discussed potential suggestions for future revisions to the membership.

Infrastructure & Sustainability (IS) Council (Lucindo) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin) - No report.

EEDCC – Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

- We as a collective subcommittee would like to change our name to Educators for Equity, Diversity, and Cultural Consciousness (EEDCC).
- Our core values are...As activists to the Faculty Senate, this subcommittee will disrupt the status quo by dismantling and eradicating inequities. We challenge others to be uncomfortable and do the transgressive work towards the shared goal of infusing equity and antiracism throughout our college. We will rebuild, critically question, challenge, engage, reexamine equitable praxis, and validate cultural agency of the entire Palomar College Community with particular attention towards serving students.
- We will be meeting on Friday September 17, 2021 to begin planning our virtual social justice convening.

Accreditation (Meehan) - No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

Here are the highlights of the Sept. 15 meeting

- Proctoring
 - Erin Hiro said that the Faculty Senate is asking for the DE Committee to bring forward proctoring programs that will replace Proctorio, which is problematic for invasion of privacy, equity, and technology limitations.
 - Kelly Falcone suggested that the DE Committee bring forward strategies for dealing with proctoring needs along with programs.
 - David Gray, from ATRC, told the committee that all proctoring programs have the same challenges as Proctorio
- Unicheck
 - David Gray told the DE Committee that the college needs to move from the plagiarism checker UniCheck to CopyLeaks because UniCheck was bought by a larger company and the rates increased. The ATRC was hoping the transition could take place over the fall semester. They realized that it would run out this weekend.
 - The DE Committee Member Crystal Velasco made a motion to direct DE Coordinator Erin Hiro to work with Instruction to find \$6,000 to pay to keep UniCheck working through the end of the semester.
 - Motion approved unanimously.
- Canvas Program Selection
 - DE Committee members have expressed frustration over a lack of understanding on how the ATRC selects which Canvas programs to fund.
 - David Gray said he was not sure of the process either and that the ATRC learns about new programs through conferences and conventions or through faculty requests.
 - There are also concerns about free Canvas add-ons that faculty use in Canvas that are not accessible.

- The Committee will bring back this issue for further review and consider compiling a list of Canvas add-ons with information on their accessibility and other factors to help faculty in the selection process.
- Canvas Access
 - Last Spring, the Faculty Senate granted faculty the right to decide who has access to their class. Based on the resolution, the ATRC created an access of “Observer.” While this helps with TERB evaluations and some access needs, it is causing problems for Librarians who need to add content.
 - Committee member Linda Morrow asked that the DE Committee send a recommendation to the Senate to allow faculty to have full control over the level of access to a class.
 - David Gray cautioned that faculty have asked the ATRC to give students access to other students' grades and may inadvertently violate FERPA rights. He cautioned the DE Committee against granting full access.
 - The DE Committee will bring this issue back to the Oct. 6 meeting.
- POCR
 - The POCR process is being tested as part of the application to make Palomar a POCR-certified school.
 - Testers Linda Morrow, Amy Caterina and Kelly Falcone are participating in this testing cohort and are hoping to have it completed and sent to the state for review in October.
- HyFlex
 - The HyFlex experiment for four faculty members is going well. The students love the flexibility, and the faculty are learning how to balance the simultaneous Zoom and in-class students.
 - The only concern of current faculty is every class period so far has had some technology issue.
 - There is a growing list of faculty members who want to try HyFlex in the spring. The current HyFlex faculty cautioned the next test group should not be too big as to overwhelm the two AV support personnel.
 - The DE Coordinator spoke with one of them who said he was ready for the challenge.
 - The coordinator will caution administrators to schedule HyFlex classes carefully so there are no more than two starting at the same time in case there are technology challenges.
- New Discussion Board Redesign
 - Committee member Kelly Falcone asked the ATRC Rep about a new Discussion board feature that will help faculty. She wondered when training would be available and when it might be turned on David Gray said he would find out and get back to the DE Committee for guidance on the changes.
- Goals
 - The group worked on goals and collected feedback.
- Action
 - DE Coordinator Erin Hiro made a motion to elect Crystal Velasco to the position of DE Rep for the CALM committee.
 - Barbara Hammons seconded the motion, which was unanimously approved.

Guided Pathways (Nelson) - No report.

Budget (Ferro)

Budget Committee met on 9/14 and was presented with the Adopted Budget, followed by a lengthy question and answer period, with many very specific questions being asked by our PFF reps on the committee. Faculty representatives on the committee have requested that there be the ability to review information and use the Budget Committee time to provide guidance and feedback before information is presented to the Governing Board or finalized.

TERB (Lawson)

The semester has started with a bang. We're focused on getting in outstanding reports from previous semester to improve the completion rate for evaluation reports—especially among part-time reports. The pandemic shifted things a

bit, and doing everything digitally has provided some challenges, but it's essential to return all outstanding reports. This semester, after positive feedback last semester, we are continuing our *discussion* of implementing student evaluations at the end of all courses. Our next step is to take this to constituent groups for feedback and ideas. TERB is also exploring the idea of introducing a question in the self-reflection document for evaluations that asks faculty to look at disaggregated success/retention data for their courses and reflect on the numbers vis-à-vis their classroom practices. If this idea moves forward, we will solicit feedback and thoughtful ideas.

We also had a discussion of the optional Dean Form used on Part-Time Faculty Evaluations. There is some confusion about the process. To clarify: deans may ask to see evaluation materials for part-time faculty members before the evaluator assigns ratings (but after they've written the narrative). At that point, the Deans review the material and then complete their Dean Form—which currently has precisely one question (that was vetted by both faculty and admin): “The evaluatee adheres to contract guidelines.” Deans provide feedback on that question and return the evaluation materials and the signed Dean Form to the evaluator (however, they do not sign the final report because, well, it's not final as there are NO RATINGS). The evaluator then considers their feedback and decides whether to implement it into the report or not, completes the report, and meets with the part-time faculty member (after grades post).

Speaking of improving completion rates for reports and meeting with faculty after grades post, we're looking into a new process where you can meet with evaluatees before grades post *and* maintain our promise to students to not share their specific feedback with evaluatees before grades post. This potential new process may increase report completions as evaluators won't have to wait until the next semester to submit reports.

TERB is also exploring a web-based survey interface to eliminate the need of sending evaluations to email addresses and potential make evaluations more efficient—especially in face to face or general survey environments. More soon.

TERB also appoint its EAC member for the year, and the outgoing TERB coordinator has asked Senate, PFF, and the President's Office about seating their positions if they have not done so yet.

And speaking of outgoing...if you are interested in taking on the TERB Coordinator role (must be tenured faculty) because you believe in faculty-led evaluations, logistics excites you, you want to get to know your colleagues *really* well, and you are looking for a tough but rewarding leadership experience, please reach out to Lawrence Lawson. He would love to chat with you and make sure there are great applicants for the position come Spring 22.

Professional Development (Guerrero) - No report. The next meeting is Tuesday, September 28.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)

The AB705 Support Subcommittee met on 9/09/2021, where we went over the following:

- **Action**

- We approved the May 2021 minutes.
- We voted on term limits for our SSC.
 - We will randomly assign ½ of the positions to a 1-year term, and ½ of the positions to a 2-year term.
 - Mark Clark, Wendy Metzger, and Cindy Anfinson (all Mathematics Department members) will randomly assign the positions and report back to the SSC.
- The SSC noted that our scheduled November meeting falls on November 11 (Veterans' Day). The SSC decided to hold an unofficial meeting on Nov. 18 to continue our progress.

- **Readings/Research:**

- NBER (National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper: [Is Online Education Working?](#))
- RP Group July 2021: [Enrollment and Success in Transfer-Level Math and English for Special Populations](#)
- CCCCO's July 21 Report: [Equitable Placement Spotlight \(Implementation and Evaluation of AB705\)](#)
- [Resource Library on Strong Start to Finish](#)

- Vision for Success AB705 Resources
 - Go to the 3PD Portal - Communities
 - Click on Communities Home
 - Click on All Communities
 - Go to CCC: Equitable Placement (AB705)
 - Click on Join Community
- **Reports**
 - Chair reported out regarding the May 26, 2021 presentation to SEA and monthly reports to Faculty Senate
 - No report from the AB705 Workgroup as that group has yet to meet this semester.
 - No report from Guided Pathways.
- **Group Work**
 - This fall the AB705 SSC is looking into closing equity gaps. We started by looking at the big picture. We will zoom in on DI groups later.
 - We broke out into 3 groups (see below)
 - Communication, Common Language, Common Advising
 - Tutoring and other Support Services
 - Data and Research into programs that help underserved students succeed, and Placement, Enrollment, Scheduling, and appearance in the schedule
 - Groups selected 1 or 2 priority goals from the May meeting and began creating an actionable plan to eventually send forward.
- **Announcements**
 - Grading for Equity book club and Becoming HSIs

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)

We meet for the first time this semester on September 16th. At the meeting, we will begin to review sabbatical reports from AY 21-22.

Equivalency (Towfig) - No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) - No report. The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, September 21.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary