



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
September 28, 2020

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Marie-Therese Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Ellen Weller

**GUESTS:** Patriceann Mead, Vikash Lakhani

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** No public comments.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:** Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro reminded faculty that today is the deadline to submit your camera requirements for your sections for spring 2021. All sections of the same class do not have to be uniform. This information will be added to the class notes. For a variety of reasons, there are students who are not going to be able to have their cameras. Having this information readily available to a student when he/she enrolls in a class will hopefully eliminate most issues.

Senator Susan Miller announced she will be conducting a ZOOM session this Thursday, October 1 for pride on LGBTQ candidates running for office in November. She is adding a basic "how to" section for first time voters as well. An information flyer is going out to all faculty today.

Faculty Senate President Rocco Versaci reminded faculty about the two webinars that are going to be on consecutive Fridays starting October 2 regarding diversity and hiring, particularly with the part time faculty pool.

**AGENDA CHANGES:** No agenda changes.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1** MSC: Thompson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated September 21, 2020 as amended (See Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

## **ACTION**

A. **Curriculum** – No actions to approve.

### **B. Committee Appointments**

**Motion 2** MSC: Zavodny/Doyle Bauer Faculty Senate approval to confirm committee appointments (see Exhibit 2).

Professional Development – **Gina Wilson**, Faculty, SBS (20-22)

The motion carried.

**Motion 3** MSC: Zavodny/Laughlin Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot for the Hiring Committee for Director, Information Services (See Exhibit 3).

Hiring Committee, Director Information Services – **Sergio Hernandez**

Due to current policies from Committee on Committees, the winning candidate must receive more than 50% of the vote. Four rounds of voting took place.

The motion carried.

### **C. Guided Pathways Task Force**

**Motion 4** MSC: Thompson/Nelson W. Faculty Senate approval of the Guided Pathways Task Force Governance Structure Group Request Change Form (See Exhibit 4).

The motion carried.

### **D. Response to *San Diego Union Tribune* article**

**Motion 5** MSC: Thompson/Laughlin Faculty Senate approval to be a signatory on the letter responding to *San Diego Union Tribune* (See Exhibit 5).

Nays: Eduardo Aguilar, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Erin Hiro, Lawrence Lawson, Susan Miller, Ben Mudgett, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Anastasia Zavodny

Abstentions: L. Reza Wrathall

Versaci stated that it is still undecided where this response will go or where it will be posted. That discussion becomes more complicated. Groups other than Faculty Senate may make those decisions. Currently, CCE and PFF will be signatories on this letter. Versaci added that he wanted everyone to know that faculty member Hossna Sadat Ahadi's contribution to this response letter was to make sure that there was a part of the letter that talked about what Palomar is doing now and moving forward The CCE Resolution, the Faculty petition that came to Faculty Senate, Faculty Senate's Resolution and the written statement by Rafiki Jenkins made to the Governing Board have all been downloaded to Faculty Senate's media library.

Comments from Senators included we should shift the narrative to the student experience and the work Palomar educators for antiracism are doing to make our students thrive at Palomar College. We have dozens of affinity groups that never existed before. We are challenging our white fragility both interpersonally and as professionals, and as an institution. We are creating brave spaces to nurture courageous change. This isn't about faculty, it's about our students and we owe our students demonstrated action and a critical consciousness to the pervasive systemic racism framework our country's institutions of higher learning were built from and to which we were trained as discipline experts. There is

great respect for the colleagues who put this letter together but with the idea that our colleagues should not have to answer for an institution. This letter is too reactionary and it's delving into the depths of comparison that loses the point. A decision was made that's not coming from the point of faculty or any other group ganging up against an individual without any other racist or sexist or other undertones. The letter doesn't convey that clearly and the current form goes beyond the scope of where Faculty Senate's responsibilities lie. The heart of the idea behind this letter could be supported but that message would be shorter and focused on highlighting a proactive stance and would illustrate that the reasons for the termination of the president were reasons locked behind a court decision

Versaci ended the discussion by stating that signing this letter will not preclude any further statement coming from Faculty Senate.

The motion carried.

## **INFORMATION ITEMS**

**A. Faculty Appointments to Grant-Funded & Other Assignments** (See Exhibit 6) – Senate President Rocco Versaci reported that he along with Senators Fererro, Thompson, and Zavodny met with Vice Presidents Beam (Human Resources), Lakhani (Student Services), and Sivert (Instruction) on Thursday, 9/17 to discuss the issue of Faculty Senate authority in appointing faculty, particularly to grant-funded committees. During the meeting, we requested that they explain how the list of proposals below failed to address their concerns, and there was no response. The administrators brought up three main points to support the District having final say on grant-funded faculty positions: 1) That “Coordinators” do not fall under Title V 53203(f) because there isn't a “group” involved, 2) That if faculty members fail to perform their duties in a grant-funded position, then the District has no recourse, and 3) That District appointment of these positions will eliminate the possibility of #2. No resolution was reached; VP Sivert said that they needed to “regroup” on this and get back to us. Much of the discussion focused on the Umoja Coordinator position (as an example), but VP Sivert stressed that they were interested in the grant-funded positions generally. I have since requested a list of all active grants on campus in order to get a comprehensive understanding of the positions in question, but I have not yet received anything.

Since this meeting, President Kahn contacted Versaci and asked if we would be amiable to us reaching out to ASCCC Executive Council to get guidance on this matter. Versaci reached out to ASCCC this morning and has not yet received a response. Senator Kelly Falcone added that visiting the ASCCC Rostrum page can be helpful. The information can be found here <https://www.asccc.org/content/reassignment>

**B. Faculty Access to Campus** – Senators stated that providing bathroom services to students coming on campus to specifically use Palomar's Wi-Fi has been a sticking point in discussions since day one. Other colleges have remedied this by not allowing students to use the bathrooms on campus. Students could be screened before entering the designated area since they may leave their cars to get out and talk to each other. Faculty and students dealing with complicated labs need a space to set up or other types of complicated instruction really need the equipment located on site. Many students just don't have internet access. Students just want a safe place with Wi-Fi access to do their school work.

**Motion 6** MSC: Thompson/Laughlin

Faculty Senate approval to move back into the Action portion of this meeting.

The motion carried.

**Motion 7** MSC: Laughlin/Nelson W.

Faculty Senate approval to accept and send the following list of “asks” regarding campus access and visits to the District.

Abstentions: Beatrice Manneh, Anastasia Zavodny

- Allow faculty and students to use parking structure and parking lots for Wi-Fi access (Apparently, other schools, like Mira Costa, are doing this).
- Reserve rooms and provide access to equipment for faculty to film videos for their classes. Possibly designate one building (with functioning AC) where classrooms can be used by faculty members to teach synchronously using Zoom and practicing social distancing.
- Better and more responsive system to facilitate requests to access campus, possibly by separating the types of requests, as specified in the following two items.
- Have a default system if simply going to one's office to retrieve items.
- Have a more nuanced, department by department approach to more complicated access requests.

The motion carried.

**C. Faculty Senate & Antiracist** (See Exhibit 7) – Versaci shared exhibit 7 and asked Senators for any additional ideas and initiatives. Senator Eduardo Aguilar mentioned the “San Diego City College Model” that has an established social justice conference in their professional development program. Also, Mira Costa College Academic Senate has a committee called DEqCC. This Diversity, Equity and Cultural Competence Committee (DEqCC) provides faculty resources to increase cultural competence and strive for cultural proficiency. Versaci will add creating a Senate committee to the list of ideas.

Senator Kelly Falcone suggested identifying colleges that have a requirement within their flex calendar requirements to complete diversity, equity inclusion bias type training. For example, San Francisco City College requires two hours for four years (eight hours total) to complete this training that is selected each year by the college. Falcone provided an example of how two students created an Instagram account for students and faculty so they can safely post anonymous stories to be shared. <https://www.instagram.com/blackinpusd/?hl=en>

Senator Wendy Nelson suggested doing a cultural audit of sorts by making sure all of our curriculum adopts a cultural or multicultural content in it. The vast majority of our courses really should be touching these issues as it relates to their discipline.

**D. Diversity in Faculty** (See Exhibit 8) – Versaci shared exhibit 8 reflecting a list of requests and suggestions put forth by faculty to improve diversity in faculty hiring. Some components of the hiring process lie under the Faculty Senate's sphere of influence and not its control, and those portions have been separated out. Several items are in need of more refinement and should be part of a larger discussion and, eventually, an action plan. We need to consider three main questions: 1) What do we need to add and/or refine on this list, 2) Can I take the final list to President Kahn for inclusion in the campus-wide committee he is forming to address the issue of diversity hiring, and 3) How can we turn the items on this list under Faculty control into an Action Plan?

Senator Wendy Nelson suggested that our Communications Dept. (Public Information Office) produce and release content both internally and in the community showing all of the work we are currently doing. This will improve the image of Palomar and attract more students. Also, Palomar is designated as a Hispanic Serving Institution and we do get special funding for this. Nelson also mentioned creating a group, a club or workshops that would encourage our diverse students to become college professors.

Senator Eduardo Aguilar suggested that we initiate a campaign of sorts for Latino students. Many of his Latino students don't really “see” themselves represented on campus. Create murals and other meaningful representations of the Latino life and other cultures here on campus.

Senator Kelly Falcone shared what she read in an ASCCC publication about diversity in faculty hiring that mentioned how the job announcement should include things like sharing our campus culture, what we are proud of, what makes this a great place to work and why it is so vibrant, what our accomplishments are, and our traditions. What do we share in our job announcements to really get people wanting to come and work with for us? And maybe that's something the Senate can do by putting some time into writing that piece.

Senator Adam Meehan shared that just as a kind of informational item that's the idea of disaggregating demographic data comes up several times in accreditation from ACCJC. Going through our report we found that we really have campus wide shortcomings in terms of desegregating data for our various student demographics. I know that's not really something under our purview, but since it's mentioned on our list, it might just be something to be aware of.

**E. BP/AP4021 – Program Development, Revitalization, and/or Discontinuance** (See Exhibit 9) - Senators shared concerns including whether or not this should go through IPC's program review or curriculum, and understanding the difference between 4020 and 4021. All of the steps start with the PRPs through IPC's program review and then curriculum becomes involved. This item is not being voted on at IPC and it still must go through Policies & Procedures before it goes to SPC. Curriculum will again review this item to provide more feedback. Senator Wendy Nelson shared her appreciation that the committee focused more on revitalization and not discontinuance. If a program is struggling, there's quite a bit of time (three year process) and support to help them revitalize and figure out how to move forward.

**F. Strategic Enrollment Management Plan Summary** (See Exhibit 10) – The discussion began with figuring out how this committee was created and who sits on the committee. Senator Erin Hiro who serves on the committee stated the report is very dense and difficult to read. The summary was created to make it easier to understand and she encouraged every Senator to read it. Senator Falcone suggested that task force members' names should appear on the cover to make it easier for faculty to know where to go to ask questions. This item will be discussed at IPC this Wednesday.

## **REPORTS**

### **President (Versaci)**

- Update to the 9/17 meeting about Faculty Senate appointments (attendees: Rocco, Jenny, Craig, Anastasia, VPs Lakhani, Sivert, and Beam). There was little response on the part of the administrators to the document we sent to them ahead of this meeting (Exhibit 5 on the 9/21/20 agenda); during the meeting, we requested that they explain how our list of proposals failed to address their concerns, and there was no response. The administrators brought up three main points to support the District having final say on grant-funded faculty positions: 1) That "Coordinators" do not fall under Title V 53203(f) because there isn't a "group" involved, 2) That if faculty members fail to perform their duties in a grant-funded position, then the District has no recourse, and 3) That District appointment of these positions will eliminate the possibility of #2. No resolution was reached; VP Sivert said that they needed to "regroup" on this and get back to us. Much of the discussion focused on the Umoja Coordinator position (as an example), but VP Sivert stressed that they were interested in the grant-funded positions generally. I have since requested a list of all active grants on campus in order to get a comprehensive understanding of the positions in question, but I have not yet received anything. Another issue that arose is the conflict between the District's "right of assignment" and Title V; specifically, full-time faculty members who cannot teach either face-to-face or online this semester have been given "special projects," and in at least one case, a faculty member has been assigned a position that under normal circumstances would have come through the Senate for appointment. In response to our growing concerns about these instances, President Kahn reached out to me, and he proposed that the two of us draft a letter to the ASCCC requesting some guidance on the issue. I agreed, and we will be working on this.
- I have been working with Alex Doyle Bauer to create and organize a space on the Library website to house the antiracist teaching materials that faculty members have been sending me. We hope to unveil something in the next two weeks.

**SSEC (Versaci)** - SSEC will next meet on Friday, October 9.

**SPC (Versaci)** - SPC will next meet on Tuesday, October 6.

### **IPC Report (Versaci)**

- Dean Fabienne Chauderlot replaced Dean Pearl Ly as Chair of the IPC New Programs Subcommittee
- There was some discussion about BP/AP 4021 – Program Development Review, Revitalization, and/or Discontinuance. These policies were crafted by VP Sivert and a team of faculty that included Travis Ritt, Jackie Martin, Craig Thompson, Rocco Versaci, Wendy Nelson, and Ben Mudgett. Kelly Falcone raised the question of whether this overlaps with BP 4020, which also mentions program development; VP Sivert will research this and report back to IPC. This pair of documents appears on the 9/28/20 Senate agenda (Information Item E) and will eventually head to Policies and Procedure, likely in October.
- There was discussion about the Strategic Enrollment Management Plan Executive Summary (Information Item F on the 9/28/20 Senate agenda). There was some discussion of how this plan overlapped with the Guided Pathways action plans. There was also a question about the authors of this summary; in particular, the relationship between the “old” enrollment task force (which contained several faculty, including a Co-Chair), and this “new” group, which VP Sivert said contained a cross section of groups from across the college).
- Student Services continues to work on the “Waitlist/Permission Code Project,” and will be meeting later this month.
- Plans continue for the SDSU/RBEC “microsite” for programs in Administration of Justice and Speech (see IPC report from 9/14/20).
- A process was discussed for departments wishing to change their name. A streamlined process involving the relevant Chair & Dean, the Articulation Officer, and IPC was discussed. The main issues involved making sure that the name change did not infringe upon other campus departments or create articulation problems. Also enumerated were the many operational changes (e.g., renaming budget strings, changing letterhead, etc.) that would result. Discussion ensued about voluntary department and/or discipline mergers (focusing on a proposal by Philosophy and Religious Studies to merge), but the group decided that more information was needed before proceeding.

### **SSPC (O’Brien)**

The council welcomed the new Dean of Counseling, Leslie Salas.

1<sup>st</sup> Reading: Change the co-chair of Behavioral Health Committee from the Dean of Counseling to the Assistant Director, Behavioral Health Counseling Services.

Council reviewed the current 14-page Strategic Enrollment Management (SEM) Plan.

Comments included:

- VPS Goal 2 Transfer: Increase from 1629 to 1872 students who will transfer to UC or CSU is dependent on UC and CSU accepting our students.
- Several members commented that we need to include how we will achieve the goals of the SEM operationally (funding sources, operational objectives, etc.).
- Why are undocumented students not listed as DI group (AB 705 not an accurate count)
- The average number of units earned for Palomar students who complete an associate degree is not 88 units. Per Mike Large, it is in the low 90’s.
- I expressed that several faculty members on the Faculty Senate raised a concern about the impact Guided Pathways would have on course offerings. A member of the council responded those faculty members are in the minority.
- A faculty member raised a concern about one of the assumptions on page 10 - “SEM acknowledges that some disciplines, programs, or degrees have unique needs that may necessitate flexible and unique planning, implementation, enrollment, student support, and marketing strategies.” They felt that is should be more explicit about the impact this will have on programs and courses.
- The group did not know how many faculty members were on the SEM Team or SEM task force.
- Several members expressed that retention and completion should have higher priority than marketing and recruitment.

**HRPC** – No report.

**FASPC** – There are currently two Senate-appointed faculty vacancies on this council.

### **PFF (Laughlin)**

Being in the Zoom world is surreal. The days have melted into one another as have the endless meeting. In the time since the Faculty Senate meeting I have been representing Faculty at various Zoom meetings including:

- Governing Board Meetings: I attended the regularly scheduled and special Board Meeting in September. Tuesday's Board Meetings was shockingly quick, only ½ hour!!!
- Campus shared governance meetings:
  - o Budget meetings: Guess what?! We know are showing a \$142,000 **surplus** for 2019-2020 with the \$5 million loan from Fund 69. It is complicated by the fact we also paid into fund 69 approximately \$3 million. I have asked what the net effect is, but have not received a clear answer. The explanation for the large swing in the 2019-20 budget is that they have tightened up budget practices, but I think it is clear the District over budgeted by about \$5- \$6 million. We also have a balanced budget for 2020-21. The story is, as always, "this year we are okay, but NEXT year we will have problems."
  - o The weekly update on the COVID19 situation
  - o Faculty Senate
  - o Human Resource Planning Council
  - o SPC
- Negotiations: We continue to negotiate MOUs that are directly or indirectly associated with the COVID 19 pandemic. Things have slowed down a little now that the big Health Care push is done.
- Interaction with members: I have had with several meetings with members regarding various concerns about hiring practices, working conditions, and contract interpretation.
- Interaction with our CCE colleagues: We stay in close communication with our brothers and sisters in the CCE. We stand shoulder to shoulder.
- Meetings with Administration: In order to keep the lines of communication open, I have met with various administrators on various topics, mostly COVID related and the access to the campus.
- Food Distribution: Palomar Faculty Federation in association with Council of Classified Educators, North County Labor Alliance, San Diego and Imperial Counties Labor Council, and Feeding San Diego are doing our part to help our community by distributing food periodically. The food distributions follow strict COVID 19 guidelines and are contact-free. We have one this weekend. Spread the word!
- Working closely with Barbara with COPE and the elections this year.

Keep on keeping on! Stay safe!

### **Distance Education (Hiro)**

The DE Committee is set to meet Oct. 7 2:30 to 4 p.m. Zoom

Meeting: <https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/99578026727?pwd=QXR5RUNoRUY0OFIqRVZCY1lwLzJQQT09>

Password: 950357.

Until then, we have three fliers with important information.

- Flier #1: POET Zoom Session – The DE Committee is hosting daily help sessions for any online teaching or Zoom questions. All faculty are invited to drop into the Zoom meeting for help or inspiration.
- Flier #2: POET Happy Hour – The DE Committee is hosting two, half-day Distance Education training events called Friday Happy Hours. Each will offer a variety of online teacher trainings and collaboration.
- Flier #3: Palomar College Class Formats -- We have finalized the online class format options for next spring. The information on this flier will be emailed to faculty next week.

### **Guided Pathways (Nelson)** - No report

### **Policies and Procedures (Lawson)**

Senator Lawson (Senate Rep) and Senator Ferrero (alternate) attended September's P&P meeting. The other Senate Rep was not in attendance. Policies and Procedures next meets on Friday, October 2.

### **Budget (Ferrerro)**

The Budget Committee met on 9/22. We were presented with a rundown of the FY 19/20 Closing Budget, which currently shows total revenues of \$142.5 million and total expenditures of \$142.3 million, which means we have a surplus instead of facing a multi-million dollar deficit as anticipated. While expressing appreciation for all of the cuts made by all employee groups, the Fiscal Services department was quick to temper excitement, pointing out that energy credits for the closed campuses, over budgeting, underestimations of savings, and other unusual circumstances contributed to this situation. We were also given a presentation on the FY 20/21 Budget. We are entering the year with a balanced budget. Estimated revenues are \$130.9 million, and estimated expenditures are \$132.9 million, for an anticipated deficit of around \$2 million. There is a plan to work in adjustments to address the deficit- some will be one-time (ex: reducing hourly police), some are ongoing (ex: energy savings and reorgs), resulting in an expected surplus next year as well.

### **TERB (Lawson)**

Information emails have been sent out to the campus regarding evaluation procedures. The next TERB meeting is Monday, September 28.

**Professional Development (Falcone)** No report.

### **Sabbatical Leave (Lawson)**

We are currently reviewing Sabbatical Reports from AY 19-20. There have been some amazing, professional, and beneficial (to students, programs, departments, and [therefore] the District) projects coming through the committee for approval. Senator Lawson encourages you to view them when they are public.

### **ASG (Mouawad)**

- Movies for Mental Health is happening the first week of October—dates have yet to be confirmed.
- The ASG retreat had to be moved to a different date due to the district holiday on September 25<sup>th</sup>, 2020. The retreat date will be confirmed come our October meeting.
- Our students are currently being placed into various different shared governance committees that Palomar has open to student representation. We appreciate your support as we work on establishing our new ASG board.
- ASG continues to work closely with compiling data regarding Prop M and the future of user groups and the LL building. More details to follow.
- ASG is currently hosting a virtual talent show headed by our Vice President of Communications, Carissa Anderson. More details to follow.

### **ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 PM.

*Margaret Faulkner*

Respectfully submitted,

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary