



Minutes of the  
MEETING OF THE FACULTY SENATE  
October 8, 2012

APPROVED

PRESENT: Melinda Carrillo, Haydn Davis, Barb Kelber, Greg Larson, Teresa Laughlin, Jackie Martin, Pam McDonough, Christina Moore, Linda Morrow, Patrick O'Brien, Lillian Payn, Perry Snyder, Diane Studinka

ABSENT: Ken Dodson, Katy French, Fari Towfiq

GUESTS: Berta Cuaron, Lisa Hornsby, Angel Jimenez, Shayla Sivert, John Tortarolo

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by the President, Greg Larson, at 2:02 p.m., in Room SU-30.

Approval of Minutes:

Motion 1 MSC Kelber, Morrow: Faculty Senate approval of the minutes of October 1, 2012, as amended. The motion carried.

One Senator noted the Senate's Action last week in moving Information item E, Faculty Senate role in an All Candidates Forum, to action, stating that the Senate should be cautious in compromising the current process of moving an item from "Information" to "Action" unless it is time sensitive. Placing an item on the Agenda first under Information allows all faculty members to see the item on the agenda and have an opportunity to attend the next meeting before it is acted upon. Barb Kelber explained that there was some concern with the short period of time to notify the Governing Board candidates of the event, which is why there was a vote to have the item moved forward to Action. Kelber stated that, for the record, she was very disappointed that a week later the candidates had not yet been invited because it meant that the unusual move to Action had been for naught.

Public Comments: There were no public comments.

Announcements: Perry Snyder distributed copies of the following Resolutions from the Academic Senate Part-Time Faculty Caucus:

Whereas the Academic Senate is an organization committed to promoting the welfare of the entire faculty and representing the entire faculty in its academic and professional relations with the District;

Whereas part time faculty comprise a majority of those faculty and should play a crucial role in the functioning of the Academic Senate;

Whereas it was resolved that the State Academic Senate for California Community Colleges urge local senates to include part time faculty as local academic senate members in Spring, 1995 (resolution 0110);

Whereas there are still local Senates that have no part time representatives;

***Be it therefore resolved*** that every District should include at least 10% of its total seats for part time faculty or, should local Senates comprise less than 10 members, at least one of those seats include a part time faculty member.

Academic Senate Part Time Faculty Caucus

Whereas in the Fall of 2010, a resolution was passed (01.05) creating a yearly award for a part-time faculty member "that recognizes excellence in teaching and outstanding contributions to the campus environment and to student success and that the award amount and presentation be consistent with other comparable faculty awards given by the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges," and,

Whereas the status of this award was changed to award a part-time scholarship specific for attending institutes and plenary sessions and, secondarily, changed to allow part-time faculty eligibility for any of the other four Senate Awards;

Whereas awards and scholarships have completely different requirements and objectives;

Whereas the possibility of a part-time faculty being awarded one of any of the four existing Senate Awards is negligible given that a full-time faculty member's opportunities to serve professionally are so much greater than those afforded part-time faculty members' opportunities to serve professionally;

*Be it Therefore Resolved that the Academic Senate for the California Community Colleges create a yearly award for part-time faculty that follows criteria for excellence in part-time faculty contributions and that is similar to the Hayward Award.*

Academic Senate Part-Time Faculty Caucus

Snyder asked that the item be placed on next week's Faculty Senate Agenda for discussion.

Christina Moore announced that the Palomar Faculty Federation (PFF) will be hosting a meet and greet event on Wednesday, October 10, all day in front of the MD building. Coffee and donuts will be served to provide faculty and staff the opportunity to stop by to meet the part-time members of the PFF board.

Committee  
Appointments:

There were no committee appointments.

Curriculum:

Senators were provided electronic copies of the following Curriculum items:

#### PALOMAR COLLEGE CURRICULUM COMMITTEE MEETING ACTION ITEMS

Wednesday, October 3, 2012

##### I. ACTION ITEMS

Details of all program and course proposals can be viewed at: <http://www.curricunet.com/palomar>

Select "track,"

From the list of pending proposals, select the Check Status button for the program or course you wish to view.

Select the Pencil icon in order to navigate through the various pages of the proposal, or

Select the "COR" or "WR" icon to view the Course Outline of Record or Program Report, or

Select the "CC" icon to view a report that displays proposed changes for the course outline of record or program

Select the "CR" icon to view a report that displays ALL proposed changes for the course

##### To View Packages

Select Packages under Create/Edit Proposals, select the Pencil icon to see individual proposals included in the Package. Various icons will be accessible for creating Reports or viewing the pages of each proposal.

##### II. CONSENT CALENDAR

There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a Curriculum Committee member or guest requests that a particular item be removed from the Consent Calendar. Items so removed will be considered separately. All matters remaining under Consent Calendar are considered to be **routin**e and will be approved by **one motion**.

The following curricular changes, pending appropriate approvals, will be effective FALL 2013:

##### A. Credit Course/Program Packages

1. There are no Credit Course/Program Packages for this agenda.

**B. Non-Credit Course/Program Packages**

1. There are no Non-Credit Course/Program Packages for this agenda.

**C. New Programs**

1. Program Title: Associate in Arts in Geography for Transfer  
Discipline: Geography (GEOG)  
Award Type: AA-T Transfer Major (18 units or more)  
Total Units: 18.00 - 19.00  
Transfer Model Curriculum  
*Catherine M. Jain*

2. Program Title: Associate in Science in Geology for Transfer  
Discipline: Geology (GEOL)  
Award Type: AS-T Transfer Major (18 units or more)  
Total Units: 27.00  
Transfer Model Curriculum  
*Patricia A. Deen*

**D. New Vocational Programs**

1. There are no new Vocational Programs for this agenda.

**E. Program Reactivations**

1. There are no Program Reactivations for this agenda.

**F. Program Changes**

1. There are no Program Changes for this agenda.

**G. Program Deactivations**

1. Program Title: Commercial Photography  
Discipline: Photography (PHOT)  
Award Type: Certificate of Proficiency  
Total Units: 15

**H. Vocational Program Changes**

1. There are no Vocational Program Changes for this agenda.

**I. Vocational Program Deactivations**

1. There are no Vocational Program Deactivations for this agenda.

**J. Credit Courses – New**

1. There are no New Credit Courses for this agenda.

**K. Credit Course – Change**

1. There are no Credit Course Changes for this agenda.

**L. Credit Courses – Reactivations**

1. There are no Credit Course Reactivations for this agenda.

**M. Credit Courses - Deactivations**

1. Course Number and Title: PHOT 201 Elementary Color Negative Printing  
Short Title: Elem Color Negative Printing  
Discipline: Photography (PHOT)  
Prerequisites: PHOT 105  
Courses Included in the following programs:  
    A. Fine Art Photography Certificate of Proficiency  
    B. Photography A.A. Degree Major or Certificate of Achievement  
Transfer Acceptability: CSU  
Old Technology, necessary products not available.  
*Robert M. Barry*

2. Course Number and Title: PHOT 202 Intermediate Color Printing  
Discipline: Photography (PHOT)  
Prerequisites: PHOT 201  
Courses Included in the following programs:  
    A. Photography A.A. Degree Major or Certificate of Achievement

Associate Degree General Education - C: Humanities  
Associate Degree General Education - E: Lifelong Learning and Self-Development  
Transfer Acceptability: CSU  
Old Technology, necessary products not available.  
*Robert M. Barry*

**N. Non Credit Course – New**

1. There are no New Noncredit Courses for this agenda.

**O. Non Credit Course - Change**

1. There are no Non Credit Course Changes for this agenda.

**P. Non Credit Course - Deactivation**

1. There are no Non Credit Course Deactivations for this agenda.

**Q. Distance Learning\***

The following courses may be offered as distance learning and meet Title 5 Regulations 55200- 55210, effective Fall 2013.

|                                |  |
|--------------------------------|--|
| <b>Catalog/Subject Number</b>  | <b>Distance Learning Offerings (s)</b> |
| There are none for this agenda | There are none for this agenda         |

**R. Requisites and Advisories\***

The establishment of the following advisories meets Title 5 Regulations 55003, effective Fall 2013.

| <b>Catalog Number</b>          | <b>Type</b> | <b>Description</b> | <b>Proposal Type</b> |
|--------------------------------|-------------|--------------------|----------------------|
| There are none for this agenda |             |                    |                      |

**VII. RESUMPTION OF REGULAR AGENDA**

**A. ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR**

**B. DISCUSSION**

1. Prerequisites, Corequisites and Limitations on Enrollment/Content Review § 55003. ***Policies for Prerequisites, Corequisites and Advisories on Recommended Preparation.***

*(a) The governing board of a community college district may establish prerequisites, corequisites, and advisories on recommended preparation, but must do so in accordance with the provisions of this article. Nothing in this subchapter shall be construed to require a district to establish prerequisites, corequisites, or advisories on recommended preparation; provided however, that a prerequisite or corequisite shall be required if the course is to be offered for associate degree credit and the curriculum committee finds that the prerequisite or corequisite is necessary pursuant to sections 55002(a)(2)(D) or 55002(a)(2)(E). Unless otherwise specified in this section, the level of scrutiny required to establish prerequisites, corequisites, and advisories on recommended preparation shall be based on content review as defined in subdivision (c) of section 55000 or content review with statistical validation as defined in subdivision (f) of this section. Determinations about prerequisites and corequisites shall be made on a course-by-course or program-by-program basis.*

2. Repeatability Timeline and Procedures ( Attachments A & B)

3. Curriculum Committee Goals 2012-2013 (Previous Year's Goals Attachment C)

4. Other

**C. INFORMATION**

1. Student Success Taskforce

2. Curricunet Meta

Upcoming Webinars: October 4, 11, 18, 25, 2012, from 9 a.m. to 10 a.m.

3. Status of Course Outline Reviews

The following courses have completed the course outline review process between September 12, 2012 and September 26, 2012 and are effective Fall 2013.

DNCE 101 Survey of World Dance

4. 2012-2013 Curriculum Activity Summary

|                      | <b>Current<br/>Agenda</b> | <b>2012-13<br/>Cumulative</b> |
|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| New Courses          | 0                         | 0                             |
| Course Revisions     | 0                         | 9                             |
| Course Reactivations | 0                         | 0                             |

|  |          |           |
|--|----------|-----------|
| Course Deactivations                     | 2        | 2         |
| Course Reviews<br>(9/12/2012– 9/26/2012) | 1        | 8         |
| New Programs                             | 2        | 2         |
| Program Revisions                        | 0        | 0         |
| Program Deactivations                    | 1        | 1         |
| <b>Total Activity</b>                    | <b>6</b> | <b>22</b> |

Draft - Repeatability Update Options

Note: Where a Course proposal is in progress, Instructional Services will ensure Repeatability is removed before the proposal is placed on the Curriculum Committee agenda.

- Option 1 – Department generates Course change proposal to remove repeatability. They may propose other changes as well. Curriculum Committee to establish a deadline date. \_\_\_\_\_
- Option 2 – Instructional Services initiates a technical update to remove repeatability from all courses remaining with repeatability.

All courses updated through a technical update will retain their original Review date even though they will have an effective date of Fall 2013 when implemented.

Timeline for Families and Athletic Conditioning Courses

**Families**

- November 28, 2012 - Families identified and submitted to Instructional Services
- December 5, 2012 - Families approved by Curriculum Committee
- February/March 2013 - Families entered into the 2013-14 college catalog
- June 15, 2013 - Process for monitoring student registrations in place for start of Fall registration

The following Disciplines must create families this year:

- Kinesiology
- Dance
- Music
- Theatre Arts
- Art
- ArtI – Illustration
- ArtD - Design

A review of our courses may reveal additional disciplines which need to create families this year or next year.

**Intercollegiate Athletics Conditioning Courses**

- November 28, 2012 - Conditioning courses for Intercollegiate Athletic courses identified and submitted to Instructional Services
- December 5, 2012 - Conditioning course groups approved by Curriculum Committee
- February/March 2013 – Total hours limitations on conditioning courses published in 2013-14 college

Draft - Defining Families of Courses

| Discipline              | # of Courses<br>in Family | Family Descriptor<br>(Name) | Catalog # & Course Title   | Comments                         |
|-------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|--|----------------------------------|
| <b>EXAMPLE:</b><br>KINE | 4                         | Tennis                      | KINE 140 Beginning Tennis-<br>Techniques and Analysis<br>KINE 141 Intermediate Tennis-<br>Techniques and Analysis<br>KINE 142 Advanced Tennis-<br>Techniques and Analysis<br>KINE 216 Professional Preparation<br>for Individual Sports (Tennis)-<br>Theory and Biomechanic<br>Application | Creating<br>Family for<br>Tennis |

Title 5:58161(b) A district may claim state apportionment for an enrollment in a credit course for the attendance of a student who receives a satisfactory grade, as defined in section 55000 one time unless an exception applies. Section 55000 defines "courses that are related in content," or families, as "those courses with similar primary educational activities in which skill levels or variations are separated into distance courses with different student learning outcomes for each variation."

Section 55040 will now state that "The policies and procedures adopted by the governing board of each community college district pursuant...may not permit student enrollment in "active participatory courses," as defined in 55000, in physical education, visual arts or performing arts that are related in content, as defined in 55000, more than four times for semester courses or six times for quarter courses." Taken together, these definitions and changes make the designation of families a very important issue for local curriculum committees. The current interpretation of Title 5 allows for no more than four levels of experiences within a family such that each course may only be taken one time unless the course meets the new criteria for repeatability under section 55041.

These items will be brought back for Faculty Senate ratification at next week's meeting.

Greg Larson reported that Earth Sciences faculty member Mark Lane attended the recent Curriculum Committee meeting to address the group on a Curricunet clerical error that occurred with the Deactivation of Astronomy A.A./Certificate of Achievement (motion passed by the Curriculum Committee on September 19, 2012, and ratified by the Faculty Senate on October 1, 2012). Lane is asking that the Senate take the necessary action to rescind that deactivation.

Motion 2 MSC Laughlin, Snyder: Faculty Senate reconsideration of its approval of the Curriculum Committee Consent Calendar dated September 19, 2012. The motion carried.

Motion 3 MSC Laughlin, Snyder: Faculty Senate reconsideration of the approval of the Curriculum Committee Consent Calendar dated September 19, 2012, noting the removal of the Senate's approval of the Deactivation of Astronomy A.A./Certificate of Achievement. The motion carried.

Motion 4 MSF Laughlin, Snyder: Faculty Senate approval of the Deactivation of Astronomy A.A./Certificate of Achievement. The motion failed.

Agenda Changes: With no objections, there was agreement to suspend the Agenda to discuss Action item E, BSI Allocation Report, Information item D, Confidentiality Agreement, and Information item E, Instructional Planning Council Draft of Enrollment Management Plan, due to guests being present.

BSI Allocation Report: Shayla Sivert provided Senate members with copies of the [2012 ESL/Basic Skills Allocation Report](#) in its final draft, which has been arrived at in consultation with the chairs of Reading, Math, English, and ESL, all of whom have expressed their approval of the document as it now reads.

A brief question and answer period followed. Senators expressed to Sivert their hope of receiving updates on the process as it moves forward.

Motion 5 MSC Kelber, O'Brien: Faculty Senate approval of the Faculty Senate President's signature on the final draft of the 2012 ESL/Basic Skills Allocation Report. The motion carried.

Confidentiality Agreement: On August 27, 2012, Senate members heard a presentation by Shawna Hearn and Lisa Hornsby on the amended Human Resource Services Selection Committee Confidentiality

and Conflicts of Interest Agreement. They explained that issues of confidentiality are becoming more challenging because Palomar is transitioning to a new software program, "People Admin," which will allow (and require) hiring committee members to review submission materials online. Thus, for the first time hiring committees will be able to access applicants' files from home and other off-campus sites.

At that meeting, Senate members expressed some concern with the following sections:

*Conflicts of Interest:* The definition of "close personal connections" was not clear and has a potential to disadvantage Palomar's adjunct faculty since many faculty members on campus have developed close relationships with part-time faculty members who apply for full time positions.

*Conducting research via the Internet or other electronic searches on any applicant at any point during the recruitment process:* Some questioned whether a formal law exists that prohibits committee members from researching applicants online because the practice is widely used in the hiring process of community colleges and UC/CSUs.

*Breach of confidentiality and/or the presence of a real or apparent conflict of interest resulting in one or more consequences, including removal of the member from the selection committee; suspension from service on future selection committees; and/or suspension and/or cancellation of the recruitment:* There was concern about the role of the Assistant Superintendent/Vice President for Human Resources Services in making such a determination and the general lack of clarity about how the process of removing a committee member would actually work.

At today's meeting, Hornsby and John Tortarolo provided copies of three versions of the Human Resources Services Selection Committee Confidentiality and Conflicts of Interest Agreement: the original one, the new one brought August 27, 2012, to the Senate, and the latest version, which is very similar to the one brought forward on August 27, 2012, with some minor changes in language. Tortarolo discussed areas about which the Senate had earlier voiced concerns, explaining why Human Resources has continued to think these areas are important to be included in the agreement.

Tortarolo first outlined the Confidentiality section, providing several examples of how the process works. He discussed one area of Faculty Senate concern: the section that prohibits committee members from conducting research via the Internet or other electronic searches on any applicant at any point during the recruitment process. Tortarolo stated that because on-line information cannot be validated, it cannot be considered for employment purposes.

Some expressed concern that selection committee members could have knowledge of a candidate gained from social media that would constitute a violation of the confidentiality agreement. Tortarolo distinguished between knowledge gained from participation in social media sites with that gathered from the on-line research prohibited in the agreement. Conflicts arise, he stated, when relationships exist but are not disclosed. For example, being "friends" with someone on Facebook would not be an automatic exclusion due to a conflict of interest, nor does knowledge gained through such a Facebook relationship mean research is being conducted on an applicant. Tortarolo stated that committee members must determine their ability to be impartial. Those serving on a committee will be asked to maintain impartiality.

Additional discussion followed, and specific changes to the document were noted. One Senator asked for clarification on the Confidentiality and Conflicts of Interest Agreement where it states...The Assistant Superintendent/Vice President for Human Resources Services or designee shall be the final arbiter regarding removal of committee members for confidentiality violations and potential or real conflicts of interest and suspension or cancellation of any recruitment...There was a question as to why there was mention of a designee included and under what circumstances a designee would be appointed. Tortarolo responded that it was included in case the Vice President of Human Resources position was vacant. Also another individual might be appointed if the Vice President of Human Resources was participating in the selection process in some other way. Tortarolo stated that the wording could be changed to strike "or designee" and instead state "Superintendent/President."

Another Senator noted that the section referring to the removal of a committee member was not clarified any further in the new draft document, even though Senators had earlier presented concern about the lack of specificity about the process. Tortarolo and Hornsby indicated that it was difficult to be precise about the process of removing someone for a confidentiality violation because that particular scenario would have to be addressed on a case-by-case basis.

This item will be brought back for Faculty Senate Action next week.

Instructional Planning  
Council Draft of  
Enrollment Management  
Plan:

Berta Cuaron acknowledged that because of all the Legislative changes being brought forward over the past few years, the district continues to move forward in a constantly changing climate. She expressed a hope that all of the groups on campus working together to respond to these changes be proactive rather than reactive. She reported on the efforts of the Instructional Planning Committee (IPC), which has been developing Enrollment Management Guiding Principles in response to the following Resolution passed by the Faculty Senate on May 14, 2012:

MSC Brannick, Towfiq: Whereas, in response to reduced funding from the state the college instituted across the board course section reductions from the class schedule during 2010-11 and that the college acknowledges the potential for further course reductions to the Spring 2013 schedule in the face of a failed tax initiative in November 2012;

Whereas, for Fall 2011 the college restored some, but not all, course sections to the schedule, without faculty participation in the decision, using reportedly "strictly objective criteria of student demand" that, upon further analysis were actually, according to the college administration, faulty data, leading to changes in the schedule that were not adequately justified by the data and may not have been aligned with the college goals;

Whereas, Education Code 70902 states, "The Governing Board shall ... ensure ... the right of the Academic Senate to assume the primary responsibility for making recommendations in the area of curriculum and academic standards" and, according to the Academic Senate of California Community Colleges (ASCCC) paper "Enrollment Management Revisited" adopted in 2009, determining which courses to offer is certainly part of what is meant by curriculum because curriculum must be more than a course outline, and;

Whereas, the Academic Senate of California Community Colleges reports that a collaborative faculty, staff and administrative Enrollment Management Committee is the appropriate venue for mutually developing enrollment management policy that guides choices when making the always difficult, and often controversial, decision to cut and replace course sections;

Resolved, that the Behavioral Sciences department requests that the Palomar College Academic Senate establish a new or existing participatory governance committee tasked with developing enrollment management policy



driven by a clear set of mutually developed guiding principles and a commitment to use good qualitative and quantitative data to inform decisions to be used when developing schedules for Spring 2013 and thereafter.

The motion carried.

Cuaron distributed an informational packet which included copies of documents received by members of the IPC as they worked over six weeks on developing an enrollment management plan. One 2010 document from the Chancellor's Office set the tone that lifelong learning was no longer going to be part of the California Community College's mission, that instead colleges should review their course offerings to see how they align with the state priorities of basic skills, transfer, and career technical. The document states that colleges should give particular scrutiny to those courses which fall outside these three areas. Cuaron explained that members of IPC were then given excerpts from all of the class schedule developmental guidelines for the last three years, all of which include details required from the Chancellor's Office. Members of IPC then broke up into groups of three or four, and each discussed the components of what an enrollment management policy might look like. IPC next developed guiding principles that would be overarching in nature while still considering the culture and process that is within each department. The committee also developed three tiers of scheduling priorities and identified quantitative and qualitative data it deems important to gather for making decisions about course offerings.

Also included in the packet were an Enrollment Load Report and data on Curriculum balance.

A brief question and answer period followed, as well as discussion on how the district will move forward. One Senator noted that there may be a need for a distinction between the State of California's Mission, with its focus on basic skills, transfer, and career technical courses, and Palomar's Mission, which as currently written includes "Aesthetic and Cultural Enrichment and Lifelong Education." Another Senator expressed concern and hope that Palomar will not be forced to move toward a K-12 system, with its focus on streamlining everything as quickly as possible at the expense of losing much of what is valuable in a particular institution.

Cuaron stated that it is expected that the Enrollment Management Policy will become a "live" document that can be utilized no matter the fiscal climate and revisited annually or as needed.

Senators were asked to review the documents carefully and share them with faculty in their departments. This item will be placed on the agenda for Information on October 22, 2012.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 3:31 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Pam McDonough, Secretary