



**REGULAR MEETING**

**February 6, 2023**

**EXHIBITS**



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
January 30, 2023

APPROVED

**PRESENT:** Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone (ZOOM), Jenny Fererro, Shelbi Hathaway, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Lawrence Lawson, Leigh Marshall, Leanne Maunu, Ben Mudgett, Michael Mufson, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Beth Pearson, Nicole Siminski, Alyssa Vafaei, Elena Villa Fernández de Castro, Edwina Williams (ZOOM), Anastasia Zavodny

**ABSENT:** Melissa Bagaglio, Lacey Craft, Molly Faulkner

**GUESTS:** Barbara Baer, Leah Brown, Erin Feld, Rebecca Wilson, Kathy Young

**Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

**CALL TO ORDER** The meeting was called to order by Faculty Senate President Wendy Nelson in LRC-116 at 2:30 PM. The meeting was also streamed live on ZOOM.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS** – No public comments.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Barbara Baer read the following statement:

*I am here to ask Faculty Senate support to revamp the timing and instructions for ILOs and make it faculty friendly.*

*First, the timing.*

*On November 10th, faculty were notified that their classes were selected for ILO reporting. That was a little more than a week before Thanksgiving week came. Furthermore, PT faculty do not have either holidays nor non-instructional days.*

*That gave our PT faculty 5 days before leaving, and 3 days before returning to have ILOs completed before not being able to use them towards professional development (remember, PT faculty have NO institutional service pay) and all PD must be completed by December 1. We can not carry over December PD to spring either. PFF tried to negotiate a way for PT faculty to pre-certify ILO and SLOs work, but we were unsuccessful. Furthermore, at that point, wisely many PT faculty had completed and certified all the PD they were eligible for.*

*Another issue in the timing is that at the end of December, faculty are already incredibly busy helping students catch up, accepting late work and preparing for finals.*

*I would ask that all ILOs be sent out at the start of the term so that the rubrics can be integrated into assignments and then completed while grading those assignments-.*

*The second issue is an overhaul of how we ask our faculty to do ILOs. I will just tell you my personal story here.*

*I spent hours trying to understand what to do concerning ILOs. No one ever told me which ILOs to do. I had to go to my dean to get me screenshots of my ILOs and even she struggled to find them all initially too. And there are few deans out there willing to provide that kind of assistance.*

*Meanwhile the video provided did not look like any of the links I had on my Canvas. I understand Child Development had to create department specific videos to help their faculty through the process. In the end, I finally gave up after writing specific criteria into my final exam and then being overwhelmed with other work.*

*I am not being humble when I say if I can't figure it out then 98% of my fellow part-timers certainly won't as I have a ton of institutional knowledge and connections on campus. This is clearly not working. I imagine ILO compliance for PT faculty is tiny or non-existent. I imagine that FT faculty are struggling with it too.*

*I call on our Faculty Senate to help fix the issues so faculty can provide the feedback needed to know if we are meeting our objectives.*

In regard to Baer's announcement, Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Ben Mudgett asked that an ILO assessment progress report be provided to Faculty Senate.

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro said Campus Police are not citing for parking violations this week and asked faculty to remind students of this.

VP Fererro announced that emails will be coming out for Women's History Month. Organizers are still accepting proposals and ideas for activities up until February 7<sup>th</sup>. Departments or specific classes who have activities during the month of March and can tie the event into Women's History Month, are welcomed to apply as well.

Senator and PFF Co-President Lawrence Lawson said to be on the look out for an email from him relating to step placement for fulltime faculty. PFF is researching how fulltime faculty are placed into their initial step (not column) to ensure the process is consistently applied. More specifically, PFF wants to know if any fulltime faculty ever received step credit upon hire for experience teaching outside of their discipline.

Senator Lawson also announced that PFF continues to follow up with the District regarding faculty safety concerns.

Senator and EEDCC Co-Chair Michael Mufson announced that Performing Arts is already holding rehearsals for *Rent* that's coming in March. More information can be found here: [www.Palomarperform.com](http://www.Palomarperform.com)

**AGENDA CHANGES** – No agenda changes.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Motion 1: MSC Maunu/Hathaway**

Faculty Senate approval of Faculty Senate meeting minutes dated December 12, 2022 and December 15, 2022 (Exhibits 1 and 2).

The motion carried.

### **ACTION**

### **INFORMATION**

#### **A. What Did You Learn During Spring 2023 Flex Week?– W. Nelson**

Senate President Wendy Nelson said there were many workshops and events this past week for faculty and asked Senators to share their experiences.

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro said the three courses she attended were related to her duties as the DE Coordinator and she will be sharing some of those tips with her DE Committee and other faculty during the Spring semester.

Senator Alyssa Vafaei said DRC had their DRC retreat last week as well. Faculty from ESL came and spoke about the availability of ESL non-credit classes that some DRC students should take a few times to better grasp concepts and can take more than once without causing problems with GPA, financial aid or other issues.

Senator Lawson said the human library held at Friday's Social Justice Festival was an excellent opportunity to hear stories directly from the students. Faculty had an opportunity to sit down one-on-one with a student and to just listen to that student for 30 minutes. Creating more human library events on campus would be significantly impactful for faculty to better listen to and understand a student's story.

Senator Michael Mufson said EEDCC's Social Justice Festival was highly successful last Friday. The January 2022 inaugural event was about disrupting the conventional conference format which is rooted in a very long history of white, Eurocentric patriarchal thinking and structuring of the world. In 2022, students were the keynote speakers. This year was a true community event with limited offerings and themed on building equity minded communities. The most impactful activity was the human library that Senator Lawson explained where one had to just sit and listen deeply to a student without interrupting, who explained their personal journey. Those who participated said it was a very profound format and experience. Mufson also explained the Call of Mirrors activity where participant's bodies were used to create a visual model (pictures, bodies and space) of what the problem is instead of just listening to words that explain the problem. After the event Mufson said it occurred to him where the biggest inequity was and he began thinking about the experience of the students compared to his own privileged liberal arts experience when he had two years of college to decide his major. Students in the community college system don't have this privilege of exploring different interests before declaring majors. It made him wonder how many of our students who don't persist through the first semester because they were forced to choose a major and didn't like that major, then decided to drop out.

President Nelson said she attended some events and commented on the workshop for Handshake. This is a relatively new platform that students can use to find jobs. Through the program, students can get connected to employers with internships or other job opportunities. A communication will be going out shortly to students about this new program and skill shops will be set up to assist students as well.

VP Fererro said that in addition to the content, she was happy to see so many faculty eager to participate in Spring plenary. The Gina Garcia event as well as the general session were highly attended.

#### **B. Equitable Placement and Completion Committee (Exhibit 3) – Erin Feld**

Erin Feld, chair of the Equitable Placement and Completion Committee said the Chancellor's Office provided general guidance for AB 1705 and will be conducting a webinar next week and some of the committee members will attend. Feld will then know if anything needs to happen at Palomar related to AB 1705.

AB 1187 allows for \$64 million for community colleges to support students who are impacted by AB 705 in their prerequisite courses, tutoring and other support. It isn't clear how much each college will receive and hopefully she will learn more about this in the webinar next week.

Feld met with President Rivera-Lacey to provide an update of AB 705. The committee identified funding priorities (see exhibit) and Feld shared these with Dr. Rivera-Lacey as well. The committee would like to organize a symposium or something similar with other community colleges in the county where ideas, information, research and planning can be shared. The idea was shared at the end of Fall with Guided Pathways Coordinators in the San Diego/Imperial County areas. This idea was supported by Dr. Rivera-Lacey and Palomar can host the event this Spring at the Rancho Bernardo Ed Center maybe utilizing some Guided Pathways regional funds. A committee is being formed to organize this event.

Senator Shelbi Hathaway commented that the Math faculty were warned in late December that math will be getting hit hard because they can't offer any classes lower than calculus. Feld said the committee is meeting next week for the first time this semester and this issue will be discussed.

Senator Ben Mudgett asked if funding could be considered for Credit for Prior Learning (CPL) especially since it is explicit in AB 1705 to use CPL where students have experiential learning so they don't repeat any knowledge that is already gained. Regarding Senator Hathaway's calculus question, he would like to be kept in the loop because there are significant articulation challenges when prerequisites for calculus are identified. Feld said she would include Mudgett in the meeting invite when this item will be discussed. Feld also said that CPL will be considered for funding now that she has received the official guidance.

Senator Anastasia Zavodny commented about the issue on page two regarding difficulty of determining which budget strings are to be used when funding was approved because she too experiences the same issue. President Nelson said that the NOHE process is still not functioning well and she along with VP Fererro talk regularly to President Rivera-Lacey about this issue. Dr. Rivera-Lacey said the NOHE project has been assigned to Diane Studinka this semester and she is hoping to get the process fixed and on track. Senator Lawson said compensation should never be delayed because the District can't figure out which account string to use. He said that those problems should be reported to the union.

**C. Senate Subcommittees – Committee on Committees (Exhibit 4) – Zavodny**

Senator and Chair for Committee on Committees Anastasia Zavodny shared the exhibit which outlines the Senate committees. Work has also started to reorganize all of the campus wide committees that fall under specific Councils. The purview for Senate is only the Senate related committees so that is the focus for Committee on Committees. Senator Zavodny said this is an opportunity to streamline processes, "house" a central repository for Senate related committee information, make sure information is clear and determine if any training is necessary for faculty who are leading or seated in these committees.

Zavodny and President Nelson went on to explain some of the various tasks that Committee on Committees have identified as next steps. Senators shared various comments during the meeting and were also told to provide input via email directly to committee members. Some unresolved issues or changes can be agendaized for a Senate meeting for further discussion.

**D. Educational & Facilities Vision Plan (Exhibit 5)– W. Nelson**

President Nelson shared an email with a timeline for the plan. The group recently met for two days synthesizing everything including feedback from the listening sessions, from the survey, from the outside community partners as well as the educational partners. The group set some draft goals which Nelson further explained. Nelson will share the final goals with Senate once it is complete.

**E. Senate Meeting Modality Spring 2023 – W. Nelson**

President Nelson said Council recently discussed whether Senate should continue live streaming the meetings. Senator Leanne Maunu said this topic may have been prompted by the ZOOM discussion that occurred during the December 12 meeting. It was suggested that maybe it would have been more civil if the discussion took place face-to-face. VP Fererro added that the benefits of conducting meetings using ZOOM were not numerous or no longer valid. Several Senators explained the advantages of hybrid meetings including the fact that some Senators aren't on campus on Monday afternoons so the Hybrid meeting modality gives them the opportunity to participate. Offering participation via ZOOM provides equity by giving every faculty member or anyone for that matter an opportunity to at least watch and/or participate during the meetings. It was also mentioned that some presenters cannot be present in person. This single incident that occurred December 12 should not limit participation at Faculty Senate but instead Senate should adopt policies that discourage this type of conduct during meetings. It was noted that there needs to be somewhat of an expectation though for members of committees to participate in person if that's the chief meeting modality for the group. It was suggested that a ZOOM assistant be assigned to monitor ZOOM activity during the meeting.

**F. Faculty Senate Meeting Decorum/Community Agreement Discussion – Tabled.**

**G. Student Code of Conduct AP 5500 & AP 5520 Review Update – Tabled.**

## **REPORTS**

### **Budget (Ferreiro)**

The Budget committee met on 12/13/22. Barbara Baer presented the [updated projections from the Legislative Analyst Office](#) which included information about the potential for a Prop 98 revise, which is unlikely to result in huge cuts to the education budget due to the state's rainy day fund. We will not know anything for sure until summer 23. The predicted statutory COLA for 23/24 is 8.73%. Michelle Barton presented on the Emergency Conditions Allowance which was approved for Palomar, and Nancy Lane presented an overview of the 311 Report. The Budget committee will next meet on 2/14/23. [Budget - LAO - Google Slides](#)

### **Credit for Prior Learning (Rose)**

Credit for Prior Learning (CPL) is college credit awarded for validated college-level skills and knowledge gained outside of a college classroom. Students' knowledge and skills might be gained through experiences such as:

- Military training
- Industry training
- State/federal government training
- Apprenticeships, internships, work-based learning, or other industry-based experiential learning
- Validated volunteer and civic activities (e.g. Peace Corps)

Palomar is leading the way with CPL and has the most robust CPL offerings out of all of the community colleges in California.

Students can now apply for Credit for Prior Learning (CPL) for the spring semester. You can direct them to our [Credit for Prior Learning website](#).

Please keep these deadlines in mind:

#### **Monday, April 3rd (Week 9)**

- Deadline to Petition for portfolio review or credit by exam

#### **Monday, May 1st (Week 12)**

- Faculty post the grade for portfolio review or credit by exam into the CPL petition form
- Deadline to Petition for Industry Certification or Military Transcript

#### **Monday, May 15th (Week 14)**

- Students accept or decline their grade for portfolio review or credit by exam in the CPL petition form

#### **End of the semester**

- Faculty submit the grade for portfolio review or credit by exam into MyPalomar/eservices

If your department would like more information on CPL, reach out to the CPL coordinator to schedule a meeting: [cpl@palomar.edu](mailto:cpl@palomar.edu)

### **Equivalency (Klinger)**

The Equivalency Committee is currently reviewing applications.

**Sabbatical Leave (Epstein)**

Material/Action Items from December 8, 2022 meeting:

1. The committee completed the review of the sabbatical leave applications for the 2022-2023 academic year.
2. Once on contract, the committee will continue to meet as necessary to approve revisions.

**ADJOURNMENT** The meeting was adjourned at 3:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

*Molly Faulkner*

---

Molly Faulkner, Secretary

**Item G. from BoardDocs Agenda**

The following curriculum changes, pending appropriate approvals, will be effective fall 2023:

**G.1. ACTION: Noncredit Course Changes - effective fall 2023**

Subj	Nmbr	Title	Trnsf. Ed.	Dist. Ed.	Grad. Basis	Open Entry /Exit	Justification	Reqs.	Originator
A.	N AP PRE	903	<a href="#">Red Cross Adult First Aid/CPR/AED</a>	No	TRUE	P/NP/S P	No	Added student learning outcomes to comply with SLO requirements, updated grade options to pass/no pass/satisfactory progress because the course is a program requirement for a certificate, added minimum qualifications and work-based learning categories.	No Jason Jarvinen

**G.2. ACTION: New Credit Programs - effective fall 2023**

	Program Title	Disci.	Awrd	Units	Justification	Orig.
A.	<a href="#">Communication Studies 2.0</a>	SPCH	AAT	18	A new Communication Studies 2.0 AA-T is required by the CCCCCO. The college will be phasing out the old version with the approval of this program.	Marquesa Cook-Whearty

**G.3. Credit Program Deactivations - effective fall 2023**

Program Title	Disc.	Awrd Type	Units	Justification	Originator
A. <a href="#">Communication Studies</a>	SPCH	AAT	18	Per CCCCCO, deactivating program to be inactive/teach out status to allow the 2.0 to be active. The TMC Communication Studies underwent substantive changes requiring a new Communication Studies 2.0 program and making the original version inactive/teach out simultaneously.	Marquesa Cook-Whearty

**G.4. ACTION: Distance Education - effective fall 2023**

The following courses may be offered as distance learning and meet Title 5 Regulation 55200-55210, effective fall 2023

Course Number	Course Title	Originator
A.	N AP PRE 903 <a href="#">Red Cross Adult First Aid/CPR/AED</a>	Jason Jarvinen

**Item H. from BoardDocs Agenda**

The following curriculum changes, pending appropriate approvals, will be effective spring 2023:

**H.1. ACTION: Distance Education and Course Reviews**

The following courses have completed the course review approval process. Those eligible to be taught Distance Education meet Title 5 Regulations 5200-5521 and are indicated below. Since these updates have no impact on catalog or college data, they are effective spring 2023.

Subj	Nmbr	Title	Dist.	Originator
A.	ACCT	101 Bookkeeping	TRUE	Leah Hoover



## February 1, 2023 Curriculum Committee Actions

B.	AJ	210	Basic Crime Scene Forensic Science	TRUE	Jack Hook
C.	AMS/MCS/ SOC	200	Race, Class, and Ethnic Groups in America	TRUE	Seth San Juan
D.	ANTH	135	Magic, Witchcraft, and Religion	TRUE	Anne-Marie Mobilia
E.	AP C	730	Cabinet Installation		Jason Jarvinen
F.	AP C	758	Scaffold Reshoring		Jason Jarvinen
G.	AP C	770	Green Building and Weatherization		Jason Jarvinen
H.	AP PL	713	Theme Plastering		Jason Jarvinen
I.	BIOL	47	Biology Topics		Richard Albistegui-DuBois
J.	CHDV	100	Child Growth and Development	TRUE	Gina Wilson
K.	CHDV	115	Child, Family, and Community	TRUE	Laurel Anderson
L.	COMM	100	Introduction to Mass Communication	TRUE	Wendy Nelson
M.	DBA	220	TV Production and Directing		Scott Richison
N.	DBA/CINE	275	Avid Editing for Television and Film	TRUE	Scott Richison
O.	DNCE	116	Ballet II	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
P.	DNCE	117	Pointe I	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
Q.	DNCE	118	Pointe II	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
R.	DNCE	210	Ballet III	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
S.	DNCE	211	Ballet IV	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
T.	DNCE	217	Pointe III	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
U.	DNCE	218	Pointe IV	TRUE	Margaret M. Faulkner
V.	ENG	100	English Composition	TRUE	Leanne M. Maunu
W.	FIRE	151	Fire Fighter I Academy	TRUE	David Miller
X.	HUM	100	Introduction to Humanities I	TRUE	Leanne M. Maunu
Y.	ITAL	197	Italian Topics	TRUE	Scott Nelson
Z.	PHOT	125	History and Criticism of Photography	TRUE	Amy Caterina
A.A.	PHYS	197	Physics Topics	FALSE	Aundrea Tavakkoly
A.B.	PSYC	235	Principles of Learning and Behavior Modification	TRUE	Matthew O'Brien
A.C.	READ	105	Academic Reading	TRUE	Erin Feld
A.D.	READ	110	Power Reading	TRUE	Erin Feld
A.E.	READ	50	Reading Improvement	TRUE	Erin Feld
A.F.	RS	102	Religion in American History	TRUE	Craig A. Forney
A.G.	SOC	115	Introduction to Women's Studies	TRUE	Devon Smith
A.H.	SOC	130	Introduction to Sociology of Health	TRUE	Jose Briceno

## February 1, 2023 Curriculum Committee Actions

A.I.	SOC	135	Gender and Society	TRUE	Devon Smith
A.J.	SOC	197	Special Topics in Sociology	TRUE	Jose Briceno
A.K.	TA	100	Introduction to the Theatre	TRUE	Michael A. Mufson

### ***Item I. from BoardDocs Agenda***

**The following technical corrections, pending appropriate approvals, will be effective fall 2023:**

<b>I.1. ACTION: Credit Course Technical Corrections</b>										
Subj	Nmbr	Title	Trnsf.	Dist.	Grade	Open	Justification	Originator		
			Ed.		Basis	Entry				
						/Exit				
A.	ENG	100E	<a href="#">English Composition Enhanced</a>	CSU	Yes	G	No	ENG 100E is being created in response to feedback we have received about our currently separate ENG 49 and ENG 100 class model. We created ENG 49 in response to AB 705, and the two classes together are our co-requisite college-level composition class. This new class will combine both classes into one course, making it easier for students to register and making the class content more focused/directed on best practices and just-in-time teaching methods. Course proposed for competency in reading and writing, local GE area A.1 English Composition, CSUGE A.2 Written Communication, and IGETC A.1 English Composition <i>1/18/2023 - Met with dept. chair to include the non-course prerequisite of eligibility for ENG 100E as determined through the English Placement Process. The requisite was validated with the dept. chair and added to META. - Benjamin Mudgett</i>	No	Leanne M. Maunu

# EXHIBIT 3

February 6 2023							
Name	Division	Department	Committee	Position	How will you utilize an Equity and Antiracism lens in your work with this committee, or in what ways will you commit to learning about Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Antiracism and how will that influence your role on the committee?	What are the knowledge, skills, and abilities you will bring to this committee?	ACTION
Vickie Mellos	L&L	ESL	AB705 Support Subcommittee	Faculty, ESL (22-24)	As an ESL faculty member, I want to advocate for international, multilingual, and immigrant students to ensure that placement processes are not discriminatory. Also, on this committee I would like to share and brainstorm ways we can foster success for all ESL students, not just the ones with a leg up in society and education.	For spring semester, I will be taking over as the AB-705 ESL coordinator while Tracy Fung is on sabbatical. Last year I co-hosted equity workshops in our ESL department and would like to continue that work on this committee. Note: When Tracy returns from sabbatical, she will likely return to this committee.	
Amy Thompson	SBS	psychology	Access and Inclusion Subcommittee	Faculty, Instructional	I'm firmly committed to antiracism work and I try my best to keep the principles of antiracism, inclusion, and equity at the front of my mind in both my personal and professional interactions. I believe these concepts are particularly relevant for the access and inclusion committee.	I have been teaching undergraduate college courses for 13 years, including the 6 1/2 years I've been at Palomar. I have been on all of the sides of the table when it comes to the matter of students who require accommodations in order to access their education. I am a mother to three children, each of whom have disabilities that significantly impact their daily lives, particularly at school. I am very aware of what inclusion entails, as it has affected my children. Just as I try to keep inclusion at the front of my mind, I also try to keep equity and antiracism at the front of my mind as well. I believe that all of those issues are different angles on the same problem.	
Sean Peck	CTE	Emergency Medical Education/Fire Technology	Curriculum Committee	Faculty, CTE (22-25)	I believe that everyone needs an equal chance in life. We need to make sure that everyone feels welcome in this world, and provide a safe learning environment. As a member of the curriculum committee, I would make sure that everyone is represented and that DEI is advanced through sound curriculum.	I am a trained adult educator with a BS in Adult Education and a M.Ed in Career and Technical Education. Currently a doctorate student in Curriculum and Instruction. In my full time job, I serve as the Deputy Fire Chief for a large fire department. I have championed for DEI and a workforce that mirrors the citizens we serve. I have taken classes at work regarding DEI and I am currently working to ensure that our female firefighters have the correctly sized PPE so that they are effectively able to do their jobs.	
Kimberly Velazquez	MSE	Biology	Curriculum Committee	Faculty MSE (22-25)	Everything we do as educators should reflect our goals of equity, inclusion and antiracism. Curriculum decisions must be made through an equity lens, analyzing the impact of curriculum design on under-served and marginalized individuals and groups, and identifying and eliminating barriers. Regardless of what committees I serve on, as an educator I must continue to learn and evolve to provide an equitable learning experience for all students. We must continue to have these important conversations, attend trainings, and do all that we can to stay informed and aware.	I am currently the Biology Department Chair, and service on the Curriculum Committee will help us make some important decisions about current biology curricula that are outdated and contribute to student equity gaps.  I have served in several leadership roles at Palomar, including Title V STEM Activity Director, Title V STEM Grant Supplemental Instruction Director, and NSF STEP Grant Learning Assistant Director. Prior committees on which I have served include the AB 705 Support Subcommittee, Women in STEM Network, Strategic Planning Council, Facilities Planning Committee, Food Services Committee, and Tutoring Committee.  I co-led the "Grading for Equity" Book Club which explored ways in which our grading policies can perpetuate equity gaps and a "fixed mindset" in students, and can increase failure rates, especially in marginalized groups. We worked on implementing new, more equitable grading strategies in our courses, and collected data to assess whether the new grading policies were increasing success rates. We continue to have these important conversations as we learn more about our own implicit bias.	
John McMurria	AMBA	Media Studies	Curriculum Committee	Faculty, AMBA (21-24)	We need to incorporate a DEIAA lens in everything we do. On that list in the near future, which I would like to contribute to, is to extend modifications in META to require DEIAA assessments for new courses/programs and in course/program reviews, and offer examples for DEIAA in developing and revising the COR (for course descriptions, SLO's, assignments, readings and content). I have learned much from professional development workshops and seminars in DEIAA related work, and look forward to continuing to do so.	As a recent member of the Curriculum Committee, in May 2022 the Committee elected me to represent the members on a College-wide taskforce to create a DEIAA (Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, Access and Anti-Racism) course. In developing sections in the fall of 2022 on Latinx and African American student experience, intersectionality, equity in communications, equity in teaching, and Palomar DEIAA resources, I have learned much that I would like to share in on-going Curriculum Committee work.	

Adriana Guillén	L&L	World Languages	Curriculum Committee	Faculty, L&L (22-25)	I will use an Equity and Antiracism lens by focusing on ensuring that underrepresented racial groups are able to navigate through the college system as freely as those who are considered the "standard" or "traditional" student. I would continue to commit to my learning about Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Antiracism through my participation in relevant workshops so that I may be in better touch with the voices that represent and/or study best practices. I would bring perspectives in my learning and prior experience to the curriculum committee.	DEIA best practices are crucial in my own curriculum (Spanish). Textbooks and additional curriculum that feature the diversity of Spanish speakers and include social justice themes is important in offering students a realistic picture of the Spanish-speaking world. I have developed curriculum that features the work of authors of color in my 200-level classes, which provides additional opportunities to promote greater representation of under-represented	
Wing Cheung	MSE	Earth, Space, and Environmental Sciences	Curriculum Committee	Faculty, MSE (20-23)	I will evaluate curriculum proposals to ensure that the language used does not contain unintended microaggressions in order to build a safe and inclusive learning environment for all students regardless of academic disciplines.	I have written and submitted many curriculum proposals, and attended many DEIAA trainings over the years, but I still have much to learn in this area. I hope to share what I have learned from my curriculum writing experience, but also wish to learn new strategies to create inclusive curriculum by reading others' curriculum proposals.	
James Eighmey	SBS	Anthropology	Curriculum Committee	Faculty, SBS (20-23)	As an Anthropology instructor these themes are central to our discipline. I look forward to participating in, and receiving instruction on how to recognize and combat discrimination and exclusion in our college.	I have been a member of this committee for over a decade and hope to bring to it considerable institutional knowledge. I teach cross-cultural Anthropology courses in which the invention of the race concept by practitioners of our discipline, its evolution worldwide, its inextricable links to class structure, its ties to colonialism, and its egregious social consequences are central topics in every single course. We are constantly working to broaden the opportunities for diversity within our discipline, a process that must begin at the community college level.	
Rachel Thompson	SBS	Child Development (ECE Lab school)	Safety and Security Committee	Faculty, different divisions (22-24)	I will continue to implement equity and an antiracism environment in my classroom. I always encourage the children to express themselves, especially when it involves their home lives, family background, religion, identity and more. I want to join a committee that I can utilize, and learn about what is going on, on campus. I will share this information with the master teachers and families I work with. I will share with the committee stories and ideas that involve many topics. This is also important so they can learn about situations that occur with our families and on our facility. Many people do not hear about our Center and what goes on up here. Our classroom environment and family relationships absolutely require an antiracism and inclusive relationship to support all the different races, cultures, gender preference, and more that enter our classroom.	I have knowledge about Child Development and what is currently happening in our community with the little ones. I have been working at Palomar for many years and have experience working with children with different home backgrounds, who live in financial strain and/or are new to the country etc. I love to hear about what is occurring on campus and I want to involve our families more. There have been many questions about lock down drills and how we will keep their children safe. I think it will be beneficial to learn from this committee. Along with providing ideas I may have. I think it is important to stay connected and know about events that happen so I can also notify our staff and families. I think it is important to stay connected so we can be inclusive, adjust our teaching methods and plan events to invite more diverse families as well.	
							Vote for 1:
Charles Alexander	Student Services	Counseling	Comets Affordable Learning Materials (CALM) Committee	Faculty, Counseling (21-23)	I would like to try and close the equity gap by assisting committee members with helping students obtain free and low-cost learning resources and tools to foster student success, regardless of income.	My Critical thinking and problem-solving skills. My ability to provide an equity lens in the classroom, while providing new low cost and updated learning materials that support learning outcomes for students of all backgrounds/abilities. Lastly, my direct experience with students inside and outside of the classroom with a counselors lens will assist my committee members on providing affordable learning materials to students at Palomar College.	
Rachel Thompson	Student Services	Child Development	Comets Affordable Learning Materials Committee (CALM)	Faculty, Counseling (21-23)	I will continue to implement equity and an antiracism environment in my classroom. I always encourage the children to express themselves, especially when it involves their home lives, family background, religion, identity and more. I want to join a committee that I can utilize, and learn about what is going on, on our Palomar campus. I work directly with many students who are parents of the children I have in my classroom. I will share the information and ideas that we discuss, so my colleagues and students can learn about opportunities that are available on campus. Many people do not hear about our Center and what goes on up here. Our classroom environment and family relationships absolutely require an antiracism and inclusive relationship to support all the different races, cultures, gender preference, and more that enter our classroom.	I have knowledge about Child Development and what is currently happening in our community with the little ones. I have been working at Palomar for many years and have experience working with children with different home backgrounds, who live in financial strain and/or are new to the country so much more. I love to hear about what is occurring on campus and want to involve our families more. I think it is important to stay connected and know about events that happen so I can also notify our staff and families. I love volunteering and helping, especially if it involves the community. I think it is important to stay connected so we can be inclusive, adjust our teaching methods and plan events to invite more diverse families as well.	

<b>February 6 2023</b>		
<b>CALM Faculty Counselor</b>		
<b>Senator LAST name</b>	<b>FIRST name</b>	<b>CALM</b>
Bagaglio	Melissa	Charles Alexander
Craft	Lacey	
Dalrymple	Will	Charles Alexander
<i>Doyle Bauer</i>	<i>Alexandra</i>	
Falcone	Kelly	Charles Alexander
Faulkner	Molly	Charles Alexander
Fererro	Jenny	Charles Alexander
Hathaway	Shelbi	Charles Alexander
Hiro	Erin	I choose neither
Jarvinen	Jason	Charles Alexander
Lawson	Lawrence	Rachel Thompson
Marshall	Leigh	Charles Alexander
Maunu	Leanne	Charles Alexander
Mudgett	Ben	Charles Alexander
Mufson	Michael	Charles Alexander
Nelson	Scott	Charles Alexander
<i>Nelson</i>	<i>Wendy</i>	
Pearson	Elizabeth	Charles Alexander
Siminski	Nicole	Charles Alexander
<i>Vafaei</i>	<i>Alyssa</i>	
Villa Fernandez de Castro	Elena	Charles Alexander
Williams	Edwina	Charles Alexander
Zavodny	Anastasia	Charles Alexander
<i>(ASG) De La Cruz</i>	<i>Kimberly</i>	<i>Charles Alexander</i>

## Tips for Promoting Civility in Public Meetings

[www.ca-ilg.org/PromotingCivility](http://www.ca-ilg.org/PromotingCivility)

December 2011

### What is Civility?

In the context of democratic debate, civility is about how people treat each other. Civility involves the display of respect for those who have positions with which one disagrees.

Even though disagreement plays a necessary role in governance and politics, the issue is *how* one expresses that disagreement. The key is to focus on the strengths and weakness of proposed solutions to community problems—not to engage in personal attacks against those who favor different solutions.<sup>1</sup> An even more powerful leadership strategy is to listen for the concerns and values that underlie people's diverse perspectives to try to identify points of agreement and common ground.

### Specific Strategies

- **Embrace Diverse Points of View.** Local officials are grappling with difficult policy challenges. Bringing as many perspectives on what might be the best solution to a given problem increases the likelihood that the solution will indeed be successful and enduring. A goal is to create a culture of tolerance for differing points of view that credits everyone with having the best interests of the community in mind.
- **Everyone Gets a Chance to Share Their Views.** Voltaire said "I may not agree with what you say, but I will fight to the death for your right to say it." Everyone's right to have their view heard is a central democratic value. Conversely, a strategy that relies on drowning other perspectives out usually results in a turning up of the volume and corresponding decreases in civility in discussions.

#### Related Resources

This tip sheet is a distillation and update of the Institute for Local Government's 2003 whitepaper called *Promoting Civility at Public Meetings: Concepts and Practice*, available at [www.ca-ilg.org/civility](http://www.ca-ilg.org/civility).

Additional resources from the Institute include

- *Dealing with Emotions at Public Hearings*, available at [www.ca-ilg.org/respondingtoconflict](http://www.ca-ilg.org/respondingtoconflict) and
- *A Leader's Role When Tragedy Strikes*, available at [www.ca-ilg.org/tragedy](http://www.ca-ilg.org/tragedy)

- **With Rights Come Responsibilities.** For there to be time for everyone to weigh in on an issue, there may need to be reasonable time limits on how long individuals speak. The goal is to create a culture in which as many people as possible (including decision-makers) are respectful of other people's time in attending and participating in the meeting.
- **Avoid Debates and Interruptions.** Interruptions should be discouraged so that individuals have the opportunity to complete their thoughts. A good practice for everyone participating in the conversation is to make a note of a question or different point of view that occurs to you when someone is speaking and then address that issue when it is one's turn to speak. This is an especially important approach for decision-makers to model.
- **Reduce Uncertainty.** Assuring people they will be allowed to share their views and how can reduce concerns that they will not be allowed to be heard. Explaining the process to be used to allow all views to be heard at the outset of a meeting or discussion item can reduce tension levels.
- **The Importance of Listening.** Listening is an important sign of respect, as is giving others the opportunity to listen. Decision-makers' active interest in what people are saying is vital. Repeating back core points that a speaker makes reassures the speaker that their message has indeed been heard—even if one does not necessarily agree with it. The mood turns ugly if the public thinks the matter has already been decided, decision-makers don't care about public input, or decision-makers are being impolite or disrespectful of the public they serve. Everyone attending a meeting should respect other attendees' right to both listen and be heard. One person should talk at a time, any private conversations should be taken outside or deferred, and smart phones should be turned off (texting and emailing should not occur during the meeting).
- **Be Compassionate About the Fear Factor/ Heckling and Applause Not Allowed.** Polls suggest many people fear public speaking.<sup>2</sup> This fear can come from concerns about

### Agenda Guidance

Some local agencies include language to the following effect on their agendas:

Free expression of all points of view is an important democratic value in this community.

To allow all persons to speak who may wish to do so, each speaker is allowed a maximum of \_\_ minutes. An effective approach is to lead with your key point or concern and then explain the reasons underlying it.

If others have already expressed your views, you may simply indicate that you agree with the previous speaker. If appropriate, a spokesperson may present the views of a group.

To encourage and respect expression of all views, meeting rules prohibit clapping, booing or shouts of approval or disagreement from the audience.

being judged negatively or having ideas that people will ridicule or reject. Allowing cheering and booing or other forms of heckling discourages people from sharing their views (even silence or no applause can be perceived as rejection). It also runs the risk that those that do speak will focus more on getting applause than moving the conversation towards addressing difficult issues. (Eye-rolling and grimacing can be non-verbal forms of heckling and also have no place in communities that value mutual respect.)

- **Separate People from The Problem.** Personal attacks or questioning people's motives or character rarely moves the conversation forward to a solution of a problem. In the book about effective negotiating called *Getting to Yes*,<sup>3</sup> the authors encourage negotiators to attack the problem, not the people involved in the problem. Anything that approaches name-calling should be off limits.
- **Consider Using Titles.** Referring to each other by title and last name (Supervisor Hassan, Council Member Lee, Board Member Aviña) can serve as a way of showing respect that an individual has been elected and is participating in the conversation in that capacity. Using similar forms of respect for members of the public (Mr., Ms, Sir, Madam) when speaking can also reinforce the notion that everyone is engaged in a special kind of discussion. Community norms vary, however, and in some communities this may be perceived as an affectation.
- **Take a Break.** If conversations get heated, consider taking a break. As one veteran observer of public meetings noted "time can be an anti-inflammatory agent" that can give people a chance to calm down and restore order.<sup>4</sup>

### A Note on Civility and Staff

Staff plays a critical role in providing service to the agency and the public the agency serves. An agency's ability to attract and retain capable and motivated staff is an important determinant of how satisfied the public is likely to be with the agency's performance and that of its elected officials.

An old management saw counsels those with oversight responsibilities to praise in public and criticize in private. That advice is sound for those in public service.

If an elected official has concerns about a staff member's performance or actions, a good practice is to make the top administrative official of the agency aware of those concerns.

Similarly, if a member of the public raises concerns about the performance of a public agency employee, refer it to management with a request for follow up.

If the communication is more in the nature of a personal attack, try to identify the underlying concern and respond to that. Encouraging the person to focus on the issue and avoid personal attacks. Separating people from the problem can be just as valuable a strategy when it comes to staff.



- **Ejection a Last Resort.** If a recess does not work to restore order and other techniques are not successful, calling in the sergeant of arms is a last resort. A good practice is to create a record that disruptor was given ample warnings and opportunity to leave or reform their behavior voluntarily. If selective removal of one or more disruptors does not restore order, state law does allow clearing the room with the media allowed to remain<sup>5</sup> (as an even more last resort).

## Parliamentary Procedure and Civility

Rules of parliamentary procedure are another tool to encourage civility and decorum at meetings. The most famous source of parliamentary procedure is Robert's Rules of Order. A good starting point is [www.robertsrules.com/](http://www.robertsrules.com/) (the "survival tips" page is especially helpful).

A former mayor and county supervisor (and now judge) has created a simplified version for use at the local level. Called "Rosenberg's Rules," the text and an explanatory video are accessible from the Institute's website at [www.ca-ilg.org/rosenbergrules](http://www.ca-ilg.org/rosenbergrules).

The following is an excerpt from Rosenberg's Rules on about courtesy and decorum:

The rules of order are meant to create an atmosphere where the members of the body and the members of the public can attend to business efficiently, fairly and with full participation. At the same time, it is up to the Chair and the members of the body to maintain common courtesy and decorum. Unless the setting is very informal, it is always best for only one person at a time to have the floor, and it is always best for every speaker to be first recognized by the Chair before proceeding to speak.

The Chair should always ensure that debate and discussion of an agenda item focuses on the item and the policy in question, not the personalities of the members of the body. Debate on policy is healthy, debate on personalities is not. The Chair has the right to cut off discussion that is too personal, is too loud, or is too crude.

Debate and discussion should be focused, but free and open. In the interest of time, the Chair may, however, limit the time allotted to speakers, including members of the body.

Can a member of the body interrupt the speaker? The general rule is "no." There are, however, exceptions. . . .

Note that the chair may have greater latitude in enforcing decorum among decision-makers than between the public and decision-makers.

- **Walk the Talk.** For civility to be a regular part of community discourse, community leaders must set the standard. Scholars are concerned—and the data seems to demonstrate—that public officials’ incivility to one another contributes to voter alienation and antipathy toward public officials and public agencies.<sup>6</sup>

A good approach is to treat people how you would like to be treated. This includes a) limiting one’s statements in discussions to those that move the conversation forward, b) keeping one’s remarks brief, to the point and non-repetitive of comments others have made (other than to note one’s agreement), c) avoiding personal attacks (in public and private) and d) otherwise adhering to the strategies described above.

## Conclusion

How a community conducts its public meetings is a reflection of the community and its values. As Dr. Martin Luther King’s observed:

In a neighborhood dispute there may be stunts, rough words, and even hot insults; but when a whole people speaks to its government, the dialogue and the action must be on a level reflecting the worth of that people and the responsibility of that government.<sup>7</sup>

Dr. King’s admonition to his listeners to set their standards of discourse high--irrespective of how others behave--is consistent with the quote from Gandhi to his followers that “you must be the change you wish to see in the world.”

### About This Resource

This resource is a service of the Institute for Local Government (ILG) whose mission is to promote good government at the local level with practical, impartial, and easy-to-use resources for California communities. ILG is the nonprofit 501(c)(3) research and education affiliate of the League of California Cities and the California State Association of Counties. For more information and to access the Institute’s resources on Local Government 101, go to [www.ca-ilg.org/localgovt101](http://www.ca-ilg.org/localgovt101).

\*The Institute welcomes feedback and suggestions on enhancing this resource:

- *Email:* [info@ca-ilg.org](mailto:info@ca-ilg.org) Subject: *Tips for Promoting Civility in Public Meetings*
- *Mail:* 1400 K Street, Suite 205 ▪ Sacramento, CA ▪ 95814

### Sample Codes of Civility

**Drafting Note:** A threshold issue is whether an agency's code will be positive or negative. In other words, will the code describe conduct that is prohibited or describe the kind of conduct it desires to be the norm. Describing the kind of conduct that is preferred has the advantage of being more instructive in setting the goal and encouraging people to meet that goal.

#### Commitment to Civil Behavior

To maintain a cohesive, productive working environment, the members of the San Diego County Water Authority Board of Directors commit to:

1. Support the Authority's mission.
2. Bring Authority related concerns, issues, and conflicts to the Authority Board for discussion.
3. Offer alternative solution(s) when addressing a problem or issue.
4. Show respect to each other as appointed representatives of their member agencies.
5. Promote civility during Board meetings and tolerate nothing less.
6. Maintain the confidentiality of material discussed during closed Board meeting sessions. Similarly, not to disclose the content or substance of confidential or privileged communications relating to Authority business.
7. Limit the length of comments during Board meetings to three minutes per Director per item and not repeat points that already have been stated by other Directors.

#### Pledge of Civility

1. The manner in which we govern ourselves is often as important as the positions we take.
2. The organization's collective decisions will be better—and truer to our mission—when differing views have had the opportunity to be fully vetted and considered.
3. All those who appear before the organization's board and committees have the right to be treated with respect, courtesy, and openness. We value all input.

Accordingly, we commit to conduct ourselves at all times with civility and courtesy, to both those with whom the Board interacts and to each other. We also pledge to endeavor to correct ourselves, should our conduct fall below this standard.<sup>8</sup>

## Resources and References

---

<sup>1</sup> Burgess, Guy and Heidi, *The Meaning of Civility*, Conflict Research Consortium at [www.colorado.edu/conflict/civility.htm](http://www.colorado.edu/conflict/civility.htm).

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.gallup.com/poll/1891/Snakes-Top-List-Americans-Fears.aspx> (fear of public speaking ranks second to fear of snakes).

<sup>3</sup> Fisher, Roger and Ury, William L., *Getting to Yes: Negotiating Agreement Without Giving In* (1991).

<sup>4</sup> See Vermont Institute for Government, *Born to Chair: An Introduction to the Science and Art of Chairing a Board Meeting* (1998), available at <http://www.sec.state.vt.us/municipal/pubs/chair.pdf> and <http://crs.uvm.edu/citizens/chair.pdf>, page 3.

<sup>5</sup> See Cal. Gov't Code § 54957.9, which provides:

In the event that any meeting is willfully interrupted by a group or groups of persons so as to render the orderly conduct of such meeting unfeasible and order cannot be restored by the removal of individuals who are willfully interrupting the meeting, the members of the legislative body conducting the meeting may order the meeting room cleared and continue in session. Only matters appearing on the agenda may be considered in such a session. Representatives of the press or other news media, except those participating in the disturbance, shall be allowed to attend any session held pursuant to this section. Nothing in this section shall prohibit the legislative body from establishing a procedure for readmitting an individual or individuals not responsible for willfully disturbing the orderly conduct of the meeting.

<sup>6</sup> Carter, Stephen L., *Civility: Manners, Morals and the Etiquette of Democracy* (1998) at 9.

<sup>7</sup> *From the March on Washington for Jobs, Peace and Freedom*, 1963.

<sup>8</sup> Adapted from the Pledge of Civility adopted by the California Public Employee Retirement System Board.

Palomar College  
EVP Goals and Objectives from January 18-19, 2023 Goal-Setting Session

**Goal 1. Reimagine and redesign instruction and student services centered on students' needs, wants, and interests.**

**Objectives**

- 1.1 Make sure academic and career support services are organized and offered in a way that students can easily utilize when, where, and how they need them.
- 1.2 Reorganize student services to align with pathways and the student journey in a holistic, integrated way.
- 1.3 Make student services timely, effective, welcoming, and an overall positive experience.
- 1.4 Ensure instructional design and facilities are humanized, equitable, affordable, engaging, and student-centered.
- 1.5 Consolidate current programs and offerings and offer new programs that meet labor market and community needs.
- 1.6 Offer a class schedule that works for students.

**Goal 2. Embrace a Culture of Change.**

**Objectives**

- 2.1 Develop a student-centered approach that prioritizes community, collaboration, and accessibility in our physical environment.
- 2.2 Establish a culture of inclusivity, empowerment, accountability, and success from interview to resignation.
- 2.3 Develop and implement DEIAA-informed strategies and processes to recruit the best individuals for the position followed by honest, effective, and timely evaluations.
- 2.4 Provide consistent and relevant training for current positions and career & succession planning.
- 2.5 Develop compensated opportunities for subject matter and thought leaders to reimagine and implement uniform, streamlined, well-documented processes.

**Goal 3: Grow Enrollment.**

**Objectives**

- 3.1 Develop and implement a targeted and intentional student outreach/in reach system.
- 3.2 Reimagine Palomar's marketing to make it more creative, community-focused, intentional, and engaging.
- 3.3 Create student-centered course schedules and offerings.
- 3.4 Improve hiring practices to be nimble, support enrollment goals, and support DEIAA goals.
- 3.5 Develop a strategic enrollment plan that encourages growth and includes benchmarks and timelines.
- 3.6 Offer courses and programs that have value for our community and show demonstrated student interest.
- 3.7 Reinvent and improve student services to provide a holistic and student-friendly approach.

#### **Goal 4: Strengthen External Partnerships.**

##### **Objectives**

- 4.1 Develop an organizational structure to oversee developing and strengthening external partnerships.
- 4.2 Improve and enrich educational partnerships with District High Schools, feeder colleges and universities, and expand new opportunities.
- 4.3 Develop relationships with industries that require certifications and create pathways (e.g., Credit for Prior Learning).
- 4.4 Optimize outreach to businesses and community organizations to maximize opportunities for students and programs.
- 4.5 Connect and develop curriculum to emerging career opportunities.
- 4.6 Connect a comprehensive infrastructure to connect students to careers.
- 4.7 Structure strategic opportunities to bring communities to campus.
- 4.8 Develop partnerships that purposefully include a focus on DEIAA student groups.

#### **Goal 5: Build Palomar College for all of North County: four campuses that are unified, yet hold unique, student-focused identities and community connections.**

##### **Objectives**

- 5.1 Invest in staffing to provide comprehensive services at all campuses.
- 5.2 Develop anchor programs that are aligned in collaboration with community partners.
- 5.3 Provide support and resources (jobs, transportation, technology) so students across North County can take advantage of programs offered at all Palomar campuses.
- 5.4 Engage students and community through events, clubs, activities, performances, etc. at all campuses.
- 5.5 Expand, improve, and standardize facilities to provide an inclusive environment for student services, course offerings, events, study space, etc. at all campuses.