



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
March 22, 2021

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Natalie Lopez, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Susan Miller

GUESTS: Michelle Barton, Jon Walker

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS - No public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced that Michael Mufson is holding auditions/interviews on Wednesday, March 24 at 6 PM for *It's Monumental...Ending the Silence*, an upcoming antiracism Virtual Communication Arts Festival happening in May.

Senator and PFF Co-President Teresa Laughlin announced that 406 cars came through the food distribution event held Saturday, March 20. The next event will be on April 17. Laughlin recognized the Women's basketball team and the cheer team for their assistance at the event.

AGENDA CHANGES No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Towfiq/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated March 15, 2021 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstentions: Lacey Craft, Leigh Marshall, Elizabeth Stephens, Wendy Nelson

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 MSC: Fererro/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the actions taken by the Curriculum Committee on March 17, 2021 (see Exhibit 2).

Abstentions: Lacey Craft, Elizabeth Stephens

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Chair Wendy Nelson said she shared Senate's feedback with the Curriculum Committee about curriculum posted to department websites. An option may be to add an interactive link for students to a department's website.

Math prerequisites was also discussed at great length during Curriculum.

B. Committee Appointments

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny announced that the Professional Development Coordinator job description has been updated and will come to Senate next meeting.

As directed, Committee on Committees reviewed questions asked of volunteers for regular committee assignments. The revised questions are 1) What are the knowledge, skills and abilities you will bring to this committee? And 2) How will you utilize an equity lens in your work with this committee or in what ways do you commit to learning about diversity, equity and inclusion and applying that knowledge to this committee?

Motion 3 MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the following individual to the Curriculum Committee (see Exhibit 3).

Abstentions: Lacey Craft, Elizabeth Stephens

Curriculum Committee – **Michael Mumford**, MSE 20-23

The motion carried.

Motion 4 MSC: Zavodny/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot for the new council placements (see Exhibit 4).

Abstentions: Lacey Craft, Elizabeth Stephens

College Council – **Lawrence Lawson**, Senator
College Council – **Joshua Frank Cardenas**, Faculty, Part-Time (advisory vote)
Employees, Community and Communications Council – **Jenny Fererro**, Faculty
Employees, Community and Communications Council – **Michael Dudley**, Faculty
Equity, Education and Student Success Council – **Sabrina Menchaca**, Faculty, Counseling
Equity, Education and Student Success Council – **Tina Barlolong**, Faculty, Counseling

The motion carried.

On the call itself, Zavodny stated that volunteers were reminded that they must attend the council meetings and must provide regular updates to Faculty Senate. The ballot was discussed in detail and one additional Senator was added as a candidate for the College Council position. The ballot was then emailed to all Senators to cast their votes.

Several rounds of voting took place and Senators recommended that another option for casting votes virtually be explored. Senator Faulkner suggested using BoardDocs and will get training. Senate VP Jenny Ferrero suggested using a point system to replicate rank choice voting to find the top candidate(s).

C. Resolution for PT Equity for Area D Meeting

Motion 5 MSC: Dalrymple/Zavodny Faculty Senate approval of the resolution for Part-time Equity for the Area D meeting (see Exhibit 5).

The motion carried.

Senator Anastasia Zavodny stated there has been much talk about trying to promote part-time faculty equity at Palomar and this is a systemic California Community College and larger issue. Going into this ASCCC event, we can ask members of the ASCCC Executive Council and other leadership about what they can do to promote part-time faculty equity and we can also share the work being done at Palomar. She said that a member of the ASCCC Executive Council recommended that we bring forward a resolution through Faculty Senate to call on ASCCC to reopen the work that they've previously done in examining part-time faculty and the inequity issues. The exhibit references a paper adopted by ASCCC in 2002, *Part-Time Faculty: A Principled Perspective* written after reviewing a large and lengthy survey sent out to all California community colleges. This ASCCC Executive Council member went on to say that since it's been quite some time since ASCCC performed a thorough investigation into this work, this Faculty Senate resolution could possibly be the launching point to reopen the examination. From this, additional resolutions may come from ASCCC that could lead to improvements in advocacy, changes to legislation and recommendations to local Senates.

Zavodny went on to say that Exhibit 5 represents the recommendations she and fellow work group members, Senators Will Dalrymple and Susan Miller prepared together to discuss today. Zavodny further explained that this resolution is asking ASCCC to reexamine the entire project including all the avenues originally investigated.

Senator Dalrymple recommended that Senators take the time to read the paper as it will show the depth and scope of what is being asked of ASCCC to address. This ask has meaningful long-term and short-term implications for very real people across the state. The paper is not just focused on equity solutions for part time faculty but addresses the issue as part of a system wide endeavor and suggests that we do this in such a way that is productive and forward moving. Despite its size, 68 pages, it's a very positive report and has a lot of positive actions to move us forward.

The exhibit was word-smithed and finalized.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Community Agreements for Senate (see Exhibit 6)

Senate President Rocco Versaci shared Exhibit 6, Community Agreements which showed edits he made to the preamble section of the document. Senators endorsed the additional edits. The preamble will be added to the Faculty Senate's web page.

B. Resolution for Area D Meeting (see Exhibit 7)

Senate President Versaci shared Exhibit 7 showing the ASCCC Area D Spring Plenary Resolutions and asked Senators for questions to be brought to the floor during discussion. Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson questioned the use of the term "cultural competence" since DEqCC is also discussing usage of this term. Senate VP Jenny Ferrero shared that these ASCCC Resolutions are just recommendations and not mandates so DEqCC has discretion using this term.

C. Accreditation Annual Report (see Exhibit 8)

Senior Director Michelle Barton shared Exhibit 8, ACCJC's 2021 Annual Report Review that Palomar is required to complete every year. It includes information for enrollments, student academic performance as well as a fiscal report. Within the report, we are required to show our institution set standards metric that show our performance. ACCJC requires stretch or aspirational goals for us to achieve because of the federal requirement for active monitoring institutional performance. Barton brings this report to Faculty Senate every year to review.

Director Barton first focused on the Institution Set Standards for Student Achievement table. She noted that Question 13b. shows the actual successful student course completion rate was 71% in 2018/19 and it rose significantly to 75% in 2019/20 due to the introduction of the EW grade in spring 2020. This will make it difficult to follow trends over the next few semesters. The EW grade existed before spring 2020 but rarely used. Faculty Senate followed the Chancellor's recommendation by extending the deadline to apply for this grade each semester up through this spring 2021 semester.

Barton asked if Senate wanted to update any of the standards or stretch goals on course success rates and then moved to the Certificates section of the document and asked if Senate wanted to increase those goals as well. President Versaci agreed with Senator Faulkner who stated we should hold the course during this COVID pandemic.

Versaci asked Barton if during normal times, is there any downside to have the actuals succeed the stretch goal. Barton stated that during the site visit, ACCJC will review the set standards and goals and determine if they have been set based on a consideration of data and different factors and then examine to see if we are just setting a goal so that we can always achieve it. Barton recommended that Senate maintain the goals that have been set for now but Senate may want to consider lifting the floor slightly for degrees. Enrollments are down but enrollment is down system wide. Senator Sabrina Santiago added that because of offering fewer fact-to-face classes in fall 2021, enrollment will continue to decline.

Senator and PD Coordinator Kelly Falcone asked Barton why do we set our goals low to begin with and if there is no penalty to not reaching goals, why we would we not increase them? Barton stated that when we initially set these goals, we looked at 10 years of data and even some with variables outside of our control. The goals were set conservatively at that time. Over time, the Senate has moved to increase them slowly but not aggressively. Falcone added that we should be using these numbers purposefully and when goals are not met, conversations are triggered to make changes or to figure out how to improve.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudget asked Barton if this data can be desegregated to look at identifying if our transfer rates are increasing for underserved students. Barton answered yes that the data can be desegregated any way. Senator and DEqCC Co-Chair Eduardo Aguilar said he would be interested in knowing the data for specific populations.

Barton suggested that Senate request information from the program review and planning data. This data provides all the information on course success rates that can be broken down in many ways. The Vision for Success data and equity data is also available. Barton added that she is currently tracking and monitoring many different metrics and she can provide Senate with a report for all the potential metrics that may be most important to Senate. President Versaci will pull a smaller group together to review available metric reports that may be useful to Senate and get back with Director Barton on that matter.

Under the current circumstances and conditions, Senators agreed that the set standards, the floors and the stretch goals Barton presented should remain the same.

Senators Erin Hiro, Sabrina Santiago, Ben Mudgett, Wendy Nelson and Eduardo Aguilar volunteered to meet to determine which data metrics to request from Institutional Planning & Research.

Motion 6 MSC: Mudgett/Lawson Faculty Senate approval to extend the meeting.

The motion carried.

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad)

- ASG welcomed three new members to our team last meeting! Our numbers are growing quite fast, and all our VP roles are now filled.
- VP Hussain, VP of Internal Affairs Therese Mouawad, Senator Vega, and President Mouawad presented the Survey findings to the DE committee, and plans to move forward with discussing in greater detail with TERB and other faculty committees what actionable steps to take to institute student evaluations.
- President Mouawad and Student Trustee Alazar met with Dr. Kahn and other local Mayors/GB members to discuss student concerns and housing insecurities. The conversation was particularly uplifting for ASG as many of the member's prioritizations were in line with student needs.
- ASG discussed ASG awards, commencement, and elections at our last meeting, and have started up our elections committee.
- ICC (Inner Club Council) had successfully hosted the virtual club rush. Students had the chance to view the different clubs on campus. Clubs had a chance to display and educate their club to other students.
- The Communications Committee has been working hard at creating content for Women's History Month and trying to coordinate with the discount app to make it as effective as possible and to get exactly what ASG invested in.
- A student Q&A will be held on March 26, with a follow up that will address any concerns regarding the vaccine and will be held with a medical professional.

President (Versaci)

Fari, Ben, and I met with Vice President Montoya on Friday, March 12 to discuss Brown Act issues with our Equivalency and Faculty Service Area committees. He initially expressed the belief that neither would be subject to the Brown Act but later confirmed in an email that he was mistaken. He is exploring the possibility of using closed sessions in those committees to address issues of confidentiality.

I met with Luke Lara, Faculty Senate President at Mira Costa, on Friday March 12. We discussed equity issues in general and faculty hiring in particular. He shared many ideas that have been enacted at Mira Costa, including faculty-created equity training workshops and approaches to job announcements, interview questions, and teaching demonstrations.

It was a good opportunity to connect with a campus leader at another college and share ideas/insights about our equity work.

Jenny and I met with President Kahn on Friday, March 12. One item we discussed was funding for DEqCC to cover items like books, conference registrations, guest speakers, etc. Jack requested that DEqCC send him an email with a formal request and estimate. Jenny also mentioned the possibility of the PFF conference fund for conference registrations. One solution would be to augment the Senate budget and create a line item for DEqCC. After Jack receives the request, we will know more about how it will be handled. We also discussed scheduling for Fall '21 and made the request that completely-vaccinated faculty have full access to campus to work in their offices, make copies, etc. Jack was noncommittal, but we will continue to press the issue.

Jenny and I also met with President Kahn and VPs Lakhani, Montoya, and Sivert to discuss a process for faculty-administration collaboration on making faculty appointments to grant-funded positions. That document will come to the Senate for discussion on Monday, April 5.

The diversity in faculty hiring workgroup (me, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, and Lawrence Lawson) met on Tuesday, March 16 to discuss the faculty hiring procedures, a letter to be sent to department chairs, and requests to Human Resources. We are still in process on those, but suggestions regarding the hiring procedures is going to DEqCC and PC3H for input and feedback, and a list of questions has been sent to HR. The procedures and department chair letter will come to the Senate later this semester.

I completed the DEI survey after seeking feedback on the work group's responses from both DEqCC and the Senate.

Finally, I sent out reminders about nominations for the Faculty Service Award and the Scholarly & Professional Achievement Award. Both have deadlines of April 2, which we may need to adjust as that date falls during spring break.

SSEC (Versaci)

SSEC met on Friday, March 12. We approved a funding request from Glyn Bongolan for copies of the book *From Equity Talk to Equity Walk* for a counselor's book club/workshop series. VP Sivert gave an update on the college's development of a land acknowledgement statement. This effort is being done in consultation with our American Indian Studies Department and will include other initiatives besides articulating a statement, such as scholarships. We also received updates on the Undocumented Student Support Group, DEI efforts, and the Equity Framework Workgroup.

SPC (Versaci) - SPC met on Tuesday, March 16. Our discussion included the following:

- We reviewed some policies and procedures under first reading. These are available [HERE](#).
- Robert Threatt gave an update on our CARES Act funding/spending. The proposal—which is a work in progress—is to spend the new funds in similar percentages to how previous funds have been spent; specifically, towards 1) Health and Safety, 2) Student Grants, 3) Instruction & Classroom Needs, and 4) PPE & Facilities Preparation.
- Dean Leslie Salas and Vice President Vikash Lakhani gave an overview to the "Degrees when Due" program.

IPC Report (Versaci) - IPC next meets on Wednesday, March 24.

SSPC – No report.

HRPC - No report.

FASPC (Antonecchia) FASPC met on Thursday, March 11. Some highlights:

- We lost 12% of enrollment due to Pandemic.
-

- Due to Hold Harmless Revenue- college is being funded at the 17-18 enrollment level (18,342) what we are seeing is 15,214 in 20-21.
- Growth Factor- if we grow more than what college is being funded at right now, we don't get additional funding for that growth
- Scenarios: the college would save \$400k without COLA increases
- Technology Plan report: working on rolling out a plan to inventory all technology software used on campus and a creating a plan to streamline onboarding and discontinuing access to employees no longer employed at Palomar College and improving are of emergency communication.

PFF (Laughlin) No report.

DEqCC – Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competence (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi) – No report.

Accreditation (Meehan) – No report.

Distance Education (Hiro) - The following occurred at the March 17, 2021 DE Committee meeting:

- The Committee welcomed new member Tanessa Sanchez.
- The Committee heard a presentation from the ASG on student survey results that included recommendations to improve online learning. The Committee will bring back recommendations for discussion next meeting and updated ASG on the progress.
- Webpage organization: The Committee is reorganizing and updating existing DE-oriented websites to make them easier to find and use. The DE Coordinator will bring back a final draft of the organization for a vote next time.
- Course packs update: A subgroup of the DE Committee is working with the ATRC to create and maintain a list of course packs and their accessibility ratings to help faculty when selecting course packs. The subgroup reported that ATRC will create and maintain the list with the DE Committee reviewing the list yearly. Members also recommended reaching out to regional colleges to see how they handle this task and if we can share resources.
- Zoom Security update: The DE Committee had voted to require Waitlists to protect Zoom security at its March 3 meeting. The ATRC made the change but neither the ATRC nor the DE Coordinator communicated the change. The change was quickly undone to stop Waitlist problems and the committee will ask ATRC to attend the next meeting and review options for Zoom security. The action will include a communication plan.
- Formats in Class Notes: A committee member suggested that the DE Committee recommend requiring Class formats for each class be listed in Class Notes to prevent student/faculty confusion as to when and how the class meets. With fall including new class formats, this could be even more important. The DE Coordinator will bring this up to the VPI of instruction and back to the DE Committee at its next meeting.

Guided Pathways (Nelson) – No report.

Policies and Procedures (Frank & Fererro for Lawson)

BP & AP 2510 read and approved with minimal changes. AP 3415 was sent back for review from constituents and workgroups. BP & AP 3500 was read and approved with minimal changes. BP & AP 3505 as previous. AP 6345 as previous. AP 3000 passed with minimal edits.

Budget (Ferreiro) - The Budget Committee next meets on Tuesday, March 23.

TERB (Lawson)

We continue to review, revise, and approve improvement plans. The process is slower this semester than in previous semesters as TERB is committed to taking more time to ensure the IPs are strong and actionable. We also had a visit

from ASG who presented compelling data on why students would like evaluations at the end of every course, every semester (Fall/Spring). While there are contract implications, TERB is discussing the idea of supplying student surveys at the end of every semester for all classes. A survey to the campus faculty should come out just after Spring Break asking opinions of this idea.

Professional Development (Falcone) - No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson) - The AB705 Subcommittee met on Thursday, March 11.

- We reviewed the following research:
 - o [Cal Matters article about AB705](#)
 - o RP Group's January 2021 report on [Enrollment and Success in Transfer-Level English and Math](#)
 - o Public Policy Institute of California's [Data on AB705](#)
 - o [Math Equity Toolkit and Webinar](#)
 - o [Racelighting in the Normal Realities of Black, Indigenous, and People of Color](#) Brief by Wood and Harris III
- We looked at the RP Groups' January 2021 Report - Executive Summary in detail as it gave statewide population data on enrollment and success in math and English for the five fall cohorts from fall 2015 – fall 2019.
- We briefly discussed how the throughput rate is calculated differently in the statewide report than locally. We have requested, through the AB705 Workgroup, if we can get local throughput numbers using the statewide report's definition for comparison.
 - o RP Group's definition of throughput: success as a proportion of the *entire* cohort of students taking any English or math courses.
 - o Palomar's definition: proportion of fall *first-time* students completing transfer-level math or English within one year.
- We are developing a plan on how to increase intensive support for underprepared students. In particular, we are looking at the following areas:
 - o Continue to research and develop other learning structures/opportunities to meet the needs of underprepared and disproportionately impacted students.
 - o Identify and recommend best practices that address student needs in the first year.
 - o Identify and recommend non-curricular support activities for disproportionately impacted and underprepared students.
- We will make recommendations to SEA and Faculty Senate based on the above *after* our April meeting.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)

We're gearing up to look at Sabbatical Reports for the Fall 2020 semester. We meet April 15th to discuss them and begin the approval/revision process.

Equivalency (Towfig)

The Equivalency Committee met on Tuesday, March 16 from 1:00 p.m. to 2:00. The Committee reviewed a total of four applications. As result, the Equivalency Committee approved three and denied one.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)

FSA will host an open lab drop-in session on 4/20/21 from 1:00 – 2:00pm for faculty to complete their discipline FSA during open lab time. Also, the FSA Committee is discussing the expectations of being a Brown Act committee.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) - No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 4:06 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary