



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
May 3, 2021

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Natalie Lopez, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Lacey Craft, Jackie Martin

**GUESTS:** Rachel Alazar, Barbara Hammons, Richard Hishmeh, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Senator and PD Coordinator Kelly Falcone requested that a AP7120 discussion be agendized for Faculty Senate to give Senators an opportunity to discuss the proposed changes, to ask questions and to ensure there is a faculty voice in the revision process. Senate President Rocco Versaci responded by saying that Faculty Senate's faculty hiring workgroup is currently working on changes to faculty hiring and now waiting for those changes to be vetted through DEqCC and then brought to Faculty Senate for further discussion and consideration. This work group will also review any changes to AP7120. Versaci spoke to VPHR David Montoya about the timeline for making the AP7120 revisions and Versaci asked that in the future, any faculty hiring changes, including AP7120, be vetted through Faculty Senate first before going to other forums for discussion. VP Montoya was agreeable.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

ASG President Kateri Mouawad announced that ASG elections are taking place this week. She asked faculty to encourage students to vote in this election.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin said the food distribution event will take place this Saturday, May 8.

Senator and Elections Chair Alexandra Doyle Bauer reminded Senators that nominations for new Senators is open. The ballot for a part-time Senator will go out to part time faculty on Monday, May 10<sup>th</sup>.

**AGENDA CHANGES** - None

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Towfiq/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated April 26, 2021 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

## **ACTION**

**A. Curriculum** – No action required.

**B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 2** MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmations (see Exhibit 2).

Curriculum Committee – **Melissa Balcombe** – Faculty, CTE (19-22)

The motion carried.

**C. Select Professional Development Coordinator '21-'23**

**Motion 3** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the results of the ballot (see Exhibit 3).

Professional Development Coordinator - **Luis Guerrero** (21-23)

The motion carried.

Senators thanked the current Professional Development Coordinator Kelly Falcone for her contributions and work.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

**A. Faculty Service Award**

Senator Alexandra Doyle Bauer congratulated all the nominees this year and announced Lawrence Lawson as the recipient of the 2021 Faculty Service Award. Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson thanked everyone.

**B. Call for Four Guided Pathways Pillar Leads** (see Exhibit 4)

Senate President Versaci shared the updated document and asked Senators for feedback. Versaci will email the call for this position on Tuesday.

**C. Senate Resolution on Proctoring Software** (see Exhibit 5)

Senator Lawrence Lawson reviewed the resolution created by the work group. The work group included Lawson and fellow Senators Falcone, Zavodny, Hiro and VP Fererro. Lawson said he recognizes that some departments rely on third-party remote proctoring software for their classes. He hopes that once departments read this exhibit, they will come back to Senate to participate in a discussion about the detrimental effects they may have on students. VP Fererro added

that the resolution states that if faculty continue to use this software, guidelines and training for how to limit the negative impacts on students needs to take place.

ASG President Kateri Mouawad said she was grateful to see action taking place in Faculty Senate since numerous complaints from students regarding issues with Proctorio are coming to ASG. Mouawad added that the student survey scheduled to go out by the end of the semester will ask for feedback on third-party proctoring software directly from the students.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro added that the current license for Proctorio ends in December of 2021. Currently, there is no funding available to purchase an alternative proctoring program. She went on to say that there may be other ways to limit the use of Proctorio for fall so that faculty can preserve students' rights. Some of the Proctorio settings can be removed globally by ATRC. In order to do this though, DE needs to understand how faculty are using the program and guide them in its continued use. The DE Committee is planning on sending out another faculty survey to gain more knowledge of how Proctorio is currently being used.

President Versaci stated that this resolution will be moved to Action next Senate meeting.

#### **D. Department Return to Work Safety Plan (see Exhibit 6)**

President Versaci shared the exhibit and some Senators indicated they are currently involved in discussions in their respective departments or divisions regarding the plan. It was mentioned that there still is not a set plan in place regarding the ratio of face-to-face classes versus online classes which will dictate how many staff and faculty will be needed on campus. Versaci said he heard that a plan is being discussed to allow vaccinated faculty to have full access to campus but the details have not yet been released.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson said she heard that some of the meeting spaces on campus may be equipped with technology (like the HyFlex classrooms) that would allow faculty and staff to attend a meeting in person or tune in via ZOOM. Regarding the weekly Faculty Senate meetings, both Versaci and Ferrero said that the Senate conference room is no longer an option for Senate meetings due to its size and that another conference room will have to be used.

#### **E. Academic Due Process**

Versaci shared that Palomar has something called Academic Due Process and it's housed on the Faculty Senate website. <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/facultysenate/academic-due-process-procedure/> It is a holdover from before the Union was organized and created to resolve certain types of disputes. Versaci and Senate VP Ferrero met with VP Montoya and President Kahn to discuss whether its still even needed at this time since most disputes or grievances go through the PFF or CCE. VP Montoya and President Kahn will review this matter and determine what needs to happen to revise the policy and procedure that may handle certain types of conflicts that aren't covered elsewhere. The proposal will then be moved through the shared governance process.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin said that the contract handles grievances. However, the contract doesn't say anything about faculty and faculty having problems or faculty and students. We have some type of grievances that just simply don't fit anywhere else. Laughlin thinks there is a need for some type of mechanism or group that can act as a neutral third party when certain situations occur.

## REPORTS

### ASG (Mouawad)

1. ASG discussed the Cameras on Policy, and how it applies to club participation post pandemic. We're currently drafting a potential policy for virtual participation within ASG, where Brown allows, and for ICC.
2. VP Abeeha Hussain hosted the elections committee as ASG prepares for the new oncoming board members for the next academic year.
3. We had Dr. Patrick Saviano discuss at our meeting the increase student fee for access to health care, and how underfunded the program is. We discussed different ways ASG could plan to advocate for such an important issue.
4. The communications committee continues to update our website and socials about Arab awareness and Autism awareness this month.
5. We added more members to participate in the Fallbrook Vision user groups.

### President (Versaci)

The faculty hiring procedures work group continues its efforts and should soon have revisions ready to vet through DEqCC and then Senate. I have reached out to President Kahn and VP Montoya to get more information about the DEI Facilitator position and the accompanying training; specifically, I asked who created the training and were any faculty members with DEI experience consulted. Jack replied that specifics about both the position and its training were not complete, and he instructed HR to reach out to me for the names of some faculty members to participate. Receiving no outreach from HR, I sent an email to Shawna Cohen (cc'ing both Jack and David) but as of this writing have not received a reply.

Update on the above: on Wednesday, April 28, I received word from a faculty member that the Equal Employment Opportunity Advisory Committee (EEOAC) had presented a draft of changes to AP 7120. As I mentioned in my 4/19/21 report, I had a discussion with David regarding Senate authority over faculty hiring policy, criteria, and procedures in our 10+1+1. As a follow-up to that conversation, I sent him a copy of AP 7120 with all of the faculty sections highlighted and asked that revisions to that document should not touch those sections. However, the document presented in EEOAC had numerous and substantive changes to those areas (I emailed members of the Senate a copy of the proposed revisions). I immediately sent an email to David (cc'ing Jack & the Senate) that recapped our conversation, the Senate's role in/authority over faculty hiring, and the lack of communication from HR over this matter and the DEI Facilitator. **During Faculty Senate, Versaci shared the document on screen and elaborated on his concerns and edits.** I asked for an explanation, but again—as of this writing—I have not received a reply.

On Friday, April 30, I attended two meetings—the new College Council for discussion regarding the transition, and one with Jack, David, and Senate VP Fererro to discuss the existing Academic Due Process (such that it is) and its relevance moving forward.

### SSEC/SEA (Versaci)

SEA next meets on Friday, May 14, though that may change due to the President/Superintendent interviews that week (VP Lakhani and a couple of other members are on the search committee).

**SPC (Versaci)** - SPC next meets on Tuesday, May 4.

### IPC Report (Versaci)

IPC and the Prioritization Subcommittee met on Wednesday, April 28. In IPC, VP Sivert said that the District was responding to the request that vaccinated faculty have access to campus beginning on 6/15 by planning to move in that direction and working out the details to do so. In the Faculty Hiring Prioritization Subcommittee, the group approved the following priority list for hiring in Fall 2021:

1. Business
2. Psychology
3. Biology
4. Child Development
5. Oceanography/Geology
6. Cabinet and Furniture Technology
7. English (1)
8. Art – Design & Illustration
9. Mathematics (1)
10. Health, Kinesiology, & Athletics – H/K (75%)/Head Baseball Coach (25%)
11. Biology – Anatomy/Physiology
12. Speech Communication
13. English (2)
14. Economics
15. Art – Drawing & Painting
16. Mathematics (2)
17. American Indian Studies
18. Sociology

Shayla said that it was very unlikely that any of these positions would be hired as we are currently way above the FON, but the District wanted to have a list ready just in case. The first four positions on this list were failed searches from 2019. The previous subcommittee passed a motion to carry these positions forward to hiring in Fall 2020 due to extenuating circumstances and in contradiction to standing practice. The current subcommittee agreed to carry them forward one more year at our 4/14 meeting but also agreed at this meeting (4/28) that the standing practice of starting from a blank slate each year in prioritizing faculty hires would continue moving forward. There was much discussion about this at the meeting, and the recurring theme was that the data used to determine a given department's needs relative to other departments' needs has an expiration date and must be reassessed annually.

**SSPC** - No report.

**HRPC** – No report.

**FASPC (Antonecchia)** - FASPC met on Thursday, April 29 (before the 5/3 Senate meeting but after reports were due).

**PFF (Laughlin)** – No report.

**DEqCC – Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competence (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)**

DEqCC meet on 4/23/2021. We had a discussion with Anastasia Zavodny regarding the DEI questions for the volunteer form for committees. The DEqCC membership agreed that we should be included in the BIPOC or BILPOC conversation. Various DEqCC members met on 4/16 to discuss a budget for our Spring 2022 conference and ask for money for our members' other needs. In the next meetings, we will discuss the revision of the name of the subcommittee as well as the creation of a DEqCC website on the Palomar College website.

**Accreditation (Meehan)** – No report.

**Distance Education (Hiro)**

Everyone is invited to attend the next Distance Education Committee meeting on Wednesday, May 5, at 2:30 p.m. on Zoom. The meeting ID is 981 0039 1117 and the passcode is 017020.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** - No report.

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)** - P&P next meets on Friday, May 7.

**Budget (Ferreiro)**

Budget Committee met on 4/27/21 and received preliminary enrollment data and goals for the next several years from VPSS Lakhani. The overall goal is 4-5% growth in enrollment each year between 21/22 and 24/25 (meaning up to 20% increase in overall enrollment in 4 years). Based on regional and neighboring institution data, the goal is to increase Pell Grant recipients to 25% of our total headcount by 23/24, increase Promise Grant recipients to 50% of our total headcount by 23/24, and a 7% growth in AB540 students. VP Lakhani also presented goals for increases in types of degrees and certificates awarded over the next several years. The increased headcount would impact SCFF funding and our overall budget positively. The District needs to develop concrete plans to achieve and financially support the work needed to reach these aspirational goals.

**TERB (Lawson)**

The TERB Committee created/revised and approved Improvement Plan forms for full-time faculty. **During Faculty Senate, Lawson shared the document on screen and elaborated on the edits.** The revision for Probationary Faculty included adding language to make it clearer that any Improvement Plan must explain who is responsible for providing evidence of follow-up/improvement called out by the plan. Other language was added to the form to clarify what TERB is looking for when it asks for “Actions to be taken toward improvement” and “Evidence of follow-up/progress.” Then, a table was added to the Improvement Plan template to specifically call out mentor activities defined by the Improvement Plan. Further, a new section was added to the Improvement Plan for Probationary Faculty to more clearly delineate when an Improvement Plan is marked as complete. Currently, when the next review report marks all areas of concern from the previous report as “standard” or higher, the Improvement Plan is concluded; however, there is no mechanism that documents “the plan is concluded,” and that has led to some confusion. As a result, the new component of the Probationary Faculty improvement Plan features a table that asks the TEC Chair to note with a “yes” or a “no” whether the evaluatee completed “the recommended actions and showed satisfactory improvement.” Then, the TEC Chair is asked to, in writing, explain their yes or no answer. Last, in the same table, the evaluatee is asked to share, in writing, any relevant information from their perspective. The goal of the new additions is to remove any ambiguity from the process, document as much as possible, and add/strengthen accountability. This revision was then recreated for peer (tenured) faculty under improvement plans so their process could share the same enhanced documentation.

We then created and approved a new form for evaluation processes that spins out the mentor documentation so that a mentor involved in an improvement plan can have information on what is expected of them during the process. As mentors cannot see the review report/improvement plan, it’s been difficult to communicate with the mentor exactly what issues are afoot that they are being asked to mentor an evaluatee through. The mentor form includes the following information: Evaluatee Name and Department; Mentor Collaborating with Evaluatee and Department (Must be Tenured Faculty for Probationary Faculty); Meeting Schedule and Semesters of Collaboration; Person Responsible for Connecting the Evaluatee with the Mentor; Person Responsible for Checking in with Evaluatee and Mentor during the Semester; Collaboration Goals; and Products, Responsible Parties, and Due Dates. Then, the TEC Chair, Evaluatee, Mentor, and TERB Coordinator sign the document.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** – No report.

**AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)** - The next meeting of the subcommittee is Thursday, May 13.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)**

We have been meeting to review sabbatical projects for returning faculty.

**Equivalency (Towfiq)** - No report.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** - No report.

**Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)** - No report.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:47 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary