



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
May 10, 2021

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Natalie Lopez, Leigh Marshall, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Beatrice Manneh

**GUESTS:** Richard Albistegui-DuBois, Craig Chamberlin, Matt D., Jeff Epstein, Barbara Hammons, Cory Lindsay, Anne-Marie Mobilia, Hossna Sadat-Ahadi, Tanessa Sanchez, Netta Schroer, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Hossna Sadat-Ahadi announced she and Luis Guerrero are doing a project this summer called *Decolonize Your Syllabus*. Any faculty interested in participating are welcome and will receive a \$100 stipend for their participation and this is funded by Guided Pathways. The project is meant to assist faculty with creating a more welcoming syllabus for students by removing some of the punitive language that may exist in the current syllabus. Registration: <https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLSfDOLmV8SNP-Tbq94i0Zbo19nBkkZWaT2XaUuzAecFRMhBMsq/viewform>

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Senator and Secretary Molly Faulkner announced *It's Monumental--Ending the Silence* takes place this weekend. The virtual galleries now open include visual art, poetry, essays and short stories written by students, faculty, staff and community members. ZOOM performances take place over the weekend. More information can be found here: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/palomarperforms/its-monumental-ending-the-silence-galleries/> Performing Arts music events and dance will take place over the next three weeks.

**AGENDA CHANGES** - None

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated May 3, 2021 (see Exhibit 1).

**Abstention:** Jackie Martin

The motion carried.

## **ACTION**

### **A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum actions taken May 5, 2021. (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

### **B. Committee Appointments – No action required.**

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said the committee is discussing a possible merge of some smaller committees that only meet as needed and is also discussing a possible structural change to Committee on Committees in terms of the requirement that all members be Senators. These recommendations will be forthcoming. Committee on Committees is also working through an update on the policies and procedures for Committee on Committees specifically on an allowance for ranked choice voting which should help with the committee appointment process. Some robust discussions are occurring regarding the Oversight Committee for Grant Funded Programs and those recommendations should also be provided hopefully by the end of the semester.

### **C. Senate Resolution on Proctoring Software**

**Motion 3** MSC: Faulkner/ Towfiq Faculty Senate approval of the Senate Resolution on proctoring software (see Exhibit 3).

#### **No vote was taken on this motion. See Motion 4.**

Several faculty members attending the meeting voiced their concerns about the resolution in general and also had issues with some of the language used. The shared comments and concerns of most faculty in attendance included

- The use of video recording students while taking tests is not new (Math Center and DRC).
- Accommodations for students with disabilities, for example, is already often done.
- Security settings on Proctorio can be considered intrusive but the settings can be modified by faculty to make it non-intrusive.
- The tech requirements for using Proctorio is the same for using ZOOM [this statement is inaccurate, but it was voiced during the meeting]
- Proctoring is critical in some classes to prevent students from cheating and as instructors, it is our job to proctor students.
- Students are able to eliminate most technical issues by simply asking for help from the instructor or the online Help from Proctorio.
- If there are real issues around equity access, then it's worth considering how valuable it is as a tool.
- There are more nuanced uses of Proctorio such as not requiring the use of the camera.
- Asking students to download a third-party APP is not unheard of in this online learning environment
- The second WHEREAS places an assumption that faculty claim that students are fundamentally or necessarily guilty of cheating in advance of taking the exam because faculty want to proctor it.
- Proctoring is very common in face-to-face settings.
- Faculty would like to strike a balance between deploying this resolution in ways that aren't discriminatory, that don't reduce equity and access at the same time.

- In the Resolution, language regarding identifying faculty who use Proctorio is intimidating. The language needs to be changed so that faculty understand that support is available for setting some of the features in the software that are currently problematic.
- Some faculty feel under supported by the institution when it comes to documented instances of cheating and plagiarism. It would be helpful to have a more robust set of criteria and a support structure in place to deal with these issues for both faculty and students. This may also reduce faculty's need to use third-party proctoring software.

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson stated that several faculty members emailed concerns directly to him last week and today and he stated he would share those points during this discussion today. However, Lawson said all those concerns have already been made. Lawson added that the second WHEREAS doesn't say proctoring creates a default assumption of guilt; third party remote proctoring software creates that. Lawson shared that he feels there is middle ground that can be reached. The limited use guidelines of a third-party remote software shared by faculty during the meeting and through email can help reduce inequities and negative impacts for students.

Senator Adam Meehan suggested the class schedule should include the fact that students may be required to download third-party proctoring software. Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro answered that she is pushing for this especially since if a student plans on using an iPad or cellphone to take the class, proctoring software won't work on those devices. At this time, Hiro isn't sure whether this information made it into the class schedule or not.

ASG President Kateri Mouawad reminded Senators according to ASG's recent student survey regarding their own online education, a majority of students do not like using third-party proctoring software primarily due to the privacy issues. Many students are uncomfortable using this software and this software does not prevent cheating. Mouawad recognizes the importance to maintain learning integrity but doesn't feel that using Proctorio is the method to use. Although ASG has not come out with official support of this resolution, the students have spoken out loud and clear that the privacy and equity issues must be of foremost importance and made a priority.

Senate VP Jenny Ferrero explained that the Resolution is not meant to identify faculty using Proctorio to tell them they need to assess students differently. It is meant to provide those faculty with information about how they can use Proctorio in more equitable ways. When this issue came to Faculty Senate, Ferrero, along with other Senators had not heard about some of the reasons why Proctorio is so potentially difficult and damaging and how it creates financial, access and discrimination barriers for students. Ferrero said that faculty who use Proctorio need to know and learn about how settings work in that software.

Senator Lawson suggested tabling the vote for the Resolution until the language can be edited. Lawson asked interested faculty to meet with him within the next week to make any necessary changes.

Senator Susan Miller suggested that research be done to see if Canvas can provide some of the proctoring tools needed for faculty or if there are other alternatives available.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro stated the District is under contract with Proctorio until December of this year and there are no funds available to procure any other proctoring software at this time to replace Proctorio through December 2021. The District also has funding available in January 2022, approximately \$18,000, to negotiate a new contract for third-party proctoring software. Senator Hiro plans to send out a survey asking faculty about whether they use Proctorio and if they do, what settings or features do they utilize to proctor their classes. Based on the results of this survey, Hiro will be looking at alternatives that may be less intrusive for the students and more budget friendly.

**Motion 4** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to postpone the vote on Motion 3 until May 17, 2021.

The motion carried.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. Senate Elections Update**

Senator and Elections Chair Alexandra Doyle Bauer announced that **Anastasia Zavodny** will fill the part-time faculty Senator position with the term ending May 2024.

Senator Bauer also announced that two full time faculty positions are still available for the term ending May 2024. The following faculty will serve as Senators for the full-time faculty seats with the term ending May 2024:

**Lacey Craft**  
**Sergio Hernandez**  
**Teresa Laughlin**  
**Susan Miller**  
**Tina-Marie Parker**

### **B. Gift of Time Award**

President Versaci announced that Council selected the 2021 Palomar College Margie Ruzich Gift of Time Award recipient. The award was named after the late Margie Ruzich who was a long serving professor in the Child Development Department and a former Faculty Senate President. Senate Council award it every year to a faculty member who has gone above and beyond the call of duty on behalf of the College. This year, the award is going to **Erin Hiro** who has been instrumental in ensuring that faculty were prepared to meet the special circumstances of this past academic year. While serving as a Senator, Hiro also headed up a group that affects everyone campus wide. In her role as DE Coordinator, she has kept us informed about the latest instructional developments and about best academic practices. Hiro has made herself available to answer questions and help steer faculty as they have had to develop a variety of skills to meet the challenges of these challenging times.

Senator Hiro thanked Faculty Senate and shared she is honored to receive the award.

### **C. Call for Service-Learning Coordinator (see Exhibit 4)**

President Versaci explained that a call for a Service-Learning Coordinator will go out tomorrow with a deadline of May 21.

### **D. Curriculum Year-End Report**

Curriculum Co-Chair and Senator Wendy Nelson shared her Top 10 Year End Report that can be viewed here:

<https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1cMvFncJyTMgo-hkq9B-3524shapmkU3F1IXyAdsL6MY/edit?usp=sharing>

President Versaci thanked Senator Nelson for this valuable year end report.

## **REPORTS**

### **ASG (Mouawad)**

1. ASG approved up to \$750 to allocate the tech club to purchase bots for their research activities, along with a total of \$750 allocated to our Room Design committee to repaint SU202,203, &204 rooms.
2. We're in the process of forming a faculty award committee and survey committee, with results due later next week.

3. We brought back our Club Camera Policy for further discussion and will determine our vote on it at our next meeting.
4. Our Communications Committee worked on history posts about Asian American and Pacific Islander Heritage Month for our social media accounts. In lieu of this, we have an upcoming our AAPI event on May 21st from 1:00-2:30.
5. Our elections are still going! We did have a minor hiccup with a complaint, but addressed it diligently, and made sure all involved were notified of the process. Results will come out anytime after May 10th . Candidate bios can be viewed on the SL&L website.
6. And of course, we continue on with our Bylaw and Constitution edits, with our goal to be done before the new board members are sworn in. We'll see.

**Late addition to reports:**

Election results will be available on May 17.

**President (Versaci)**

Our diversity in faculty hiring workgroup (me, Lawrence Lawson, Hossna Sadat Ahadi) is finishing up suggested revisions to the faculty hiring procedures, which we'll be vetting in DEqCC on 5/14 and then bringing to the Senate for discussion on 5/24. We will also be looking at the faculty sections of AP 7120 to see what changes we should suggest to those; ideally, those will also be part of the 5/14 DEqCC and 5/24 Senate discussions. I had a very productive meeting with Vice President Montoya on 5/3 about the process by which AP 7120 will be revised so that the changes are substantive, that they fully address DEI concerns, and that the authority/purview of various groups is recognized. All signs indicate that the process will now allow the Senate to get the faculty hiring piece set and that there will be a more ample discussion about the DEI Facilitator before AP 7120 continues through the shared governance process.

Also, the Senate-approved document, "Process for Faculty Senate/District Appointments for Grant-Funded Positions," was approved by administration, so I have put it on our website. I created a new item for the left menu called "Faculty Leadership Positions," and have housed it there. Secretary Molly Faulkner is working on a list of leadership positions that Senate appoints, along with their terms, and that will also be housed under this tab.

**Late addition to reports:**

The work group focused on faculty hiring procedures put together some suggested revisions on our own procedures and those are going to DEqCC this week.

The administration signed off on the document we created for Faculty Senate/District Appointments for Grant-Funded Positions. The document is now available on the Faculty Senate website.

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/facultysenate/files/2021/05/Faculty-Appointments-to-Grant-Funded-Positions-050521.pdf>

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner is creating a complete listing of faculty leadership positions that will also be posted to the website.

**SSEC/SEA (Versaci)**

SEA next meets on Friday, May 14, though that may change due to the President/Superintendent interviews that week (VP Lakhani and a couple of other members are on the search committee).

**SPC (Versaci)**

SPC met on Tuesday, May 4. We had a brief discussion on the progress of the Mission-Vision-Values statement; we had a discussion on how and when we should evaluate the new Councils (folks seemed to favor a mid-year assessment, but not to make any changes until at least a year into using the new structure); and Dennis Astl provided an update on the progress for the Athletics projects, and in particular the new football and softball stadiums.

**IPC Report (Versaci)** No report. IPC next meets on Wednesday, May 12.

**SSPC** No report.

**HRPC** No report.

**FASPC (Antonecchia)** No report.

**PFF (Laughlin)**

We're hosting an outdoor retirement celebration for all faculty who have retired from Palomar since Fall '19, and all our members are invited! We would love it if you could please join PFF to celebrate our 31 colleagues that have retired since Fall of 2019!

Thursday, May 27

4-6pm

Cocina del Charro in Restaurant Row

1020 W San Marcos Blvd., #50

\*the outdoor patio\*

The Palomar Faculty Federation is thrilled to announce the winners of the inaugural awards of "Union Supporter" and "Community Champion." Our winners will be honored at Palomar College's end of the year celebration. In addition, they will receive \$500 and a plaque.

The Union Supporter award is for a PFF member (not an eBoard member) who regularly attends Union meetings, functions and volunteers time when asked. The Faculty nominated for this award were Lisette Lasater, Sari Morris, and Tami Weintraub. Our winner is Lisette Lasater.

The Community Champion is for a PFF member (not an eBoard member) who has worked to make our College and larger community a better place by demonstrating social justice awareness and initiating programs or activities that benefit our students, staff, and/or community members. The Faculty nominated for this award were Amber Colbert, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Lawrence Lawson, and Nora Kinney-Whitley. Our winner is Hossna Sadat Ahadi.

Food Distribution was last Saturday, 5/8/21. Next food distributions: 6/12 and 7/10.

Negotiations are ongoing.

If you have concerns about these or any other issues, please email me at [tlainelaughlin@gmail.com](mailto:tlainelaughlin@gmail.com).

### **DEqCC – Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competence (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)**

- Some members on DEqCC attended the Committee on Committees meeting regarding starting a collaborative process with matters related to DEI+Antiracism.
- A workgroup is reviewing the faculty hiring procedures with President Rocco Versaci and updates for all members on DEqCC and Senate are forthcoming.
- DEqCC is planning professional development events for next academic year and when finalized, this will be shared with Faculty Senate, PD, and the entire campus.

**Accreditation (Meehan)** – No report.

### **Distance Education (Hiro)**

The Distance Education Committee met on May 5 and addressed the following issues:

- a. Committee members assessed their DE goals for the current academic year and suggested that four -- POCR, TERB/DE Partnership, Coursepack and Accessibility Trainings -- should continue throughout the next year. The remaining goals of CVC Home/Teaching College approval and DE website re-organization, have been completed.
- b. The DE Coordinator brought the Senate Proctoring Resolution to the committee for discussion. The DE Committee members generally supported it though some said they would encourage department colleagues to attend the Senate on May 10 for the vote. There was concern that it would fall on the DE Committee to execute the resolution during the summer, which would be difficult.
- c. The Committee also considered a math professor's recommendation of ProctorU to replace the current proctoring system. Members noted it would have the same challenges as Proctorio and would be excluded should the resolution be passed by the Senate. The other concern is the ATRC does not have the budget to pay for ProctorU.
- d. The DE Committee heard a faculty concern about Canvas not being able to handle large videos, which causes problems for student learning. The DE Committee agreed this is a problem as Canvas is not designed to store large videos uploaded to the LMS itself. Instead, faculty should upload to a website such as Youtube or Vimeo or use Canvas Studio for video storage. Those are also the best ways to get videos captioned to adhere to accessibility standards.
- e. The DE Committee members were asked what kinds of training should be offered at plenary in the fall. Among the suggestions were accessibility, Universal Design, authentic assessment, and workshops on POCR and Hyflex class models.
- f. Faculty are encouraged to email the Distance Education Coordinator Erin Hiro at [ehiro@palomar.edu](mailto:ehiro@palomar.edu) with other suggestions for faculty trainings.

### **Late addition to reports:**

Guided Pathway funds are available to pay the cost for @One courses and encouraged faculty to sign up.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** No report.

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)** No report. P&P next meets on Friday, May 7.

**Budget (Ferro)** No report. Budget next meets on Tuesday, May 11.

**TERB (Lawson)** No report.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** No report.

**AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)**

The AB705 Support Subcommittee (SSC) reports to both the SEA Council and the Faculty Senate. Here is our report and recommendations for the Spring 2021 semester.

1. The AB705 SSC evaluated ongoing research done on AB705, including research and presentations by the RP Group, PPIC (Public Policy Institute of California), CCRC (Columbia University’s Community College Research Center), CAP (California Acceleration Group), and Palomar College’s IRP.
2. As a result of our research evaluation, we noticed a difference in the definition of throughput used at Palomar College (PC) versus other researchers, in particular, the RP Group. We requested clarification from the AB705 Workgroup, as IRP sits on the Workgroup. IRP gave clarification as to why PC is using a different metric than the RP Group. IRP reports there is discussion at the CCCCO of sing an expanded metric system wide and that can be used for comparison purposes.
3. The SSC reviewed the new Math Placement Tool and gave input to make it more student friendly. Note: The Math Placement Tool was also reviewed by a group of incoming students that was organized through Guided Pathways. These recommendations were incorporated into the tool and it is ready to go live. See the [Math Placement Tool here](#). It will continue to be refined.
4. The AB705 SSC created the final definition of “gateway courses” at PC and sent them along to the AB705 Workgroup. The definition is below:
  - a. The term “gateway courses” at Palomar refers to the first transfer-level courses that meet English/freshman composition GE requirements and the first transfer-level mathematics or quantitative reasoning courses that meet the mathematics/quantitative reasoning GE requirements of a four-year institution. AT Palomar this also includes the first-level courses in any selected degree/certificate/pathway when successful completion of those specific courses is required to begin on that pathway. This may include common courses that are mandatory.
  - b. Gateway classes welcome students to learn foundational general education skills and first-level courses to succeed in their college careers.

<b>Needs of first-year students</b>	<b>Best Practices that address needs for first-year students</b>	<b>Best practices: department(s) who can potentially do the work</b>
Checklists for first year students; make it easier to navigate and easier to find.	Bridge type programs, FYE activities, connecting to resources such as counseling, tutoring.	Palomar Promise, Starfish, Student Services, Tutoring, Prep for Math, ESL Jam
Assistance in figuring out registration and technology help as needed.	Palomar Preview Days	Outreach and other campus departments
Academic counseling (selecting courses, developing an ed plan, etc.).	Just-in-time information (Canvas, registration, etc.). Example: Discover Palomar	Student Services
Assessment advisors and counseling to assist students		English, ESL, Math, Student Services



selecting their math course that fits their pathway.		
To first get into PC: Counseling webinars, Chat Bot.	Call campaigns to connect to students.	
Once at PC: ASK a Librarian, Andrea/Leti Live, Virtual Help Desk, Chat Bot.	Differentiated orientations.	Already being implemented
Time management and other college success skills integrated into gateway courses.	Starfish: kudos, flags, raise your hand feature, etc.	
Connections to tutoring early.	Using Canvas for communication; example is the tutoring link on Canvas. The group feels strongly we should push more info out through Canvas to existing students.	Tutoring, Starfish

5. Departments and campus divisions are sending their lists of gateway courses to the AB705 SSC Chair, who is compiling them and will share that information with the AB705 Workgroup and Guided Pathways.
6. The AB705 SSC had a deep discussion on what we can do to support our students in the transition back to campus (whenever that occurs). Some ideas that the SSC came up with are:
  - a. Be flexible, especially with absences and schedules.
  - b. Help students feel safe: remind students of campus resources and services on a regular basis. It is OK to be uncomfortable; help students seek help when needed.
  - c. Communicate with students more regularly than in the past.
  - d. Keeping some student services online.
  - e. Have a welcome event(s) to welcome students back on campus.

### Final Recommendations from the AB705 SSC

**Item 6.** Identify and recommend best practices that address student needs in the first year.

**Item 7:** Identify and recommend non-curricular support activities for underprepared and disproportionately impacted students.

Items
<b>Student Services:</b>
Counseling, to include goal-setting workshops.
More outreach regarding financial aid, especially as students are enrolling.
Peer-led workshops on student success skills such as time management, what office hours are for, etc.
Workshops: discovering campus resources in a scavenger hunt activity. Also continue to have support services do classroom visits.
“Hangout” rooms for specific pathways and majors meeting on particular days.
Campus tours, esp. to show all the support centers available.
Open houses for families to see the school and get introduced to resources.
A Canvas orientation shell with all the Palomar resources listed.
University tours early in their first year to help with goal setting.
Open computer labs just before and at the start of the semester where students can drop by and learn how to access MyPalomar, their Palomar email, Canvas, etc.

Checklists of steps they can take during various stages of their first year.
<b>Communications, Marketing, and Public Affairs</b>
Campus maps of specific supports color coded by type of support.
<b>Instruction:</b>
Umoja and Puente Programs
STEM Core Program
Community work as a group related to their pathway or major. Service Learning.
Connect to community resources.
Summer camps/bridge programs on something related to their pathway/major.
Mentorships: peer or faculty.
Supplemental Instruction and tutoring.

From the governance structure, the role and responsibilities of the AB705 Support Subcommittee are as follows:

**Role:** The AB705 Support Subcommittee will assist in identifying and implementing academic and non-academic student support services for students enrolled in Reading, ESL, co-requisite support and/or accelerated English and Math courses.

**Responsibilities:**

1. Promote discussion, understanding, and analysis of AB705 compliance and impact.
  2. Promote discussion, understanding, and analysis of multiple measures.
  3. Evaluate ongoing research connected to AB705, including student success in English, Math, and ESL courses.
  4. Research, identify, and recommend best practices for pedagogy pertaining to AB705.
  5. Continue to research and develop other learning structures/opportunities to meet the needs of underprepared and disproportionately impacted students.
  6. Identify and recommend best practices that address student needs in the first year.
  7. Identify and recommend non-curricular support activities for underprepared and disproportionately impacted students.
  8. Provide input and recommendations to the Student Achievement and Equity Council to include in the Equity Plan.
- As a regular part of our meetings, we complete items 1 through 4; for item 4 we rely on our AB705 departments (English, Humanities, and Reading; ESL; Math) to do most of the heavy-lifting as they are the subject-matter experts.
  - We focused on items 5 – 7 for the purposes of the recommendations in this report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** No report.

**Equivalency (Towfiq)** No report.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** No report.

**Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)** No report.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*  
Molly Faulkner, Secretary