



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
March 15, 2021

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Natalie Lopez, Beatrice Manneh, Leigh Marshall, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: No absences to report.

GUESTS: Rachel Alazar, Laurel Anderson, Tanessa Sanchez, Jon Walker

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS No public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner announced that *A Wrinkle in Time* is showing this weekend in Performing Arts. Tickets can be purchased here: www.palomarperforms.com

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson congratulated the following faculty who were conferred tenure or permanent status during the last governing board meeting.

Leticia Aguirre, Counseling
Matthew Doherty, Biology
Jason Jarvinen, Cooperative Education
Monique Lineback, Nursing Education
David Miller, Public Safety Programs
Tamara Holthaus, Early Childhood Education Lab School

Shannon Andrews, Chemistry
Michael Dudley, Behavioral Sciences
Cory Lindsay, Biology
Vickie Mellos, ESL
Marlo Willows, Behavioral Sciences
Rene Robelin, Early Childhood Education Lab School

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett announced that there is a spot bill being discussed in Sacramento; AB 928 Student Achievement Reform Act of 2021. This act would establish an intersegmental implementation committee to hold campuses accountable and enable a statewide focus on simplifying transfer. It will also consolidate the two existing general education pathways into one that meets admission requirements at both the CSU and UC. Lastly, the bill will automate the placement of all community college students onto an ADT pathway intended for their major. In doing so,

a student will be placed directly onto the pathway that will maximize their probability of entering and completing a four-year university degree in their chosen field of study in a timely manner, while minimizing the accrual of excess units.

ASG President Kateri Mouawad announced that NCHEA is sponsoring an event called *CAREERS DURING COVID, The Digital Turn*. The event is Thursday, March 18 from 4 to 7 PM. More information can be found here: <https://www.ncheasd.com/>

Mouawad also shared a message she recently received from a second-year student at Palomar. The message read:

“So, I ask how I can succeed if my professor doesn't care and set the class up for failure from day one. I would never ask for an easier road to travel and traveling alone is running its course. I have to ask myself, why bother going back to school. I feel depressed, disappointed and pushed to my limit with online school and not receiving the support I need to return. However, for those professors that have gone above and beyond for us, thanks are not enough. For those that are just getting by, get to know me and what it's like a day in my shoes before you treat me with such disregard. Ask yourself, if you took this class during the pandemic like this, would you have been successful.”

Mouawad went on to say that as a member of the ASG, she is working hard to represent students like this. It's very discouraging to see these messages come through. ASG is working on making this online learning process easier for students and the same can be said for all faculty who are working hard as well. When students come to you with real, genuine concerns, Mouawad asked for sincere consideration of these issues.

AGENDA CHANGES No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 MSC: Ferrero/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of meeting minutes dated March 8, 2021 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstentions: Kateri Mouawad, Ben Mudgett

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum – No action needed.

B. Committee Appointments – No action needed.

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny reminded Senators that the deadline to volunteer to serve on the new councils is Friday, March 19. The designated Senator seat on the College Council still needs a volunteer.

C. Community Agreements for Senate

Motion 2 MSC: Laughlin/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval to adopt the Community Agreements (see Exhibit 2).

Abstention: Anastasia Zavodny

Nay: Sabrina Santiago

The motion carried.

Senate President Rocco Versaci wants this text placed on meeting agendas at some point, added to the website and included in open call communications for Senators. He sees it as a living document that would be revisited when there is an influx of new Senators. This behavior applies to everyone in the meeting. It should be the responsibility of all Senators to assist with maintaining these behaviors whenever Senate gathers.

Several Senators made suggested edits to the document. Versaci conducted a straw vote asking Senators if they wanted to vote on the approval of this document today or to postpone the vote until after he has had the opportunity to make all the necessary edits. A majority of Senators indicated that the vote should be done today and that Versaci will bring back the final edited version as an Information Item next week.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. DEI Survey (see Exhibit 3)

Senate President Versaci shared the exhibit asking Senators for feedback on omissions or information that is inaccurate.

Senator and Curriculum Chair Wendy Nelson commented on survey Question #14 regarding the PRP process. Last year, the PRP work group desegregated the data for faculty from the course level so that faculty can actually look at core success rates based on student groups. Nelson suggested regarding efforts made to create a culture of diversity through the curriculum.

Senator and Professional Development Coordinator Kelly Falcone asked for clarification on Question #12 and stated that she is able to provide additional information if needed. Falcone and Versaci will discuss edits offline. Regarding communication comments made between PD and Senate, Versaci stated that there would be conversations in DEqCC and Senate about what would be good trainings to add that are related to DEI.

ASG President Mouawad requested clarification on Question #6 regarding general student involvement in the College's DEI work. Mouawad said there is room for growth in this area but student feedback showed that some students don't feel they are being heard. Versaci said that faculty and administration both have the responsibility to bring more students into the conversation.

Versaci will hold on to the survey for a few more days should anyone want to provide additional feedback. This survey was sent to every community college in the state. There will be a group who will sift through the responses to create a report of the DEI work being done statewide. Versaci will make sure all Senators get the report once its complete.

Senate Vice President Jenny Ferrero shared that, as part of the group responding to this survey, she thinks that it was a good exercise because it provided an opportunity for important reflection. She encouraged Senate to keep some of

these questions in mind and to revisit this as we move forward throughout the year and next year to make sure we're staying on track with our goals.

B. Emeritus Status for Dr. A. Carey Carpenter (see Exhibit 4)

Motion 3 MSC: Fererro/Laughlin Faculty Senate approval to suspend the rules and move back into Action.

Abstentions: Kateri Mouawad (Advisory Vote), Anastasia Zavodny

The motion carried.

Motion 4 MSC: Towfiq/Laughlin Faculty Senate approval to confer Emeritus status to Dr. A. Carey Carpenter.

Abstentions: Kateri Mouawad (Advisory Vote), Anastasia Zavodny

The motion carried.

C. Curriculum Information for Department Websites

Senate VP Fererro spoke on behalf of Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner who needed to leave the meeting. VP Fererro stated that this came about from a recent discussion Senate had about whether departments should have curriculum information on their website because there are concerns about it being out of date. A suggestion was floated that the mapper should be used as the primary tool for students to get information about the different programs. There are some issues with the accuracy of the mapper. There are questions about whose responsibility it is to keep the mapper up to date. Performing Arts and Child Development's curriculum on their respective websites is correct. The mapper and the course catalog are not doing an effective job of keeping up with all the course cuts and rearrangements. To the questions that Senator Faulkner wanted to raise, who's responsible for updating the map, or with curriculum changes from the current year? And what is the timeframe for this to happen? The mapper that we're currently using is only for the current year, but is there going to be an archive of mappers for previous years since we have students working on programs from previous years? We would hate to see that departments are discouraged from keeping curriculum information on their website because in many cases, that's going to be the most accurate place to get the information. Fererro said that Child Development encourages students to visit with their department first before going to a counselor to create their roadmap.

Senator Wendy Nelson responded by saying that the mapper was just launched in June 2020. Figuring out how to institutionalize it is next. A work group is being put together from Curriculum for a year or so to talk about some of the issues in the mapper. After all, the curriculum is completed in META, those changes that were made effective in the fall of 2021 will be made between May and July. The maps will then be updated. Palomar just went to an electronic catalog so everything is going to be come right out of Meta and go into this electronic catalog. Everything in META will be accurate and current in the catalog.

Senator Nelson went on to say that tech review was done two years ago and it unearthed a lot of problems with the process and what happens to curriculum after the curriculum committee approves it. Nelson thinks that tech review is almost complete. The mapper is an out-facing or marketing tool for a potential new student to see a path. The specific curriculum is in the catalog. Nelson also shared that the mapper software can not represent summer nor can it indicate

that the class is only offered semester specific (just fall or just spring). Nelson said that we want our students to visit with their counselor to create their own roadmap.

Laurel Anderson shared that it looks like it might be helpful to include the mapper on the department's website, but it doesn't always match up to courses being currently offered. If you started in the fall, that would align with the mapper, but if you started in the spring, or if you started in the summer that's going to be dramatically different. If we were going to use the mapper, it must be accurate and up to date and departments should have some control over it as well. In its current state, the mapper is not a good tool for students.

Senator Falcone shared that when the mapper was first launched, one of the most difficult things was poor data integrity. The students should be getting the same information, whether they're looking at the catalog, the mapper or department websites. When we put data in multiple different locations, multiple different locations have to be updated which is more opportunity for errors. Falcone said that hopefully, we can put more emphasis on keeping META updated and making sure the information we're sending to the State is accurate and then linking all of our systems together.

Senator Wendy Nelson added that the most important thing is that we all need to trust META. There has been so many issues caused by a variety of things and we're going to get all of those fixed. If we all had confidence in META, maybe the catalog would be a good place to link to.

Senator Mudgett stated this discussion triggered the idea that when Palomar receives grants or short-term funding for an initiative or a project, how are we going to institutionalize it? After the money is gone, the work often continues. What's that plan?

President Versaci responded to Senator Mudgett's comment by saying that he and VP Fererro have been involved in discussions with administration about how we handle these grant funded faculty appointments. We're going to bring something to the April 5 meeting agenda. Part of that, in terms of what we were talking with the district about is some way to finally centralize the whole grant writing process. And part of that would of course be to address exactly what Senator Mudgett is talking about. Versaci took away from that meeting that administration is very interested in having that conversation and figuring something out.

Senator Wendy Nelson added that she has been talking to VP Sivert for the last six months letting her know that we need more release time. Karan Husky has done a lot of the work because she's on the STEM grant for all the STEM maps. We used some Guided Pathways money to pay her and some other counselors. It seems like there's a lot of these situations where we are asking ourselves who's supposed to do that job now and how are we going to pay for it?

Senator Wendy Nelson will bring these comments to Curriculum on Wednesday March 17.

REPORTS

ASG (Mouawad)

- VP Hussain, VP of Internal Affairs Therese Mouawad, Senator Galaviz, Senator Vega, and President Mouawad met with TERB to present the student findings and our potential solution to integrate Canvas administered surveys. The same presentation is intended to be given at the DE committee.
- ASG continues our first and second reading of our bylaws and constitution as we continue to move closer to officializing compensation, and organizing our documents.
- ASG continues to move forward with meditation room designs, planning next year's budget, and supporting clubs/events, as well as participating in multiple councils/committees.

President (Versaci)

The DEI Survey work group (me, Jenny Ferrero, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Lisette Lasater, Tina-Marie Parker, and Cynthia Cordova) met on Thursday, March 4. We had all submitted notes on the survey's nineteen questions, and we used the time to compile them somewhat and discuss other people that we needed to bring into the conversation. Since that meeting, I combined, condensed, and expanded on those notes; reached out to the individuals we had identified; and completed a version of the survey that will be reviewed in DEqCC at their 3/12 meeting and in Senate on 3/15. The survey responses are due from Senate Presidents to ASCCC by 3/22.

The Diversity in Faculty Hiring work group (me, Lawrence Lawson, and Hossna Sadat Ahadi) will meet on 3/16 to share our progress on each of the three documents that we took responsibility for: a letter of "best practices" to departments (me), suggested revisions to the existing faculty hiring procedures (Hossna), and a list of issues/asks to bring to HR (Lawrence). Once we finalize these documents, we will bring them to DEqCC and the Senate for further revisions.

I sent out the "Summary of Findings" and the "Department By-laws Template" on Tuesday, 3/8. The former went to all faculty and counselors, vice presidents, deans, and Interim President Kahn; the latter went out to all department chairs.

I also sent out calls for nominations for the Faculty Service Award and the Scholarly & Professional Achievement Award. Both have deadlines of April 2.

SSEC (Versaci) - SSEC next meets on Friday, March 12.

SPC (Versaci) - SPC next meets on Tuesday, March 16.

IPC Report (Versaci)

IPC met on Wednesday, March 10. We reviewed the resource requests from the PRPs that the Deans prioritized (based on a rubric); the Council approved advancing these requests to the next level. We also had an update on the New Program Subcommittee.

SSPC – No report.

HRPC – No report.

FASPC (Antonecchia) – No report.

PFF (Laughlin)

I have been actively involved in the shared governance and union meetings including:

- Governing Board Meetings:
 - At the 3/2/21 meeting I read out our Diversity and Inclusion statement.
- Campus shared governance meetings:
 - Budget meeting: VP Borth is kind of on her own now that Carmen Coniglio and others have left the Fiscal team. She is reaching out to Barbara, Anel, and me for help understanding past history.
 - Faculty Senate
 - SPC
 - Benefits
 - TERB
- Negotiations are starting up again. We are setting up an Academic Calendar work group to figure out summer 2022-2023.

- Interaction with members: I have had with several meetings with members regarding various concerns about hiring practices, working conditions, and contract interpretation.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.
- Meetings with Board members: We have regularly scheduled meetings with Governing Board members monthly.
- Food Distribution is March 20,2021.

The District is planning for limited face-to-face instruction in the fall. The planning is pretty opaque. The District refuses to give faculty any leeway when it comes to minimum number of students in each class, in spite of the fact that classes are three hours apart and that faculty would have to prep the class in an entirely different way. If you have concerns about these or any other issues, please email me at tlainelaughlin@gmail.com.

DEqCC – Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competence (Aguilar/Sadat Ahadi)

DEqCC meeting is on Friday, March 12. We will be discussing funding sources for DEqCC, student and employee complaints about racism on campus, reviewing AP 3000, reviewing the DEI ASCCC survey, revising DEqCC's mission, reviewing the faculty hiring process, planning DEI conference for Spring 2022, and Fall 2021 workshops.

Accreditation (Meehan) - No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

Faculty are invited to attend the next virtual Distance Education Committee meeting on March 17 from 2:30 - 4 p.m.

Zoom Meeting:

<https://palomar-edu.zoom.us/j/98100391117?pwd=R3FJQ3FJOHFvWTcwdUJ2SHpmKy81dz09>

Meeting ID: 981 0039 1117

Passcode: 017020

You can find meeting minutes and agenda on our website, <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/academic-technology-committee/>.

Guided Pathways (Nelson)

Here are the Guided Pathways Priorities for Spring/Summer 2021

- Onboarding: Maps & Orientation
 - Implement changes to the website as a result of the Civilian redesign.
 - Link meta-majors to careers and provide students with career-related information.
 - Determine need for additional videos for the degree and certificate pages.
 - Create a dual enrollment structure with advising group and lead job announcements.
 - Develop differentiated orientation videos.
- Majors
 - Create a process for students to use the meta major structure to select a path.
 - Begin conversation about academic and career pathways as official majors.
- Student Success
 - Ticketing system for EOPS, DRC, etc. - this is currently being initiated by AB-705 workgroup and subcommittee to transition from paper/pencil format of student academic status to online submission through STARFISH.
 - Develop a formal Student Ambassador Program to include student voices in guided pathways work.
 - Early Alert – workflow on back end to determine the process, language, marketing, and content before fully implementing to faculty.
 - Initiate student success teams using STEM, Athletics and Veterans Services as models.

- Establish team, goals, timeline, activities for Degrees when Due initiative.
- Develop Teaching Excellence Online Training / Teacher Institute
- Research
 - Examine student data.
 - Collect student input via focus groups to meet outcomes of the Student Engagement Innovation Grant.

Policies and Procedures (Lawson) – No report.

Budget (Ferreiro)

The Budget Committee met on 3/9 to hear budget assumptions in various scenarios through FY 2024/25. There was discussion about the FCMAT recommendation to not assign COLA to Palomar, and whether using that is a realistic assumption. Further discussion included the FCMAT suggestions for the efficiency standard, and volunteers were solicited for two subcommittee/workgroups: Budget Development and Budget Nuts & Bolts. The Committee was also informed that two key fiscal positions (Accounting Manager and Director of Fiscal Services) are now recently vacant and will not be filled before the budget closes.

TERB (Lawson) - No report.

Professional Development (Falcone) - No report.

AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)

The AB705 Subcommittee met on Thursday, March 11, after the deadline for this week's reports, so there will be an update on 3/22.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) – No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) – No report.

Credit for Prior Learning (Rose) – No report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary