



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
December 14, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Candace Rose

**GUESTS:** Barbara Baer, Kendyl Magnuson, Leigh Marshall, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Senator Ellen Weller encouraged students and Senators to attend the Chorale and Chamber Singers concert Wednesday evening debuting a piece conceived by her and Dr. Madelyn Byrne. On Thursday, the annual Honors Recital takes place. Friday and Saturday night features the Jazz Ensemble with two unique programs. The Pacific Coast Concert Band performs on Saturday night as well. More information can be found at:

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/palomarperforms/>

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro announced that just 50 faculty have yet to complete their DE certification for spring 2021. If anyone is aware of part-time faculty coming to teach in spring and who may be bogged down in the hiring process, let Hiro know so she can reach out to them to get certified in January.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Senate President Rocco Versaci reminded Senators of the Faculty Senate Special Meeting on Friday, December 18 at 1 PM. Faculty Senate Council will not be meeting this Wednesday, December 16.

President Versaci thanked Faculty Senate Past President Craig Thompson, now retiring, for his outstanding and dedicated teaching at Palomar. Thompson has been a staunch advocate for faculty rights. Versaci closed by stating that Thompson will be missed.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated December 7, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

## **ACTION**

### **A. Curriculum**

Senator and Curriculum Chair Wendy Nelson thanked all faculty for completing their DE addendums. All courses that are being offered in spring have completed the process. Since July, almost 800 courses went through the process.

The GE Subcommittee has been working on AP/BP4025 for some time and its being brought to Curriculum on Wednesday. Nelson wants Faculty Senate to review in February to make possible edits before it goes to second reading in Policies & Procedures in March.

### **B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 2** MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to postpone confirmation of the volunteers to serve on the Presidential Search Committee until Friday, December 18 and to extend the deadline for applying to Thursday, December 17.

The motion carried.

### **C. SLOAC Co-Coordinator**

**Motion 3** MSC: Farrell/W. Nelson

Faculty Senate approval to confirm SLOAC Co-Coordinator appointment (see Exhibit 2).

#### **Aundrea Tavakkoly**

The motion carried.

Senator and current SLOAC Co-Coordinator Katy Farrell stated that Tavakkoly reached out to her to learn about the SLOs when she first started at Palomar. Based on her experience at LBC, Tavakkoly understood SLOs right away.

### **D. Part-time Instructor Equity**

**Motion 4** MSC: Dalrymple/Zavodny

Faculty Senate approval to adopt the paper titled *Summary of Findings Equity and Inclusion for Part-Time Faculty within Departments and the College* (see Exhibit 3).

Abstention: Kateri Mouawad (Advisory)

The motion carried.

Senator Will Dalrymple reported that the work group met on December 8. Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny and Barbara Baer presented the paper to PFF last week. It was met with a warm and welcoming response. PFF has created a work group of their own to work on these issues with an opportunity for us to collaborate.

Past President Craig Thompson asked Dalrymple to elaborate on Page 6 *Summary of Findings* regarding part-time voting within the department. It's also included in the bylaws document. Dalrymple answered by saying that this would be decided by the individual departments but since this is a systemic issue here on campus, this issue needs to be dealt with in order to provide some equity part-timers are seeking. These are policies that affect a large part of the faculty Dalrymple stated. In regards to concerns that part time might sway the vote, Dalrymple's experience at other colleges is

that some part time faculty do attend the department meetings but are usually outnumbered by full time faculty but said that part-time faculty should still have an opportunity to present their perspective.

President Versaci added that he has a similar concern as Thompson. But in his reading of the document, he sees that the Senate adopts this paper and then that just disseminates the data about the situation and possible solutions to the departments. This is a recommendation by the Senate that departments digest and consider some of these specific things. Versaci will work with the work group to provide a communication that makes it very clear to departments.

Dalrymple went on to add that he thinks there is a balance to be found and supports department autonomy. And, he believes that part-time faculty who come to department meetings will be bringing goodwill and seeking the best for the department.

Senator Kelly Falcone agreed with Versaci and added that the work group created a document with only recommendations. She does hope that when faculty and departments read the paper and the bylaws template, they stop and do some self-reflection and think about who the department is. The majority of classes are taught by part-time faculty so Palomar students are more likely to take a class from part-time faculty. Falcone hopes that those part-time faculty feel connected to their department and they feel like they get communication from their department because the more informed they are, the better chance the students have for success. Falcone hopes that as a Senate, we support this and we look at opportunities to shift our culture a little bit more that will make our part-time faculty feel more supported.

Senator Ellen Weller thanked the work group for their work and added that inviting part-time faculty to department meetings gives the departments a mechanism to access a huge amount of intellectual capital that has been underutilized.

**Motion 5** MSC: Dalrymple/Weller

Faculty Senate approval to adopt the Department Bylaws template document (see Exhibit 4).

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro voiced her concern that some of the content is under the purview of PFF and should be supported by PFF. In addition, Fererro is concerned that one area in the template contradicts the contract as well. Under the section *Process for Teaching Assignments* it states *“The department will attempt to provide course assignments for part-time faculty in block schedules to reduce transportation impacts and provide,”* or *“To ensure Part-Time Faculty have consistent course loads, Part-Time faculty will be assigned course loads before Full-Time Faculty are assigned overload.”* Fererro stated that this is opposite of what the contract says. The contract says that it has to go full time contract load, full time overload, retiree one course, than part-time. Also, when the document references *“teaching assignments based on mode, time/day, and location, should be equitably distributed among Full-Time and Part-Time Faculty.”* Fererro thinks that a best practices statement should be used here instead.

Senator Falcone recommends that the bylaw template vote be postponed until Senate can get additional best practices information and to allow for more time to collaborate with PFF.

No vote (see Motion 6)

**Motion 6** MSC: Falcone/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to postpone adoption of the Department Bylaws template document.

The motion carried.

## **E. TERB ideas regarding Peer Review & Student Evaluations (see Exhibit 5)**

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson stated that this item is an ongoing discussion item and no immediate action is expected. Lawson's intent is to get this information to as many faculty as possible. This should help students get used to doing the feedback process especially since they're switching to all online and that should help drive up response rates. Currently, students don't provide feedback unless their instructor is up for evaluation. This will also help professors get constant feedback to reflect on at the end of the semester.

Senator Weller asked if this can be done for summer classes as well especially since the courses in her department are often different during summer and that feedback back would be really valuable on those classes as well. Lawson stated that the contract only includes evaluations in fall and spring.

Senator Susan Miller shared she is in favor of this and thinks it will improve teaching excellence. An added benefit is if faculty would use rubrics and import their SLO assessments into their grading rubrics, we would be consistently and very effortlessly collecting data for accreditation purposes.

Past President Thompson shared his concerns regarding the makeup of the peer review committee. Thompson's concern is a likelihood of a second evaluation by the outside person which gives the department less control over the peer evaluation process than it has for probationary evaluations. An outside person selected by either the TERB Coordinator or the VPI can be helpful but it can also be adversarial. Lawson responded that these concerns are valid but to keep in mind that the department is the main writer of the report so there is some control there as well. Thompson also mentioned the heavy workload issue for an outside person.

Senator Lacey Craft requested that a standardized timeline be established for the student responses maybe in the second to last week of the semester. Also, evaluations for the eight week/short term classes should be included to keep it equitable.

ASG Representative Kateri Mouawad commented that she is in favor of giving the students a bigger voice in terms of rating classes and providing feedback. Currently reporting and resolving issues with instructors in the classroom setting is lengthy and often doesn't get resolved.

Senator Wendy Nelson stated she considers student evaluations a tool for faculty to improve their courses. Nelson also praised the option of having a random selection for that outside member who can be objective and who may bring a new perspective. Nelson added that the entire evaluation process is very collegial and encourages all faculty to be excellent.

Senator Lawson closed the discussion by mentioning that this information will be sent to all faculty for feedback.

## **F. Cameras On Policy**

**Motion 7** MSC: Hiro/Thompson

Faculty Senate approval of the Palomar College Camera Requirements Policy (see Exhibit 6).

Senator and DE Coordinator shared the revised policy which also includes revisions by VPI Sivert. Changes in the document are highlighted in green.

Senator Weller again addressed her concern that in some curriculum, cameras are necessary.

Senator Jackie Martin shared that there may be an equity issue for students if just one section of a course is offered which does require cameras on.

Kateri Mouawad stated that the number one complaint found in the student survey was that instructors required cameras on. Of the students who participated in the survey, 35% indicated that their instructors required cameras on during instruction and asked that this cameras on information be included in the class notes.

Additional clarification was requested by Senators and it was decided to postpone the vote and bring this back to Senate on February 1.

No vote (see Motion 8)

**Motion 8** MSC: Weller/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to postpone voting on Motion 7 until February 1, 2021.

Abstention: Kelly Falcone

The motion carried.

### **G. Withdrawal Guidelines for Noncredit Courses**

**Motion 9** MSC: Thompson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to direct Enrollment to create a new and separate withdrawal deadline for noncredit classes at the 60% point in the course term (see Exhibit 7).

The motion carried.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. EW & P/NP Deadlines for spring '21**

**Motion 10** MSC: Thompson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to move back in to Action.

The motion carried.

**Motion 11** MSC: Faulkner/Thompson

Faculty Senate approval of the EW & P/NP Deadline Proposals for spring 2021 (see Exhibit 8).

The motion carried.

Director Kendyl Magnuson stated that this Senate guidance follows the same guidance recommended for fall 2020. It allows the students to elect an EW, or P/NP through the extent of the class they are in. Students can petition like normal after that. Unfortunately, an EW or NP does affect the completion rates for the class but the negative COVID 19 issue warrants the deadline change.

Senator Weller warned against the possibility that these EW and NP grades may determine if the class is offered again in fall 2021 by the Scheduling Committee and that no written policy for this has been created. Magnuson stated that an EW is still considered an enrollment. Senator Wendy Nelson who is on the Scheduling Committee promised she would bring this issue to the committee.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett stated that the four-year partners are no longer allowing the universal blanket exception for pass. It's really important that students, in consultation with a counselor, make sure that their destination is going to accept the past grade in their major. At this point, some campuses are accepting it while other campuses are not. Mudgett also noted that students really need to make sure that they do their homework and consult with a counselor to make good decisions. Magnuson stated that this information will be included in the communication going out to students.

**Motion 12 MSC:** Fererro/Thompson Faculty Senate approval to extend the meeting.

The motion carried.

**B. Regina Stanback-Stroud Diversity Award** (see Exhibit 9) – Tabled until Friday, December 18 meeting.

**C. Student Survey Findings** – Tabled until Friday, December 18 meeting.

## **REPORTS**

### **President (Versaci)**

This past week I attended meetings of the Budget Committee, IPC, and SSEC (see reports below). I also attended a meeting to finalize the college's application for the Association of California Community College Administrators (ACCCA) Award for Progress in Diversity. We approved our question responses and supporting materials, and we will submit everything before the December 15 deadline.

Also, this Senate meeting (12/14/20) marks the last regular meeting attended by Dr. Craig Thompson, Senate Past President, who is retiring after 20 years of full-time service with the District. During that time, he has been an excellent and dedicated teacher, embodying a commitment to students and the profession to which we should all aspire. During his time on the Senate, he has been a tireless advocate for Senate purview and the rights of faculty, and he has been an invaluable resource and advisor for me as I stepped into this role. On a more personal note, he has been a good friend and colleague for the past two decades, and I will miss very much. Best of luck to Craig as he moves into this next chapter of his life!

### **SSEC (Versaci)**

The SSEC met on Friday, December 11. Highlights from the agenda included the following:

- Cindy Anfinson presented an Equity Framework Update
- Maria de la Torre presented the Guided Pathways SOAA Plan, Year 4 Update
- Olga Diaz presented updates on the SEA Annual Report and the 11/21 Student Supply Distribution
- Dr. Hossna Sadat Ahadi made a funding request for an antiracist book club, along the lines of the Black Minds Matter book club that she had previously organized
- Discussion about how this Council would change moving into the new governance structure (where it will be combined with SPPC and IPC). This discussion included brainstorming what operational subcommittees will be needed in the new organizational structure.

**SPC (Versaci)** No report. SPC next meets on Tuesday, December 15.

### **IPC Report (Versaci)**

- IPC met on Wednesday, December 9. Some highlights:
- Erin Hiro discussed the CVC-OEI Consortium and becoming a “Teaching” college.
- The impending Zoom migration was discussed, and emails have gone out to faculty on campus altering them of this change.
- The PRP review rubric was examined (the document used by groups to review the PRPs).
- The Council spent some time discussing the transition to the new governance structure, focusing specifically on which operational subcommittees would be needed to carry out the IPC-related work under its new, combined council (joining SSPC and SSEC). Another topic that came up was the need to have a centralized “location” for the overall committee structure and composition with a clarified understanding of where this document would be housed and who would be responsible for making sure it stays updated.

### **SSPC (O’Brien)**

- 1st Reading: Change name of Pride Center Name to “Pride Center to Combat Hate.”
- Palomar College Committee to Combat Hate (PC3H) in the process of changing to “Pride Center to Combat Hate.”
- SOAA Plan Year: Dr. Glyn Bongolan reviewed simplified (easier to read) version of the SOAA plan presented to the Faculty Senate. Guided Pathways Leads and members are meeting on 12/18.
- Dr. Patrick Savaiano – Reviewing committee structure for Behavioral Health and Campus Committee Reviewing Committee structure. EOC is looking at emergency procedures and protocols for students and faculty who may experience medical or other emergencies during synchronous and asynchronous classes—creating a website for emergency resources. Discussion about requiring students to update their contact information before each semester to maintain up-to-date information.
- Registration Committee- For the first time, Summer/Fall registration starts on the same day: May 3<sup>rd</sup> (Priority) Open Registration May 10 or 11.
- Scholarship Committee – Looking for ways to increase participation
- Dean Salas is working with Student Services team on Student Services Strategic Plan.
- VPSS Lakhani – working on transitioning to a new Governance Structure with SSPC/IPC/SSEC combining next semester.
- Student Success Call Campaign- Email was sent to 10,600 students enrolled in fall but have not registered in spring 2021. Administrators and directors, and staff are calling 3,500 students who enrolled in at least six units in fall 2020 who have not registered in spring yet.
- Student Affairs Director/Sherry Titus – Palomar will have Virtual Commencement

**HRPC** No report.

**FASPC (Antonecchia)** No report.

### **PFF (Laughlin)**

Zooming into meetings sounds so much more exciting than it is IRL. I have been actively involved in the shared governance and union meetings including:

- CFT Community College Council meeting on 12/5. There was much discussion about the budget. The Legislative Analyst Office (LAO) came out with a positive report for California and particularly for community colleges. There is a one time “windfall” of \$26 billion in the California budget. For schools and colleges that means the Prop 98 guarantee is \$13.1 billion more than budgeted for this year and \$585 million more than forecasted for next year.
- Governing Board Meeting: The next Governing Board Meeting is on 12/15/2020. At this meeting the Board will be swearing in three new Board members: Roberto Rodriguez, Brian Olsen, and Christian Garcia.

- Campus shared governance meetings:
  - Budget meetings: VP Ligioso presented a budget update and was cautiously optimistic about the budget, but still concerned. We were presented a CARES act summary of expenses. There still are CARE Act funds for COVID related expenses. The District is being conservative about approving the expenses, but does not want to leave any money on the table.
  - The weekly update on the COVID 19 situation
  - Faculty Senate
  - Benefits: most discussion was on retirement plan explanations.
- Negotiations. We still continue to negotiate the academic calendar. We have presented the District with five acceptable options for the calendar. They still refuse to consider our options.
- Interaction with members: I have had with several meetings with members regarding various concerns about hiring practices, working conditions, and contract interpretation.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.
- Meetings with Administration: In order to keep the lines of communication open, I have met with various administrators on various topics.
- Toy Drive: Faculty and Staff together collected 291 toys for children of Union families who have been hit especially hard by this year's economic situation and the PFF donated \$5 per toy donated to the cause.

**DEqCC – Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competence (Aguilar)**

The newly-formed DEqCC plans to have an introductory meeting some time during the week of December 14.

**Distance Education (Hiro)** No report.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** No report.

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)**

A workgroup was created to address concerns with BP/AP 3430 Prohibition of Harassment raised by the Faculty Senate President. Items on EEO, Discrimination and Harassment Complaints and Investigations, Construction, and Institutional Code of Ethics were up for second read. For first read, there are items on Student Trustee, Intellectual Property, Contracts, and Civility are up for 1<sup>st</sup> read. Senator Lawson will distribute those policies electronically in order for the Senate to review and submit concerns they'd like him to bring to P&P at the first meeting in February 2021. Finally, AP 7120 is still being worked on by HR; it has been tabled/in committee for a while.

**Budget (Ferrerro)**

The Budget Committee met on 12/8. The committee was presented with a budget update, where we were reminded that the District's fiscal outlook is much improved from a year ago, although the legislature will be facing major budgetary decisions in the upcoming year, with the Governor's expected budget to be released in January. It is too soon to predict how much money Palomar might see from the state. For 2020/21, the District's revenues are on track as budgeted, expenditures show expected savings, and the District is expecting a surplus in the budget. The hold harmless was extended to 2023-24. The District's cash flow is also looking much better than expected by a "good margin", with no expected borrowing needed. The committee received an update on CARES funding. There is \$66K in the federal block grant that needs to be spent by the end of December, although that money may be accounted for by planned expenditures. The committee was also presented with a review of the financial audit process.

**TERB (Lawson)**

The group revised student evaluation options for Peer Evals to make the process clearer; that process revision is headed to PFF for a vote. TERB discussed the notion of the Chair Letter for Probationary Evals in areas with no Department Chair. Currently, probationary faculty in those areas simply do not have a Chair Letter written for their



evaluation process. TERB reviewed and approved the notion that, in lieu of the Chair letter when an area has no Department Chair, another faculty member in a leadership position in that area can write the letter with (or without) input from the 1<sup>st</sup> level administrator (whichever is appropriate for the situation). TERB discussed changing when student evals are deployed in a semester. Current practice is the mid-point, but TERB discussed launching evals later in the semester to better capture feedback over the length of the course. TERB also discussed shortening the evaluation period from four weeks to two weeks for online student evaluations and discussed ways in which to drive up response rates through making evaluation completion requests more intrusive and visible. Last, TERB discussed the difference in policy of how out-of-cycle evals may be requested for tenured faculty and for tenured faculty who are serving as chairs with an eye toward making the two request processes as similar as possible.

### **Professional Development (Falcone)**

December 1<sup>st</sup> was the due date for Fall Part-Time PD pay, here's the data:

- We had 631 Part-Time Faculty eligible to be compensated for Professional Development based on their workload and 77% (484) completed and were paid for PD hours based on eligibility. This is an increase in participation from past semester. Until fall 2019, we averaged around a 65% participation rate, which increased in spring 2020 to about 70% and fall 2020 increased to about 77%.
- We also had an additional 56 Part-Time Faculty members paid to complete POET who were not eligible for PD based on workload. These faculty members benefited from the PFF MOU to compensate Part-Time faculty members for POET even if they are not currently teaching. With these faculty members completing POET we had a total of 540 Part-Time Faculty paid for PD this semester.
- Fall 2020 had the lowest number of eligible Part-Time faculty since 2014, meaning less Part-Time faculty had a workload (there has been a downward trend since 2014). There seems to be a correlation with the lower number of eligible part-time faculty and an increase in their workload, this may be an outcome of the Part-Time prioritization number.

Overall PD data for the college:

- From August 1<sup>st</sup> to December 8<sup>th</sup>, our employees have completed the following number of PD hours:
  - o Full-Time Faculty Completed Hours= 5,386
  - o Part-Time Faculty Completed Hours= 6,956
  - o Classified Completed Hours= 1,007
  - o Admin and GB Completed Hours= 647
  - o Short-Term, Student, certificated Completed Hours= 236

Training in development

- Department Chair Training
- Trustee Training
- Review of DEI focused training

Idea phase

- The PD Committee discussed the idea of including a DEI focused training requirement within our PD hours requirement. The idea of a DEI focused PD requirement was also presented/discussed/suggested at the PTK Antiracism event. Further discussions will continue with faculty leadership on this possibility.

Spring Plenary is January 28<sup>th</sup>. You can submit workshop/meeting requests until December 19<sup>th</sup> at <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/pd/plenary/>. The Plenary agenda will be posted in January when we return from Holiday break.

**AB705 Subcommittee (Anfinson)** No report.

A complete report will be forthcoming to the Senate at one of its meeting in the early spring.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)**

We're continuing to review sabbatical leave applications. Faculty members are planning to do some really great projects that will greatly benefit students and the District.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** No report.

**ASG (Mouawad)**

- ASG officially closed out for the Fall semester and will resume meetings come January 04, 2021
- ASG has withheld our support of the Part-time equity findings until further cost analysis of budget impacted solutions are provided
- ASG is dealing with the alleged case that the student discount app is a scam, and will provide further information once an investigation has been launched
- We would like to give a huge thank you to all faculty and staff who made such a great virtual experience possible for students this semester

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Margaret Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary