



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
February 1, 2016

APPROVED

PRESENT: Richard Albistegui-Dubois, Melinda Carrillo, April Cunningham, Jenny Ferrero, Joel Glassman, Sergio Hernandez, Teresa Laughlin, Shannon Lienhart, Jackie Martin, Pam McDonough, Lillian Payn, Travis Ritt, Seth San Juan, Fari Towfiq

ABSENT: Greg Larson

GUESTS: Marty Furch

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by the Vice President, Jackie Martin, at 2:00 p.m. in Room SU-30.

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

Approval of Minutes:

Motion 1 MSC Laughlin, Ritt: Faculty Senate approval of the minutes of January 25, 2016, as amended. The motion carried. Abstention: Hernandez

Public Comment: There were no public comments.

Announcements: Fari Towfiq shared data from Math Course Pass Rates & Retention Rates from 2009, 2010, and 2011 as follow-up information from discussion at last week's meeting regarding online tutoring. Although the information included useful statistical data, it is hoped that the pilot project with NetTutor will provide more in-depth information on usage from students such as the preferred time of day for certain courses, and for which classes students are utilizing the service.

Senators discussed the recent number of interim positions and how those appointments were made. There was reference to Board Policy and Ed Code which requires that these positions, even those that are interim, be opened for a full and open recruitment process that utilizes the permanent hiring processes. There are also limitations on the length of time these positions can be filled by an interim.

Learning Outcomes
Council:

Marty Furch thanked April Cunningham for her recent report to the Senate on Dashboard, a program created a few years ago in response to the assessment of the Information Literacy ILO. An ongoing challenge is measuring the effectiveness of the Dashboard lessons for students. There is now a log-in through Blackboard to access it under the "Organization" tab. Students can now self-enroll into the Dashboard and utilize the service at their own pace.

Members of the Learning Outcomes Council (LOC) have assessed the Quantitative Literacy ILO and now a workgroup will be producing learning modules or tutorials similar to the Dashboard model which will be content-specific for quantitative literacy. Digital Literacy is being assessed this semester, with course sections being randomly selected for participation. Students will be directed to a website where the organization Northstar will provide the assessment tools.

Furch stated that on Friday, February 5 she will be meeting with SLO facilitators to assure that the process will go smoothly this semester. A workgroup from the LOC is beginning their review of those reports from the SLO facilitators to assure that the database is working for the department and to address any current or future needs.

Senators discussed the utilization of Northstar, with some expressing concern about paying an outside source to compile student data. Jackie Martin indicated that after much discussion and attempts to create our own assessment, the LOC determined that it could be cost-effective to utilize Northstar. One Senator noted the outsourcing of student services can potentially have an eroding effect on instructional teaching, and campus-wide conversations need to be ongoing to assure open communication and that there is faculty support. Lengthy discussion followed and Marty Furch shared additional information on how the assessment will occur with faculty who are randomly chosen to participate. The participating faculty member will then direct their students through the process, utilizing whatever motivation method they choose. After the students complete the assignment they are given a survey conducted by the faculty member. The assessment data is compiled by Northstar and sent to our Research and Planning, who will analyze the data. Marty Furch noted the challenges faced by the district when assessing students for digital information literacy as a general education institutional outcome rather than as a placement tool.

Governing Board:

Shannon Lienhart reported that the district is conducting a national search for consultants to assist in the hiring of the next Superintendent/President. 27 were targeted for consideration, and 4 applicants responded, one of which was rejected previously. One Senator also noted the timeline being proposed by the Governing Board has the candidate forums scheduled for June when the faculty are not on contract.

Interim President
Gonzales:

Jackie Martin indicated that she and Greg Larson met with Adrian Gonzales on Thursday, January 28. Discussion focused on the composition of the Presidential Hiring Committee and the proposed reduction in the number of faculty in the membership. Martin and Larson emphasized to Gonzales the Senate's recommendation that divisional representation is necessary to represent all faculty.

There was also discussion at that meeting on the recent interim hires and the lack of a participatory hiring process. The process used to fill interim positions should parallel what is used to fill permanent positions according to the district's current policy, though that process was not followed for all interim positions.

Palomar Faculty
Federation (PFF):

Members of PFF are currently discussing the issue of administrative overreach on faculty evaluations. For probationary faculty in their first year of the evaluation process, there seems to be a new "requirement" to avoid "high professional standard" as an overall rating, though there have been exceptions made at the discretion of the Vice President for Instruction. This mandate from the VPI is outside the evaluation process approved

through shared governance, and at times has counteracted the wishes of the faculty evaluation committees.

Teresa Laughlin added that faculty and staff have received their retroactive pay adjustment in their January paycheck.

Student Services
Planning Council:

April Cunningham stated that members of the Student Services Planning Council continued their review of Student Services Program Reviews at their last meeting. Adrian Gonzales shared information on areas and issues that will be focused on this semester.

Academic Technology:

Lillian Payn was saddened to announce that Michael Bartulis passed away 22 January, 2016. Mike was a dedicated, consistent, and sincere member of the Academic Technology Committee and had served on the committee for over 5 years. He also was one of the developers of the Palomar Online Education Training, and the final version that ATC continues to deliver for faculty training reflects Mike's contributions.

POET Stats: 108 total trained to date (since Jan 2012)
includes 27 external certificates
17 trained this academic year to date
(14 Fall, 2015, and 3 January, 2016)

Streaming Server Update:

To comply with the TEACH Act and place media on our new Kaltura server, we have a new procedure to follow. Please note that the old server will be erased and taken out of service. The media on that server will not be copied to the new server. Please see the link for the steps to follow to add media to the server:

<http://www2.palomar.edu/pages/atrc/files/2016/01/StreamingMediaServerWorkflowProcess.pdf>

Please note that materials that you have created are yours and are protected by copyright laws, even if you do not register them. Any media that you did not produce are subject to copyright laws and must comply with the TEACH Act. To begin the process, you must complete the online Academic Technology Resource Center (ATRC) TEACH Act Compliance Checklist Form in order to have media placed on the new Streaming Media Server using this link:

<https://www2.palomar.edu/pages/atrc/faculty-services/streaming-media/streaming-media-submission-form/>.

Because this will be labor-intensive, we are asking faculty to fill out the forms and then submit their media as soon as possible so there is no disruption in availability of media for classes. (Also, please note that the hard copy of the media will not be returned, but will become permanently shelved in the library, in accordance with the TEACH Act.)

Committee
Appointments:

Motion 2

MSC Ritt, Towfiq: Faculty Senate approval of the following committee appointments:

Tenure & Evaluations Review Board (TERB)
(15-17) Deborah Paes de Barros (FT) English

Curriculum

(13-16) Jim Eighmey (FT) Anthropology

Human Resources Services Planning Council

(14-16) Patrick Obrien (FT) Counseling

Policy and Procedures

(14-16) April Cunningham (FT) Library

Service Learning

(15-17) Michael Hernandez (FT) Art

North County Higher Education Alliance (NCHEA)

(14-16) Robert Chamberlain (PT) Business Admin

The motion carried.

Curriculum:

Motion 3

MSC Fererro, Laughlin: Faculty Senate ratification of the Curriculum Committee Action items dated December 16, 2015, and January 20, 2016. The motion carried.

Jenny Fererro noted the large number of courses going through with a non-faculty member as the originator are because they are apprenticeship courses for which there is no faculty member.

Student Services
Planning Council
Composition:

There was no report.

Presidential Search
Process and
Committee
Composition:

Some members of the PFF and the Senate Faculty Council are meeting with Adrian Gonzales to discuss the Presidential Search Committee composition. The last committee included 12 faculty members, 9 appointed by the Faculty Senate: 7 full-time, 2 part-time; and 3 appointed by the PFF.

The Senate has expressed their support for the current structure to remain in place for this search as well, noting that the process was collegial and productive.

Hiring Process
for Deans:

This item was discussed earlier in the meeting. Shannon Lienhart asked Senate members to refer to the district's current [Recruitment and Hiring Procedure](http://www.redwoods.edu/HumanResources/EmploymentManual/EM/Title5Sec53021.PDF), as well as Ed Code: <http://www.redwoods.edu/HumanResources/EmploymentManual/EM/Title5Sec53021.PDF>

There was agreement that the Senate should bring forth a formal resolution on this issue. This item will be brought back for Faculty Senate Action at next week's meeting.

Student Success
and Equity Council
Activities:

Copies of a document from the Community College Research Center, *Redesigning Community Colleges for Student Success, Overview of the Guided Pathways Approach*, were distributed. Jackie Martin asked Senate members to review the document and it will remain on the Agenda for further discussion at next week's meeting.

TERB Report:

A copy of a letter sent by Barb Kelber to the Tenure & Evaluations Review Board (TERB), the Faculty Senate, and the Palomar Faculty Federation, was shared for information:

January 22, 2016

To: Tenure & Evaluations Review Board
Faculty Senate
Palomar Faculty Federation

From: Barb Neault Kelber, Professor of English

During my six years as the Tenure & Evaluations Coordinator, I reported regularly to the groups addressed here. This final report is focused particularly on the most recent semester, during which I observed a fundamental shift in the administrative approach to Probationary Faculty evaluations. This shift was precipitated by the attitude and actions of the interim Vice President for Instruction, and I view it as a cause for grave concern. During the fall semester, I discussed this concern in meetings of the TERB, in the Faculty Senate, and in a meeting with administrators. I have taken it up many times directly with the interim VP for Instruction.

Article 17 of the Faculty Contract outlines the role of the TERB Coordinator and the process and protocols for faculty evaluations. These matters are negotiated, and TERB is given responsibility for maintaining fair and consistent practices. Fairness and consistency depend a great deal upon knowledge and direct experience, and I am confident in stating that my knowledge and experience absolutely inform my concerns here.

The attitude and actions of the interim VP for Instruction revealed a serious disregard for our negotiated process and protocols. In a semester when the college faced major instability and intense change, the VPI's approach was often out of compliance with Article 17 and consistently disrespectful of the nature of this essential element: "Faculty Review shall be the primary feature of the evaluation process" (Article 17.1.9).

The result of the erosion of the last semester is a damaged process and an uncertain future. Although I've tried to be relatively brief here, I am certainly willing to provide more details if they are needed by any group who seeks them. In reporting these concerns, I take full responsibility for bringing them forward and for supporting any action required to reverse the damage that has been done.

I am committed to protecting the confidentiality of all faculty members, and I do not intend to address specific cases. With that in mind, I ask that you acknowledge my concerns as they relate to serious signs of a systemic, fundamental shift in roles and process. This shift threatens to undermine the core principles of the faculty's assigned role in Peer Review, principles grounded in our classrooms, in subject matter expertise, and in our commitment to authentic student success.

It was my distinct honor to serve the college for six years as the Tenure & Evaluations Coordinator, and I have given a great deal of thought to the question of whether I should have written this at all, but I could not in good conscience leave my post without reporting responsibly, as I am required to do.

Senators discussed the memorandum, and Barb Kelber's efforts to work with administration during her service as the TERB Coordinator.

After brief discussion, Senators agreed that the Faculty Senate would like to support the PFF in their efforts to protect faculty purview as they communicate concerns to the district regarding matters relating to tenure being a mandatory subject of bargaining. This item will be placed on the Senate Agenda under Action at next week's meeting.

ASCCC Diversity
Award Nomination:

On November 16, 2015, Senators approved the letter of application for the Regina Stanback-Stroud Diversity Award. Greg Larson will be sending that letter to the State Academic Senate early next week.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 3:27 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jenny Fererro, Secretary