



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
October 5, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Ellen Weller, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:**

**GUESTS:** Jon Walker, Leigh Marshall, Tracy Fung, Nimoli Madan, Erin Feld, Karl Seiler, Patriceann Mead, Vikash Lakhani

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Senator Anastasia Zavodny made the following statement:

"Last week we passed a motion to be signatories to a letter responding to a newspaper article. While I wholeheartedly support my colleagues, I still feel very strongly that the nature and scope of this motion was incorrect for Senate.

We are now signatories to a letter with no known recipient.

What was the issue we are trying to fix? If it was a show of our solidarity to our fellow faculty, why hasn't this body issued such a resolution or statement?

Our sister college's Academic Senate responded clearly back in Spring: first with a letter directly from their Senate president, then with a special meeting of Senate and a 'resolution of a Declaration that Black lives matter.

It is now October. Why hasn't Palomar done the same? Why is our only response to date to be signatories to an unaddressed rebuttal letter to a newspaper article about our former superintendent? I strongly urge my colleagues to call into reconsideration the motion from last week and to act with a clear resolution in affirmation of support for our colleagues and the greater message that Black lives matter."

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

Senator and Distance Education Coordinator Erin Hiro stated that a form was sent today to all department chairs requesting specific information as to which classes require cameras to be on during online class time next spring. This information will be included in the course descriptions.

Senator and Articulation Officer Ben Mudgett stated that last week CSU and UC announced the exceptions for pass/ no pass are no longer in place past summer 2020. When students are working with faculty for pass/no pass, just be mindful of this and refer to them to a counselor.

Senator Susan Miller announced an event on Wednesday, October 7 hosted by the Gender and Women's Studies Club featuring Olga Diaz. The subject is women in politics. She encouraged Senators to offer attendance as extra credit for student.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES (see Exhibit 1)**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/ Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated September 28, 2020 as amended.

The motion carried.

## **ACTION**

**A. Curriculum (see Exhibit 2)-** Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Wendy Nelson stated that Curriculum has approved 408 courses for DE. If faculty still have courses that need the DE approval or identity from spring and summer or for fall of 20, those need to launch by November 20th. The MOU to pay faculty for that work is complete and the Instruction Office will be processing those payments via a NOHE in the next couple of weeks. Curriculum update deadline for new courses and changes to courses or programs is now October 15. Additional curriculum drop in dates have been added to the calendar. Those dates can be found here: <https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/curriculum/> there is a meeting scheduled for October 23rd for a select number of disciplines to work with CSUSM to essentially create a four-year map for students that will be going to start at Palomar and finish at CSUSM.

**Motion 2** MSC Nelson, W/Hiro

Faculty Senate approval of actions taken by Curriculum on September 30, 2020.

The motion carried.

## **B. Committee Appointments (see Exhibit 3)**

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot for committee election.

Pillar 4 Lead – Sabrina Santiago

The motion carried.

**C. Faculty Senate & Antiracist Activities (see Exhibit 4) -** Senate President Rocco Versaci reviewed the exhibit showing potential antiracist initiatives and proposed actions that can be taken. Versaci suggested creating a Senate subcommittee to take the lead and tasked the Committee on Committees to discuss ideas for who should be on this Senate subcommittee. This subcommittee would include Senators and others on campus. Committee on Committees will bring ideas to Senate next week or the week after. Versaci also wants to create a Senate task force to work on a

support statement for Black Lives Matter for the campus and the creation of antiracist activities. Senator and Chair of Committee on Committees Anastasia Zavodny stated the committee will bring recommendations to Senate hopefully next week.

Several Senators voiced concerns and wanted clarification regarding the support statement or endorsement for Black Lives Matter. Was Faculty Senate supporting the antiracist cause or the organization itself?

**Motion 4** MSC: Thompson/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to form a Senate subcommittee to focus on diversity and equity and to direct Committee on Committees to bring a proposal for such.

The motion carried.

**Motion 5** MSC: Laughlin/Towfiq

Faculty Senate approval to form a Senate task force to discuss framework of an antiracist statement for Faculty Senate to adopt.

Abstention: Lawrence Lawson

The motion carried.

Volunteers for the Senate task force are Lawrence Lawson, Jackie Martin, Sabrina Santiago, Jason Jarvinen and Ben Mudgett.

**D. Diversity in Faculty Hiring (see exhibit 5)**

**Motion 6** MSC: Thompson/Aguilar

Faculty Senate approval to direct Faculty Senate President to write a letter to HR and R&P asking for more detailed information regarding diversity in faculty hiring.

The motion carried.

**Motion 7** MSC: Laughlin/Thompson

Faculty Senate approval to direct Faculty Senate President to take the list of suggestions compiled by Faculty Senate to the subcommittee on diversity hiring that President Kahn is forming and participate in those efforts.

The motion carried.

**Motion 8** MSC: Lawson/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to create a Senate task force to draft a document for department (Chairs) that would solicit diversity hiring information and needs from them; provide a list of suggestions regarding antiracist frameworks and committee formation, job announcement language, interview questions, and teaching demonstrations; and address issues in the hiring practices/procedures of part time instructors.

The motion was withdrawn. Senators suggested that Committee on Committees include these hiring matters in their proposal (see Motion 4).

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

**A. Tutoring CO-Location Proposal (see Exhibit 6)** – Tracy Fung began the presentation by sharing background on the project and proposal. Currently there are three tutoring/learning centers in Languages & Literature; an ESL one, a reading one and a writing center. For the past year, the idea of colocation or consolidation and a desire to reduce costs is something that's been brought forth repeatedly particularly in spring this year. It became a focus and then in early summer a decision was announced that the unit was moving into STAR. More faculty involvement was requested in this process and decision making. An extension of time was granted through this October for a work group to form and meet and then make some options and a proposal. Three options were presented and the work group selected Model 1 for a variety of reasons outlined in the exhibit. The work group has taken their recommendation to the Tutoring Committee who also endorsed Model 1. This model is the most equitable and includes accessible co-location options for tutoring that is closely connected to faculty and instruction with positive impacts on persistence, retention, and completion. Retaining two centers allows students to have more options as well as focused and connected discipline-specific tutoring. A literacy and writing center would provide support for students impacted by AB-705. And Model 1 offers reduced costs and increased apportionment. Senator Jenny Fererro pointed out that there is no longer any sort of budget deficit. Palomar now shows a surplus with an expected surplus next year as well. Granted that surplus is not a lot of money but the motivation for pursuing this type of consolidation to make financial cuts and savings may have changed. Palomar is at a real different place in terms of what everyone thought the budget was. Now we know what the budget is and there's not this need for massive, massive cuts.

This item will be placed back on the agenda for October 12 to accommodate further discussion.

**Motion 9** MSC: Towfiq/Faulkner      Faculty Senate approval to extend the meeting.

Nays: Kelly Falcone

The motion carried.

**B. Faculty Appointments to Grant-Funded & Other Assignments (see exhibit 7)** – Tabled.

**C. Strategic Enrollment Management Plan Summary (see exhibit 8)** – Tabled.

**D. Dance Program Endangerment (see Exhibit 9) - Dance Program Endangerment (see Exhibit 9)** - Patriceann Mead reported that the administration is systematically dismantling the Afro-Cuban/Brazilian Drum and Dance Ensemble (AGOGO) and the World Drum and Dance programs. Their actions include no longer supporting the two-teacher model and reducing the number of live drummers needed. As of 9/11, they have confirmed the change in the policy with no explanation or offering a viable solution that honors the Afro-Cuban/Brazilian traditions or this vital program. This program directly supports cultural diversity and students of color and yet the District is actively destroying this flagship program. The District promotes embracing anti-racism but shutting down this program says quite the opposite. The mission of the world classes/events is to provide a safe, culturally diverse and inclusive community as well as a bridge to the campus to our students of color and our at risk students. It is also a bridge to our General Dance AA/ Certificate and to all of Palomar College. If the two-teacher model is not reinstated, the program will need assistance to find a funding source for both the Musical Director (54 hour per semester ) and a Latin Social dance instructor (54 hours per semester /24 hours in the summer), and assistance to preserve the right to use the accompaniment budget as the program deems necessary. Originally the department was given until fall of 2021 to find solutions to some of the issues but some changes will already go into effect beginning with the spring 2021 semester even though we are currently within budget. Dean Smiley has agreed to meet with VP Sivert to further discuss these matters. The administration wants to look like it is promoting diversity, but they're not willing to fund the classes that actually provide multicultural, multi ethnic cultural experiences as if the only way to learn about another culture is from a textbook. We see this when the scheduling committee schedules lots and lots of euro centric art classes and very few classes that deal with marginalized or Native American cultures. The department is not seeing the District put their money where their mouth is. So if we want to seem diverse, we can talk about it but if we really want to offer equitable and diverse curriculum, that means there are going to be

smaller programs that need support that will continue to have opportunities for people of diverse backgrounds to join. Mead, along with Senators Ellen Weller and Molly Faulkner are hoping that the Senate will come out in support of these smaller but extremely important programs. This item will come back to Senate next week.

## **REPORTS**

**President (Versaci)** - As this was the fifth week of the month, there was a pleasant lull in governance committee meetings, one exception being IPC (see report below).

- The Public Affairs office is working on a series of articles about the various antiracist activities going on around campus, and I was interviewed about this by Tom Pfingsten on Tuesday, September 29.

**SSEC (Versaci)** - There was a special meeting regarding the Student Equity and Achievement (SEA) money and budgeting for tutoring on Wednesday, 9/30. It was attended by me, VP Lakhani, VP Sivert, and Olga Diaz. Olga gave an overview to the funding, and the conversation for most of the meeting focused on the cost of tutoring. I was the lone faculty representative—though an earlier invite included faculty members Leanne Maunu, Rafiki Jenkins, Fari Towfiq, and Cindy Anfinson. I voiced objection to this privately in an email to Vikash and Shayla and then in the meeting itself. My main concern was that those particular faculty members know far better than I what kind of questions to ask and points to make concerning tutoring costs and funding. Some of the specific questions I asked concerned 1) the inclusion of an employee's benefits in the "reassigned time" costs in the tutoring budget and 2) how they were calculating the costs of embedded tutoring. I made (another) request that we include the relevant faculty and a PFF person—Teresa Laughlin or Jenny Fererro—to provide information about how reassigned time is calculated and/or accounted so that we're all in the same room (so to speak) at the same time. This was somewhat resisted, but there was talk of a larger meeting down the line somewhere. Shayla said that she would be discussing the issue of costs with her Deans and the Coordinators (a group that includes some of the faculty members listed above). SSEC will next meet on Friday, October 9.

**SPC (Versaci)** - SPC will next meet on Tuesday, October 6.

### **IPC Report (Versaci)**

- Ben Mudgett announced information about AB 1460, which addresses how the CSUs will include an Ethnic Studies class as a graduation requirement.
- Name changes for two departments were approved; "Multicultural Studies" is now "Ethnic Studies," and "English and Humanities" is now "English, Humanities, and Reading."
- Some concerns were raised during the second reading of AP4120 (program development, revitalization, and discontinuance). Some of these were suggestions for more clear formatting. I shared Lawrence Lawson's concern about non-credit ESL classes and read a statement he prepared. Shayla was going to look at the language again. I also raised the issue of how programs may be "informally" discontinued by eliminating funding or in some crucial way changing the teaching model. Shayla suggested that Section C might address this, but the items in that particular section are part of the process when a program enters its "revitalization" phase, and the cuts/changes I was positing could/would likely happen before a program is even identified as needing to go through this process.
- Some issues were also raised during the second reading of the Strategic Enrollment Management Executive Summary. I relayed the suggestion made at the 9/28 Senate meeting that the specific members of the Enrollment Management Task Force (EMTF) be listed. I also asked a question about the language for the one item under the "Planning Assumptions" (page 10)—"SEM acknowledges that some disciplines, programs, or degrees have unique needs that may necessitate flexible and unique planning, implementation, enrollment, student support, and marketing strategies." Specifically, I asked if the language here could be a little more clear/active in terms of what that means (i.e., "acknowledging" something doesn't mean that special consideration will be enacted). Anastasia

Zavodny raised concerns about the EMTF and its relation to a previous group and its lower number of faculty members as compared to that group. She also asked about the unclear reporting structure. Shayla was going to look into this.

**SSPC (O'Brien)** - No report.

**HRPC** – No report.

**FASPC** - There are currently two Senate-appointed faculty vacancies on this council.

**PFF (Laughlin)** - No report.

**Distance Education (Hiro)** - Three things to know:

- As of Sept. 29, we have 643 people on the list of [Certified Instructors for Online Teaching](#). Of those, 446 are trained in the new POET class. It is not too late to join. Enroll in POET through the PD Portal.
- We are hosting two half-day trainings Oct. 2 and Oct. 16 called POET HAPPY HOUR. The trainings cover accessibility to Canvas Studio to Faculty Showcases. Please consider joining by signing up through the PD Portal.
- The DE Committee is set to meet Oct. 7 at 2 p.m. Everyone is invited. Zoom id: 99578026727 Password: 950357

**Guided Pathways (Nelson)** - No report

**Policies and Procedures (Lawson)** – No Report. Policies and Procedures will meet on Friday, October 2.

**Budget (Ferreiro)** - No report.

**TERB (Lawson)** – No report.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** – No report.

**Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)** – No report.

**ASG (Mouawad)** - No report.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

  
Molly Faulkner, Secretary