



FACULTY SENATE MEETING

December 5, 2022

EXHIBITS



Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
November 28, 2022

APPROVED

- PRESENT:** Melissa Bagaglio, Will Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Erik Duarte (ASG), Kelly Falcone, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Shelbi Hathaway (ZOOM), Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Leigh Marshall, Leanne Maunu, Ben Mudgett, Michael Mufson, Scott Nelson (ZOOM), Wendy Nelson, Beth Pearson, Nicole Siminski, Alyssa Vafaei, Elena Villa Fernández de Castro(ZOOM), Edwina Williams (ZOOM), Anastasia Zavodny
- ABSENT:** Lacey Craft, Lawrence Lawson
- GUESTS:** Hilda Colondres, Carmelino Cruz, Billieanne McLellan

Please note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.

CALL TO ORDER The meeting was called to order by Faculty Senate President Wendy Nelson in LRC-116 at 2:30 PM. The meeting was also streamed live on ZOOM.

PUBLIC COMMENTS – No public comments.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Senator Michael Mufson said that *The Gods of Comedy* is coming December 2 to 9. It is an absolutely frivolous and ridiculous comedy that everyone needs right now. More information can be found here: www.Palomarperform.com

Senator Leanne Maunu said the English Department is hosting an Open House for the Little Free Library on December 7. New book stock will be available as well as refreshments. During the event, donations will be accepted for the Student Period Club which is a club to combat menstrual poverty and to raise awareness of menstrual issues.

Senator Melissa Bagaglio announced that *Tarde de Familia* is scheduled for this coming Friday, December 2 from 5:30 to 8 PM in the Student Union. The program will be in Spanish. There will be free food and entertainment and everyone is welcomed.

Senator Bagaglio also announced that her British Literature class is doing a round robin reading of books one through four of *Paradise Lost* on Friday, December 2 from 9 AM to noon. Everyone is encouraged to come read or just listen. The location is Humanities 312 and snacks will be available.

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro said organizers are accepting proposals through February 10th for Women’s History Month coming in March 2023. An email went to all faculty today with a link to submit a proposal.

VP Fererro said an email will go out today regarding updated faculty hiring procedures. President Nelson also said this information will also be shared with the faculty hiring committees. The purpose is to clarify the discussions held in Senate about this process. In addition, the email will also encourage tenured fulltime faculty to serve on those hiring committees as an “outside” faculty member or as a Compliance Officer.

Senate President Wendy Nelson announced the vote results from the recent Faculty Constitution/Bylaws documents. The items were defeated by a very close margin and the final count was 52/47. Discussion on this matter will be added as an Information Item for Senate on December 5.

AGENDA CHANGES – No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1: MSC Pearson/ Bagaglio

Faculty Senate approval of Faculty Senate meeting minutes dated November 14, 2022 (Exhibit 1).

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum (Exhibit 2 and 3)

Motion 2: MSC Mudgett/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval of Curriculum Committee Actions taken on November 16, 2022 (Exhibit 2).

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum Co-Chair Ben Mudgett shared Exhibit 3, a Governance Structure Request Form to create a new taskforce created by the Curriculum Committee. The taskforce will be called Assembly Bill 1111/928 Steering Committee Taskforce. Senator Mudgett explained the exhibit and then answered questions and provided clarification. Senator Mudgett said he would bring the Senator's questions back to the Curriculum Committee for further consideration and the document will come back to Senate in early Spring.

B. Committee on Committees – Zavodny

Motion 3: MSC Zavodny/Doyle Bauer

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the following faculty on the hiring committee (Exhibit 4):

The motion carried.

Project Director/Military Leadership Hiring Committee – **Candace Rose**, AMBA, Media Studies

Motion 4: MSC Zavodny/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to confirm the following faculty on their respective committees (Exhibit 5):

The motion carried.

Sabbatical Leave Committee – **Rosie Antonecchia**, Faculty, Student Services (22-25)
Academic Integrity Taskforce – **Jeff Epstein**, Faculty, SBS

Motion 5: MSC Zavodny/Faulkner

Faculty Senate approval to accept the results of the ballot (Exhibit 5):

The motion carried.

Academic Integrity Taskforce - **Stephen Crook**, Faculty, MSE

Senator and Committee on Committees Chair Anastasia Zavodny said the call for the Academic Integrity Taskforce has been open for a few weeks now with only two faculty willing to volunteer and serve. Senator Zavodny said that

normally after a few weeks, a second call goes out and if no one volunteers from a specific division, that position may be considered “at-large” which will allow other faculty from outside that specific division to be confirmed. While a second call for this taskforce has not gone out, she asked Senators to consider confirming both faculty including one as faculty, at large. Senators asked Zavodny if a more targeted call can go out to specific divisions/departments which may result in more volunteers for these positions. Zavodny answered that targeting these calls is not possible especially since there isn’t any technology available to her to make this process efficient with her available time.

President Nelson asked that Committee on Committees take a further look at options available to help fill open positions on committees.

Senator Zavodny emailed the ballot to Senators.

After announcing the ballot results, Zavodny reminded Senators that additional tenured, fulltime faculty are needed on the Sabbatical Leave Committee, and the new Academic Integrity Taskforce needs to have a Senator step up to chair that committee as soon as possible.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. ASG Report – No report.

B. New Grants Management/Oversight (Exhibit 6) - Pauline Moros, Grants Manager

Pauline Moros introduced herself and thanked Senators for inviting her to the meeting. She began her presentation by saying that just before the Thanksgiving break, she had the opportunity to share initial recommendations about the current state of the grants program, a direction moving forward and direction of where improvements and consolidations could be made. As the Grants Manager, Moros said her primary role will be to provide leadership in planning for and securing external grant funding to advance Palomar’s mission and strategic priorities. Moros then briefly reviewed the life cycle and flow chart of the grant funding process.

Senators shared their appreciation of Moros’ leadership and expertise that can now support the grant funding program at Palomar. Senators also shared their frustrations for the lack of proper grant management in the past.

Moros is finalizing the roadmap for the grants program in early Spring and accepted an invitation to come back to Senate to provide an update.

C. Call for Upcoming Faculty Reassigned Time Positions (Exhibit 7)– W. Nelson

President Nelson presented the exhibit outlining faculty reassigned time.

Senators reviewed the document and Nelson made the updates. President Nelson will bring this back to Senate.

D. Cross-Listed Course Evaluations – Tabled.

E. Review HSI Recommendations Under Senate Purview – Tabled.

F. Educational & Facilities Vision Plan – Tabled.

REPORTS

President (Nelson)

This past week I attended the following meetings: Educational & Facilities Vision Plan planning meeting, VPI 2nd Level Hiring Committee, Organizing Governance Ad Hoc Committee, and the DEIA Curriculum Framework Workgroup.

Here are some highlights from the meetings:

1. Educational & Facilities Vision Plan
 - a. We discussed the two data sets the Taskforce would be reviewing
 - b. We talked through putting people in groups to discuss the data and make
2. Organizing Governance Ad Hoc Committee
 - a. We discussed the governance structure and reviewed all committees.
 - b. We began talking about communication and possible strategies.
3. DEIA Curriculum Framework Workgroup
 - a. We started breaking down the rubric to determine responsibility
 - b. We began discussing revenue streams for possible activities.

Equivalency (Klinger)

The Equivalency Committee is currently reviewing applications.

Faculty Service Areas (Jarvinen)

The Faculty Service Area Committee met on November 15th, 2022. The committee continued to discuss a need to clarify the role of personal FSAs in lateral transfer and reduction-in-force situations. There were a few perspectives on this point. The committee also discussed the development of a rubric or criteria for evaluating discipline FSAs.

Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship (IEPFS) Council (Bongolan)

Here is the IEPFES update.

The Institutional Effectiveness, Planning, and Fiscal Stewardship Council met on 11/4/2022. Below are some highlights:

- Michelle Tucker along with Acting VPFA Lane are the Co-Chairs. Tri-chair option no longer being considered.
- Policies reviewed include the following:
 - [AP 4235](#), Credit By Exam, was sent to EESSC for review rather than by IEPFSC. IEPFSC approved the AP as it was an action item.
 - [AP 2510](#), Participation in Local Decision Making. Made the following adjustments.
 - i. User group *feedback* vs user group *should*
 - ii. Put user groups below the Operational Committee section
 - iii. Shortened (a.) cut after work administrators.
 - iv. (h) it is suggested that . . .
- IEPFSC is continuing its work to define its goals which include the following questions and comments:
 - What are the tasks and outcomes?
 - Provide ideas and reasoning behind the ideas rather than specific actions.
 - Governance Council verbs: approve, consult, establish, monitor, recommend, and delegate. Operational side uses the verb: implement.
 - Goals need to be guiding.

Next meeting is November 18, 2022

PFF (Lawson)

The Palomar Faculty Federation (PFF) continues to support the faculty (and student) experience at Palomar College. Recently, we have reached out to campus organizers in response to resource support requests and have supported

Veterans and first-generation college students with funds earmarked for campus donations. As well, PFF has begun its annual toy drive, in collaboration with the Council of Classified Employees (CCE) and the San Diego imperial County Labor Council, with the collected toys (bring them to MD-330) headed to union families across the region. In addition, we our supporting PFF members with groceries cards to help support our own Union families as they bring friends and family together to share food during the upcoming holiday season. Lastly, in addition to grocery cards, PFF is also assisting its own Union member families that are in need of children’s toys and gifts this holiday season. PFF members who can use some assistance should email palomarfacfed@gmail.com with their name, their department, and the number of children in their immediate family by Friday, December 2nd. Names will be kept completely confidential, and we will reply to you within a few days.

In other news, our three-year contract negotiations continue, and PFF appreciates and shares the interest in the collaboration and collegiality we've seen at the negotiations table.

Lastly, PFF is optimistic after the results of the Governing Board election. The incoming Trustee, Dr. Judy Patacsil, has a long history of community college leadership and equity work. We look forward to her expertise on our Board. As well, PFF looks forward to the skills Jaqueline Kaiser and Michelle Rains will bring to the Governing Board. The winning candidates represent a balance of perspectives, and we're confident we all have the same goal: a healthy, vibrant Palomar College for students, employees, and the community. We at PFF wish outgoing Trustees Miyamoto and Raju well and thank them for their service to our college, our students, and our employees. As well, we wish retiring Trustee Evilsizer a wonderful post-Palomar life and thank him for all the good he's done for our community.

Sabbatical Leave (Epstein)

Materials/Action from November 10 meeting:

1. The committee continued the review of the sabbatical leave applications for the 22'-23' academic year.
2. The Committee will continue to meet per our regular schedule to complete review of sabbatical leave applications.

Student Learning Outcomes (Bealo/Tavakkoly)

We sent out the Critical Thinking ILO assessment request to faculty teaching a course that has at least 1 SLO mapped to at least one dimension of the Critical Thinking ILO.

<https://www.palomar.edu/teachingexcellence/wp-content/uploads/sites/140/2022/09/Rubrics-for-Critical-Thinking.pdf>

LOSC is refining the dimensions of the Teamwork ILO to prepare it for assessment in Spring 2023.

We will be participating in a demo of SLO assessment integration using Curricunet’s META to see if it may be a potential replacement to Nuventive.

We finally finished up Fall 2022 SLO Facilitator trainings this week.

ADJOURNMENT The meeting was adjourned at 3:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Molly Faulkner, Secretary

EXHIBIT 2

December 5 2022							
Name	Division	Department	Committee	Position	How will you utilize an Equity and Antiracism lens in your work with this committee, or in what ways will you commit to learning about Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Antiracism and how will that influence your role on the committee?	What are the knowledge, skills, and abilities you will bring to this committee?	ACTION
Adena Issaian	MSE	Chemistry	Equal Employment Opportunity Advisory Committee (EEOAC)	Faculty, appointed by Faculty Senate (22-24)	As a mother of two biracial kids, I understand the importance of inclusion and equity, and I am committed to learning about and executing new methods to apply an anti racism lens toward employment at Palomar.	I will be promoting diversity in the workplace and calling out unconscious bias when I see it. I have been an advocate of pay equity throughout graduate school and will bring my experiences from that work in bridging equity gaps. I am also from a multicultural household and understand the importance to sensitivity toward the holidays of different cultures and will be a strong voice in advocating for that and creating an inclusive training program that highlights it.	

HSI RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATION ONE - Enhance the racial, cultural, and linguistic experiences for Latinx students. Allocate resources to Latinx enhancing actions, designate time and compensation for those who lead these efforts.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome
Conduct a needs assessment of current “spaces” that are being used by students to determine needs	Business and Finance	Infrastructure and Sustainability Council (ISC)/Institutional Effectiveness, Planning & Fiscal Council IEPSC					
“Dashboard” of activities/support of Latinx students (goals and metrics to keep up accountable) are being met and what needs are yet to be met	Institutional Research						
Have bilingual general communications examples: flyers, banners, 75th anniversary banner	Julie Lanthier-Bandy						
Include expressions reflective of students' linguistic experience in communications Integrated information versus secondary messages- unapologetically Signage across campus English/Spanish	Julie Lanthier-Bandy						
Visibility for resources specific to Latinx students Offering bilingual opportunities; Professional Development Committee is currently working on this (creating and posting all materials in Spanish and English; also creating activities that are HSI-oriented)	Human Resources?						
Activities that gage our student body incorporate cultural elements examples: culturally relevant food, music, vendors Equity in language, literature and skills to be incorporated inside and outside of the classroom							

Notes

Met with Julie about diverse signage at all the sites, workin on this now for potential purchase prior to june 30, 2022

Aramark is under contract with PC, what can we do to go around the requirement.

Begin offering a College Hour for students to engage in these sorts of activities

Centralize coordination of “Events”

Involve/engage students who have benefitted from our programs and services to connect with our future students

Offer culturally mental health approaches

Provide institutional commitment and not relying on the free labor of others or individual fundraising resources

Institutionalize Tarde De Familia (permanent funding, staffing)

Prioritize funding

Support faculty/staff

Approve leave time for staff/faculty to participate

Designated physical space for students/staff/faculty that creates a sense of belonging (resources/staffing/activities)

Classes (need to increase course offerings)

RECOMMENDATION TWO - Hire people of color for staff, faculty, and administrator positions, including Latinx people who mirror our student population.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome	Other thoughts/comments
Recruitment in non-traditional places	HRS	Faculty Senate		Spring 2022 Approval (Faculty Hiring Procedures) S22/F22 Senate Let Hiring Committees Know				
Consider where and how we are promoting open positions; job postings need to be intentional about this and posted in places that will attract a diverse candidate pool (be proactive about these needs)	HRS	Faculty Senate		Spring 2022 Approval (Faculty Hiring Procedures) S22/F22 Senate Let Hiring Committees Know				
Hire bilingual and diverse faculty								Offer opportunities for current faculty to take language courses and receive pay scale increases. Also change our application process to describe our atmosphere of bilingualism
When we include standards, include those that make it more achievable								
Ask and layer questions that ask candidates to discuss how they practice equity		Faculty Senate - EEDCC			EEDCC could help create question pool for DEIA			
Demonstration activity/teaching example that helps represent the diversity of the college to assess how the candidates directly handle a diverse classroom (Human Resources lets us ask applicants a question about antiracism/equity)								
Incorporate trainings reflective of student populations								
Diversity Equity Inclusion (DEI) trainings embedded in onboarding practices								

Being careful of our implicit bias so we do not hire people who are too similar to the current make-up of what we actually want to change

Engage in hiring practices that take into account the impact of diverse experiences

Representation matters and impacts all of our students

Hire faculty who use culturally responsive teaching since tenure-track faculty will be here a long time – ask them to show how they demonstrate this

Ensure there is no disconnect in what we say we value and what we do

Support for part-time faculty to be involved whenever possible

Update the required training for hiring committees.

Palomar's application process needs to ask robust DEIA questions in initial faculty applications. Incorporate students into the hiring process (teaching demo and maybe more). ASCCC has had discussions on this recently.

RECOMMENDATON THREE - Protect and empower Latinx staff and faculty to go into leadership roles.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome	Thoughts/comments
Support the retention of these employees, since too much of a burden gets put on our employees of color to do a lot of the equity work								We need to re-train everyone to be open to hearing the diverse/minority viewpoints on topics in meetings
Allocate and allow leave time for supporting Latinx initiatives		Faculty Senate / PFF						
Make opportunities visible and communicate opportunities – “you don’t know what you don’t know”		Faculty Senate - Committee on Committees		Spring (one webinar), Fall plenary (meetings/webinars)	Create orientations to clarify process for all faculty and present a welcoming atmosphere			
Support for part-time faculty to be involved – ensure that our part-time faculty are paid for the work that they do		Faculty Senate / PFF						
Mentoring opportunities can help with visibility for Hispanic/Latinx faculty who are seeking opportunities (SDICCA can help with mentorships and ASCCC can help with mentorships too)		Faculty Senate / Professional Development Committee						

RECOMMENDATION FOUR - Institutional commitment to support ALASS, MEChA, and Puente.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome
<p>Provide funding for these programs from through the College's general funds</p> <p>Additionally, dedicate HSI funding for these programs</p> <p>Create systematic and budgetary process to support and follow the MOU's</p> <p>Dedicated position to cultivating Latinx focused and other student equity groups</p> <p>Cultivate cultural activities</p> <p>Respond to non-instructional Program Review and Planning forms (PRPs) requests for any and all budgetary requirements needed to current programs</p> <p>Include ALASS into the Organizational Structure</p> <p>Provide release/reassigned time to support ALASS to get their work done</p> <p>Need participation from the campus and institutional support (release/reassigned time) to do the work since current situation is not sustainable</p> <p>Enhance support for the Puente Program (usually only hold 1 cohort per semester) by providing staffing and resources</p> <p>More mentors for Puente needed to share professional experiences with students</p> <p>Promote the Puente Program by communicating with students that the program exists</p> <p>These groups need a designated space, support, and funding, an example is that ALASS and MEChA do their own grass root fundraising for graduation</p> <p>Incentivize broad participation in Latinx events</p> <p>Support graduation for Latinx students, embedded into usual graduation week and information, rather than as a less known event</p>							

RECOMMENDATION FIVE - Provide a physical space dedicated to Latinx students.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome
<p>Create spaces and places of belonging for Latinx students</p> <p>Visual representation, rebranding, cultural art throughout the campus community</p> <p>Cultural hub center</p> <p>Prioritize this space in the Facilities Planning and identify the space</p> <p>Recognize that if all Facilities Requests go through PRPs, then this is an institutional barrier to getting a dedicated space</p> <p>Make this a visible cause to get this space</p> <p>Establish a line item in the budget to support this space</p> <p>Create a task force with members from the governance councils, along with other faculty/staff/students, and engage all constituents to move this forward</p> <p>Student lounge modeled on the Veterans' resource center</p>							

RECOMMENDATION SIX - Provide a physical space for Undocumented/AB 540/DACA and mixed status students.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome
<p>Create spaces and places of belonging for undocumented students</p> <p>Prioritize this space in the Facilities Planning and identify the space</p> <p>Make this a visible cause to get this space</p> <p>Establish a line item in the budget to support this space</p> <p>Create an advocacy group/task force with members from the governance councils, along with other faculty/staff/students, and engage all constituents to move this forward</p> <p>Student lounge modeled on the Veterans' resource center</p> <p>Include not only resources, but also lockers for personal belongings, microwaves, etc.</p> <p>Locate office spaces with the College's commitment to ensure this is a safe space</p> <p>Add the education aspect to this item for the campus community, such undocumented resource and ally training, provide legal services to students, and create staff positions that are inclusive of Undocumented/AB 540/DACA candidates</p>							

RECOMMENDATION SEVEN - Use an HSI lens to improve institutional practices and require equity training for all employees.

Action Items	VP Area of Responsibility	Governance Council	Action Item Lead	Timeline	Resources Requested	Progress (%)	Measurable Outcome
--------------	---------------------------	--------------------	------------------	----------	---------------------	--------------	--------------------

Professional Development opportunities that include some requirement hours towards diversity (HSI) training, on a yearly basis for staff, faculty, administrators, and board members

Provide cohort trainings for incoming employees with trained facilitators

Work with all constituent groups to validate mandated training for everyone, including unions and employee groups

Ensure that new hires have an equity lens

Train all employees on microaggressions

Participate and model practices from the Strong Workforce institute (analyzing student demographics to remove inequities) Dr. RAD, Cultural Curriculum Collective (at MiraCosta), and others