EXHIBIT 1

THE FACULTY SENATE
PALOMAR COLLEGE

Minutes of the
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE
November 9, 2020

APPROVED

PRESENT: Eduardo Aguilar, Lacey Craft, William Dalrymple, Alexandra Doyle Bauer, Kelly Falcone, Katy Farrell, Molly Faulkner, Jenny Fererro, Erin Hiro, Jason Jarvinen, Teresa Laughlin, Lawrence Lawson, Beatrice Manneh, Jackie Martin, Adam Meehan, Susan Miller, Kateri Mouawad (ASG), Ben Mudgett, Scott Nelson, Wendy Nelson, Candace Rose, Sabrina Santiago, Elizabeth Stephens, Craig Thompson, Fari Towfiq, Rocco Versaci, Reza Wrathall, Anastasia Zavodny

ABSENT: Patrick O'Brien, Ellen Weller

GUESTS: Rachel Alazar, Barbara Baer, Tina Balloon, Jory Hadsell, Vikash Lakhani, Leigh Marshall, Bob Nash, Patriceann Mead, Karl Seiler, Jon Walker

P**lease note: All votes are presumed unanimous unless indicated otherwise.**

CALL TO ORDER: The video conference meeting was called to order by Senate President Rocco Versaci, at 2:30 PM.

PUBLIC COMMENT: No Public announcements.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Senate Vice President Jenny Fererro reminded Senators about the teaching online certification deadline for spring 2021. Certification will not be available over winter break so you must get certified by the end of this semester which is December 18. Senator and PD Coordinator Kelly Falcone added that part-time faculty who want to be paid the ten (10) extra hours, need to have Poet done by December 1 because that's the PD deadline for fall. If you have further questions, contact Erin Hiro.

Senate President Rocco Versaci announced that Council is changing their meeting time this week and next week only. Instead of meeting on Wednesday, November 11 and 18, Council will meet on Thursday, November 12 and 19 at 12:30. The ZOOM ID and password have not changed.

Senator Alex Doyle Bauer announced that the library will be providing physical materials from the San Marcos Campus Library including DVDs and books for students, staff and faculty. A formal notice will go out to the campus this week.

Senator Teresa Laughlin announced that PFF is participating in a food distribution event on November 21 in Parking Lot 12. PFF donated $6,000, the Foundation added $6,000 and the San Diego Labor Council donated $4,000. 500 turkeys will be available. She asked Senators to spread the word. Palomar students will be notified through Canvas.

AGENDA CHANGES: No agenda changes.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion 1 **MSC**: Thompson/Laughlin — Faculty Senate approval of minutes dated October November 2, 2020 as amended (see Exhibit 1).

Abstentions: Adam Meehan

The motion carried.

ACTION

A. Curriculum

Motion 2 **MSC**: W. Nelson/Laughlin — Faculty Senate approval of actions taken during the November 4, 2020 Curriculum meeting (see Exhibit 2):

The motion carried.

Senator and Curriculum chair, Wendy Nelson notified department chairs of classes that do not have the DE addendum completed. The deadline to launch those classes is November 20.

B. Committee Appointments

Motion 3 **MSC**: Zavodny/Laughlin — Faculty Senate approval to confirm committee appointment (see Exhibit 3):

Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – **Natalie Lopez**, SBS, Faculty at-large

The motion carried.

Motion 4 **MSC**: Zavodny/Laughlin — Faculty Senate approval to confirm committee appointments.

Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – **Tracey Fung**, ESL, AB705 Representative
Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – **Wendy Metzger**, Math, AB705 Representative (fall 2020 only)
Guided Pathways Advisory Taskforce – **Mark Clark**, Math, AB705 Representative (spring 2021 only)

The motion carried.

Senator and Chair of Committee on Committees Anastasia Zavodny provided ballot information (see Exhibit 4) for selection of the Senator Co-Chair for the DEqCC Subcommittee. Upon this presentation, Senator and TERB Coordinator Lawrence Lawson rescinded his application. The call is now out to fill the balance of the committee. Zavodny asked Senators to encourage other faculty to volunteer and to reduce bias, she will redact names of applicants on the questionnaire.

Motion 5 **MSC**: Zavodny/Lawson — Faculty Senate approval to confirm committee appointment.

DEqCC Subcommittee – **Eduardo Aguilar**, Senator Co-Chair

The motion carried.

C. ASG's Conversations about Support for Struggling Students

Motion 6 **MSC**: Laughlin/Zavodny Faculty Senate approval of ASG's draft student survey to be emailed this semester (see Exhibit 5).

The motion carried.

ASG Representative Kateri Mouawad presented an updated draft of the survey. The goal is to get the survey out before Thanksgiving. Senators suggested a few additional questions to add such as an open-ended question that allows the student to share additional information, and a general question asking how online learning has impacted their education. Mouawad stated that ASG is planning on sending an additional survey to students asking questions directed at the effects of COVID. Senator Falcone mentioned that Research & Planning sent a similar survey out last spring and 2,500 students responded.

INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Part-time Instructor Equity (see Exhibit 6**)**

Senator Will Dalrymple thanked Senators for their thoughtfulness and generosity of reading through the document. He suggested our biggest opportunity is recognizing that advocacy matters. Attitude and norms shape and reinforce policy, and policy shapes and reinforces attitudes and norms. Our views and our policies on academic and professional matters are not only important in their own right, they shape the views and policies around workplace conditions as well. These are issues that are embedded in the system. He thinks we have even more power than we might imagine to interrupt that cycle and to begin rebuilding that system in a more accessible, inclusive and equitable way.

Senator Dalrymple explained that there are options on how to proceed. We can either see this as a document in its own right, or a document working together in a dialogue with one or more additional documents such as a bill of rights. Initially, Dalrymple believes we should determine who the audience is for this and what we are hoping to accomplish with it. One possibility is that another document be crafted to guide what specifically the Senate should be doing in terms of action, while this document stands as a statement of a theory or framework and of general advocacy for part-time issues.

Past President Craig Thompson asked for clarification in the document regarding equality in department matters such as voting. Dalrymple answered that he was thinking of this in terms of access and inclusion. For example, at other colleges he teaches at, part-timers are welcomed to come to department meetings and be involved in the discussions. Part-timers are recognized as faculty and fully qualified to participate.

Thompson also shared his concerns about the institution of tenure. He added that the hiring process and the tenure process are both pretty arduous and extensive and they should count for something. Thompson said he has been an advocate for part-time representation for years and wants to know more about the definition of equity. Dalrymple responded by saying that the last thing part-timers want to do is jeopardize tenure. He went on to say that he believes that we are striving for is a way that in fact reinforces those sorts of tenure protections and adds the sorts of protections and privileges for part-time. Dalrymple referred to a mentorship program that would support part-timers in a kind of analogous way. He believes a majority of part-timers want to become full-timers and to have those privileges that accompany full time leadership.

Senator Falcone, recognizing the importance of this issue, suggested that a work group be formed to review the document. The following individuals volunteered to serve on this work group: Anastasia Zavodny, Elizabeth Stephen, Will Dalrymple, Lawrence Lawson, Barbara Baer, Kateri Mouawad, Jason Jarvinen and Kelly Falcone.

B. Instruction Plan/Considerations for summer ’21 & fall ’21 – Tabled.

C. Chancellor’s Office Opinion on Captioning & Cameras (see Exhibit 7)

Senator and DE Coordinator Erin Hiro presented three legal opinions from the Chancellor’s Office. The opinions relate to online class camera requirements that state that requiring a camera on during class 1) highlights equity gaps among students who may lack the technology (no camera) 2) invades student’s privacy particularly if they have minor children 3) can cause FERPA violations particularly if you’re recording class and students are prominently featured and 4) can violate ADA rights because requiring cameras can harm students with disorders (anxiety).

The Chancellor’s Office has recommended that colleges adopt policies that strictly limit requiring cameras on during class and adopt a camera-optional approach for all classes. When Hiro received feedback from faculty concerning camera requirements, she noticed that a significant number of classes required cameras on which goes against the Chancellor’s recommendation.

The next opinion presented concerned closed-captioning and the state indicating that we must have closed-captioning for our students. Because the state has no available funding for the technology needed for this, the DE Committee has a few options to offer. One is to upload videos to YouTube which automatically closed-captions. The other option is to work through Canvas Studio and that automatically closed-captions as well. There is training for this available in the PD portal.

The last opinion also relates to closed, live captioning and other types of captioning. DRC has said that if any student who is struggling with this issue should register with DRC and their team will help the student.

Hiro closed by saying that we currently have no other solutions for these issues but she and her committee will continue to explore options but in the meantime, faculty are strongly encouraged to work with their students on these issues. Lastly, the DE Committee will start work on drafting a camera policy as recommended by the state and bring it to Faculty Senate.

D. CVC-OEI Consortium (see Exhibit 8**)**

Senator Erin Hiro addressed Senators asking for consideration of two different requests that will help Palomar students graduate faster and help to fill the low enrolled online classes. This applies to distance education courses. The first request comes from California Virtual Campus (CVC) who is asking ATRC to flip a switch and make us a home college. This means that Palomar students who need a class that we don't offer or don’t have available can log on to the CVC consortium and sign up for that class at a different college without going through the registration process.

The state Chancellor's Office has required that all California community colleges become a part of the consortium. When the DE Committee realized that we have to become a home college, committee members worried that we would lose our online enrollment. Our small programs are already struggling, which is why the DE Committee voted to recommend becoming a teaching college as well.

Hiro’s second request, on behalf of the DE Committee wants Palomar to apply to become a CVC teaching college, which means that our own Palomar courses would be included in the list of available courses and be accessible to students outside of Palomar and from around the state. The DE Committee feels this will help students transfer faster, which is part of our college goals. This will add enrollment to our programs and to our online courses that are struggling.

Senator Hiro introduced CVC Executive Director, Dr. Jory Hadsell and Bob Nash, Dean of Academic Affairs for CVC who are present to answer questions. CVC has been heavily partnered with the statewide Academic Senate since 2013. The state Chancellor's Office is encouraging community colleges to join the consortium as a way to help students find access to courses needed to complete their programs.

There are two ways a college can participate. One is a home college meaning students who are currently enrolled at Palomar but who can't get a particular class, can cross enroll into another college's class online. That student still accesses the class through Palomar's Canvas. The second way to participate is by becoming a teaching college. A teaching college is able to receive non-Palomar students in the same temporary way. Palomar's students still have priority registration and these other students can fill remaining seats when open registration begins. And displacement of a college's own students hasn't been a problem. For financial aid students, there is a federal financial aid consortium agreement that allows for those units to count toward their aid. Another advantage to becoming either a teaching or home college is access to student data. That data is available to Palomar and can provide information such as what classes are students enrolling in or what classes are students looking for.

Dr. Hadsell answered several questions by Senators. The college that is teaching the course gets the FTES credit but the completion credit portion stays at the college the student is enrolled at. A student is limited to two (2) courses per academic term through this exchange. Data showing what classes Palomar students are searching for through the exchange is also provided to Palomar. Hadsell added that no college has second-guessed their participation due to negative effects on their college. Also, this program was originally set up for colleges to participate as both a home and teaching college. Once COVID hit, the Chancellor asked CVC if they could break up the program so we could have a more open model to where any college could serve as a home college. Colleges must start out as a home college because the implementation process to become a teaching college takes a little bit more time. A teaching college provides students with services related to their course but most all other student services will still be provided by the student's home college. The website uses algorithms when students are searching for courses and home colleges always show up first for that student. Unfortunately there isn't course equivalency between colleges because there isn't a centralized system that the state Chancellor's Office maintains.

President Versaci stated this item will be coming to action at the next Faculty Senate meeting. Senator Hiro asked Senators to direct any additional questions to her so she can provide answers before next meeting.

E. Superintendent /President Hiring Committee – Tabled.

F. Hayward Award - Tabled.

REPORTS

President (Versaci)
In the past week I attended the special meeting of the Governing Board on 11/2, SPC on 11/3 (see report below), and a Hiring Improvement meeting on 11/5. At the Governing Board meeting, the main agenda item was to discuss the search for the Superintendent/President. Many items were discussed, including committee representation, timeline, and the use of a consulting firm to help with the search. In terms of representation, the discussion focused on the model brought forth by HR; specifically, faculty membership was listed at 6, and community members was listed at 1-5. The ensuing discussion moved toward more faculty representatives (including part-time faculty) and fewer community members. Discussion on the timeline sought to strike a balance between having a permanent president in place when Jack's contract expires and not making too many decisions when 2-3 new members will be joining the Board. As for the use of a consulting firm, most Board members wished to limit the use of a firm.

SSEC (Versaci) This Council next meets on Friday, 11/13.

SPC (Versaci)

- SPC met on Tuesday, November 3. Some highlights:
- The Governance Structure & Participation Handbook came up for 2nd reading. Some minor changes and clarifications were proposed and approved, though the approval of the entire document itself was pushed back to the next SPC meeting after lengthy discussion. One issue raised was that Executive Administrators (VPs) were listed as "advisory/non-voting" for the College Council (group replacing SPC). Some felt that VPs should have a vote on this council, while others argued that the membership was carefully considered by the Task Force and vetted extensively, and changing the membership at this point would create an imbalance in what the TF had carefully crafted.
- We had further discussion about the college's vision statement by focusing on values.

IPC (Versaci) IPC does not meet again until Wednesday, 12/9. IPC review of the PRPs is scheduled to begin on Friday, 11/6.

SSPC (O'Brien) No report.

HRPC No report.

FASPC (Antonecchia) No report.

PFF (Laughlin) No report.

Distance Education (Hiro)

Certification stats

There are 701 faculty who are on the faculty certification list. There are 221 people not certified but scheduled to teach in spring. The DE Coordinator is trying to help them get certified by Dec. 18.
The Committee discussed the cutoff for certification recently and planned to bring it back next time.

CVC Report

The DE Coordinator is talking to various committees to inform everyone about the opportunity to become a teaching and home college at the CVC Consortium. Senate will hear about it on Nov. 9

TERB online observation form

The DE Committee looked over slight changes to the online observation that will refer observers to the CVC Rubric.

CCC Tech connect feedback

Since all faculty will have to switch zoom accounts Dec. 20, two DE Committee members volunteered to test it. They said the Zoom application was better and easy to use. They reported one problem with losing recordings, which ATRC is working on fixing. More information about the switch will be coming later in November.

Canvas programs

The DE Committee spoke with Dr. Najib Manea about NameCoach and other programs that have been requested. Dr. Manea told the committee the ATRC budget is small at $50,000, with all of it committed to other programs. DE Committee members will discuss what programs are the best use of the small ATRC budget and bring suggestions to Dr. Manea at the next meeting.

Guided Pathways (Nelson)
Reports for GP are suspended until the GP Task Force gets up and running. The Senate has put out a call for the three at-large faculty members.

Policies and Procedures (Lawson) No report. Policies & Procedures next meets on Friday, 11/6.

Budget (Fererro) No report.

TERB (Lawson)
TERB met on Monday 26 October, and we discussed the role of directors in probationary faculty observations (per contract, a Dean can delegate to a 1st-level administrator to serve in their stead on a TEC) and part-time faculty evaluations (directors could participate in a workplace/ classroom observation though faculty must be the one's writing the evaluation report). This would be useful in the case of certain, few areas where directors have much more interaction and contact with faculty.

TERB also discussed a new online course observation form that included language about accessibility and draws on the CVC online course evaluation rubric from the CCC. This form revision is being developed for spring 2021 implementation, and will be brought to Faculty Senate for feedback.

TERB then discussed the role of TERB in out-of-cycle peer evaluation requests for tenured faculty who are serving as department chairs. Per contract, in response to documented concerns, TERB can initiate an out-of-cycle evaluation for tenured faculty who are serving as department chairs, and there was discussion of what threshold of documentation and concern would need to be brought to TERB for TERB initiate the out-of-cycle evaluation. Further, there was concern that the process to request an out-of-cycle evaluation for tenured faculty who are not department chairs is *much easier* that for those who department chairs are. As a result of this imbalance, TERB is discussing this contract language with an eye toward suggestions to improve equity.

Professional Development (Falcone) No report.

Sabbatical Leave (Lawson) No report.

Faculty Service Areas (Mudgett) No report.

ASG (Mouawad)
- ASG is hosting a costume contest for students and continues to host virtual events for a better student experience.
- ASG officially changed their meeting times to every Monday from 11:30am – 1pm.
- Our students are currently being placed into various different shared governance committees that Palomar has open to student representation.
- ASG is working on increasing recruitment by presenting in Zoom meeting what ASG is and what we do. If there are any professors on Senate who would agree to ASG presenting in their class/posting a flyer on Canvas, please notify Abeeha Hussain, VP of Internal Affairs. Her contact is ahussain@palomar.edu.
- We have officialized our semester goals and are working collectively to accomplish them, the main ones being our website re-design, antiracist rhetoric, and overnight parking policy.
- As Senate is aware, ASG is working on conducting a survey for students to gain information what best practices can be initiated in the spring semester.

ADJOURNMENT:
The meeting was adjourned at 3:53 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Margaret Faulkner

Molly Faulkner, Secretary