



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
October 26, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:**

**GUESTS:** Barbara Baer, Chad Cooney, Vikash Lakhani, Leigh Marshall, Patriceann Mead, Adam Navarro, Leslie Salas, Jon Walker

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** No Public announcements.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson made the following statement:

*"There was a view of "systemic racism" expressed in our previous meeting that I wanted to address because, other than a response from Senator Susan Miller, it seemed to pass by unremarked on. There was a sentiment that seemed to question the existence of institutional or systemic racism, a term coined during the Civil Rights era to refer to discrimination perpetrated at the system/institution level instead of the individual level—think the practice of redlining or how school districts are funded or other policies that contribute to discrimination against people of color.*

*If you're unfamiliar with redlining, here's a quote from a Washington Post article published three days ago: "Federal housing policies starting in the 1930s resulted in a practice of color-coding maps to designate certain neighborhoods as best or worst for mortgage lending. Borrowers buying in White communities — colored green for being safest for lending — could get loans backed by the federal government. Black neighborhoods — colored red — were deemed too risky for mortgage lending. Without the federal guarantee, banks wouldn't lend to Blacks."*

*It was intimated to me, both recently and previously, that because I am white, I cannot know that a thing such as "systemic racism" exists, but I'd like to note that I am well aware of systemic racism because I, and my family, have benefitted from it for generations.*

*I'm third-generation American. My grandmother emigrated from Sweden around the turn of the century. My great-grandparents on the other side came from France via Canada. At every turn, moving west, my ancestors*

*were able to rent and buy property in ways and in places that their black peers, historically, could not. Over the generations, as that property was handed down or sold, we benefitted financially in ways our typical black peers, historically, did not.*

*Others were kept out or kept down so that my family could be let in. So, I see systemic racism at work in our society. I want it on record that this is the viewpoint of at least one Senator at this table.”*

Senator Dr. Susan Miller thanked Senator Lawson for making this statement and added that systemic racism is also beyond redlining. We only need to look at mass incarceration and all the policies and legislation that have been done to promote racist activity. We don't need to look too far in the past as we can look at dismantling the Voting Rights Act recently and the waves of voter suppression that has occurred as a result of that. It's important to understand that systemic racism has to do with the system and the system includes laws, all the public institutions, corporations and places that institute policies, regulations and procedures to systemically disadvantage people from opportunity.

Faculty Senate President Rocco Versaci announced that Phi Theta Kappa is hosting a student project on December 4 from 1 to 3:00 PM. It will be a video with recorded testimonials of students and their experiences with racism on campus and possibly a discussion afterwards. Versaci encouraged all Senators to register.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated October 19, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

### **ACTION**

#### **A. Curriculum**

**Motion 2** MSC: Nelson, W. /Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum actions taken October 21, 2020 (see Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Chair Wendy Nelson stated November 20 is the last day to launch the DE addendum in META. Tech Review meets this Wednesday to finalize courses in the queue. Curriculum will be reaching out to chairs and discipline specialists for all of the cross listed courses because they are adding minimal qualifications to the course outline of record.

#### **B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the following individuals to their respective committees (see Exhibit 3):

Abstentions: Kelly Falcone, Kateri Mouawad (Advisory), Craig Thompson

Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – Nicholas Thomas, Faculty at Large, Part time

Student Success & Equity Council – Charles Alexander, Faculty, Counselor, (20-22)

The motion carried.

### C. Faculty Senate Subcommittee on Equity & Diversity

**Motion 4** MSC: Aguilar/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the new Senate subcommittee Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competency (DEqCC) (see Exhibit 4).

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny shared an updated Governance Structure Group Request form. To encourage diversity and equity in the existing hiring practices, Senate President Versaci asked to include faculty hiring matters under product #2.

Senator Lawrence Lawson asked for clarification of product #4. Zavodny stated the group wants to include changes throughout entire processes so if we want to bring out recognition and awareness of diversity, equity and cultural competency, we should have that incorporated into the evaluative process as well (TERB). Perhaps a change on the student portion of evaluations so we could capture it and reflect if this is happening in a classroom space. In addition Zavodny said there could potentially be other changes for other portions of that evaluation process that would force us to encapsulate it and say that yes, we are making this kind of progress. Zavodny agreed with Lawson indicating that this should be a conversation with TERB to figure out how to fit this into evaluations in some way.

Senator and PD Coordinator Kelly Falcone stated she thinks this subcommittee will be Senate's subject matter experts. This group can then see what's going on at other colleges and learn some promising practices and then make suggestions as the advisors and consultants to the Senate.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett asked if this subcommittee would be recommending professional development workshops and activities to Palomar's PD program. Falcone answered that what makes Mira Costa's committees so strong is that this committee or group actually are the ones who offer and sustain the program. So they're the ones who have the pulse on what area really needs attention. This committee becomes the experts and we look to them to offer training, rather than just identifying training already exists.

The motion carried.

**Motion 5** MSC: Towfiq/Thompson

Faculty Senate approval to amend the Diversity, Equity, and Cultural Competency (DEqCC) Subcommittee form to include "including those matters relating to faculty hiring" on Products item #3 (see Exhibit 4).

Senator Jackie Martin cautioned against fine tuning the language to specifically add faculty hiring. In their meetings, the taskforce discussed this matter at length and feels that keeping the language broad in scope leaves room to apply oversight to a variety of processes. Versaci stated that Faculty Senate has dedicated much time and energy into the faculty hiring process and favored that this process be included in the language on this form.

Senator Wendy Nelson stated her concerns that we might be overwhelming this new subcommittee especially since there is no release time connected to it. She stated that diversity in faculty hiring may become its own separate project.

Versaci reminded Senators that improving diversity and equity in the hiring process was an original action item on the list of initiatives. This subcommittee could create a document that would go to departments addressing these issues including consistency among how part timers are hired, considering antiracist frameworks in the writing of questions and maybe even teaching demonstrations. It was suggested at that time to fold these activities into this new subcommittee. The work needs to be done and Faculty Senate needs to make some kind of changes in terms of improving diversity in faculty hiring.

Senator Fari Towfiq also shared concerns that the word “hiring” be included somewhere in Products for this subcommittee.

Senator Ben Mudgett questioned whether this subcommittee will include issues affecting PC3H. Towfiq indicated absolutely “yes.”

The motion carried.

#### **D. Senate Statement on Antiracism – Senate Task Force**

**Motion 6** MSC: Ferrero/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval of the Faculty Senate Statement on Antiracism (see Exhibit 5).

Senator Lawrence Lawson shared the amended statement that reflected edits since made from previous reviews. Senators were given the opportunity to make additional edits during this time. A significant number of Senators shared comments and suggested edits.

Senate Secretary Molly Faulkner shared the following statement written by Senator Ellen Weller who is not currently present in this meeting:

*“I would like my vote to count as IN FAVOR of the committee’s version if it includes the phrase “systemic racism” or something equally specific. If we fail to boldly and forthrightly address this in clear and unambiguous terms, then we have failed in our duty as an advisory body to guide Palomar College firmly towards equity. Anything short of calling this out is reinforcing the status quo, which is to ignore racism and its evil siblings, and pretend we are being “fair.”*

The motion carried.

#### **INFORMATION ITEMS**

##### **A. Early Alert/Starfish/Canvas (see Exhibit 6)**

Vice President of Student Services Vikash Lakhani began his report by affirming that during the student services reorganization, he along with Dean Leslie Salas will be making sure that the early alert piece is institutionalized. They will have a strong structure in place to reach out to students. They are taking the “cast the net wide” approach for students’ interventions or any kind of support. The information would go out to the respective students support staff or counselors, rather than it being handled by a specific unit. The intervention will begin with counselors and these other student support services because the relationships are there.

Dean Salas began answering the remaining questions listed at the bottom of the exhibit. The team will follow up with the student once the alert is raised by a faculty member. Right now, the Business Systems Analyst sees those alerts daily and immediately assigns them to the teams. All of this activity is logged into Starfish once the issue has been resolved. The way its set up now is that faculty does not receive any communication and it's up to faculty to go into Starfish to see where the issue stands and whether it has been resolved with the student. It is her understanding that faculty are not receiving that communication because they didn't want faculty to get inundated with these emails Salas asked if faculty want to receive an email once communication starts with the student. There has been training for faculty for the Early Alert program. Salas reiterated VP Lakhani's statement that the goal it to reconnect the students with their programs and counselors in those programs. Salas added that their team is looking to set up different levels or tiers of flags which can be used to determine how great and timely the need is. This may also determine the type of communication needed with the student.

Senator Patrick O'Brien asked what the plan will be for creating a hub of sorts or team who will do the intake tasks for Early Alerts and how will they get the information to the right counselors. Dean Salas affirmed the need to reorganize the department to make this process more streamlined and institutionalized. VP Lakhani added that there is automation available to automatically direct these alerts to an assigned service area and that option is being explored.

Senator Kelly Falcone said she is looking forward to getting a better understanding of what the internal processes are. She added that this was the primary reason she suggested a pause on the Canvas integration. Falcone stated she is looking forward to understanding who that retention team is and how we're utilizing them. She also suggested that faculty should get notifications even to just know whether a connection has been made with the student. She would like to see those touch points and understand what is actually happening with that student.

VP Lakhani said right now, all Early Alerts are faculty driven. It is his hope that their division will have a support system in place in the near future that will accommodate sending emails to faculty to keep them updated on the progress of the student. He is hoping that by spring of 2021, a plan will be worked out.

#### **B. Part-time Instructor Equity**

Senator Will Dalrymple will make his presentation at the November 2 meeting.

#### **C. Area D Meeting Update (see Exhibit 7)**

Senate VP Jenny Ferrero asked Senators to review her notes taken from the Area D meeting. She highlighted important areas that she suggested to be reviewed and included important links. She and Versaci are attending plenary at the end of next week. If there are any resolutions that concern Senators or have questions about, please email her and Rocco so they can bring those issues up on the floor at plenary.

#### **D. Governance Structure & Participation Handbook (see Exhibit 8)**

Senate President Versaci announced that governance structure is coming to SPC on November 3. If anyone has any suggestions or comments for that governance structure proposal, let him know and he'll bring them to SPC.

## **REPORTS**

**President (Versaci)** In the past week I attended SPC and SSEC (see reports below).

**SSEC (Versaci)** This Council met on Friday, October 23 (before our 10/26 meeting but after these reports went out).

**SPC (Versaci)** SPC met on Tuesday, October 20. Here were the highlights:

- Several Board Policies and Procedures passed without discussion. These included policies on sexual harassment and occupational safety (separate policies)
- First reading of the Governance Handbook and Governance Structure. Discussion ensued on a variety of topics, including the difference between “governance” and “operational” committees (this issue was raised in regards to how/where the current Council structures might be preserved. The prevailing view was that once the governance committees are established, they will determine what operational committees are needed. Craig Thompson suggested that the future iteration of a “program review” committee should follow the current model of the Curriculum Committee (i.e., largely under faculty purview). Also discussed was the issue of changed/diminished representation on various councils. Teresa Laughlin said that reduced numbers were somewhat mitigated by the new consensus model, which requires 2/3 vote rather than simple majority.
- The District will present its financial update to FCMAT tomorrow (10/21) as a precursor to presenting to the State Board of Governors in November, but the Vice Chancellor for Financial Services suggested that the November presentation be postponed until the District receives significant feedback from the FCMAT team.
- There was much discussion about the college’s vision statement, and some time was spent in small breakout groups discussing the following three questions, the responses to which the writing team will consider as they continue their work:
  - o “What is Palomar’s role in the world? What impact do we want to have on our community?”
  - o “Without revealing *how*, what is Palomar working to accomplish?”
  - o “What words or phrases depict the type of college and the end-goals we seek to achieve?”

**IPC Report (Versaci)** IPC next meets on Wednesday, October 28.

### **SSPC (O’Brien)**

We discussed program called [Name Coach](#) to be used in Canvas. Students would be able to record their preferred name to be used by the instructor. Would assist instructors with pronouncing names.

We reviewed AP 5530 Student Complaints and Grievance. Volunteers will work with Sherry Titus regarding changes before bring back to SSPC.

Student Services Strategic Plan – A new document will align with Strategic Plan, Guided Pathways, Visions for Success etc. VPSS and Dean of Counseling will form a group to develop a long-term Student Success Strategic Plan. Other news:

- DRC will hire two tenure-tracked DRC counselors.
- Transfer Center - in the middle of CSU/UC application period
- Palomar Promise - [Skillshop Workshops](#)
- 2021-2022 Palomar Promise application now available on MyPalomar
- Career Center – promoted Student Lingo
- EOP&S enrollment down 15% workshops focused on mental well-being, more students withdrawing due to online format.
- Proposed Name Change: Palomar College Committee To Combat Hate (PC3H) to Pride Center Committee to Combat Hate
- Financial Aid director interviews happening now
- Heroes Grant spent – 3 million (\$750 per student)
- Counseling working on how-to videos for students

**HRPC** No report.

**FASPC** There are currently two Senate-appointed faculty vacancies on this council.

**PFF (Laughlin)** Zooming into many meetings including:

- Governing Board Meeting: The Governing Board Meeting on 10/13/2020 was, as usual, tense and contentious. There was a civility training, report on the SURPLUS 2020-21 budget, and discussion regarding the Presidential search.
- Campus shared governance meetings:
  - o Budget meetings: We were presented with the adopted, surplus 2020-21 budget. A similar refrain was sung: “we are okay this year, and maybe next year, but we will be in big trouble in the third year.”
  - o The weekly update on the COVID19 situation
  - o Faculty Senate
  - o Benefits

SPC: Here is the agenda of the last meeting: The main topics of discussion were the Governance Structure revision found here:

[https://go.boarddocs.com/ca/pccd/Board.nsf/files/BUFQVJ6B1C8A/\\$file/Draft%20Final%20%5BApril%5D\\_PDF.pdf](https://go.boarddocs.com/ca/pccd/Board.nsf/files/BUFQVJ6B1C8A/$file/Draft%20Final%20%5BApril%5D_PDF.pdf)

- Negotiations: Jenny can tell you more, but the negotiations are pretty frustrating. We are stuck on the academic calendar. The District wants to get rid of the 8 week summer session that follows the first 4 week summer session. This would mean that if students take the first 4 week session, and want to take an additional summer session they would have to have a one week overlap. This would lead to additional stress for students because they would be trying to finish one term and begin another term in the same week. We gave the District three options that would solve the problem, all of which they rejected without a counterproposal.
- Interaction with members: I have had with several meetings with members regarding various concerns about hiring practices, working conditions, and contract interpretation.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder. We are combining with CCE to create a Dash and Bash team called the essentials. My “essentials” photo of “Doctor” Laughlin is below.
- Meetings with Administration: In order to keep the lines of communication open, I have met with various administrators on various topics.
- Food Distribution: Palomar Faculty Federation in association with Council of Classified Educators, North County Labor Alliance, San Diego and Imperial Counties Labor Council, and Feeding San Diego are doing our part to help our community by distributing food periodically. The food distributions follow strict COVID 19 guidelines and are contact-free. The next food distribution is 11/21/2020. We are working to get funding for turkeys this time!
- Working closely with Barbara Baer with COPE and the elections this year.

**Distance Education (Hiro)**

- Online teaching certification - Palomar went from less than 200 to over 600 certified instructors in about 5 months. We have about 200 instructors who are teaching in the spring and aren't certified. We are working on helping them.
- John Harland summarized results from publisher course pack survey given to faculty. The survey found that some faculty use Canvas and course packs while others are unwilling to integrate the publisher course packs to Canvas because Canvas is unreliable and difficult for them. The DE Committee will continue to study this to see how to provide training and advice on this issue.
- Kelly Falcone told the DE Committee that she attended an ACCJC webinar yesterday. Fed regulations for DE have changed. Affects ACCJC expectations for regular and effective content. Now it is being defined in 5 different ways, and at least 2 of 5 must be employed in each DE course. Next webinar in November will cover specific changes.

- Kelly Falcone created a POET discussion board in PD portal, under Communities. The DE committee members encourage everyone to join and contribute.
- Erin Hiro said the DE Committee is exploring whether to become a CVC Home College/Teaching College. She is set to attend an informational meeting about the application process. Erin will bring this issue to the Senate in November
- CCC Tech connect: Zoom will be changed to a “better” Zoom before the end of the year. Appointment booking will be a lot better. Canvas will be integrated with Tech Connect LTI Zoom instead of ConferZoom. But that means faculty members should not create Zoom appointments or meetings for spring semester until after the winter break.
- Alyssa Vafaei from the DRC said they are exploring adding a DRC button to Canvas Courses to help DRC Students.

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** Reports for GP are suspended until the GP Task Force gets up and running. The Senate will put out a call for the at-large faculty members shortly.

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)** P&P next meets on Friday, November 6.

**Budget (Ferreiro)** The Budget Committee next meets on Tuesday, October 27.

**TERB (Lawson)** No report.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** No report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** No report.

**Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett)** No report.

### **Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)**

In September I met with our current credit for prior learning (CPL) faculty to give updates and review the CPL course list webpage. I am currently updating the CPL website with helpful information for students, counselors and faculty.

I continue to work with the student services team on the following:

- Development of a CPL student petition form that is dynamic, workflow-enabled and sends notifications to all parties throughout the process – from the initial meeting with a counselor and petition for CPL, through faculty assessment, to the award of credit on the transcript.
- Transcribing prior learning assessment on a student’s transcript to meet title 5 and ACCJC requirements

I am meeting with counselors to keep them informed on the CPL assessment workflow process and the transfer of CPL credits to the 4-year colleges.

I recently attended the following workshops to learn more about awarding CPL for military training/education and to assist our faculty in this process:

- ACE “Military Training to College Pathways: Giving Credit Where Credit is Due” workshop to learn more about giving credit to military students using ACE (American Council on Education) military recommendations
- Norco Military Articulation Platform (MAP) meeting – learned about the MAP database and how Palomar can use it to help research courses that align with ACE recommendations



I am working with our Computer Science faculty on collaborations with military partners:

- Awarding 22 - 28 units of credit through CPL in the Computer Network Administration with Emphasis: Cisco program to students in the Marine Corps Communications Electronics School who have completed over 600+ hours of training and education
- Providing Marines training for their Intel Data Engineers through our computer science program

So far this semester, individually or as a team, Ben Mudgett and I have presented at 11 different CPL workshops, both regionally and nationally, showcasing the amazing work of Palomar College faculty and staff as the leaders in this initiative for the CCCs and sharing best practices with our colleagues. We have five more workshops scheduled before the end of this year.

I am reaching out to stakeholders and engaging discussions around "Credit by Exam" (CBE) fees at Palomar. As stated in Title 5 55050 (e) CPL:

*While districts may charge a fee for credit by examination, districts should keep student equity in mind when determining fees and ensure fees do not limit access to CPL by placing an undue financial burden on students.*

Things to consider:

- Title 5 states that we cannot charge students fees for the other methods of CPL assessment: military transcripts, industry certificates, portfolio review, AP, IB, CLEP
- Palomar currently charges students the tuition rate for the course when they do CBE - out of state or international students pay the higher tuition rates
- Our current AP5030 on student fees does *not* list credit by exam
- Financial and military aid may not pay for CBE
- CPL faculty are in favor of removing this financial barrier and making CBE equitable to all students
- Other than external exams, CBE is the only CPL method of assessment that is guaranteed to transfer to the CSU/UC at this time – discussions at the state level are taking place regarding CPL and transfer so this may change in the future

ASG (Mouawad) please find below Palomar's Associated Student Government weekly report:

- Movies for Mental Health which occurred on October 9th, from 1-2:30 pm. The outcome was positive, and successful.
- ASG has chosen to support and officially voted on MODEL ONE of the Tutoring Colocation Plan. An official statement from ASG was given, and sent to the Executive team.
- The ASG retreat occurred on October 9th, and was very successful. ASG has started to work on facilitating their goals.
- Our students are currently being placed into various different shared governance committees that Palomar has open to student representation. Marie-Therese Mouawad is now seated in the SPC meeting, and will communicate with the Faculty Senate about relating issues.
- ASG has a new Vice President of Internal Affairs, Abeeha Hussain.
- ASG discussed the future of the virtual Halloween event; more details to follow.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Margaret Faulkner*

Molly Faulkner, Secretary