



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
November 2, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Erin Hiro, Adam Meehan

**GUESTS:** Barbara Baer, Vikash Lakhani, Leigh Marshall, Patriceann Mead, Hossna Sadat Ahadi, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** No Public announcements.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Hossna Sadat Ahadi announced that on Friday, Palomar College is welcoming the San Diego Chapter of the American Association for Women in Community Colleges. The event is called *I Am . . .* with a focus on healing or empowerment. Binary and non-binary faculty and students are welcomed to attend. It would be great if more faculty can attend as well. Senator Jenny Ferrero will be speaking at the event.

Sadat Ahadi also reminded Senators about Phi Theta Kappa's call to action antiracism project scheduled for Friday, December 4. It's open to all students and they've worked really hard to share their experiences with racism and will share how to eradicate racism in education.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett reported that the Board of Governors is hearing second reading on correspondence-based education, International Baccalaureate and CLEP exam standardization scores working with the academic senate and competency based education. Just this morning, a group of Senators met with VP Sivert to talk about competency-based education. During the meeting, the group discussed the chancellor's need for colleges to complete an interest form and the group is cautiously interested but had some concerns related to funding and institutional support. Mudgett will stay in the loop and provide additional information to Senate as it becomes available.

Senator Ellen Weller reminded Senators about the Palomar College Chamber Singers and Chorale performance on Sunday, November 8. The cost is just \$10 and more information can be found here:

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/palomarperforms/event/palomar-choral-music-series/2020-11-08/>

Senate President Rocco Versaci reminded Senator's about Puente's *Everything you've ever wanted to know about Dia de Los Muertos* event on November 4<sup>th</sup> at 11:30 AM. The flyer was emailed to all Senators.

President Versaci asked Senators to review Information Item E: Governance Structure and email comments or suggestion to him no later than this evening. The item is on SPC's agenda for second reading on Tuesday, November 3.

Senate Vice President Jenny Ferrero asked Senators to provide feedback on the resolutions as soon as possible. She along with Versaci will be attending the statewide academic senate plenary at the end of the week.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated October 26, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

### **ACTION**

**A. Curriculum** – No actions to approve.

**B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 2** MSC: Zavodny/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to confirm a committee appointment (see Exhibit 2):

#### **CALM Committee – Adriana Guillen, Faculty at-large**

The motion carried.

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny announced there is a Senator vacancy on Committee on Committees. Senator Wendy Nelson is interested in filling the position. Also, the call will go out today for a Senator to fill the Co-Chair position of DeqCC (Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competency subcommittee) with a close date of Friday, November 6.

**Motion 3** MSC: Towfiq/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval to appoint Wendy Nelson to serve on Committee on Committees.

#### **Committee on Committees – Wendy Nelson**

The motion carried.

Senator Zavodny asked for clarification on the Guided Pathways Pillar Three lead voted on October 19. Senate selected a team with Glyn Bongolan as the lead to that position and she is not seeing that represented clearly in Guided Pathways materials. Senator Wendy Nelson stated she thought it was noted that Glyn Bongolan would represent this team but maybe we should reach out to Bongolan to confirm her intentions. Zavodny will reach out to Bongolan.

President Versaci shared that at Council this week, Senator Lawrence Lawson asked how Senate will they create actions and identify mechanisms in place to support the antiracism statement that was just approved. Versaci referenced the following statement:

*'Be it resolved that, in matters related to district and college governance structures, the Faculty Senate will ensure that Faculty Senate representatives are sensitive to and take action toward advancing issues of equity, diversity, and inclusion.'*

Versaci continued saying that we do get many committee appointments. But it shouldn't prevent us to live up to our resolution by being more specific and pointed when approving committee members.

Senator Zavodny shared that Committee on Committees is addressing this but first within the scope of the larger shared Governance Council structure that is coming. The committee will eventually have consideration of current committees, their functions and roles and will have the opportunity to go through the volunteer process for committees to make changes.

Both Senators Ben Mudgett and Kelly Falcone agreed that an easy first step that could be followed though right away is just adding an additional question to our committee volunteer questionnaire asking how would the applicant encourage and advance DEI in the work of the respective committee.

Senator Ellen Weller would like to see more faculty involved on the various committees and would like to know more about the faculty member who is applying by asking more questions about themselves. In addition, she thinks newer faculty don't become involved because they see the same faculty members serving on so many of the different committees.

Senator Wendy Nelson shared that she has heard some faculty members say they never felt like they had a chance to serve on certain committees because it was sort of a popularity contest. To make the process itself more equitable, Nelson has been advocating to change the process. Additional questions that are specific to the committee would be helpful.

Additional suggestions from Senators included giving Senators more time to review applicants, schedule additional Senate meetings to cover committee appointments, redact names from applications to make the process less biased, to know ahead of time how many committees the applicant serves on, and to embrace new faculty who may have fresh and better ideas that can serve the committee well.

Committee on Committees will be discussing these suggestions and will bring back some recommendations to Faculty Senate.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **A. Part-time Instructor Equity (see Exhibit 3)**

Senator Will Dalrymple began the discussion on equity for part-time faculty. This issue affects a majority of faculty on the campus but has implications for the entire body of faculty. Senator Dalrymple prepared a Faculty Senate Statement to serve as the framework for the discussion. He stated that this issue is systemic and consequently it can feel like there isn't much we can do as a Senate body. He suggested, however, this is far from the case and that our responsibility with respect to part-time issues is rooted in the mission of the community college, whose values include access, inclusion, diversity, and equity. These values are inclusive values that apply to us as an institution and we should be modeling those values.

Dalrymple continued to say that while Faculty Senate has purview over academic and professional matters and the union has purview over workplace condition issues like compensation, this separation of purview is a division created

by the system, at times effective but that frequently works against the needs of part-time faculty by failing to address the inseparable relationships between the two domains. We must recognize that how we frame and address academic and professional matters directly influence the gains that can be made in workplace conditions. To that end, we must recognize that, beyond purview, Faculty Senate has a significant sphere of influence, one we should take advantage of. At the level of the system, we have opportunities to work together not only with the faculty union, the Senate at the state level, and the chancellor's office but also to use our voice to reach, for example, media, legislators, and the larger community we serve in our quest for equity.

Dalrymple continued by specifying that of fundamental concern for part-time faculty are workplace issues, including pay, healthcare, office space and more. This document proposes that we look for opportunities for furthering part-time faculty equity, both under the umbrella of academic and professional matters, but also as an advocate in workplace conditions. Full-time and part-time faculty do share much common ground and the more that we can further these issues along, the stronger the faculty voice will be overall.

Senator Kelly Falcone thanked Dalrymple for preparing the document. Her challenge after reading the document was what does this all mean in terms of action. Dalrymple explained that he was hoping in the course of this discussion, we could begin the process of identifying things that can be done. Falcone added that she found a study on the ASCCC website that was shared at the part-time faculty institute regarding a type of salary sharing with full-time faculty. In addition, the study talked about maximizing class to class time and minimizing downtime which is what we try to do for students now. This strategy could be utilized when assigning class to our part-time faculty.

Senator Lawson thanked Dalrymple for the work he put into creating this statement and recognized some of the very important statements Dalrymple made in the document.

Senator Teresa Laughlin stated that she supports these efforts and went on to say that this problem is systemic and there are terrible economic incentives for part-timers to be exploited in this way but we have to come to grips with it and to facilitate equity for part-time and full-time instructors.

Senator Susan Miller agreed with Dalrymple but thinks it's really important to understand that for any sort of change to happen, we have to convince people who have power, who have space, who have the resources and ask them to give something up and that's tough to do. Dalrymple suggested perhaps there are opportunities for enlarging the pie, so to speak, so that such sacrifices are minimized. Miller and Dalrymple both agreed that some idealism can be useful and maybe gains can be made that no one thought possible.

Senator Eduardo Aguilar stated that he supports efforts to provide more equity to part-time faculty.

ASG representative Kateri Mouawad stated that some of the most influential people in her life have been part-time faculty at Palomar College and promised continued support for part-time faculty.

Senator Wendy Nelson shared some of her experience as part-time faculty. She realizes there is just "one pot" and now as a full-time faculty member, she would be willing to share more of that pot with part-time faculty and this is something that we should be thinking about.

Senator Craig Thompson asked Dalrymple to explain the distinction between what he is talking about and advocating for the 75/25 ratio. Dalrymple responded saying that a good percentage of part-timers would prefer to be full-timers and one of the key things we should be striving for is increasing that number up to and beyond that recommended minimum 75%. But the fact remains that there is a need for part-time faculty and there are faculty who only want to

work part-time. And so the question remains, for those people who want to be in that role, are they still protected? Are they still getting the benefits of working.

Patriceann Mead shared that Performing Arts Dept. already tries to schedule blocks for part-time instructors. But one of the things not being addressed in equity in part-time is the prioritization list that we now have to abide by which has hurt Performing Arts. There are part-time faculty who no longer teach for us because of the prioritization list. We have now eliminated some of our really wonderful part-timers. Because of that, just to keep that in mind when you're working your document.

Senator Laughlin also stated that the prioritization list is definitely a situation where it helps some people and hurts others but we were forced to do it and given the circumstances, this was the best we could do. Secondly, Laughlin believes that there is this false idea that there's only one way to cut the pie. Currently, it's said that full-time faculty get this much and part-time faculty get that much. So the faculty piece of the pie is  $x + y$ . We have been under these draconian efficiency standards where they're saying you have to have 85% fill rate, whether that is being taught by a part-time instructor or a full-time instructor, the college gets the same amount of money for a full-time equivalent student. So if we really want to change things, we make it so that everybody basically gets paid what they are worth. I would argue if it's a three unit class and 30 units is the load for a full-time faculty, part-time faculty for each class gets one-tenth of what they would if they were full-time faculty. And if that means that the district has to hire fewer consultants or stop getting into these legal battles, so be it.

President Versaci asked Senators to read through the document prepared by Dalrymple and come prepared to discuss this matter further at the next Faculty Senate meeting.

#### **B. Chancellor's Office Opinion on Captioning & Cameras (see Exhibit 4)**

Due to the absence of DE Chair and Senator Erin Hiro, Senator Falcone began the discussion by explaining that the exhibit are just the legal opinions. Every college has struggled with the cameras on requirement so the Chancellor's Office asked for and provided a legal opinion on this matter. The captioning area is important, but Falcone thinks Palomar is doing a good job of captioning. She encouraged Senators to read the cameras on requirement. Feedback from many faculty showed that many were not happy with the idea of not being able to require a camera on during class. After reading the legal opinions, Falcone believes it becomes very clear reflecting the challenges for students. The next step is to create our own policy.

Senator Weller requested that faculty be given reasonable time and instruction when asked to complete any online survey or questionnaire. And, Faculty Senate should be allowed to monitor the volume of these requests going out to faculty as well. Falcone responded by saying that this was a last minute thing that came from the Instruction Office and it had a due date in order to get it in the class schedule. Because ultimately, the reason Senator Hiro sent the survey out is because our students are having a lot of challenges. Students are taking classes that they literally can't pass because faculty are requiring a camera that they don't own and they weren't told about having to have a camera. This survey came about through student concerns and realizing that students have a right to know the cost of their education and we need to make sure we're upfront with letting them know if there are certain equipment or technology requirements. Weller finished by saying she understands the need but everything right now is urgent and it becomes an unfair burden on faculty.

Senator Laughlin asked if there was a distinction between a camera need for a lecture or an assessment. She is aware of camera requirements for some type of assessments. Falcone responded that right now, there is no distinction.

### **C. ASG's Conversations about Support for Struggling Students (see Exhibit 5)**

ASG representative Kateri Mouawad thanked Senators for their concerns regarding this matter. Student complaints came primarily from STEM stating they had too many assignments, extra tight deadlines and lack of communication with their instructor. Unfortunately, Mouawad stated that this is one of the reasons for the high dropout rate in the STEM program right now. Instructors complained of lack of interaction with the students due to cameras being off and difficulty in communicating with the students. ASG wants an open and honest discussion with Faculty Senate about what can be done to improve student support in spring 2021—i.e. implement strategies that successful professors are using, such as giving more extra credit as incentives, applications for students to request extensions with deadlines from the beginning because of personal matters, discuss in person labs that are COVID-safety approved. ASG is preparing to send a survey to all students at the end of the semester.

Senator Ben Mudgett stated that he has incorporated some methods of flexibility for his students which are appreciated and much needed.

Senator Falcone added that in Poet's 2nd module, there is an assignment where you actually watch them employing equity-minded and culturally affirming teaching practices in virtual learning communities. We have that piece in Poet already. Maybe we can continue some type of a communication strategy that just reminds our faculty the importance of being relational, being intrusive, helping students and employing these instructional strategies that will help our students be successful. Additionally, Falcone thinks that we should do a survey for students where Faculty Senate and ASG collaborate together to send this out. She believes have an opportunity to ask some questions that would allow our students to share with us what is working for them and how the classes could improve. Once Senate gets this information, we can put that information together and get it out to faculty.

Senator Wendy Nelson highly supports this survey but suggests that the survey go out sooner than semester end. This allows faculty the opportunity to make changes or better choices for spring 2021.

Senator Candace Rose meets with her students regularly and her students often share experience they have with other classes such as students having to mail in assignments because their instructor doesn't know how to use Canvas. Let's look at this now.

Senators Falcone, Zavodny and Fererro volunteered to assist ASG with creating this student survey. It was also noted that it would be helpful to get Research & Planning to send out the email.

### **D. Exemplary Program & Hayward Awards (see Exhibit 6)**

President Versaci asked Senators to review the exhibit and email any questions or concerns.

### **E. Governance Structure & Participation Handbook (see Exhibit 7)**

President Versaci asked Senators to review the exhibit and email any questions or concerns.

## **REPORTS**

### **President (Versaci)**

In the past week I attended SSEC and IPC (see reports below). In addition, Jenny Fererro and I met with the EOC to go over our list of "asks" and their responses. It was a productive meeting. In terms of opening parts of campus for students and faculty to access Wi-Fi, they informed us that the parking structure and Lot 12 are wired for that, but they are looking for a consistent lowering of local Covid infections before deciding on opening those lots for the spring. As

for the idea of opening a designated building so that faculty members can sign up for times/rooms from which to teach classes, attend meetings, etc., they seemed open to the possibility after receiving clarification from Jenny and me.

**SSEC (Versaci)** SSEC met on Friday, October 23. Some highlights:

- Feedback was given on the Governance Structure Handbook. Two issues that came up and that will be carried forward to the SPC discussion on this matter involved clarifying the Umoja and Punte representatives on the Equity, Education, and Success Council. Someone had suggested adding that these individuals would be selected by the respective program coordinators and then approved by the relevant groups (e.g., if a staff member is named, then CCE would appoint). Also discussed was the issue of compensating students for their service on this and other councils, as several groups in the new structure have designated student members.
- Cindy Anfinson brought forth a proposal to develop a land acknowledgement statement, and several people volunteered to look into this/coordinate with other individuals and groups on campus who have done work in this area.
- We received an update from Olga Diaz about the Kumeyaay statue display, which will be installed near the end of the library. She also provided a report about the year-end SEA funding expenditures.
- We took a look at an equity plan developed at American River College, and discussed the possibilities of using it as a model for our own.
- A small group was formed to go through the PD webinars on equity in order to come up with a manageable number to recommend for Trustee onboarding.

**SPC (Versaci)** SPC next meets on Tuesday, November 3.

**IPC Report (Versaci)** IPC met on Wednesday, October 28. Some highlights:

- We discussed the Governance Structure Handbook, and various issues were raised, including the new “consensus” model that will require a 2/3 vote on issues and the raised/dissmised possibility of a “college hour.” The main part of the conversation was in how the formation of operational committees would unfold. This part of the governance change process has, perhaps, not been completely thought through, as the new structure is set to begin in the spring, yet councils have not been discussing what kinds of operational committees are going to be needed/how existing subcommittees are going to shift.
- Reminders regarding the PRP calendar: PRPs are due to the deans on Friday, 10/30, and IPC review of the PRPs begins on Friday, 11/6.
- There was some discussion of Early Alert/Starfish/Canvas, and the idea that we need a full discussion of Early Alert before moving on was repeated. Najib Manea offered some information about the “data sharing” part of full Starfish-Canvas integration. Basically there are two models—automated (which would allow the instructor to make settings that would trigger EA flags) and manual (which would give a small group of counselors/retention team members access to the information on Canvas). This part of the conversation has yet to take place, as both I and Shayla reiterated.
- The issue of “NameCoach” came up, and a few people asked about 1) the possibility of alternate, free methods that would achieve the same thing and 2) about the ability to use NameCoach outside of Canvas (it is possible to do this, Najib confirmed).

**SSPC (O’Brien)** The SSPC meeting for Wednesday, October 28, was cancelled.

**HRPC** No report.

**FASPC** There is currently a Senate-appointed faculty vacancy on this council.

**PFF (Laughlin)** No report.

**Distance Education (Hiro)** No report.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** Reports for GP are suspended until the GP Task Force gets up and running. The Senate will put out a call for the at-large faculty members shortly.

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)** P&P next meets on Friday, November 6.

**Budget (Ferrerro)** The Budget Committee meeting for Tuesday, October 27, was cancelled.

**TERB (Lawson)** No report.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** No report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** No report.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** No report.

**ASG (Mouawad)**

- ASG is hosting a costume contest for students and continues to host virtual events for a better student experience.
- ASG will be hosting special meeting Monday, November 2, and will potentially switch to Monday's for their regular ASG meetings.
- Our students are currently being placed into various different shared governance committees that Palomar has open to student representation.
- ASG is working on increasing recruitment, and would like faculty support.
- We are finalizing our goals for the semester, and intend to start working on several ambitious projects, and will follow up regarding establishing communication campus wide.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Margaret Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary