



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
November 16, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Jackie Martin, Fari Towfiq

**GUESTS:** Cynthia Cordova, Erin Feld, Barbara Hammons, Vikash Lakhani, Leigh Marshall, Alyssa Vafaei

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Senator and PD Coordinator Kelly Falcone was told by Dean Chauderlot that tutors and students are facing a challenge during the tutoring session. The challenge is when using Canvas, faculty members are not assigning due dates or not using modules and the students then have a hard time finding the assignment they need assistance with. Senator Katie Farrell, a member of the Tutoring Committee will share this information with the tutoring chair.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Senator Alexander Doyle Bauer announced that due to workload issues for Dean Ly, the Library Department has been asked to move from the Social & Behavioral Sciences Department to the Languages & Literature Department. Unfortunately, it is not guaranteed that the ADA position will be transferred as well. This is not official yet and there is no defined timeline. Senator Doyle Bauer asked Senators to any questions or concerns to her about this matter.

ASG representative Kateri Mouawad announced that the student survey was emailed today and thanked Senators for their assistance in getting this done.

Senator Teresa Laughlin reminded Senators about the food distribution event on November 21st. Turkeys and other non-perishable food items will be available. She asked everyone to share the information with anyone who may be in need of food for a Thanksgiving meal. Kateri Mouawad mentioned that ASG donated 500 school supply bags for Palomar students.

Senate President Rocco Versaci reminded Senators about the December 11 deadline for submitting applications for the Hayward Award. Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson noted that she is beginning the paperwork to nominate Senators Ben Mudgett and Candace Rose, and Dean Nichol Roe for their work on the military leadership program. This item will be added to the November 30th agenda.

President Versaci announced that Council will be meeting this week on Thursday at 12:30 PM. The ZOOM ID has not changed.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/W. Nelson Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated November 9, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstentions: Patrick O'Brien

The motion carried.

**ACTION**

**A. Curriculum** – No action required.

Senator Wendy Nelson reminded that November 20 is still the deadline for courses to be launched for the DE addendum offered in spring 2021.

**B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 2** MSC: Laughlin/Lawson Faculty Senate approval to confirm committee appointments and to confirm the results of the ballot for the Hiring Committee for Dean of CTEE (see Exhibit 2).

**Sierra DeSimone** – EME

**Jason Jarvinen** – Cooperative Education

**Anita Talone** – Drafting

**Jennifer Anderson** – CFT

The motion carried.

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny shared the Hiring Committee for Dean of CTEE document indicating that four (4) of the five (5) faculty positions assigned to this committee have volunteers included on the document. Two candidates are confirmations only (DeSimone and Jarvinen) while the remaining two clusters or sets of applicants must be selected through a vote. At this time, no faculty from Public Safety have volunteered to serve.

Senator Teresa Laughlin questioned why this Public Safety assignment couldn't be converted to an at-large position and Zavodny stated that over the last year, HR has pushed back maintaining that if no one from the department volunteers, the faculty seat remains unfilled per provisions set in AP7120.

Senate President Versaci suggested that we also select a faculty member from another CTE department and submit that name to HR as an alternate with the hopes that HR will approve. Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner, a dance instructor under the broader category of CTEE volunteered to serve.

Senator Zavodny emailed the voting document to Senators.

**Motion 3** MSC: Weller/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to submit a fifth name today to HR to fill the Public Safety seat and to serve as an alternate on the Hiring Committee for Dean of CTEE.

Ayes: Erin Hiro, Teresa Laughlin, Beatrice Manneh, Kateri Mouawad (Advisory Only), Ellen Weller

The motion failed.

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro expressed her concern that there hasn't been an opportunity for faculty outside of the top coded CTE departments to volunteer. Before submitting the fifth name to HR, Fererro feels there needs to be that opportunity.

**Motion 4** MSC: O'Brien/Weller

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the ballot for an alternate seat selected from the two remaining unsuccessful applicants who applied for the Hiring Committee for Dean of CTEE.

Nay: Jenny Fererro

**Solange Wasif** – Design & Manufacturing

The motion carried.

Several Senators advised President Versaci to submit the fifth committee member selected, Solange Wasif to HR.

Senator Zavodny stated that a call went out for volunteers to serve on the DEqCC committee and noted a close date of last Friday, November 13 at noon. During Council on Thursday, November 12, Zavodny shared that fewer than needed volunteers answered the call and there was question or confusion as to whether this information would be coming to Senate with names redacted. Minutes from November 9 Faculty Senate indicated that this information was to be presented today in an anonymous format. During Council, Versace requested the ballot be held and the deadline extended.

Zavodny also added that Committee on Committees met this morning and discussed this new formulation for committees. Senate President Versaci expressed his concerns about this process stating that asking the Chair of Committee on Committees to redact names and identity of applicants, the Chair is a voting member of Senate who knows more information than the rest of the voting Senators. In addition, Versaci believes that while the statement written by the applicant is important, he doesn't feel that its the only basis we should consider when voting. A strong convincing statement doesn't necessarily mean he/she would be the best person for the job. Instead of moving us into the direction of limiting information, we should rely on all information and proceed with a fuller discussion about the applicants.

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro advised that removing bias is important but removing names from applicants doesn't remove that bias since we most likely will know who the applicant is by reading their statement. Fererro also suggested that by keeping the applicants identify known, this will provide an opportunity to consider how many committees this person is currently serving on, their workload, and their availability to effectively serve on this committee.

Zavodny added that during Committee on Committees today, they discussed the issue of redacting other types of identifying information in the statement itself. And, if this is information going devoid of names, then it allows for the thoughtful examination of the statements as they were presented.

Senator Adam Meehan stated that when he began applying for committee seats, he didn't quite understand what the statement was supposed to include, how long it should be or what the process was. He expects that newer faculty are in this same position and we should clarify the instructions and explain the process more. He also added that having more information available to him when making a selection would be appreciated and valued.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett shared that he finds value in knowing more about an individual's experience and what they bring to a committee. He would be concerned about redacting information from an applicant. Senate has been trying to figure out ways to make sure the junior faculty get on committees.. There's an opportunity with the recent Senate resolution passed a couple weeks ago resolving that Faculty Senate be sensitive to and take action about advancing issues of equity, diversity and inclusion. Mudgett went on to suggest that we create a rubric where when we ask people to volunteer, their information will be evaluated against the defined rubric.

Senator Zavodny stated that as of today, she has ten (10) applicants for the DEqCC committee. President Versaci suggested she extend the application deadline to Friday, November 20 and plan to provide applicant information at the November 30 Faculty Senate meeting without redactions.

Next, Zavodny reminded Senators that a group was selected to serve as the Guided Pathways Pillar Three lead. Since that time, she has received information that Glyn Bongolan is working as the Pillar Three lead with the rest of the group members serving as leaders within the committee. This committee has not yet been formalized but the preliminary formation document states that the committee would be potentially open to all employees and not necessarily faculty. To address the lead issue, Zavodny stated that we could either nullify that vote, look to see what other solutions including putting out a call again, or for clarification sake, discuss the issue with the five individuals that were part of that team. We would explain that only one individual can be named as the team leader or they must all accept the team lead and then not work on a future position within the committee once its forms.

Senator Ellen Weller expressed her concern stating that it seemed like we were trying to stuff a committee with people that didn't exist as opposed to just who is going to lead. She thought that's the only thing that can come out of the vote that Glyn is the lead. To have other individuals preapproved for some future position or leadership within the committee makes no sense. She thinks that just reaffirming the understanding that the only thing that was approved was Glyn as the lead and no others. Zavodny stated that the motion approved all the individuals as the co-lead. Weller went on to say that clarification was provided before the vote and that a last minute email indicated that Glyn would act as the Co-Lead.

**Motion 5** MSC: W. Nelson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to affirm Glyn Bongolan as the lead for Pillar Three Guided Pathways.

Abstention: Anastasia Zavodny

The motion carried.

### **C. CVC-OEI Consortium (see Exhibits 3, 4 & 5)**

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro shared additional information regarding the CVC Exchange that will help our students get classes and help faculty by increasing enrollment in online classes. The Chancellor's Office requires all community colleges to become a designated home college through the CVC. This will allow our students who need a class that is not available here at Palomar, log onto a statewide course exchange and sign up for a class without

registering at that college. The steps currently required for our students to take classes elsewhere are extensive and this program allows our students to take fewer steps.

The DE Committee recommends that since we must already become a home college we should also apply as a teaching college to help capture back those FTES. Hiro went on to display the exchange's website to show how easy it will become for our students to register for a class at another college. The website also includes a tool students can use to assist with selecting the right classes.

Hiro presented the CVC teaching college application and will work with ATRC to get the application completed by late spring or early fall of 2021.

Next, Hiro answered questions and addressed concerns. This exchange does allow our students to enroll in up to two (2) classes per semester at other colleges. It will not prevent our students from taking classes at other colleges even if there is a comparable course available at Palomar. Students are ultimately responsible for ensuring that classes taken through this program at other colleges meets Palomar's prerequisite and major requirements.

Additional comments and concerns were discussed among Senators including the fact that students are already shopping for classes and we can't change that so let's help make it easier for them to get in and out of community college in two years. Palomar Promise was brought up but after preliminary review, the Promise program would not be affected should the student take a class elsewhere through this exchange.

It was noted that Palomar already has courses ready to go that meet the new Ethnic Studies requirement and that should be an advantage for Palomar. It was also noted by Hiro that any online course can be included in the exchange but courses that have gone through the OEI process do receive priority listing.

Past-President Craig Thompson asked Hiro what the consequences might be if Palomar chooses not to become a home school. Hiro stated that she isn't sure but has been told by some colleagues that CVC currently funds many programs for Palomar including Canvas. Although it hasn't been stated, there is always a possibility that CVC would pull funding for these programs that Palomar cannot fund on its own, including Canvas.

Senator Molly Faulkner brought up the fact that some of the smaller programs have been put on two year course rotations. Every other year we will lose a series of students. This may kill us if students try to come in at an off year. Hiro acknowledged this issue especially since her own program is also in that two year rotation. Ultimately though, she is hoping the advantages for the students will be the pay off. Faulkner also questioned the effects of waitlists. Hiro hopes that should we have the opportunity to enroll even more students through the exchange, enrollment management would acknowledge the need to open a second course for those on a waitlist and new students coming through the exchange.

Senator Patrick O'Brien shared that as a counselor, he likes the idea for transfer students who are required to complete all the major prep courses before transferring and Palomar doesn't offer all the classes required. A student can still be considered a Palomar student and possibly get those classes through the exchange. In addition, there are limitations for financial aid students who are required to be full-time and to complete all classes at one primary school and this program allows for this. O'Brien also approved of Palomar students still receiving the benefit of priority registration for all Palomar classes. O'Brien also suggested that we check with Palomar Promise to ensure students are meeting the guidelines should they enroll in a class through the exchange. Senator Falcone suspects that since we will have access to all data, we should be able to determine that a student is meeting the Promise enrollment requirements.

Senator Lacey Craft noted that many students already have the resources and time to jump through hoops to take classes simultaneously at other schools but many students also don't. This program also has the potential to help close the equity gaps for many of our students.

Kateri Mouawad, ASG representative stated that a large population of student survey responders prefer face-to-face classes, however, easier access to required classes not offered at Palomar would be a huge help to our students. She went on to support passage of this vote to become a teaching college as well.

Senator Ellen Weller suggested that a review of any major's residency requirements be reviewed as well.

**Motion 6 MSC:** Hiro/Weller Faculty Senate approval to recommend and to direct ATRC to immediately register as a home college with the CVC Consortium.

Nay: Craig Thompson

The motion carried.

**Motion 7 MSC:** Hiro/W. Nelson Faculty Senate approval to recommend to Distance Education Coordinator Erin Hiro to work with administration on the application to become a teaching college with the CVC Consortium.

The motion carried.

**Motion 8 MSC:** Fererro/Zavodny Faculty Senate approval to extend the meeting.

Nays: Teresa Laughlin, Ellen Weller

The motion carried.

**D. Part-time Instructor Equity – Tabled.**

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

**A. Instruction Plan/Consideration for summer '21 & fall '21 – Tabled.**

**B. Superintendent/President Hiring Committee – Tabled.**

**C. Proposed Governance Change to AB705 Subcommittee (see Exhibit 6)**

Erin Feld reported that the AB705 Subcommittee is currently meeting, the fourth Thursday of the month. This means that during the fall semester, the subcommittee only has two meetings because of Thanksgiving and winter break. Feld is here on behalf of chair, Cindy Anfinson to request the meeting be changed to the second Thursday of the month which would allow for four meetings in both semesters. In addition, the subcommittee members have agreed to extend the meeting time an additional half hour from 2:30 to 4 PM.

Senator Zavodny questioned whether the form should also reflect a reporting change from the as-yet-unformed SEA to Senate. President Versaci stated that the change to the governance task force probably won't occur until fall 2021.

Versaci stated that there's no real restriction that says the reporting relationship has to be one body, and he is in favor of putting in the

reporting relationship SSEC/SEA and Faculty Senate. All of these structures are going to have to be altered later when the new task force comes in.

**Motion 9 MSC:** Thompson/ Ferrero Faculty Senate approval to move back into Action.

The motion carried.

**Motion 10 MSC:** Laughlin/Zavodny Faculty Senate approval of the meeting day change (second Thursday of the month), time change (2:30 to 4 PM) and reporting relationship change (SSEC/SEA and Faculty Senate) on the Governance Change form for the AB705 Subcommittee.

The motion carried.

**D. SOAA Approval** (see exhibit 7)

Senator Wendy Nelson suggested that because of time restrictions, we can place this item on Action for November 30. This will give Senators sufficient time to read it and bring back questions on the 30<sup>th</sup>. The document needs to go to the Chancellor's Office in March. We must get it to the governing board by the first meeting in February. It is going to SPC and to several different places. Rocco needs to sign off on this first so it's important that Faculty Senate provides feedback so that any changes can be made. Nelson finished by asking Senators to reach out to her or Sabrina Santiago should they have any questions.

**E. ASCCC Fall Plenary Recap – Tabled.**

**REPORTS**

**President (Versaci)**

I attended the Governing Board meeting on Tuesday, November 10. In my report, I told the trustees about our recent activity, highlighting the formation of the DEqCC committee and the approval of our antiracism statement. I also participated in the EDI presentation and focused on faculty equity initiatives, including the MATCH student edification project, the *It's Monumental* event being planned by Performing Arts, the decolonizing syllabi project, the AS101 section for employees, and the Equity Teaching and Resources site that we have been developing.

Jenny and I attended a meeting of the Emergency Operations Center (EOC) to discuss our request to designate a specific building from which faculty members could teach synchronously. They were looking for further clarification about this request, which we provided. Below is the response that President Kahn sent us after the EOC had time to discuss our meeting:

“Thanks again for spending time with the Policy team to discuss the challenges that faculty are facing in teaching synchronously and the idea of reserving a building and specific rooms to provide for a better remote teaching environment. I think we are all on the same page in getting faculty the resources they need to be effective in the classroom.

“We really liked this idea, and in particular Derrick [Johnson] (from risk management- cc'd here) thought we could use this concept as a template when we transition to more face-to-face teaching. After much consideration, it is our recommendation that at this time, faculty should continue to address their challenges with their chair and dean, so that

all potential resolutions can be addressed before we consider the idea of on-campus locations for synchronous teaching.

“With the County heading to the more restrictive purple tier, a decision based on the increase in COVID-19 cases in our region, we do not feel that the timing is right to move this proposal forward. However, as stated, let’s continue the dialogue as this is a really helpful suggestion to be a part of transition planning.”

**SSEC (Versaci)** This Council met on Friday, 11/13 (after these reports were submitted).

**SPC (Versaci)** SPC next meets on Tuesday, November 17.

**IPC (Versaci)**

IPC does not meet again until Wednesday, 12/9. IPC review of the PRPs is scheduled to begin on Friday, 11/6.

**SSPC (O’Brien)** No report.

**HRPC** No report.

**FASPC (Antonecchia)** No report.

**PFF (Laughlin)**

Our students and wider community are hurting this Thanksgiving. Recognizing that, the PFF and the Palomar College’s Foundation each donated \$3,000 and along with an additional \$4,000 from the SDICLC we were able to buy 500 turkeys to distribute to our community. So mark your calendars, on November 21<sup>st</sup> the PFF and the CCE in collaboration with the SDICLC are going to distribute turkeys along with other Thanksgiving type food items in parking lot 12 from 8-10 am. Please spread the word to your networks. This may make a big difference for North County families in need.

COPE, working with a political consultant, worked tirelessly to elect three Board members. As of writing this report, only one, Roberto Rodriguez, was elected. Roberto is a teacher and CTA leader so we are optimistic he will consider the faculty point of view when making his decisions. It is disappointing that Nina Deerfield did not win reelection because she always was ready to listen to us, but we will attempt to develop relationships with the new Board members and reinforce our relationship with current Board members.

PFF is working on an inclusion statement similar to the Faculty Senate’s (maybe with fewer “be it resolved” clauses)

**Distance Education (Hiro)**

The DE Committee’s next meeting is Nov. 18 at 2:30 p.m. We are currently working on getting more than 200 faculty members certified to teach online before the spring semester. Please share this information with your department.

Per AP [4105](#), all faculty must be on the list of [Certified Instructors for Online Teaching](#) before they are allowed to teach an online class. This requirement was waived at the state and local level to allow us to provide our faculty with the opportunity to become certified. As you know, we have provided many opportunities for faculty to become certified since that waiver took effect in spring 2020.



As we approach spring 2021, the requirement is no longer waived. Any faculty scheduled to teach a class in spring 2021 must have completed their certification **by the end of this semester (December 18)**. Currently, there are 213 instructors scheduled to teach who are not on the list of those certified.

Please compare the list below to your S21 schedule and notify any faculty on the list below with a S21 assignment that they must pick one of the following ways to be certified ASAP or lose their class:

- Evidence of successful completion of Faculty Senate-approved distance education pedagogy workshops. Currently, that means taking and passing the self-paced [Palomar Online Education Training \(POET\)](#) course. Instructions to enroll in POET are [here](#).
- Evidence of coursework, certificates, and/or degrees that focus on online teaching which were completed at other accredited higher education institutions. If you were trained somewhere else, send proof of that training to [ehiro@palomar.edu](mailto:ehiro@palomar.edu).
- *Evidence of a successful course design and facilitation as demonstrated by alignment with the criteria approved by the Faculty Senate. Currently, that is the [OEI Course Design Rubric](#). See instructions for [How to do a Self-Evaluation of a Course](#). Send the completed rubric to DE Coordinator Erin Hiro at [ehiro@palomar.edu](mailto:ehiro@palomar.edu).*

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** No report.

#### **Policies and Procedures (Lawson)**

Board Policies on Antiracism, Legal Opinions, Prohibition of Harassment, Speakers at Board Meetings, Grading and Academic Record Symbols, and Computer and Network Use (among others) were approved by the committee on a second read. On first read, we have these issues: Discrimination and Harassment Complaints, Capital Construction, Records Retention and Discussion, and Institutional Code of Ethics up for review. Please visit <https://go.boarddocs.com/ca/pccd/Board.nsf/Public#> and find the Policies and Procedures information for 6 November to find these first read items and give Lawrence Lawson any feedback to take to P&P. Lawrence Lawson attended the meeting.

#### **Budget (Ferro)**

The Budget Committee met on 11/10/20. The committee heard from Debbi Claypool and Amber Cross about **contracts and purchasing**, including the contract database and process for keeping track of contracts, as well as the process for requisitions approval. The committee was presented with a **CARES Act update**: \$173K left in the Federal Block Grant (must be spent by 12/30/20), \$1.07mil left in the State Block Grant (must be spent by 6/30/21), \$2.03mil left in the CARES-Institutional fund (must be spent by 4/23/21), and \$521K left in the CARES-MSI fund (must be spent by 7/9/21). The top four categories of proposals for CARES funds are for technology, student kits and materials, training and overtime for remote instruction prep, and lost revenues/student refunds. Kendyl provided an **enrollment report** including a projected loss of 335 FTES for fall and explanations of why headcounts are down, including the fact that a DE Penalty results in a reduction of 12% in contact hours for fall lecture classes that were moved to DE. The committee also saw the **FY 19/20 Annual 311 and FY 20/21 Quarterly 311 Reports**. As previously reported, FY 19/20 ended with a slight surplus, and FY 20/21 is currently the same as the budget that was adopted last month.

#### **TERB (Lawson)**

TERB has approved a “soft” revision of the online course evaluation form that includes a new questions regarding an assessment of an online course’ accessibility (and provides a Faculty Senate and TERB approved tool to guide that assessment, the CVC-OEI rubric). As well, we’ve added questions from the face-to-face classroom observation form to also allow folks to answers questions about any live session viewed during the online course observation period. However, the observation must include an observation of the Canvas/LMS environment. A more robust revision of the entire form, to ensure we’re hitting accreditation standards as well as our own standards, will be considered for fall 2021 implementation.

As well, we're starting a conversation (for which we will solicit lots of feedback) on two fronts: (1) adding a third, outside, randomly appointed tenured faculty member to all peer (tenured) committees and (2) running *student* evaluations in all classes, every fall and spring semester, for the purposes of eliciting regular student feedback for instructors, and what that might mean for regular, three-year-cycle evaluations documentation.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** No report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)**

We met on the 5<sup>th</sup> of November, but Lawrence Lawson missed the meeting. There's another meeting next week. We are approving the next academic year's evaluations.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** No report.

**ASG (Mouawad)**

- ASG is partnering with Faculty Senate to launch an end of semester survey to collect data that will be implemented for best practices by faculty and professors.
- We are continuing to recruit and put on virtual events for our Palomar students, our latest was a Halloween costume contest.
- ASG is now mobilizing itself to accomplish our year goals, and our subprojects. We are continuing our work with the overnight parking pass, establishing ourselves in our respective councils and committees, and are working towards establishing an online presence.
- ASG will be launching the student discount app free of charge to accommodate students due to these challenging times.
- ASG is looking into collaborating with CSUSM Mira Costa to offer support to students throughout the district—more details to follow.
- We're reaching out to as many professors, as we can to advocate for ASG and let students know ASG is here to help.
- We are working with faculty and staff to collaborate with giving out resources during the Covid 19 situation. Faculty is asked to let students in need know to seek out assistance from ASG.

**ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 4 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

  
Molly Faulkner, Secretary