



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
December 7, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:**

**GUESTS:** Barbara Baer, José Briceño, Angela Kong, Kendyl Magnuson, Leigh Marshall, Suzanne Sebring, Karl Seiler, Alyssa Vafaei, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Senate Vice President Jenny Ferrero encouraged faculty to enroll in African American History 102 for spring. There is a section just for faculty and staff. The class is a continuation of 101 but 101 is not a prerequisite. Faculty are welcomed to email Ferrero for textbook information or about getting salary scale credit at [jfererro@palomar.edu](mailto:jfererro@palomar.edu). To register, go into your E-Services account and use course number 33512. Contact Martin Japtok at [mjaptok@palomar.edu](mailto:mjaptok@palomar.edu) to obtain a permission code prior to registering.

Senator Ellen Weller announced that on Wednesday, December 16, the Palomar College Chamber Singers and Palomar Chorale will have two virtual choir performances with original work by faculty including Dr. Madelyn Byrne, Ellen Weller and John Russell. On Sunday, the Palomar Symphony Orchestra and Contemporary Dance Ensemble will be putting on a virtual concert at 2 PM. Additional information for all upcoming performances can be found at <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/palomarperforms/>

Senator Dr. Susan Miller announced that she is sharing a flyer created for students enrolled in SOC 205 who have math anxiety. She asked Senators to share the flyer with their classes.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Senate President Rocco Versaci announced that Senate will have a special meeting to approve curriculum actions on Friday, December 18 at 1 PM. The Zoom ID is the same as the regular Monday meetings.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** Information Items A and B will be moved up to precede Action items C, D and E.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated November 30, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

**ACTION**

**A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of curriculum actions taken December 2, 2020 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Chair Wendy Nelson shared that notice was sent out to respective departments who still have classes being offered in spring that don't have DE.

**B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot for the DEqCC subcommittee members (see Exhibit 3).

The motion carried.

Michael Mufson  
Alan Lechusza Aquallo  
Alyssa Vafaei  
Tina Parker  
Hossna Sadat Ahadi  
Lisette Lasater  
Cynthia Cordova  
Lawrence Lawson

**C. SOAA Approval**

**Motion 4** MSC: W. Nelson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to support the SOAA for 2021 (see Exhibit 4).

Abstention: Craig Thompson

The motion carried.

Senator Nelson announced that if anyone has Guided Pathway questions, they will be conducting a session during plenary in January. There is also a Guided Pathways meeting on Friday, December 18 at 10 AM where they will begin transitioning over to the new governance committee. If anyone would like to attend, let Nelson know.

#### **D. Part-time Instructor Equity (see Exhibit 5)**

Senator Will Dalrymple shared a story to show the significant difference of what he, as a part-time instructor receives in pay at Palomar after 21 years of service and the pay he would receive if he was a fulltime instructor in 2<sup>nd</sup> grade at San Diego Unified School District. He would earn \$15,000 more in his first year as a 2<sup>nd</sup> grade teacher.

Dalrymple then shared a summary of the part-time instructor equity solutions document and asked Faculty Senate to support solutions that are both directly under their purview and indirectly through supporting solutions that can influence others to support changes that are needed at this time.

Dalrymple thanked the work group for all their efforts in researching and preparing these documents. He continued to say that this issue may be on the PFF meeting agenda for Thursday, December 9.

Several Senators thanked Senator Dalrymple and the other work group members for putting in time and effort to bring this issue forward. Many shared their own stories as they reflected on their own part-time faculty experiences. Many expressed their ignorance or lack the knowledge in some instances of what was taking place here on campus regarding treatment of part-time faculty. Senators were asked to look at the budget-neutral solutions and to think of what the “faculty” experience should be for all faculty, including part-time.

Senator Ben Mudgett added this could be brought to area D for a resolution to update the ASCCC paper on part time faculty equity.

Senator Teresa Laughlin commented that this inequity is also evident in the state college system and UC system. She recently went to a community college council meeting for CFT and they are working on legislation for equal pay for equal work so that the legislature ponies up the money. As part of the PFF negotiations team, she stated the teams often hears “sorry, we just don't have the money.” We have to make sure this issue becomes a district priority so funding can and must be found.

Senate VP Fererro expressed PFF's position on part-time faculty inequities by stating that this issue is always a priority during negotiations. She went on to say that it would be extremely helpful if this document was widely distributed to administration, to the trustees, to anyone who may be involved that has any authority or influence over budget priorities. She encouraged others to attend Governing Board meetings to make statements regarding this matter during public comments.

Senator Kelly Falcone warned about releasing this document to the Governing Board because many of the “fixes” listed are budget-neutral solutions that are related to campus culture brought on by full time faculty. She also added that Faculty Senate may consider creating a bylaws template for departments to use.

Senator Wendy Nelson suggested that we encourage departments to use some of the language found in this document when creating or updating their department bylaws. This could also be used as a best practice tool during potential department chair trainings that may occur in the near future.

Senator Anastasia Zavodny proposed the idea to have the work group bring forward a resolution or have some of the structure written in a format that's appropriate for campus wide distribution and a motion could be written to support that document to create equity.

Senator Falcone also added that Faculty Senate should follow the ASCCC protocol for adopting papers. Versaci will look into that process. She also asked Senators to forward any of their respective department bylaws to her to review and incorporate into a bylaws template.

Senator Dalrymple and the work group will work together to create a revised structured document and motion(s) to bring to Faculty Senate.

#### **E. TERB ideas regarding Peer Review & Student Evaluations (see Exhibit 6)**

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson presented an outline of two possible changes to the tenure and evaluations process. The two updates are reconfiguring Peer Review Committees by adding an outside member assigned by the TERB Coordinator and the VPI. And secondly, running student evaluations in each class every fall and spring. The advantages and disadvantages of these changes are reflected in the exhibit.

Various Senators shared their own experiences with the evaluation process and support the changes. VP Ferrero reminded the group that these changes would need to be negotiated.

Senator Lawrence will bring this item back to Senate next meeting.

**Motion 5 MSC:** Hiro/Lawson Faculty Senate approval to extend the meeting.

Abstentions: Teresa Laughlin, Jenny Ferrero, Ben Mudgett

The motion carried.

#### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

#### **A. Service Learning Report 2020 (see Exhibit 7)**

José Briceño reported that Service Learning partnered with Institutional Research & Planning to find out what impact Service Learning had on some of the targeted student equity groups on campus. There were four groups targeted: African American, Hispanic, first generation, and foster youth. Approximately 2,500 students in 11 different courses participated. The team looked at success, retention and persistence to see what impact Service Learning had with courses that offered it as an optional part of the course work and also required as part of the course work. They compared the results to similar courses that had no Service Learning component. Success and retention was higher for students participating in Service Learning than it was for other students in like courses. Additionally, term-to-term persistence was higher for Service Learning students than it was for other students. For a complete review of the report, go to: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/service-learning/equity-data/>

Briceño went on to say that Service Learning is available to all faculty. It's also up to the faculty on how they want to integrate it into the course work. Some faculty start off with just making it an extra credit assignment. Others make it optional or will do a Service Learning project or a book project. They are happy to work with you to figure out the best approach. Angela Kong also created a list of partners that have virtual options available.

#### **B. Withdrawal Guideline for Noncredit Courses (see Exhibit 8)**

Director Suzanne Sebring stated that there are some new requirements around noncredit that have made it necessary for them to put new processes in place beginning in spring 2021. They want to propose an adjustment to the withdrawal deadline for noncredit courses only. Title 5 indicates that a withdrawal must occur on or before the 75% mark of a course term and Palomar's policy is 50%. This hasn't been an issue with noncredit face to face classes, but now that they've had to move everything almost online, there are separate requirements for noncredit around accounting and attendance. It's making it difficult to manage that 50% withdrawal deadline because in noncredit for online courses, a dual census has to be followed. So there's a first census at the 20% mark of the course and then a second census at 60%. In talking with noncredit faculty about that, they've expressed the desire for students to have the ability to receive a W rather than an NP for noncredit graded courses. This is even more important now because

they're just finalizing the noncredit transcript. Courses that are identified as noncredit graded courses will be transcribed starting this semester. For those courses, they're asking that there be a new policy for the noncredit withdrawal deadline to align with that second census date which is 60% of the course. There is other back end programming that needs to happen to put this dual census into place and it'll just make it a lot clearer and more student-centered if they're able to align that noncredit withdrawal with that 60% second census. It would not impact credit courses in any way. It's only a request for noncredit courses and it really only affects those courses that have been set up to be graded courses which have a grade of pass, satisfactory progress or no pass.

Director Kendyl Magnuson added that in summer and fall, they were allowed to let positive attendance classes continue to go even if they met online and asynchronously. There was an accommodation of how to claim the apportionment but that accommodation is sunset at the end of this fall. To allow the noncredit positive attended classes to move forward and still claim apportionment, they're adopting this census method and it's actually a whole new part of the 320 process, it's a part seven, which they haven't used before. The second census, as part of that requirement happens at the 60% point. What they're advocating is to allow for noncredit to have a W up to that second census date, the 60% point for the noncredit online courses. What's happening is faculty will census certify that second time at the 60% point but that student may or may not have stopped attending the day after the first census, at the 40% point, or the 50% point, or the 60% point, they don't know. By allowing the W to apply, then anyone who is census certified as not being in the class as of the second census, will get a W instead of a punitive grade/no pass. If they follow the 50%, anything that's dropped at the 60% or after, is a grade required pass/no pass would be a no pass.

President Versaci will work with Sebring and Magnuson to create a motion that will be presented as an action item at the next Senate meeting.

### **C. Cameras On Policy**

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro shared the updated Camera Requirements Policy recently revised by the DE Committee that encourages faculty to not require use of cameras during class time. The default in this policy is that cameras are not required. ASG Representative Kateri Mouawad stated that she will be providing student feedback on this issue after the student survey results are compiled.

Senator Ellen Weller expressed her concern that when a physical component is required during the class such as in a performing arts class, the opportunity for the instructor to observe should be maintained in some way. Hiro responded that this information should be included in the class description so the student knows before they register. If a student opts out, they may not take those types of classes.

Senator Fari Towfiq brought up the issue of proctoring exams. Hiro replied by saying that the Chancellor's Office recognizes this need but still encourages removing the mandatory use of cameras during regular class time.

Both Senators Lawson and Falcone pointed out that some students do not have camera technology available to them. To now have these camera requirements known when registering for class is very useful.

Senator Hiro will be bringing this document back to Action at the next meeting.

### **REPORTS**

#### **President (Versaci)**

I attended a meeting run by President Kahn and regarding diversity in hiring across campus. The group outlined a number of nearly completed, ongoing, and proposed projects, and we categorized them in terms of what aspect of

hiring they are meant to improve (e.g., candidate pool/recruitment, application screening, interviewing, retention, etc.). My role in this effort has been to represent faculty hiring concerns/ideas, and once DEqCC is formed, I plan to give them an update on these efforts and the information we have gathered and to suggest that someone from that committee either replace or join me in these conversations/initiatives.

#### SSEC (Versaci)

This council next meets on Friday, December 11. I did meet with the other two chairs, VPSS Lakhani and VPI Sivert, to discuss the next agenda and to have some preliminary discussions about how we will frame/manage the transitional work of identifying useful operational subcommittees under the impending governance structure change. As they are Chairs of the other two councils that will merge with SSEC—SSPC and IPC—the conversation was especially useful as they move forward with their work in those councils.

#### SPC (Versaci)

Some highlights:

- First reading of the AB705 Subcommittee Governance Change Request, which we approved in Senate on 11/16/20. Those changes included adding a meeting time and altering the “Reporting Relationship” section to change “SEA” to “SSEC/SEA and Faculty Senate.” I explained all of these changes and their reasoning, and nobody had any issues with it. It will come back for 2<sup>nd</sup> reading/approval at the 12/15/20 SPC meeting.
- Along with Teresa Laughlin and Craig Thompson, I raised objections to AP3430 – “Prohibition of Harassment” and moved that it be sent back to Policies and Procedures to reconsider language that strengthens protections to academic freedom regarding the sections “Visual or Written” and “Environmental.” After some discussion, the motion was amended to send it back to P & P where a workgroup would be formed to address the language needed to balance protections to both instructors’ academic freedom and students/employees who might be subject to harassment. That motion passed unanimously.

#### IPC Report (Versaci)

IPC does not meet again until Wednesday, 12/9. IPC review of the PRPs is scheduled to begin on Friday, 11/6.

#### SSPC (O’Brien)

No report. SSPC next meets on Wednesday, 12/9.

#### HRPC

#### FASPC (Antonecchia)

#### PFF (Laughlin)

#### Distance Education (Hiro)

- Certification stats
  - o Erin: 884 instructors have been certified to teach online.
  - o Kelly created spreadsheet of uncertified instructors (about 100)
  - o Erin: please bring up certification in our departments! Non-certified instructors will be removed from class schedules after Dec 18.
- CVC Report
  - o Teaching application: Erin met with all critical individuals regarding CVC application and assigned various tasks, and will continue to work with them until app is complete
  - o Home application: Erin’s and Najib’s input is complete. Now in hands of administration.
- DRC Button
  - o Alyssa: work is being done on DRC online resources, in particular a button in Canvas class to allow students to directly connect with DRC.

- Erin: ATRC wants DE committee to give guidance on which buttons should be there, recommending a button for DRC.
- Erin: will write up an evaluation tool for setting which resources need a link in Canvas.
- DE Committee approved a Camera Requirements Policy created by the DE Coordinator and Administration. Sent it to Faculty Senate for final approval.

Guided Pathways (Nelson)

Policies and Procedures (Lawson)

Budget (Ferrerro)

The Budget Committee next meets on Tuesday, December 8.

TERB (Lawson)

Professional Development (Falcone)

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)

ASG (Mouawad)

- Remy Arnold officially resigned from her role as president, on our November 30 meeting. At that meeting Vice President Kateri Mouawad assumed the role as president, and Abeeha Hussain, formally the VP of Internal Affairs, assumed the role as Vice President.
- ASG is working on distributing the discount app for all students to use, and plans on having that launched during winter break.
- ASG established multiple AD-hoc committees to continue work on our yearly budget and bylaws.
- ASG continues to work on recruitment, website development, and continues to advocate for anti-hate rhetoric and policy.
- ASG's last official fall meeting will take place December 7, where we will continue our work over spring break.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 3:59 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Margaret Faulkner  
Molly Faulkner, Secretary