



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
September 23, 2019

APPROVED

- PRESENT: Richard Albistegui-Dubois, José Briceño, Melinda Carrillo, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Jenny Ferrero, Erin Hiro, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Adam Meehan, Wendy Nelson, Patrick O'Brien, Lillian Payn, Travis Ritt, Julia Robinson, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Lori Waite, Anastasia Zavodny
- ABSENT: Jackie Martin, Chris Sinnott
- GUESTS: Remy Arnold (ASG), Madelyn Byrne (Faculty), Lacey Craft (Faculty), Rafiki Jenkins (Faculty), Barbara Kelber (Faculty), Sage Kerr, Patriceann Mead (Faculty), John Russell (Faculty), Linus Smith (ASG), Susan Snow (Faculty), Jonathon Walker, Ellen Weller (Faculty) Justin Enriquez (Telescope) Lesley Blankenship-Williams (Faculty)

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Senate President Craig Thompson, at 2:30 p.m. in room SU-30.

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

**Motion 1** MSC Laughlin/Towfiq: Faculty Senate approval of minutes of September 16, 2019 (Exhibit I), as amended.

Senators shared suggestions to change minutes to reflect more discussions that occur, and addressed formatting and agenda changes. To be more respectful of meeting time, Senator Wendy Nelson and Senate President Craig Thompson asked senators to review minutes upon receipt and share suggested revisions with Secretary Erin Hiro prior to the meeting.

The motion carried. Abstentions: Julia Robinson

II. PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Dr. Barbara Kelber began her comment by reminding senators of the faculty's role at the College. Dr. Rafiki Jenkins provided a handout containing the Preamble of the Constitution of the Faculty of Palomar College and Article 4/Section 10: Opinion Polling (Exhibit II). While reading Subsection II, Article 4/Section 10, Dr. Kelber distributed a petition with 40 names, more than 10% of full-time, tenured faculty members, to the Faculty Senate related to the Superintendent/President's job performance (Exhibit III). She requested Faculty Senate to conduct a poll of full-time faculty to gauge the level of confidence in the Superintendent/President's leadership. Dr. Kelber and Dr. Jenkins both stated that this action was not easy, not something they sought, nor something they take any pleasure in doing. But it felt necessary and right to

do. Dr. Jenkins added that he was in a position where he could take action while knowing that others cannot.

### III. ANNOUNCEMENTS:

- Senator Anastasia Zavodny stated that the Faculty Senate meeting agendas and minutes have not been circulating to faculty or the public nor have the minutes been posted in a public place. President Thompson stated that changes are being implemented to ensure compliance with the rules.
- President Thompson announced that Senator Steve Perry, who also serves as the Distance Education Coordinator, has resigned from Faculty Senate effective immediately. Senator Perry's request for a motion to add a permanent Library position to the DE committee's membership will be moved to Action at the next Faculty Senate meeting.

### IV. AGENDA CHANGES:

None noted.

### V. ACTION:

**Motion 2** MSC Ferrero/Towfiq: Faculty Senate approval to move petition presented by Dr. Barbara Kelber and Dr. Rafiki Jenkins during public comment today to an action item at today's meeting.

President Thompson stated that in order to move this item to action, we must have two-thirds approval.

The motion carried. Nays: Hiro

**Motion 3** MSC Ferrero/Lawson: Faculty Senate approval to discuss the petition presented by Dr. Barbara Kelber and Dr. Rafiki Jenkins.

Senator Ferrero, Chair for Elections Committee stated that the Faculty Senate Constitution directs its Committee on Elections to conduct a poll of all full-time and probationary faculty. After a brief discussion, consensus was to move forward.

The motion carried.

**Motion 4** MSC Laughlin/Towfiq: Faculty Senate approval to conduct an opinion poll using a double-envelope ballot method with a neutral third-party present during the count.

Senator Richard Albistegui-Dubois questioned why an electronic vote can't be used. Senator Laughlin explained that the electronic vote isn't really anonymous and the double-envelope method preserves anonymity. Faculty Patriceann Mead suggested that timely notice be given to faculty to inform them that this poll is being conducted. Senator Rocco Versaci encouraged President Thompson to list the agenda item specifically as a "Vote of No Confidence" and as an information item so the matter can be discussed at the September 30 Faculty Senate. Senator Travis Ritt clarified the reporting requirement by stating that since this item went to Action today, the matter will be reported out via the Motions document, which gets emailed to Faculty on September 25. This fulfills the requirements stated in the Constitution. Senator Laughlin suggested that President Thompson write a letter to faculty informing them of this action. She finished by stating we can list "A Vote of No Confidence" as an Information item for the September 30 meeting.

The motion carried. Nays: Ferrero

**Motion 5** MSC Ritt/Lawson: Faculty Senate approval to send out poll by October 7, and request that responses be collected by Oct. 21

It was noted that the faculty vote can be sent on to the Governing Board. Faculty senators said the internal timeline for this matter should be coordinated with the Governing Board schedule so that the item can properly appear on the Governing Board agenda in November.

The motion carried.

**Motion 6** MSC Laughlin/Lawson: Faculty Senate approval to place a discussion item regarding the language for the poll as an Action item on the September 30, 2019 Faculty Senate meeting agenda.

Senator Ritt recommended that the starting language for the poll should come from the language used in the petition.

The motion carried.

A. Committee Appointments/Elections:

a. Confirmations:

**Motion 7** MSC Zavodny/Laughlin: Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmations.

Regarding the confirmation document provided by Senator Zavodny (Exhibit IV), Senator Ferrero questioned if Karmi Minor-Flores was tenured faculty and stated that the candidate must be tenured to serve on the Sabbatical Leave Committee. A subsequent motion (Motion 8) was made to split the vote so other committee confirmations could be voted upon. Committee confirmations are as follows:

AB705 Support Committee – Barb Kelber (Faculty, Counseling)  
Campus Police Committee – Jim Gilardi (Faculty, request for a counselor, 19-21)  
Campus Police Committee – Lisa Casas (Faculty, request for a counselor, 18-20)  
Curriculum – James Eighmey (Faculty, SBS, 19-22)  
Food Services Subcommittee – Cindy Torgison (Faculty, AMBA, 19-21)  
Instructional Planning Council – Anastasia Zavodny (Faculty, SBS, 18-20)  
International Education Committee – Lawrence Lawson (Faculty, ESL, 19-21)  
Student Program Eligibility Appeals Committee – Trong Nguyen (Faculty, EOP&S Counselor, 19-21)

The motion carried.

**Motion 8** MSC Towfiq/Lawson: Faculty Senate approval to split the confirmation votes to include all confirmations except confirmation for Karmi Minor-Flores.

The motion carried.

**Motion 9** MSC Zavodny/Laughlin: Faculty Senate approval of committee confirmation for the following only:

Sabbatical Leave Committee - Karmi Minor-Flores (Faculty, Student Services, 19-22)

The motion failed.

b. Elections:

None noted.

(I.B.6, I.B.7, I.B.8, I.B.9)

- B. Curriculum: Senator Wendy Nelson presented Curriculum Committee Actions taken on September 18, 2019 (Exhibit V).

**Motion 10** MSC Nelson/Laughlin: Faculty Senate approval of actions taken by the Curriculum Committee on September 18, 2019.

The motion carried.  
(I.C.3, I.C.4, I.C.5)

- C. Equivalency Forms: Senator Fari Towfiq circulated a revised equivalency form (Exhibit VI) for review. She suggested adding "Degree Title" after the word Majors on the form.

**Motion 11** MSC Ritt/Nelson: Faculty Senate approval of the equivalency form as amended by Senator Towfiq.

The motion carried.

Other Action:

**Motion 12** MSC Zavodny/Lawrence: Faculty Senate approval of newly amended Faculty Senate meeting minutes of September 9, 2019.

Senator Zavodny requested amending the minutes to reflect her inquiry made during meeting announcements regarding Council's meeting location change without proper notice. The current minutes reflect this issue as being addressed during President Thompson's report instead of Senator Zavodny's inquiry during Announcements. President Thompson called for a vote and stated that any approved minute changes must have two-thirds approval.

The motion carried.

## VI. INFORMATION ITEMS:

- A. Class Cancellation Policy: Professor Ellen Weller introduced fellow Performing Arts colleagues in attendance and presented an excerpt from a letter (Exhibit VII) sent to the dean and vice president regarding Performing Arts class cancellations. She said critical program class cuts were made even with the program increasing enrollment by 10 percent year after year. She referenced the union contract that discussed class cuts but said an administrator may choose not to cancel a class if the class is a program requirement, if the class is only offered once a year or if it is a single section. Weller said that all those requirements were met, but the Theory 3 class was cut anyway. That cut means the Theory 4 class won't have the enrollment next semester and cuts the number of student completers. The department faculty members are nervous because this will affect their overall completion rates in an already-small program. Weller stated they met with their dean to discuss this matter. They also requested a meeting with the vice president. Vice President Jack Kahn suggested they revisit the issue with the dean. An additional meeting is calendared with the dean so they can share their concerns about the process of the scheduling committee. Weller inquired if this was happening across all programs and is looking for concrete guidelines about efforts in scheduling program classes. Senator Zavodny inquired whether the Faculty Senate can make some type of formal statement regarding this policy. Faculty Patriceann Mead added that Vice President Kahn does have latitude when making these decisions and this flexibility is clearly stated in the contract. Mead added that these decisions create a three- or four-year track instead of a two-year track for students. Faculty Susan Snow stated that the word gets out among students that degrees can't be completed at Palomar College. Senator Rocco Versaci stated that this is happening

across all programs due to the new efficiency scheduling and the district is contracting the schedule before the classes are being offered. Senator Wendy Nelson stated that information from an ADAstra report has recommended we add more classes in the future. Faculty Madelyn Byrne said that historically there was more consultation with faculty when classes were being cut from the schedule. In closing, she asked what faculty should tell the students when their classes are cut.

B. Constitutional Review Committee: Tabled.

C. Professional Development Coordinator Assignment Changes: Senator Fererro announced that the District presented PFF with a proposal to change the Professional Development Coordinator from a rotating faculty position with release time to a permanent faculty position that would be hired solely and specifically to be the PD coordinator, similar to our current structure for Articulation Officer. Fererro requested faculty input on this change. Concerns with the proposal that were raised include the cost of hiring a new, full-time faculty member specifically for PD and losing a rotating faculty leadership position. Senators pointed out that PD does have different skills that can be difficult for someone to master in a short time but the skills are not as specialized as those of the Articulation Officer. Fererro added that the District stated one of the justifications for their proposal is the increasing number of colleges that are hiring permanent PD Coordinators. Senator Nelson shared feedback that she gained from communicating with the current faculty PD Coordinator, Dr. Kelly Falcone. Some of that feedback included the need for specialized skill sets, the lack of alignment with the NCHCA Coordinator position (a rotated position that does not currently align with the terms for Palomar's PD Coordinator), and the trend of other local colleges such as SD City and Mesa hiring permanent PD Coordinators. The PD Coordinator currently receives a summer stipend, although compensation is not commensurate with the summer workload. There was consensus that making the PD Coordinator position an 11-month position makes sense given the year-round, all-college nature of our PD program. Senator Lawson, who serves as TERB Coordinator, pointed out that the District declined the PFF's proposal to make the TERB Coordinator an 11-month position due to the large summer workload required. He asked that if there is consideration for a full-time PD Coordinator then there should also be consideration for a full-time TERB Coordinator since the arguments for a full-time TERB Coordinator are similar. Senator Towfiq commented that she supports a proposal to keep the positions as rotating but with a longer, 11-month term as the rotation adds diversity to the program. Senator Laughlin believes the current format encourages faculty to enter leadership positions and gain valuable administrative and leadership experience. Senator O'Brien said he supports the current format because it allows for flexibility and competition for the position. Senator Fererro took a straw poll asking Senators to choose to keep the position as is or to move to a full-time position. The consensus was that Faculty Senate wanted Fererro to go back to the table and ask for longer terms for both PD and TERB positions instead of a permanent PD position.

D. Administrators in "Acting" Positions: Tabled.

E. Committees: Tabled.

F. Policies and Procedures: Tabled.

G. Webpage Workgroup: Tabled.

VII. REPORTS:

A. Senate President: Tabled

B. Planning Council Reports: Tabled

C. Palomar Faculty Federation: Tabled

- D. ASG: ASG Representative Remy Arnold stated that ASG recently discussed its goals. They will begin to recognize pronouns that people want to use for themselves. They are asking senators to become an ally of their effort by adding their preferred pronoun at the end of their own email signature.
- E. Guided Pathways: Tabled.
- F. Accreditation: Tabled.
- G. Senate Committee Reports: Tabled.
- H. Other Reports: Regarding the VPHRS Committee, Senator Zavodny announced she put forward the name of Counselor Elizabeth Stephens to join the committee and was immediately told no by the Human Resources Department because Stephens is a part-time faculty member and there is no funding to pay her. Zavodny said she pushed back to find out if the counseling department had any available funding and was told that all funding had been allocated. Full-time faculty are not paid separately for hiring committee participation because it is considered part of their contract and institutional responsibility. Zavodny said she was told that the district would be in violation of the Fair Labor FLSA if the part-time faculty member served without pay. Zavodny said the claim was that all part-time faculty are getting NOHE for this work, which does not appear to be true. She then asked if it can be completed under Professional Development and their reply was no. She providing information confirming that PD can be applied. Zavodny said she is now waiting for approval from the VP as Stephens does meet all the criteria.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 3:58 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Erin Hiro, Secretary